

Copyright
by
Connie Michelle Steel
2016

The Dissertation Committee for Connie Michelle Steel Certifies that this is the approved version of the following dissertation:

**If Stones Could Argue:
The Rhetoric of Covenant Memory, Media and Monuments**

Committee:

Mark Longaker, Supervisor

Patricia Roberts-Miller

Janine Barchas

Casey Boyle

Neville Hoad

**If Stones Could Argue:
The Rhetoric of Covenanter Memory, Media and Monuments**

by

Connie Michelle Steel, B.S.; M.A.

Dissertation

Presented to the Faculty of the Graduate School of
The University of Texas at Austin
in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements
for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

The University of Texas at Austin

May 2016

Dedication

For

Julie Mostov

In Memoriam

Vivien Thweatt

Acknowledgements

It would take Diocletian's Column to honor the numerous people who supported my research, writing and health while writing this dissertation. Their contributions of funding, ideas, affection and food made this essay possible. Thanks to the support of my committee in the search for funding, I have had the privilege to travel to archives in the United Kingdom for field and archive research. My trips were funded with grants from the Department of English, a University of Texas Continuing Fellowship, and a Social Science Research Council Dissertation Proposal Development Fellowship with funds from the Andrew Mellon Foundation. I also had the unique opportunity to work in Edinburgh for the McComb's School of Business and took advantage of my off hours to continue my research and writing. My colleagues Robert Lane, David Spence, Sandra Stirling, Barbara Schweitzer-Thomas and Maria Terrazas made that work a joyful experience. My students delighted me daily with their adventures in British culture and their lively engagement with ethics and law. Finally, I had the privilege of working with the Department of Rhetoric and Writing as an Assistant Director. In that office, Jeff Walker, Holly Schwadron, and Anna Crain cultivate rich soil where ideas grow.

The most valuable part of a doctoral education is the opportunity to work with a dissertation committee. I have had the luck to work with five scholars who excel at research, teaching and leadership. My dissertation chair, Mark Garrett Longaker, has served as a mentor and role model both as a researcher, a teacher and a teacher of teachers. He never rests on his laurels, but consistently revises everything from lesson plans to dissertation chapters to an entire first year writing program. His approach to the writing process exemplifies in literary form the virtues of resilience and perseverance--

lessons, which I have taken to heart in this process. His constructive, practical, rock-steady approach to life is a welcome oasis in the frenetic sea of graduate student anxieties. Likewise, Patricia Roberts-Miller taught me the value of investigating “train wreck” texts helping me connect my previous training in political science with Julie Mostov at Drexel University to the study of rhetoric. Trish’s collaborative approach to the writing process through a graduate student writing group breaks up the isolation of the research process through regular conversation and feedback bringing together into the real world my favorite bits of Virginia Woolf’s *A Room of One’s Own* with the Enlightenment tradition of philosophical societies.

Janine Barchas’s ‘History of the Book’ course awoke me from the dogmatic slumber of texts as just words and research as just databases. While taking her course at the Harry Ransom Center, our campus experienced a shooting by a young man armed with an assault weapon. Her sensitive response to the incident—gathering with her shaken graduate students for proof of life—demonstrated that good teachers do more than teach, they lead. Janine demonstrates the leadership of subtle gestures: the slash of a red pen; a museum placard; or a well-timed cup of tea. For me, it has been incalculably valuable to put Janine’s work into conversation with that of Casey Boyle, the newest member of my committee. I was thrilled when Casey joined our faculty, and only wish that it had been in time for my coursework. Casey’s intellectual curiosity about how media works spills over infectiously into the halls and off the cuff coffee machine comments are often as useful for thinking about spatial and digital rhetoric as the peer reviewed journal articles quoted here.

What words can describe the indefatigable, undefeatable, indomitable Neville Hoad? Neville’s canny ability to reveal the nakedness of empires with a well-pointed question pushes every student that passes through his classroom to new critical insights.

He and Barbara Harlow together bring graduate students and alumni from across the disciplines to address the construction of power, demonstrating all the while the power of grassroots collaboration. In his service to the department, to the university and to a global community of activists, he inspires all with his ability to combine a great deal of work with a great deal of fun to effect a great deal of good.

It takes a village to raise a graduate student and without the mentorship of my undergraduate professors Julie Mostov, Douglas Porpora and Abioseh Porter at Drexel University it would not have occurred to me to even apply. Julie Mostov, a global leader in women's rights, taught me recognize when to fight and when to use diplomacy. She also taught me to get up and dust myself off when I get knocked down. She continued to invest in me at times when I nearly gave up on investing in myself. I dedicate this work to her, and to our dearly departed friend Dr. Vivien Thweatt. Vivien Thweatt was the director of Drexel University's International Area Studies program pioneering her way to Department head at a time when not many women made it into administration. She personally recruited me and nominated me for the A. J. Drexel Presidential Scholarship that together with a National Merit Scholarship made my undergraduate education possible. She is sorely missed. Her fire and love of a feisty debate lives on in my friendships that began in that era, most notably with John Quinn, George Labrinakos, Tracey Riper, Dana Mastrovito, Todd Lewis, and Benjamin Winjum.

Penultimately, I'd like to thank my motley friends here in Austin who have formed a family through the years. At any moment in this journey one of our members was lost, but in each other we always find a way back to the path. I must shine a spotlight on Jayita Sinha who has enriched my life as a roommate, a co-worker, and most recently recruited her husband, Sasvat Sai, to feed me while I revised. The rest of the family includes too many to name, but it would be remiss not to mention that a great deal

of my graduate education revolved around talking, reading and writing with Rachel Schneider, Simone Sessolo, Sheela Jane Menon, Tekla Schell, Cate Blouke, Foley (because rock stars only need one name), Meg Eatman, Meg Andrews, Meg Vail, Lauren Gantz, Pamela Neumann, Stephanie Odom, Dustin Stewart, Emily Bloom, Doug Coulson, Fabienne Ruppen, Mary Hedengren, Andrew Uzendoski, Miguel Santos-Neves, Marta Vacas Matos, Kevin Bourque, and the most recent addition to the family: Brice Ezell.

Finally, I owe much to the support of my new OnRamps colleagues, especially Julie Schell and Jennifer Porter, for giving me the flexibility to finish this project while implementing UT's exciting new dual enrollment rhetoric courses. I will always be grateful for the chance to join their mission and use my training to extend UT's excellent undergraduate curriculum to the high schools of Texas.

If Stones Could Argue:
The Rhetoric of Covenanter Memory, Media and Monuments

Connie Michelle Steel, PhD

The University of Texas at Austin, 2016

Supervisor: Mark Garrett Longaker

Through the cold, stony context of their relationship to human remains, cemetery monuments blur the disciplinary borders between English, linguistics, archaeology, history, architecture, art history and religious studies through the mixing of language and visual arts into integrated attention-focusing texts. From the Reformation into the Victorian era, intergenerational changes to Scottish Covenanter monumentality reveal the dynamic nature of Presbyterian evangelical rhetoric and Scottish media usage. This project engages with rhetorical genre studies to demonstrate how Scottish epitaphic genres question the cohesiveness of British identity and the assumptions of English departments about what constitutes text, genre, and media. The dissertation makes links between conversations in historiography, memory studies and rhetorics of public display through three case studies of kairos, style and exigency: Robert Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings* (1721), *The Margaret Wilson Monument* (1859) and the Valley Cemetery, Stirling, Scotland. Approaching argumentation as a *techne* of focusing attention, the project expands existing conversations about plain style, and the later "bourgeois" styles by posing memorability as a special component of monumental style. Wodrow's foundational history of the 'Killing Times' illustrates the role of martyrologies as

monuments and reveals their common exigencies with cemeteries. Turning to landmark monuments in the Valley Cemetery in Stirling, the project shows how Wodrow's martyr histories were re-recorded in stone. *The Margaret Wilson Monument's* form, content and gender highlight the challenges of extremes of kairos, mobile readership and ambiguous authorship in outdoor rhetorics of display. The project then looks past the epitaphs to the cemetery through the lens of Foucault's heterotopia. The Stirling Valley Cemetery demonstrates the way heterotopia work as media of in this case making an evangelical commentary on the changing status of the Sabbath in the Victorian period. The project ends with an epilogue looking at challenges of digitizing landmark monuments and the potential of online social databases for displaying cultural memory in a short case study of Robert Wodrow's grave page in FindaScottishgrave.com.

Table of Contents

Introductory Chapter--Monumental Resistance, Covenanter Memory and the Monolith of British Identity	1
COVENANTER MARTYR MAKING AND ITS LINKS TO SCOTTISH TEXTUALITY	6
A BRIEF HISTORY OF COVENANTER MEDIA AND MYTHOS	10
IF STONES COULD ARGUE: A NOTE ON USING YOUR WORDS	17
TOWARDS A RHETORIC OF EPITAPHIC GENRES: THE PRODUCTIVE MESSINESS OF EPIGRAPHY	26
CHAPTER DESCRIPTIONS	36
Chapter 1--An Opportune Monument:	42
Robert Wodrow's <i>History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland</i>	42
THE KAIROS OF THE HANOVERIAN SUCCESSION AND THE STORY OF A HEBREW HISTORIAN	44
WHEN IS A BOOK A MONUMENT? MUSINGS ON MONUMENTS AS INVENTIONAL MEDIA	61
CONCLUSION: THE MONUMENTAL CASE FOR INTERDISCIPLINARY RHETORICAL METHODOLOGIES	70
Chapter 2--Margaret Wilson Wasn't Buried Here?	76
What Epitaphic Genres tell us about Rhetoric & Media	76
WHO IS THE MONUMENTAL RHETOR? OR, LEARNING FROM ERECTIONS	82
MARGARET ISN'T BURIED HERE? EPITAPHS AND CENOTAPHS .	92
HIERARCHIES OF MEDIA & MONUMENTAL STYLE	98
DISRUPTIVE WOMEN, MEMORABILITY & MONUMENTAL STYLE	104
Chapter 3--The Battle for the Victorian Sabbath:	115
Entertainment, Enterprise and Evangelism in the Scottish Cemetery	115
STIRLING'S NEW VALLEY CEMETERY IN THE TIME OF HETEROTOPIA	119
THE DRUMMOND BROTHERS & AN EVANGELICAL EMPIRE	135

TOWARDS A THEORY OF LOGISTICAL APPEALS	140
Epilogue--Disorderly Arrangement: Monuments, Digitization, and Data	148
Appendix: Inscription on <i>The Margaret Wilson Monument</i>	158
Bibliography	159

Introductory Chapter--Monumental Resistance, Covenanter Memory and the Monolith of British Identity

Her name shall never be forgot
While Bladenoch's waters run,
And Solway kindles into gold
Beneath the setting sun.
They speak of it in Scotland's home,
'Tis told in far off lands,
How in the bloom of youth she died
Upon the Solway Sands.
—Rev. R. Riach Thom, 1883¹

Nothing (repeat:nothing) would surprise me about history. Scotland has large monuments to two women martyrs drowned for their faith, in spite of the fact that they weren't drowned at all and neither was a martyr anyway.
—Josephine Tey²

An old woman perched on a three-legged stool watched the crowd through the gaps between the gravestones. The cemetery teemed with the living. In the shadow of Greyfriar's Kirk, men transformed a flat topped, pedestaled slab monument into a writing desk with blotter, quills and ink. Men of the highest ranks gathered amongst the granite gravemarkers awaiting their turns to sign. Each approached the giant parchment and

¹ The epigraphs to this chapter introduce the praise and blame of Covenanters in the discourse around Margaret Wilson, a martyr by drowning. Each quote is inspired by a monument dedicated to Wilson—one producing admiration and the other ire. Her monuments are discussed in Chapter Two. Here they illustrate the polemic views of supporters and detractors to the Covenanters as their stories passed down through generations. Poem reproduced in: "Tribute in stone to a young martyr's death on the sands." *Stirling Observer*. 15 May 1985. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.

² Tey, Josephine. *The Daughter of Time*. New York: The Macmillan Company 1951. P 111.

signed their name solemnly. Then one man, instead of picking up the quill drew his knife. Anticipation rippled through the crowd, black hats bobbing excitedly. He drew the knife swiftly across his palm and cupped it. His neighbor nodded approvingly as he picked up the quill and dipped it in this living ink well. As he finished inscribing his family name, the grating sound of steel on stone signaled the whetting of knives as others prepared to do the same. Women prayed, kneeling, their hands clasped, careless of their gowns. A man knocked the mud from his boots, stepped up onto the slab and began to speak. The old woman, adjusting her black wool shawl to keep out the chill and the damp, clasped her hands and leaned forward to listen.³

This scene compiles details from histories and legends around the signing of the Covenant in Greyfriar's kirkyard in Edinburgh, Scotland on 28 February 1638. The contentious origin story of the Covenanters in the kirkyard and their later imprisonment there during a harsh winter interment are two of many foundational narratives of Scottish resistance to British identity. That resistance has been simmering on the backburner of public memory for centuries--perpetually ready to boil. Scottish national memory extends beyond canonical literary genres like ballads, novels, and poetry and spills over into material culture emerging in monuments, landscapes and museums. The later genres, directed towards audiences of mobile readers, make up the bulk of this project.

³ This scene of the signing of the Covenant of 1638 appears in stories, etchings, children's books and most recently as a panel in the *Great Tapestry of Scotland*. The tapestry project, inspired by Scottish novelist Alexander McCall Smith, presents the history of Scotland from the Ice Age forward in hand stitched panels. The panels are stitched by community groups all over Scotland. *Great Tapestry of Scotland*. Scottish Parliament Building: Edinburgh, Scotland, Summer 2014.

I first encountered narratives and monuments of Covenanters while making short cuts through the closes and cemeteries of Edinburgh on the way from the dormitory to the National Library where I was looking at the influences of the Scottish Enlightenment on human rights rhetoric. By the end of that trip, however, I realized that an even more interesting project lay in the archives of the kirkyards. At that point my short cuts became exploratory research trips. I soon realized, however, that there were too many cemeteries, too many gravestones for anyone to study in several lifetimes. User friendly, big data tools like Tableau were not yet readily available. I began to strategize how to narrow down this enormous body of texts to a dissertation-sized dataset in a way to demonstrate its potential for rhetorical studies. I choose Covenanter monuments for several reasons.

First, Covenanter monuments are a material manifestation of Scotland's myth-making. Although based on historical persons and events, Covenanter stories make myths in their transmission and reinforcement of cultural values and commonplaces to new generations of Scots. Second, Covenanter stories are an important textual export in Scotland's tourism and genealogy industries, which are inextricably intertwined with the export of Scottish identity as scrappy, resilient and resistant to English domination. Third, Covenanter monuments have been erected for a period of over three hundred years and illustrate intergenerational changes to Presbyterian form and style and their influences on Scottish national style. As such, this archive crosses the World Wars line expands the conversation. Fourth, Covenanter memorials include epitaphs and cenotaphs both inside and outside of graveyards showing how epitaphic exigencies overlap.

Finally, Covenanter memorials demonstrate what happens when the production of an occasional genre, in this case the epitaph, is interrupted. Covenanter mourners pushed the genre through time and space in innovative ways.

Having narrowed the project to this fascinating group of texts I found two major challenges to studying epitaphic genres: content and form. In terms of content, epitaphs are a bit rough to study in quantity because their common topic is death. In exploring this project, I read and photographed the gravestones of thousands of people in a dozen towns in Scotland and North England. As for Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings* the title is indicative of the content it relates a history of war, of torture and of murder in detail. Commemoration is about commiseration and martyrologies are designed to recreate pain. Insensitivity, the erosion of empathy and secondary trauma are real dangers in work of this sort.

The challenge of epitaphic form is that the available analytical toolbox is simultaneously under and over developed in that epitaphs appear in so many forms, materials and venues. Pinning down the epitaph to a particular form involves complex prioritization. Unless, of course, one decides that pinning down the genre to just one form misses out on the very diversity that makes the genre special. The epitaph is defined by the unifying cultural needs of honoring and recoding the dead—the material form is one of many design decisions made by commemorators. Therefore, each chapter addresses a different material form of monument representing several different semiotic layers of epitaphic complexity.

To display key features of form and content in Scotland's Covenanter monuments, the dissertation makes two parallel progressions at the chapter level. There is a chronological progression through the history of Scottish rhetoric in the context of Presbyterian politics. There is also a semiotic progression from the familiar form of Wodrow's book for which we have a well-developed analytical tool kit to the materially complex composite form of Drummond's statuary cenotaph. The dissertation then segues to a set of Reformation monuments in the heterotopia of the Stirling Valley cemetery. The project ends by looking forward in time to contemporary remediations of Covenanter monuments into online databases like Findagrave.com and their potential to be monuments in their own right. The epilogue brings the project full cycle back to Wodrow with a miniature case study of the page recording his gravestone.

Along the way, the dissertation experiments with how to give the reader some experience of epigraphic reading while still staying within the prose conventions of a dissertation. I do this in four experiments. First, each chapter begins with a pair of epigraphs about epitaphs illustrating the allographic and polyvocal aspects of wall writing. Second, each chapter opens with an ekphrastic description of the physical experiences of the composition, use or interpretation of monuments. The one exception is a chapter opening with an analysis of exactly that sort of description from the work of Sir Walter Scott. Third, the role of footnotes is expanded to divide the text into symbolic above ground and underground sections. The underground section contains both corpses and scholarly corpus, working interdependently with the above ground section that contains the walking paths approaching monuments. Finally, at the level of the sub

section each passage represents a pathway to reading epitaphs from different theoretical angles. As in a graveyard, some of these passages sharply turn corners, while others flow with clear lines of sight into the next section.

COVENANTER MARTYR MAKING AND ITS LINKS TO SCOTTISH TEXTUALITY

Scottish epitaphic genres question not only the cohesiveness of British identity but also the assumptions of English departments on what constitutes text, genre, and media. Through the context of their relationship to human remains, monuments in general and cemetery genres in particular, blur the disciplinary borders between English, linguistics, archaeology, history, architecture, art history and religious studies through their mixing of language and visual arts into integrated texts. Epitaphs, the inscriptions appearing on tombstones, have long posed a problem for scholars of semiotics and literature alike as their meaning depends on much more than the linguistic value of words for composing or interpreting a text. In this sense epitaphic texts have much in common with their multimodal and multimedia digital relatives on the internet. Both pose challenges to the frequently unacknowledged materialist assumptions undergirding the ways academic disciplines territorialize objects of study.

Currently, Scottish separatists, and tour guides alike, pull from a vivid and active Scottish public memory written in histories, inscribed on stones, and digitized onto the internet. Separatists pulled from a vivid and active public memory including five prominent national level foundational narratives of William Wallace, Mary Queen of

Scots, the Covenanters, the Jacobite Rebellions, and the Highland Clearances. Written in histories, inscribed on stones, and digitized onto the internet, these narratives have reached the status of legend forming cultural myth as noted above. Grounded in historic events and persons, Scottish mythmaking provides rich soil for commonplaces and tropes tied to a legacy of persistent resistance to outside rule and outside influence. In spite of drastically different historical context, each legend offers common values of courage, ideological steadfastness, unbending will, loyalty unto death, and endurance in the face of physical hardship. Internationally known Scottish authors such as Jane Porter, Sir Walter Scott, Joanna Baillie, and Ian Rankin have been inspired to create characters, plots or settings from these five historical narratives spreading them to audiences far beyond the British Isles.

The Covenanter stories in particular connect powerfully to the history of Scottish rhetoric and media. These resistive rhetorics follow similar patterns in their approach to memorializing violent altercations by simultaneously assigning praise to the dead and blame to their killers through rhetorics of martyrdom. Scottish martyr stories celebrate a courageous loss as fervently as a military win asserting a value system in which the intrinsic unconquerable nature of a hero matters more than the extrinsic defeat of his or her material body.

Representations of Covenanters and Covenanter monuments appear in the works of Robert Burns,⁴ Sir Walter Scott,⁵ Robert Louis Stevenson,⁶ Ian Rankin,⁷ and Alexander McCall Smith,⁸ as well as in that of writers in the Scottish diaspora like Alice Munro, the award winning Canadian short story writer.⁹ What is particularly striking about these print works is their intimate dialectic with monuments of Covenanters, particularly their graves and epitaphs. This project examines how Covenanter epitaphs and monuments blur the disciplinary borders between English, linguistics, archaeology, history, architecture, art history and religious studies through the cold, stony context of burial and human remains and the hybridization of language and visual arts into integrated texts.

The connections between the formation of public memory and the formation of literary canons rest on the borders of disciplines obscured by paradigms of textual legitimacy grounded in the materiality of objects. The monuments from which the abovementioned authors draw inspiration are as neglected in scholarly circles as old inscriptions in weed-choked kirkyards. Epitaphs in their sheer diversity of material forms

⁴ Burns, Robert. "On the Battle of Sheriff-Muir." *The Works of Robert Burns: with an account of his life, and a criticism on his writings*. Vol 4. Liverpool 1800. P 443. *Eighteenth Century Collections Online*. Web. 29 April 2016.

⁵ Scott, Walter. *Old Mortality. Rob Roy. The Heart of Midlothian*.

⁶ Stevenson, Robert Louis. "The Pentland Rising: A page of history 1666." Also, "Chapter Five: Grey Friars" of *Edinburgh: Picturesque Notes* contains descriptions of Greyfriars Kirkyard as well as a macabre account of the reunion and reburial of the skulls of five martyrs with their bodies 45 years after their execution in 1681.

⁷ Rankin, Ian. *Fleshmarket Alley*. See also, Rankin, Ian. "Creating Rebus." <http://www.ianrankin.net/pages/content/index.asp?PageID=149>. Web. Accessed 25 March 2016.

⁸ Alexander McCall Smith invokes the Covenanter's prison in *The Forgotten Affairs of Youth: an Isabel Dalhousie Novel*. He also initiated the *Great Tapestry* project described below.

⁹ Munro, Alice. *The View from Castle Rock*. See also: Hay, Eldon. *The Covenanters in Canada: Reformed Presbyterianism from 1820 to 2012*. Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 2012.

depend on more than the linguistic value of words for meaning posing a problem for scholars of semiotics and literature. If books, art and buildings talk to each other at the level of discourse, why do scholars seem reluctant to talk about them together? And does the ‘average’ reader of monuments recognize the same borders? What is the difference between a text being delivered to the reader and the reader being delivered to the text?

In much of Scotland’s urban centers graveyards and monuments form a normal part of the landscape of daily life for a nation in which one-third of workers and two-thirds of students walk or take public transport to work or school.¹⁰ These commuters combined with considerable numbers of tourists cutting across town squares, plodding through plazas and sneaking through cemeteries constitute a dynamic mobile readership—the target audience of the rhetoric of monuments. In 2013, the number of overnight tourism trips per year was nearly triple that of the population of the Scotland. Domestic tourism accounted for 43% of those trips, 38% from England, and 17% from overseas meaning that the majority of monument visitors have some personal stake in British identity, but that stake varies in perspective.¹¹

Although Scotland today is considerably more diverse in terms of religion and ethnicity than the Scotland of the eighteenth century, the Church of Scotland remains the

8 In contrast, United States Census Bureau data reveals that the daily mobile audience for monuments might be much smaller as 86% of employees drive to work in the United States. See McKenzie, Brian, and Melanie Rapino. *Commuting in the United States: 2009*. American Community Survey Reports, ACS-15. Washington, DC: US Census Bureau 2011. Web. 6 July 2015. <http://www.census.gov/prod/2011pubs/acs-15.pdf>. See also, Transport Scotland’s statistics and report by the Scottish government. “Scottish Transport Statistics No 32 2013 Edition.” *TransportScotland.gov*. <http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/statistics/j285663-03.htm>. Scotland: National Statistics 2013. Web 29 April 2016.

¹¹ VisitScotland. *Scotland: the Key Facts on Tourism in 2013*. Edinburgh: VisitScotland 2014. Web. 6 July 2015. http://www.visitscotland.org/research_and_statistics/tourismstatistics.aspx.

official, if no longer mandatory, religious institution. The differences between the Churches of England and Scotland go much deeper than name and reveal deep-seated cultural differences in the seemingly United Kingdom. Since the Reformation, the Episcopalians and Presbyterians have disagreed to the point of bloodshed on a number of theological doctrines ranging from church hierarchy to biblical interpretation with serious implications for lifestyle and aesthetics. Situated firmly in these conversations, Covenanter monuments make a Calvinist metacommentary on the content of form and form of content through a monumental plain style. From the Reformation into the Victorian era, intergenerational changes to Covenanter monumentality reveal the dynamic nature of Presbyterian evangelic rhetoric and Scottish media usage.

A BRIEF HISTORY OF COVENANTER MEDIA AND MYTHOS

Arguments for independence in the postcolonial period draw heavily on historically situated identities built on representations of pre-colonial people and events. It is still controversial to consider Scotland as colonized due to their ambiguous position as both oppressed by and benefiting from the British imperial system.¹² Nonetheless it is undeniable that enthymemes, commonplaces and temporalities associated with what

¹² For this view, see Neil Davidson's Marxist revisionist history in which he poses the question "oppressed or oppressor nation?" Davidson's work protests historiographies of nationhood that retroactively presume consensus of national identity at the expense of minority groups (in this case Highland culture). Thus he intervenes in conversations about nationalism and nation state. While provocative, Davidson's retelling of Scottish history leaves out women, as well as any analysis of feminine representations of Scotland (notably as Caledonia in the rough wooing and again during the Union). Davidson, Neil. *The Origins of Scottish Nationhood*. Richmond, VA: Pluto Press, 2000.

Gayatri Spivak famously called “the subaltern” find their way into Scottish discourse.¹³ A model enthymeme for identity based independence arguments has features like these: *we should be free. We have the right (or responsibility or obligation) to restore the legacy of our ancestors because they were free.* At an even more basic level there exists the underlying assumption that *our ancestors were a group, therefore, we are also members of that group (and groups should act together).* Often the group is given character traits codifying a value system of heroes and villains. Thus, depending on who’s talking, the Covenanters were a bit of both.

The Covenanter movement gained power in Scotland after the Reformation in the first half of the seventeenth century until the Wars of the Three Kingdoms when Oliver Cromwell (1599-1658) routed them and dismantled the Scottish navy (c. 1653). Due to irreconcilable theological and political disagreements the Covenanters fell out of favor with the Stuart dynasty.¹⁴ Consequently, while the Restoration of Charles II in 1660 may have brought comedy and theater to England, it brought the quartering of government troops in Scotland.¹⁵ Covenanting and Covenanters were outlawed creating ambivalent situations in which the same persons might be styled as heroes and villains, as martyrs and fanatics. By twenty-first century standards the situation degraded to armed conflict

¹³ Spivak, Gayatri. Rosalind Morris, ed. *Can the Subaltern Speak? Reflections on the History of an Idea.* New York: Columbia Press, 2010.

¹⁴ The theological disagreements were compounded by the Covenanters’ perceived complicity in the sudden fatal shortening of Charles I. The Covenanters had handed him over to Cromwell’s allies, but claimed no foreknowledge of the coming regicide. The Covenanters quickly embraced his heir and rejected Cromwell—a little too enthusiastically for either ruler’s taste.

¹⁵ See T. C. Smout’s critique of Marxist historiographies in the context of Scotland’s timeline of industrial development. Smout, T.C. *A Century of the Scottish People, 1830-1950.* Glasgow: Fontana Press 1987. Print.

with actions now classified as terrorism on one side, or tyranny on the other. The dismemberment and display of Covenanter bodies warned, intimidated, and ultimately inflamed the public making visceral texts of the media of human remains.¹⁶

The outlaw status of the Covenanters under the reigns of Charles II (r. 1649-1685) and James VII and II (r. 1685-1688) restricted their access to the public genres associated with mourning and grieving. Estimates vary with the politics of historiography but somewhere between 10,000 to 18,000 were martyred during the “Killing Times” from 1660 to 1688 and more were transported to the colonies. According to many accounts Presbyterians faced economic reprisals, such as the quartering of soldiers on their property.¹⁷ These factors significantly interrupted erection of epitaphs and monumental genres as it affected the legal status of bodies living or dead across large swaths of Scotland. In addition to the restrictions on contact with living Covenanters, illegally buried Covenanters were vulnerable to being dug up by the authorities and the bodies hanged or re-hanged post mortem.

Armed conflict subsided with the Revolution Settlement of 1689-90. After several rounds of negotiations with King William, Presbyterian government was established for the Church of Scotland. The negotiations, however, exacerbated the

¹⁶ In the town of Ayr, local monuments tell of a group of eight Covenanters scheduled to be executed together. The hangman refused to do his job. In the end, the condemned were offered a deal that one could live if he agreed to hang the others. Seven men were hanged. Afterwards, their heads and hands were removed and put on display their body parts become media for a powerful message of intimidation to the local populace. The commemorative stone in the yard of the Auld Kirk of Ayr eloquently responds: “Boots, thumbkins, gibbets were in fashion then/LORD let us never see such Days again.” The Hamilton Covenanter Memorial tells a similar tale of the seventeenth century use of human remains as a textual medium claiming to only mark the heads of the four remembered there. Their bodies and hands were sent as messages to other towns.

¹⁷ See, Cowan, Ian B. *The Scottish Covenanters: 1660-88*. London: Victor Gollancz 1976. Smout, T.C. *A Century of the Scottish People, 1560-1830*. London: Fontana Press 1972.

Scottish split into Presbyterian and Episcopalian factions. As a result, the century ended groups on the one end of the religious political spectrum such as the Cameronians, a remaining militant arm of the Covenanter movement who disapproved of Presbyterian compromises, and on the other extreme, Gaelic-speaking Highlanders who resisted Presbyterianism in general. These tensions sparked anew in the reign of the Anglican Queen Anne with the prospect of an Anglo-Scottish Union. Perhaps ironically, it is during the Hanoverian Succession of a new Luthern dynasty that the interrupted public commemoration of the Covenanter dead began in earnest with martyrologies like Robert Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland* (1721-2).¹⁸

Perhaps the only thing more fraught than Covenanter relations with the Stuart dynasty was their relationship to media. The Covenanting movement can be seen as an extension of the Reformation. The Reformation is a problematic period for scholars in multiple disciplines as it featured the destruction of art, culture and knowledge with the expansion of certain kinds of rights, infrastructures and political forms now associated with cultural narratives of democratic or economic progress. The Covenanters fell on the Calvinist end of the Reformation spectrum forming their doctrine from John Knox's teachings upon his return from Geneva. Knox's followers found Catholic religious art and iconography blasphemous, idolatrous and heretical.

Covenanters found idolatry intolerable and destroyed the majority of Scotland's Renaissance-era sculptures, paintings, murals, stained glass windows, plays, and

¹⁸ See Jeffrey Stephen's engaging history of the religious politics of this period. Stephen, Jeffrey. *Scottish Presbyterians and the Act of Union 1707*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 2007.

altarpieces on principle.¹⁹ In some areas even church buildings were burnt or pulled down, including the Royal Chapel at Stirling Castle.²⁰ Attitudes about idolatry applied not only to the content of the piece but to form as well, and production slowed or halted in a variety of genres and media. In sum, these iconoclasms rewrote the material landscape of public memory by silencing many of the material expressions of older Catholic value systems. In contrast, Scottish Calvinists actively promoted universal male literacy as a means to the individual reading of the Bible. The Covenanters made the construction of primary schools a national goal. Thus one finds that as arts and images were dashed down, the Word rose to take their place. By the beginning of the 18th century print texts became the dominant media in Scotland.

Radical Reformation changes to social, legal and theological structures extended to the burial of human remains, funereal genres, and monuments. Prior to the Reformation, bodies were buried under and in the churches. Calvinists, together with many other Protestant denominations, move burial to the yard around churches. Knox's specific influence moved the location of bodies relative to the church and subsequently impacted the grammar and arrangement of cemeteries. Suffice it to say that Knox felt excessive grieving was superstitious and earthly. Churches were for the living and not for the dead. A Presbyterian plain style of monumentality quickly developed corresponding to the plain styles associated with Scottish writing, speeches, and dress. At first, Knox's minimalist views on funerals and monuments were inconsistently

¹⁹ Wendel, Francois. Trans. Philip Mairet. *Calvin: Origins and Development of his Religious Thought*. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Books 1987. 284-290.

²⁰ Yeoman, Peter. *Stirling Castle: Official Souvenir Guide*. Historic Scotland: United Kingdom 2011.

adopted at first as Scots of various ranks and classes had long-standing traditions they were reluctant to relinquish. In some areas, persons of means continued older practices in exchange for paying a fine.

The first major group monument to the Covenanters came in the form of a book. Robert Wodrow's martyrology, *History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland from the Restoration to the Revolution* (1721), sought to memorialize the Covenanter dead and defend their honor to George I, the new monarch and founder of the dynasty that continues to wear the crown today.²¹ As Covenanters for all intents and purposes regained legal status, their surviving descendants finally began erecting gravestones and memorials to mark the last known locations of bodies, body parts, and executions. Since then, new Covenanter monuments, and significant restoration projects, have ebbed and flowed with the tides of denominational and nationalist tension.²²

Scottish plain style monuments question the divisions commonly made between form and content in the study of genre. Easily mistaken as boring, terse or merely underfunded, plain style monuments comment on textuality itself by asserting the values

²¹ Wodrow, Robert. *The History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland, from the Restauration to the Revolution: Collected from the Publick Records, Original Papers, and Manuscripts of that Time, and other well attested Narratives*. Vol. 1 Edinburgh: Printed by James Watson, His Majesty's Printer. MDCCXXI (1721). Print. Harry Ransom Center, Austin, TX.

²² The most recent public monument referencing the Covenanters was completed in late 2013, and displayed in 2014. The Great Tapestry of Scotland, a community-based work spear-headed by novelist Alexander McCall Smith, features a panel linking the Covenanters with public education in its 143-meter long celebration of Scottish history from the ice age to the present. The work also includes panels depicting William Wallace, Mary Queen of Scots, the Jacobite Rebellion, and the Highland Clearances. Stitched by more than a thousand hands, the tapestry's inaugural display occurred not in a graveyard, but rather in the Aberdeen Art Gallery, before moving to the lobby of the Scottish Parliament Building for the months leading up to the Referendum. A digitized version is available online at <http://www.scotlandstapestry.com/>. *Great Tapestry of Scotland*. Scottish Parliament Building: Edinburgh, Scotland, Summer 2014.

of the group with a publicly recognizable identity in resistance to the ideologies implied in the styles of surrounding denominations. Plain style epitaphs on Scottish tombstones have the striking simplicity of book title pages that modestly advertise the memory of a single human life or the saga of an entire family.

The emphasis on plain style in graveyards begins to subtly shift at the end of the eighteenth century as Presbyterian leadership transitioned from Covenanter outlaws preaching to hillside crowds to Lowlander moderates sermonizing in pulpits to the middle class.²³ Plain style makes persuasive gestures of religious identity involving choices of material, space and rituals influencing all aspects of the fine arts and is not limited to humility tropes. In its exploration of monumental plain style the project expands existing conversations about Quaker, Puritan, and the later “bourgeois” styles occurring in the UK and North America.²⁴

These monuments tell a tale of rhetors adapting and changing in the face of legal, social, economic and religious interruptions to genres. Thus, by following the thread of the Covenanters through Scottish public memory, this dissertation aspires to reveal the shifting historical influences on rhetorical genres through the regulation of media. By the nineteenth century, although the strict aesthetics of Covenanter and Calvinist thinking relaxed, the mythos around the Covenanters and John Knox continued to inspire new monuments. Nineteenth century Scots raised new forms of statuary monuments to honor

²³ Paterson, Raymond Campbell. *A Land Afflicted: Scotland and the Covenanter Wars, 1638-1690*. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers 1998.

²⁴ See, Clark, Gregory. *Rhetorical Landscapes in America: Variations on a Theme From Kenneth Burke*. N.p.: University of South Carolina Press, 2004. Print. Longaker, Mark. *Rhetorical Style and Bourgeois Virtue: Capitalism and Civil Society in the British Enlightenment*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania University Press 2015.

ancestors who would have disapproved strongly of the modes and genres in which they were being represented. The course of monumentality reveals that Scottish Presbyterian culture underwent significant changes in style and decorum, which represent deep changes in the value-laden relationship between rhetors and interpreters.

IF STONES COULD ARGUE: A NOTE ON USING YOUR WORDS

While working with graduate writing instructors, I noticed that the default resonance of the term “visual rhetoric” falls somewhere in the area of “non-print” and/or “non-linguistic” and often became mixed up in ideas about digital literacies or new media. In these discussions, various, creative, often awkward explanations of visual rhetoric emerged like “texts that do not rely on words as the primary vehicle of meaning” or “texts that rely on electricity for their primary interface.” These conversations revealed that although we clearly distinguish between texts with lots of words and texts with lots of pictures, analytic vocabularies have not caught up to current needs.

For example, researching epitaphs on a longer historical timeline from the Reformation forward causes one to pause over terms like “visual rhetoric” and “visual media.” Until the second half of the twentieth century the large majority of recorded media was visual in the sense of depending on human sight, with the exception of systems like braille. Print media relies on the visual organ and the brain’s ability to process visual input but it does not necessarily depend on literacy. In other words, definitions of rhetoric have become increasing literacy and technology dependent and oscillate wildly between the overly narrow and the presumptively broad. The persistent

distinction of visual, digital, (and now spatial) rhetoric from some other purer type of rhetoric indicates an ongoing epistemological discomfort over which media and which modalities can be accepted as sources of persuasion and by implication the legitimate production of knowledge. Therefore, the (in)acceptability of the notion ‘if stones could argue’ hinges upon the interrelated definitions of text, of argumentation and of rhetoric itself. In highly specialized subfields like argumentation, further hierarchies can be seen within the accepted locus of texts, some classified as merely rhetorical, while others are accepted as argumentation.

The tug of war over definitions of argumentation, however, extends beyond the esoteric levels of peer-reviewed scholarship and still permeates the composition textbooks used to educate first and second-year college writers making this far from a dead debate. Compare, for example, the definition of argumentation provided in Williams and Colomb’s *The Craft of Argument* (2007) with that of Wysocki and Lynch in *Compose Design Advocate: a rhetoric or integrating written, visual, and oral communication* (2007). Williams and Colomb’s textbook gestures towards a limited inclusion of carefully curated images in argumentation, teaching undergraduates that arguments require words, but they can also harness the power of images. With new digital tools, you have more ways than ever to create images that make your evidence, and so your argument, come alive for your readers...But just as a story

does not make an argument, neither does a visual image alone: arguments always need words that state at least a claim and supporting reasons.²⁵

Although this definition includes images, its adamant insistence that students prioritize words echoes hierarchies of texts handed down from eighteenth-century Scottish rhetoric manuals. The definition limits images to adding the stylistic quality of vividness, or ekphrasis to an argument. The potential for images as inartistic proofs, or as a display of forensic evidence remains neglected.

The tussle over terms carries undertones of a legacy of Protestant Reformation theological debates over the values of word and image. Scotland in the period 1600-1900 represents a particularly strong case of Reformation values being implemented at the level of daily cultural experience including the rules for rhetorical engagement. As illustrated above in the case of the Covenanters, media can be controlled through any combination of direct legal regulation, economic forces, and cultural-ideological hierarchies. Although the current history of rhetoric canon's Scottish section focuses on George Campbell's *Philosophy of Rhetoric* (1776) and Hugh Blair's *Lectures on Rhetoric and Belles Lettres* (1783), the preceding work of Henry Home, Lord Kames' *Elements of Criticism* (1761) was almost as widely read and taught. Kames, raised Episcopalian and later converting to Presbyterian, included a chapter about the potential of gardens and architecture to move (and morally improve) a viewer. His work was interpreted as attempting too broad an approach by the later Blair and Campbell. While Campbell and

²⁵ Williams, Joseph and Gregory Colomb. *The Craft of Argument*. 3rd ed. New York: Pearson Longman 2007, 15.

Blair clearly prioritize the word and language, Kames presents analysis of literature, oration, drama, gardens and architecture without as clear a hierarchy.²⁶ By the late eighteenth-century a shift in power from orthodox contingents to moderates in the Presbyterian Assembly slowly translated into changes in media usage.

An alternative approach to argumentation involves an emphasis not on words, but on attention, which subtly pivots the focal point of the rhetorical relationship from the rhetor's creation of the text towards the audience's interpretation of it. Wysocki and Lynch teach this view: "when we use 'argument' in this book then, we generally want you to have in mind a piece of communication whose purpose is to focus the audience's attentions in particular ways."²⁷ The "design" in the title of Wysocki and Lynch's textbook alludes to the Stanford influenced emphasis on "design thinking" and the move towards design as a discipline in its own right akin to engineering.²⁸ This definition coincides with a resurgent interest in audience not only for rhetoric, but in STEM disciplines as well where it is called empathy.²⁹ Wysocki and Lynch's design-centric model of composition offers students a spectrum of argumentation from the formal to the informal (similar to the categories explicit and implicit used by other scholars). Their spectrum is presented as a vertical diagram with the formal structures of word based syllogistic choices at the top and the informal at the bottom. Sometimes the controls of

²⁶ Kames' work included a chapter specifically addressing the possibilities of gardens and architecture as texts. Kames, Henry Home, Lord. *Elements of Criticism*. Indianapolis: Liberty Fund 2005.

²⁷ Wysocki, Anne Frances and Dennis A. Lynch. *Compose design advocate: a rhetoric for integrating written, visual, and oral communication*. New York: Pearson Longman 2007, 18.

²⁸ See the Stanford Design Thinking Crash course for its employment of empathy in the design process. This methodological use of empathy bears considerable emphasis to the notions of audience analysis used by rhetoricians since the classical period. <http://dschool.stanford.edu/dgift/>

²⁹ Science, Technology, Engineering and Math (STEM)

prior generations linger in the jargon and frameworks of criticism, their default resonances sounding descriptive until close scrutiny reveals underlying proscriptive or prescriptive values. Thus, one finds a bit of Reformation-era media hierarchy sneaking in through the design of an image in a textbook self-consciously attempting to disrupt the control of words over the art of argumentation.

Both textbooks yield clues to the source of argumentative anxiety—the notion that human emotions could at any moment override human logic and disrupt rationality. Even Williams and Colomb clarify and concede that “we cannot support a claim based on feelings alone. We can’t justify a claim simply by saying how strongly we feel about it.”³⁰ The problem some have with considering images as argumentation can be broken down into simple claims with implied beliefs as follows: words control meaning. Control is precision, and precision is good. Images don’t have words, therefore, images are uncontrolled. Images are imprecise, and imprecision can be misunderstood. Being misunderstood is potentially bad, and should be avoided. Images evoke emotion, and disproportionate emotion panders to irrationality. Argumentation, it follows, is a method of controlling the message to make sure one is not misunderstood. Images, therefore, must be used cautiously.³¹

³⁰ Williams, Joseph and Gregory Colomb. *The Craft of Argument*. 3rd ed. New York: Pearson Longman 2007. P 15.

³¹ One text book, originally from 1978, but released again recently, begins with an epigraph framed as a Credo:

Don’t write merely to be understood.
Write so that you cannot possibly be misunderstood.
--Robert Louis Stevenson (1850-1894)

Bates, Jefferson. *Writing with Precision: How to Write So That You Cannot Possibly Be Misunderstood*. New York: Penguin 2000.

Anxiety over the idea that images could have such a strong emotional pull that humans would lose control and have no rational free choice seems derived from oversimplifications about human nature. Two oversimplifications in particular appear to have been codified into Western writing pedagogies where words correspond to phonetic alphabets: first that images have no logic and second that images only provoke emotions³². These two statements seem redundant only if one holds that logic is the polar opposite of emotion. The statements become more distinct if one accepts logic and emotions as two of several coexisting humanistic qualities that together manifest in the rational citizen. Or, as Wycoski and Lynch uncomfortably concede: “sometimes informal arguments will contain small formal argumentative structures, and sometimes a formal argument will start with an appeal to your emotions.”³³ The emphasis on control in argumentation depends on the precision of words--a paradoxical emphasis considering the assumptions of interpretative choice and free will used in models of civic discourse that distinguish the art of rhetoric from coercion or pandering.

Thinking of epitaphs as persuasive texts presents epistemological challenges for the material territorialities of academic disciplines. The term monument is itself rooted in the material expression of the exigency of memory and not in an exigency of any specific material. In other words monumental media include every material humans have been able to get their opposable thumbs on from wood to marble to granite to bronze to cast

³² The hierarchical distinction between phonetic and pictogram forms of writing in Scottish rhetoric handbooks is further elaborated in Chapter 2.

³³ Wysocki, Anne Frances and Dennis A. Lynch. *Compose design advocate: a rhetoric for integrating written, visual, and oral communication*. New York: Pearson Longman 2007. P 18-19.

iron to paper to plastic to silicon. Furthermore, monumental traditions stretch back to the classical period making it temporally difficult to neatly nail them down with a single theory of rhetoric as the only constant of persuasion is its intimate relationship to the creation of power and its tendency to reach new heights with each new empire. While these epistemological problems have no clear solutions, I side with those who hold a broader view of how we acquire knowledge and meaning.

A shift in resources towards the consideration of material aspects of texts may change the ways scholars choose to critique and teach texts in coming years. For example, the Andrew Mellon Foundation has for several years been funding material approaches to multiple disciplines in post docs and junior research grants at multiple universities in the United States and Europe.³⁴ This shift in funding was about fifty years in the making. Scholars in semiotics became interested in the extended dimensions of textuality since at least the 1940s. Bibliographers started identifying themselves as bibliographic and textual studies by the 1990s. In rhetoric and composition waves of ideas around discourse theory and later new media have reflected similar concerns. These trends could radically change scholarly explorations of British rhetoric opening up untapped archives as the materials serving as legitimate vehicles of knowledge and meaning diversify.

D. F. McKenzie defines the text by referring to its Latinate origins gesturing to the mutual origins of text and textile. McKenzie's definition of text adapts with

³⁴ This work is a case in point. My first research trip to Scotland was sponsored by the Social Science Research Council's Mellon funded Dissertation Proposal Development Fellowship.

technological innovation: “to include verbal, visual, oral, and numeric data, in the form of maps, prints, and music, of archives of recorded sound, of films, videos, and any computer-stored information, everything in fact from epigraphy to the latest forms of discography. There is no evading the challenge which those new forms have created.”³⁵ This notion of the text weaves together possibilities for meaning making in both content and form. Furthermore, it leaves room for both technological advancements and historical work. Finally, McKenzie’s definition of the text is compatible with the Burkean revival of Aristotelian definitions of rhetoric as consisting of “all available means of persuasion.”³⁶

This broad Aristotelian definition of rhetoric was revitalized in the late twentieth century by scholarly interest in the work of Kenneth Burke and picked up further momentum in the early twenty-first century. Aristotle’s triad of major rhetorical genres includes deliberative (aka legislative or public decision making), judicial (forensic) and epideictic (praise and blame). Advocates for rethinking epideictic rhetoric as a form of public argumentation find strong support in the work of Jeffrey Walker³⁷. Walker’s work takes the all-available-means approach to tease out the persuasiveness of categories of

³⁵ McKenzie, D.F. *Bibliography and the Sociology of Texts*. New York: Cambridge University Press 1999. P 13.

³⁶ Although this essay primarily participates in conversations in rhetoric studies, this dissertation pulls its definition of the text from parallel conversations that appear in the subfield areas of bibliographic and textual studies (BTS). The canonicity of Continental philosophy could perhaps be to blame for the shortage of cross-fertilization among BTS and rhetoric specialists. English departments are perhaps too modest about sharing much less promoting their own disciplinary specific knowledge beyond the toolbox of close reading. There is still a tendency to direct graduate students back to the same dog-eared volumes of Foucault, Derrida and Lacan without considering the exciting and relevant theories often occurring down the hall or two buildings over.

³⁷ Jeff Walker takes this view of Aristotle’s definition of rhetoric in much of his work. See Walker, Jeffrey. *The Genuine Teachers of This Art: Rhetorical Education in Antiquity*. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press 2011. Pp 1-5.

classical poetry. Laurent Pernot, who allies himself with Walker's work in his introduction to *Epideictic Rhetoric: Questioning the Stakes of Ancient Praise* includes funeral speeches as one of the original epideictic genres.³⁸ While Walker and Pernot mainly focus on the role of orality and speech writing, and while monuments certainly feature inscriptions with words that is not their sole function. Inherent in monumentality is the idea of storing memories in media. Storing memories, however, is not enough, the memories must also be shared to be maintained in public memory and to perpetuate culture.

Therefore, I turn to Lawrence Prelli's collection *Rhetorics of Display* makes room for "visual," "spatial" and "demonstrative" media in the epideictic category. Building off Walker's expansion of epideictic rhetoric, Prelli includes cemeteries and monuments under the analytical category of rhetorics of display.³⁹ This project connects the notion of epideictic rhetorics of display to Foucault's theory of the heterotopia. Foucault provides a conceptualization of cultural spaces as texts and uses cemeteries, hospitals and museums as primary illustrations of heterotopia. By putting Prelli's concept of rhetorics of display into conversation with Foucault, I hope to reveal the diverse ways in which epitaphic texts work in combination to build rich, nuanced textual spaces and demonstrate the successful rhizomatous adaptation of a classical epideictic genre to the rapidly changing needs of Scottish Reformation culture.

³⁸ Pernot, Laurent. *Epideictic Rhetoric: Questioning the Stakes of Ancient Praise*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press 2015. P ix.

³⁹ Prelli, Lawrence J. "Rhetorics of Display: An Introduction." In *Rhetorics of Display*. Ed. Lawrence J. Prelli. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina 2006. P 1-9.

TOWARDS A RHETORIC OF EPITAPHIC GENRES: THE PRODUCTIVE MESSINESS OF EPIGRAPHY

The epitaph, often associated with epigrams when short or elegies when long, ranks low in the canons of poetry due to its lack of consistent formal rules of length or rhyme scheme. Similarly, in rhetoric studies epitaphs are rarely evaluated for their own claims or poetics, they are most often used as illustrations or evidence in historiographic claims about the cultures of classical Greece and Rome.⁴⁰ The limitation of epitaphs to evidence of dead civilizations belies their importance as documents and emphasizes their object nature as artifacts.

Notwithstanding the iconic depictions of cemeteries featuring neat rows of headstones seen in popular movies and shows, or the clichéd “RIP” stamped onto mass-produced candy wrappers each Halloween, the epitaph is a very genre. The messiness of the epitaph lies in the slipperiness of its relationship to media—is it a stone media or a print media? Is it a linguistic form, or an art form? Is it a literary genre or a rhetorical genre? An occasional genre or an administrative genre? The short answer is: yes, the epitaph is and does all these things. The rich variety in epitaphic forms reflects the variety of ways humans creatively commemorate the dead. Epitaphic genres defy semiotic boundaries in their shifting formal structures yet somehow always remaining recognizable in their rhizomatous adaptations.

⁴⁰ Jeffrey Walker’s work breathes life into the genre of ancient grave markers, notably in his analysis of Thrason’s epitaph. Walker, Jeffrey. *Rhetoric and Poetics in Antiquity*. New York: Oxford University Press 2000.

The common types of graveyard epitaphs consisting of names and dates recorded on stone receive little scholarly notice unless the name recorded happens to belong to a figure of historical significance. Covenanter memory often works like the ensemble cast on a popular TV show--the memory of the group looms larger than the names of its members. Representations of martyred Covenanters have been created, remediated, reused and recycled in multiple waves of Scottish political rhetorics from the early eighteenth century onwards starting with the publication of Wodrow's *History of the Suffering of the Scottish Church* into the twenty-first century separatist movement. The lack of an attributed erector of many monumental works further contributes to creating the effect of a self-authoring text blurring the line between the persona of the author and the representation of the commemorated dead.⁴¹

For some scholars the solution to this messiness lies in whittling the epitaph down to a neater twig chopping away inconvenient branches. Others attempt to include all the material variations on the epitaph creating an archive so large and so long-lived that it, like the great redwoods, is impossible to see it in its entirety. These approaches make important statements about the available disciplinary toolkits for the epitaph and reveal important areas for expansion.

For example, Joshua Scodel's book *The English Poetic Epitaph: Commemoration and Conflict from Jonson to Wordsworth* (1991) raises the issue of how to address the

⁴¹ Texts can have a Galatea effect on an audience (and not the one described by sociologists regarding workers and their bosses). Static media are sometimes described as "performing" or "embodying" this or that notion, when what is actually occurring is an interpretation of iconicity or similar appearance by the viewer. Given the relationship of epitaphic genres to actual human bodies, terms relating to iconicity and media receive preference to terms relating to performance or embodiment. It is the interpreter who breathes life into a text.

frequent deviations of epitaphs from the canons of poetry. Scodel, as a literary critic, simply narrows his scope to epitaphs appearing in “poetic” forms in England. Although one of the chapters addresses monumental forms, the rest focus on “the most important poetic epitaphs.”⁴² Scodel’s approach to the archive can best be described as author centric in which “major English poets” rise to the top.⁴³ He emphasizes the works of already canonical authors Ben Jonson, John Donne, Thomas Carew, James Shirley, Richard Crashaw, Robert Herrick, Andrew Marvell, John Dryden, Samuel Johnson, Alexander Pope, Thomas Gray and William Wordsworth in what he describes as the flourishing period of the epitaph as a literary genre. Scodel’s work represents one materialist approach to the epitaph genre by privileging the standards of print forms. Scodel’s approach grouping pieces with similar formal qualities is certainly one time honored way of bounding a genre as is picking exemplary samples from the works of famous authors.

Similarly, Scott Newstok identifies issues with from declaring that until the end of the Renaissance the epitaph was: “a fairly porous term” with “taxonomic schemes—which variously place the epitaph under the form of epigram, elegy, inscription, short poem, lyric, and so forth—demonstrate a *motive* for generic clarification, if not actual consensus.”⁴⁴ Newstok limits his project to analyzing where epitaphs are cited and re-cited in early modern English literature. Newstok invokes Bakhtin attempting to hone in

⁴² Scodel, Josh. *The English Poetic Epitaph: Commemoration and Conflict from Jonson to Wordsworth*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press 1991. P 6.

⁴³ Scodel. P 15.

⁴⁴ Newstok, Scott. *Quoting Death in Early Modern England*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008. P 14.

on what citationality reveals about primary and secondary speech genres. Newstok comes to the conclusion that Bakhtin's theory is insufficient to explaining how the epitaph functions in English culture and a tertiary level is needed.⁴⁵

There are a few scholars that embrace the epitaph in all its diverse messiness such as Karl Guthke and Ian Reid. Guthke's work sketches in broad strokes the larger archive of epitaphs from cultures across Europe and the Middle East over several centuries at the grand level of the "West." His monograph of essays attempts a loose taxonomy of the diverse array of material grouping them into chapters by themes and including remediated epitaphs in collections and anthologies of inscriptions.⁴⁶ In doing so Guthke reveals that in epitaphs "history and literature become fused; a collection of local epitaphs reads a bit like...a novel." This lively form of popular local history escapes the control of national historiography performing epideictic functions for smaller communities.⁴⁷

While Guthke broadly approaches the geography of the epitaph, Ian Reid, targets the diverse semiotics of the epitaph and attempts to rein it in through the concept of framing. Ian Reid's study of the epitaph points out the "insufficiency of linguistic conceptions of genre."⁴⁸ Reid's call for further investigations into the framing of epitaphs extends conversations around the semiotics of specific genres. Reid argues that

⁴⁵ Newstok. P 15.

⁴⁶ Guthke, Karl S. *Epitaph Culture in the West: Variations of a Theme in Cultural History*. Lewiston: The Edwin Mellen Press 2003. Reid, Ian. "Genre and Framing: The Case of Epitaphs." *Poetics* 17 (1988): 25-35.

⁴⁷ Guthke's treatment of North American anthologies of epitaphs reveals their role in creating community histories through the identification and curation of walkable local archives. See pp 30-100.

⁴⁸ Guthke. P 25.

the meaning of the seemingly small number of words typical of an epitaph can only be fully read when taking four types of framing into account: circumtextual, intertextual, intratextual and extratextual.⁴⁹ Reid's emphasis on framing implies that there exists a visual syntax beyond linguistic grammar. Scholars interested in the impact of graphic design on textuality have noticed something similar: readers and writers interpret the positions of words as contributing to the meaning of a text, even a print text.⁵⁰

Studies like these indicate two interrelated obstacles to studying epitaphs: 1) the sparse quantity of words common to epitaphs reflects hierarchical definitions of texts, argumentation and rhetoric; and 2) the overwhelming material diversity of epitaphic forms blurs generic boundaries and defies taxonomy. To address the first obstacle, this dissertation builds on the notions of text, argumentation and rhetoric introduced above by offering epigraphy, or wall writing, as a legitimate equal to the more highly regarded forms of prose, poetry and drama. As for the second obstacle, the seeming contradictions in the scholarship reveal that there isn't so much a single genre of the epitaph so as much as there are myriad epitaphic genres related so intimately to one another by rhetorical exigency and iconicity of form that the moment one is vivisected another grows to take its place.

⁴⁹ Guthke. P 25.

⁵⁰ Janine Barchas' work on the pre-standardized graphic designs of eighteenth century British novels illustrates the playfulness and inventiveness of authors and editors in their explorations of the potential for meaning in the physicality texts. Her work also looks at the spaces of ephemeral print forms like *The Tatler* where texts like poems and advertisements meet in a sort of graphic agora simultaneously competing for attention while subtly influencing each other's meanings. Barchas, Janine. *Graphic Design, Print Culture, and the Eighteenth-Century Novel*. Cambridge University Press: New York 2008.

Many graveyard epitaphs look strikingly like title pages. They announce stories of the dead and invite the passerby to read and speculate about the person buried beneath the stone. Gerard Genette addresses the functions of both title pages and epigraphs in French print culture in *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation*.⁵¹ Genette's publisher cheekily locates a definition of paratexts on the flyleaf of the book as "those liminal devices and conventions, both within and outside the book, that form part of the complex mediation between book, author, publisher, and reader: titles, forewords, epigraphs, and publishers' jacket copy are part of a book's private and public history."⁵² Using the metaphor of the threshold, Genette breaks down the anatomy of a book by illocutionary function concluding that "being immutable, the text in itself is incapable of adapting to changes in its public in space and over time. The paratext—more flexible, more versatile, always transitory because transitive—is, as it were, an instrument of adaptation. Hence the continual modifications in the 'presentation' of the text."⁵³ Genette, influenced by ideas similar to those of Reid, views paratexts as devices for framing the "immutable" central text at the heart of a book.

Epitaphs, however, highlight the tricky situation of what happens when something that looks like a paratext and acts like a paratext actually is the text proper.⁵⁴ There exists hidden in the paratexts described by Genette an unacknowledged threshold, one that links

⁵¹ Genette, Gerard. Trans. Jane E. Lewin. *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation*. New York: Cambridge University Press 1997.

⁵² Genette. P i.

⁵³ Genette. P 408.

⁵⁴ For a taste of the adaptive nature paratexts and/or the powerful potential of epigraphy to draw attention, see Joan Navarre's analysis of bibliographic variations to the title of Oscar Wilde's *Salome*, or *Salomé*. Navarre, Joan. *The Publishing History of Aubrey Bearsdley's Compositions for Oscar Wilde's Salomé*. Universal Publishers, 1999. P 100-110.

conventions in book culture to those in wall writing.⁵⁵ In books, the epigraph is the metaphoric writing on the wall. Other paratexts in books pulled from epigraphy include inscriptions, dedications and titles. To invoke Ruskin, one might say these texts are the speaking arm of architecture adapted to the object form of the book.

Title pages and tombstones look like advertisements, like fliers, like posters, like museum placards, like album covers, like nutrition labels, bumper stickers, and so forth. These forms are adaptations of epigraphy to new materials and objects. These genres share the use of words with poetry and prose, but they qualify as neither. This in and of itself is not a problem—the problem lies in the failure to recognize epigraphy as its own thing, many epigraphic texts are neglected and others are regulated to the lowest ranks of a variety of canons of both letters and the visual arts. Imagine the perils of judging cars and motorcycles using the same exact criteria—the seemingly lack of wheels on the motorcycle might distract many critics from recognizing its excellent thrust to weight ratio.

While prose, poetry and drama have been professionally standardized—epigraphy remains a frontier for formal innovation.⁵⁶ Epigraphy uses language differently than poetry or prose configuring words in spatial commonplaces and enthymematic

⁵⁵ Although much of his archive is drawn from French novels, Genette also draws frequently from the Waverley novels of Scottish author, Sir Walter Scott.

⁵⁶ Some of the most groundbreaking and widely used social media on the internet rely on virtual innovations on wall writing. The Facebook wall is a metaphor for the wall of the dormitory where students post messages to one another and display items identifying themselves as a hall community. Likewise, Pinterest uses the wall mounted pushpin board as its metaphor. Instagram and Twitter use similar epigraphic principles with stricter limits on form combining elements of epigraph and telegraph. All of these sites have in common an approach to attention similar to the way tributes of flowers are left in graveyards—users are empowered to leave messages at the foot of each post. These sites take the tribute one step further capitalizing on the algorithmic functionality possible in automated notification to create ongoing interaction between members.

arrangements following idiosyncratic rules particular to each genre. Epigraphy combines elements of linguistic grammar with idiosyncratic syntaxes based on meaningful visual conventions. Or as Mary Carruthers writes on the diversity of delivery in medieval texts: “the heart of rhetoric as of all art, lies in its performance: it proffers both visual spectacle and verbal dance to an audience which is not passive but an actor in the whole.”⁵⁷ In the case of epigraphy, the mobile reader must decrypt the visual spectacle of the verbal dance to find its fullest meaning.

In spite of the diversity of epigraphic forms, there are several characteristic threads that cross cut genres: prioritization of the call to attention, extremes of temporality, and symposiastic enthymemes. To these one might add that epigraphy frequently integrates form and content into metacommentaries, especially when composed in satirical or humorous modes. As highlighted above in Wysochi and Lynch’s definition of argumentation, calling the attention of an audience to specific information has a suasive effect. Although particular industries like advertising and graphic design have standardized some aspects of epigraphy in specific commercial industries, the perpetual need for attention insists on graphic innovation. The human eye is drawn to what breaks a pattern as much as it is drawn to admire a pattern. This can be seen in major aesthetic movements: when modernism became too popular to feel new, post modernism rose to capture the attention of artists and critics. Today when post modernism has become tired, aesthetics venture into “retro” colors and shapes seeking to

⁵⁷ Carruthers, Mary. “Editor’s introduction.” *Rhetoric Beyond Words*. New York: Cambridge University Press 2010. P 3.

break the familiar with novel takes on the looks of other decades. Graveyard epitaphs demand the attention of people who are quite literally walking around gazing at any number of other things, thus adding a dimension of rhetorical competition. In this sense all epigraphy is competitive with all other potential epigraphy in its surrounding, even with what is not yet written on walls not yet built.

Thus, a closely associated challenge to the quest for attention is the establishment timing. Epigraphic genres tend to fall into two extreme modes of temporality: on one end the ephemeral urgency of, “right here, right now,” and on the other the monumental, “so it has always been and so it always shall be.” For monument makers *kairos*, or the opportune moment, manifests in attempts to design a textual object that can survive multiple generations of aesthetic change (and still catch attention). The *kairos* of epitaphs is tied to syntax and grammar of the graveyard. That is the rules for arranging texts and even paratexts, if one might consider things like fences as the paratexts for cemeteries, depend in part on legal statutes as much as on stylistic choices based on the available socio economic resources like material, artisan labor and technology. These connections between temporality and locality reveal the finer grain of community identities and how local expressions of values form dialectics with national and even international trends.

The epitaph has a special ancient relationship to epigrammatic poetry, which reveals the symposiastic nature of its entymemes. Jeffrey Walker’s work on the related Classical genre of the epigram takes a Burkean view positing an intimate relationship between very dense, concise entymemes and audience expectations. Walker’s analysis includes examples of Hellenic gravemarkers and their inscriptions. Walker argues:

symposiastic poetry implies in principle a relatively closed, homogenous circle of “insiders” as the audience for poetic argument—so that the poet can presuppose a relatively high degree of like-mindedness and is, in consequence, under little pressure to construct the enthymematic cap, or the bare invocation of a topos; the poet can just “express” an attitude or judgment with which the audience is expected to agree already. The argument hardly needs to be argued. Or, it can be presented obliquely, elliptically. For the inside audience the grounds of judgment are obvious enough and “commonsensical” already. Under such circumstances what matters most is the stylistic elegance, charm, and memorability of the expression.⁵⁸

In other words, the form of the epigram is perfectly suited to the rapid-fire competitive, mobile circumstances of epigraphic reading.

The importance of the virtual symposia of audience expectations is not limited to the poetic variants of epigraphy but can be observed in its architectural elements as well. John Ruskin who gained fame boldly declaring laws for most of art and architecture stopped short at regulating epigraphy, or as he called it the duty of a building to talk: “it is not therefore possible to make expressional character any fair criterion of excellence in buildings, until we can fully place ourselves in the position of those to whom their expression was originally addressed, and until we are certain that we understand every symbol, and are capable of being touched by every association which its builders

⁵⁸ Walker, Jeffrey. *Rhetoric and Poetics in Antiquity*. New York: Oxford University Press 2000. p 251.

employed as letters of their language.”⁵⁹ Like Walker, Ruskin implies that consistencies or trends in epigraphy require a careful look at cultural circumstances. For Ruskin the contextual relationship of the text to the reader determined the suasive power of architecture: “I can neither force the reader to feel this architectural rhetoric, nor compel him to confess that the rhetoric is powerful, if it have produced no impression on his own mind.” Thus, even the most prolific of aesthetic lawmakers hesitates to attempt critical standards for epigraphy acknowledging that the success or failure of these tricky texts can’t be measured by the metered foot, but rather by the highly variable foot of the passerby.

Given that even Ruskin didn’t dare judge epigraphy, I certainly won’t either. I will, however, attempt to tease out and group together some of the key exigencies of epitaphic genres in these case studies of Covenanter monuments. In doing so, I hope to contribute to two conversations: one about the place of epitaphs in rhetorical genre studies, and the other about Scottish identity through the window of Presbyterian media use. Given the context of these epitaphs, the project features modest multidisciplinary overlap with British history, memory studies, religious studies, art history and archaeology. This overlap is due in large part to a research journey characterized by encounters with disciplinary territoriality over textual objects.

CHAPTER DESCRIPTIONS

⁵⁹ Ruskin, John. *Stones of Venice*. London: Collins 1960. P 31.

As noted above, the epitaph busily engages in poetry, occasional genres, public recording keeping, as outlet for grief, and in marking group identity.⁶⁰ As such, the epitaph reveals the rhetorical potential of the material elements of a text and the interpretive possibilities for the arrangement of linguistic features. In sum, epitaphic genres are more than writing displayed *on* objects, but rather are composite textual objects. In this sense, each individual epitaph mediates a prioritized bundle of values of the bereaved reflecting on the theme of death; the topic of the lost loved one; and the exigency of the genre itself. This bundle reflects assumptions about community values, as well as important interventions or deviations from them.

The diversity of epitaphs reveals that form *is* content when form becomes a compositional decision reflecting group identity. Furthermore, style—that shadowy area of rhetoric somewhere between content and form—leans in the direction of metacommentary on the value of media itself. Reformation-era Calvinists rigorously monitored access to genres--proscriptively and prescriptively controlling style, meaning and media.⁶¹ Therefore, acknowledging the polymorphic nature of epitaphic genres, this dissertation draws on Carolyn Miller’s influential definition of genre as a form of social

⁶⁰ In the United Kingdom records of deaths were not required at the national level until the 1836 bill for registering births, deaths and marriages. In spite of that bill Scottish deaths were under recorded. According to *ScotlandsPeople*, a public access digital arm of the National Records of Scotland, only 17,560 deaths were officially recorded from 1782-1959. As such, the records are supplemented with cemetery registers. “CPR Deaths and Burials.” *Scotland’s People*. www.scotlandspeople.gov.uk. Web. 19 March 2016. Also: Cressy, David. *Birth, Marriage, and Death: Ritual, Religion, and the Life-Cycle in Tudor and Stuart England*. New York: Oxford University Press 1997.

⁶¹ Miller, Carolyn. “Genres as Social Action.” *Quarterly Journal of Speech* Vol 70, No. 2. May 1984, 151-167. Devitt, Amy. *Writing Genres*. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press 2004. Pp 29-30.

action responding to recurring rhetorical situations; and Amy Devitt's intervention later reintroducing the importance of form into rhetorical genre studies.

For the epitaph the recurring rhetorical situation is death--mortality. Epitaphic genres respond to this cluster of exigencies: 1) to mourn the dead by marking a location for socially acceptable displays of grief (speech act); 2) to record the name of the dead in public history (administrative function); 3) to call attention to theologies of death through commemoration of the dead (*memento mori*); 4) to honor the dead through praise (epideictic function); 5) to learn a commonly held value from the example of the life of the dead (didactic function); and 6) to connect a current community with an ideal past community represented by the dead (identification). In representations of the Covenanters, death is painted with the brushes of martyrdom and war. Thus, the circumstances around a death can result in corollary exigencies like the following: 4a) to honor the dead by blaming their killer (e.g. 'Bluidy Clavers' aka John Graham, Viscount Dundee); and 6a) To disconnect the local group from an outside group (e.g. from the Catholics, etc.). Various other corollaries can be added for deaths due to other types of traumatizing event, such as plague,⁶² murder,⁶³ or plane crash.⁶⁴

⁶² Memorials to plague victims are extremely rare in Scotland. During plagues epitaphic composition suffers interruption. Even basic rolls of the dead and record keeping fall to the wayside while local communities prioritize containing the disease. Burial patterns face disruption as authorities designate emergency disposal procedures for human remains. Sadly, compounding these issues is that sometimes plagues kill entire families, leaving no mourners.

⁶³ In Edinburgh, commemorations to victims of the serial killing partners William Burke and William Hare tend to emphasize blame. The two men provided cadavers a bit too proactively for the local medical dissection trade much to the horror of the nation. The Anatomy Act of 1832 is considered an attempt to curtail further murders of this sort prompted by similar crimes committed by 'Burkers' in London.

⁶⁴ For example, the Dryfesdale Cemetery near Lockerbie, Scotland includes a special section for the victims of the 1988 bombing of the PamAm Flight 103. This 'garden of remembrance' features flowers and electric lighting not present in other parts of the cemetery as well as a grey granite triptych listing the

Chapter 1--An Opportune Monument: Robert Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland*, introduces a fundamental question for thinking about epigraphy and epitaphic genres: can a monument be a book? The chapter explores the kairos of the Hanoverian Succession and its relationship to Wodrow's exigency to repair the Scottish reputation through a specific re-membering of the Covenanter dead into the nation through public memory. This case study posits that changes in generic form can result when the kairos of normal generic production is delayed, in this case when groups are outlawed—pushing the exigency into future times and textual spaces. Wodrow's martyrology on the Covenanters manifests the historiographical and record keeping exigencies of a national cemetery. Wodrow engages with the aesthetics of Calvinist plain style bringing to light how groups can call attention to themselves without seeming to call attention at all. Notably, Wodrow's copious citing of an archive of first hand accounts and letters creates a sense of polyphony in the work--a distinctive feature of graveyards. The work's use of allographic evidence introduces a rhetorical competition with other groups for the ownership of the truth about the Covenanters.

Chapter 2--Margaret Wilson Wasn't Buried Here? What Epitaphic Genres tells us about Hierarchies of Media. explores the mobile reading of epitaphic genres

names of all 270 passengers, crew and ground "victims" of the "disaster" (not only the dead buried there but all victims) indicating a record keeping function. For rainy days, the cemetery also features a book of remembrance in the visitors' center featuring a page for each victim with photographs and biographical information. On the other side of the ocean in Arlington Cemetery, a cairn was built of 270 stones. Quarried and shipped from the area around Lockerbie, Scotland, each stone represents one of the Lockerbie dead. In this case the distinctly Gaelic form of the memorial connects the American cemetery to the original disaster site. The cairn identifies the two countries as connected through loss and tribute while blaming the "terrorists" (indicated on a plaque). The political overtones of the Arlington memorial were further reinforced when Bill Clinton personally unveiled the work.

through the cenotaph of Margaret Wilson, a Covenanter martyr. The chapter enters the text through the threshold of a heritage plaque that guides readers towards the “right” interpretation of the monument. The cenotaph, which shares with epitaphs iconic formal conventions, reveals how monumental texts blurs conventions of rhetoric (or more precisely ofonymity). The *Margaret Wilson Monument* calls attention to hierarchies of media and their relationship to gender in Presbyterian culture. This rare Scottish public statue of a woman, innovates on local epitaph conventions by exhorting the mobile reader to not only remember Wilson, but also to honor her by promoting women’s literacy. This unusual presentation of Wilson, presented so often in a glamorized moment of death, calls attention instead to the ‘Woman Question.’ The monument reveals the power of epitaphic genres to do more than preserve a community’s past values—this cenotaph proscribes future changes through the promotion of new ideals.

Chapter 3--The Battle for the Victorian Sabbath: the Scottish Cemetery and the Evangelical Competition for Souls shows that sometimes it’s hard to see the cemetery for the epitaphs. Using Foucault’s theory of the heterotopia, Chapter 3 thinks of cemeteries as complicated epitaphic texts in their own right. By the Victorian era, Scotland’s daily life and religious identities shifted with changes in technology and demographics, threatening the traditional observation of the Sabbath and its recurring weekly opportunities for theological moments. Thus, the Valley Cemetery served as an assertion of Free Church values during the Great Disruption of the Church of Scotland leaving behind a standing entry in the latest round of rhetorical competition for souls. Stirling’s Valley Cemetery represents a nineteenth century text taking evangelism to the

empire as the Drummond brothers use cemeteries, tracts and museums to compete with pubs for the cultural time of the Sabbath.

Epilogue--Disorderly Arrangement: Monuments, Digitization, and Data

looks forward to the relationship between landmark monuments and digital databases. In this short case study the Findagrave.com database page for Robert Wodrow's cemetery monument is put into perspective through comparison with aspects of *The Margaret Wilson Monument*. The epilogue speculates on the power and limitations of digitizing landmark monuments. The essay concludes by musing on the potential of online databases and social media to take on monumental and epitaphic functions of their own through their special relationship to the technologies of memory storage and cultural display.

Chapter 1--An Opportune Monument:

Robert Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland*

My style, I know, is what cannot answer the taste of this age; apologies for it are of no great use. I never affected, or had much occasion to attain any delicacy of style; all I purpose to myself, is to be understood. –Robert Wodrow

These and such as these, were the Points upon which the People of Scotland suffer'd the most Blood Persecution, that has been heard of in this Age, or for the last 100 years pass'd in the world. –Daniel Defoe

The folio-sized edition of Robert Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings* arrives from the archive on a sturdy steel cart.⁶⁵ Protective cardboard enrobing the book like a cowl gives it an air simultaneously sterile and mysterious. The researcher unwinds cotton twine from brass rivets to reveal the eighteenth century book inside. The front cover rests loose from its spine--the plain leather surface looking lost without so much as a title to identify it. She picks up the solitary cover, its leather surprisingly like suede, soft to the touch. She gently places the book's parts onto a faded velvet cradle. Leaning closer to lift the massive volume she catches its scent. Like wines and cheeses books have an aroma—you can date the smell. This volume smelled musty from minor water damage but with none of the pungency of earlier parchment manuscripts. Carefully turning the pages she observes the edges of the first fifty oxidized to a dull yellow. The print

⁶⁵ Wodrow, Robert. *The History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland, from the Restauration to the Revolution: Collected from the Publick Records, Original Papers, and Manuscripts of that Time, and other well attested Narratives*. Vol. 1 Edinburgh: Printed by James Watson, His Majesty's Printer. MDCCXXI (1721). Harry Ransom Center, Austin, TX. P Xli.

remains clear, crisp and black. The more pristine interior pages hint that the book has been opened many times, but seldom read in its entirety.

Aggressive three-quarter inch fonts assert the title of the work. In alternating lines of black and red popping off the page like the results of a key word search: “HISTORY” “SUFFERINGS” “CHURCH of Scotland” “RESTAURATION” “REVOLUTION.” The author’s name followed with the modest accreditation “Minister of the Gospel at Eastwood.” A simple but generously sized wood cut emblem of the burning bush adorns the interim space before “EDINBURGH.” Embossed marks from the Presbyterian Theological Society and a hand scrawled note yield clues of the book’s travel to the states from its original owner, a vicar in Scotland. And then suddenly one notices, as if it had just appeared, an italicized motto of middling size in the center of the page: “*Nec studio nec odio.*” Neither enthusiasm nor hatred.

This book is a monument to the Covenanter dead. Published at the opportune moment of the early reign of King George I, Wodrow responds to latent epitaphic exigencies resurfacing in the twilight of the Stuart dynasty. Calling attention to the Covenanter dead of the prior century, this martyrology shares with national cemeteries the grouping together of a particular type of dead based on their function in society. The rhetorical act of grouping memorial monuments by social function--be that function one of local family relationships, military service, or religious belief--represents a textual remembering of the dead into the communities of the living. In Wodrow’s case the rhetorical community extends beyond the religious, he attempts to leverage common

Protestant values to re-member the Covenanters into the shifting political spectrum of the United Kingdom led by its Lutheran-raised king.

Wodrow's martyrology illustrates the Presbyterian struggle to reconcile epitaphic exigencies with plain style. Although one often thinks of style at the sentence level, and Wodrow certainly did as indicated in the epigraph to this chapter, he also makes an intervention into the styling of evidence in historiographical argumentation through his insistence on including copious allographic material. Thus, Wodrow sacrifices canonical summarizing and narratological moves in order to include the accounts of contributors from across Scotland. This essay argues that books can be monuments and proposes a notion of the monument as a metamediary category defined not by any particular material but rather by its textual acknowledgment of the material vulnerability of human memory. The monument as a category is distinguished through its relationship to time, in much the same sense that other media are to space. This essay concludes by showing that a rhetorical metamediary concept of the monument is needed beyond English departments in the calls to theory of other disciplines like archaeology, historiography and architecture.

THE KAIROS OF THE HANOVERIAN SUCCESSION AND THE STORY OF A HEBREW HISTORIAN

When Queen Anne the last of the Stuart dynasty died childless, George I of Hanover inherited the crowns of England and Scotland creating a new dynastic

audience.⁶⁶ In the chaos of the ensuing power vacuum Robert Wodrow erected a book monument: *The History of the Suffering of the Church of Scotland from the Restauration to the Revolution*.⁶⁷ Wodrow's work is significant to the history of British rhetoric for its position as the foundational narrative for Covenanter memorials, and as a conciliatory gesture redefining the relationship of Scottish Presbyterians to the new Hanoverian dynasty in the wake of Lord Mar's 1715 rising. The book distinguishes between Presbyterian moderates who would be loyal to the new Protestant king and the Stuart loving Jacobites. Wodrow's work highlighted a past history of some of the noble families like the Argylls⁶⁸ who ran afoul of the Stuarts, but served the Hanoverian forces against the Jacobites. By 1721, the Duke of Argyll was promoted to Lord Steward, a position in the royal cabinet. Thus, the timing of Wodrow's work capitalized on a moment in which some Scottish aristocrats began to gain the ear of the new King.

The recuperation of the honor of the Covenanters experienced a cause celebre moment in the early eighteenth century. One can think of it as a dialectical mirror image to the furor around the Jacobite movement. The discourse around the Covenanters included as many as a dozen book-length histories published between 1700 and 1725 on the history of the Church of Scotland from the reign of Mary Queen of Scots to the

⁶⁶ Not for lack of trying--Queen Anne and her husband conceived as many as seventeen pregnancies in their attempts to produce an heir. To her sorrow, none resulted in a child who would live to adulthood. Her male heir, styled the Duke of Gloucester, died before age 12. For an intimate domestic history of the waning years of the Stuart dynasty see Flora Maxwell Stuart's biography of Lady Winifred Nithsdale. Stuart, Flora Maxwell. *Lady Nithsdale and the Jacobites*. Peeblesshire: Traquair House 1995.

⁶⁷ The current standardized spelling 'restauration' lacks the connotation of the re-Stuartization of the kingdom implied by the eighteenth-century Scottish variant.

⁶⁸ Yes, the popular pattern of knitwear from socks to sweaters takes its name from this famous Scottish family.

Glorious Revolution many lost now to obscurity. Of these, the most prominent include Daniel Defoe's *Memoirs of the Church of Scotland* (1714), Sir James Stewart's *Naphtali, or, Wrestlings of the Church of Scotland for the Freedom of Christ* (1714) and John Thomson's *A Cloud of Witnesses for the Prerogatives of Jesus Christ* (1714).⁶⁹ Wodrow's *History of the Suffering* outlived them all as the resilient foundational narrative for Scottish Covenanter memory. It experienced a significant re-printing in the Victorian era during the Great Disruption, and remains cited in books, on museum plaques, and inscribed on stonework to this day.

Who can quite say why one monument survives and another erodes, but perhaps Wodrow's personal sense of obligation to the memory of individual martyrs and his painstaking documentation of their fates yields a clue. In Wodrow's introductory essay he ponders issues of historiography and style--a tricky union of content and form. Here he expresses his conflicting obligations to honor and to record individual Covenanters with the historiographical exigencies of his contemporaries to record great deeds. He sees these dual obligations as stylistically incompatible. The high style popular in eighteenth century histories involved larger narrative arcs commemorating significant events that swept away the individual identities of all but select heroes and elites. Wodrow prioritizes epitaphic exigencies deciding to sacrifice any chance at eloquence by violating key expectations of the history genre. As such, he prioritizes the epitaphic exigencies of honoring the dead, naming the dead, and placing the dead in history. For him the

⁶⁹ Daniel Defoe, as an English Presbyterian Dissenter (and a writer of novels with notoriously unreliable narrators) had a complex conflict of interest in his history writings. See, Nelson, Holly and Sharon Alker. "Daniel Defoe and the Scottish Church." *Digital Defoe: Studies in Defoe & His Contemporaries* 5, no. 1 (Fall 2013).

honoring of the dead involved a complicated notion of the way allographic evidence could act as a self-voucher.

Wodrow explains his thinking in what is now called the “filling the gap” move in twenty-first century scholarship. He sees a twofold gap:

Since we want a Scots biography, and have nothing almost of the lives of eminent ministers, gentlemen, and private Christians in this church, I have been the larger in my accounts of such worthy persons as fell in my way, since I cannot but reckon that one of the most useful and entertaining parts of history: this has led me to give several instances of sufferers upon the very same account, when fewer examples might otherwise have answered the ends of this history; but I thought it pity that any thing, which might do justice to the memory of those excellent confessors and martyrs, should be lost.⁷⁰

Thus, Wodrow justifies an unusual level of detail in the Covenanter stories as a way of recording their memories, but also as filling a hole in the larger patchwork of Scottish national history.

In this sense, Wodrow’s *kairos* expands beyond the situation of the Hanoverian Succession and he invents a relationship to a much longer arc of historiography. He invokes the work of Josephus, an ancient Hebrew historian of Greek letters.⁷¹ The self-comparison to Josephus provides an extreme of temporality shifting to a truly

⁷⁰ Wodrow, *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P xlii.

⁷¹ Josephus was a Hebrew historian enslaved by Greeks, whose extant work consists of Greek history in Greek. His work included critique of what he saw as the root causes of ephemerality and lack of precision in Greek histories of the time. Thus, Josephus is both a critic of and a historian simultaneously inside and outside of the Greek tradition.

monumental kairos in which the spans of empires become the basic unit of time. This use of kairos provides Wodrow with the opportunity for invention providing a “connective hooking-in to circulating discourse” on the ethics of memory making, the responsibilities of monumentality, and a Protestant anti-poetics.⁷² His interpretation of historiography represented in the work of Josephus justifies his prioritization of the rhetorical value of good will in the collection and presentation of evidence, thus blurring the methodological line between process and product.

Wodrow invokes Josephus on the “necessity of forming history from records.”⁷³ Wodrow’s self-consciousness about the roles a historian plays in representation and witnessing resembles a Kantian moral imperative. Wodrow explains his position to the reader: “had I been writing a defence of the sufferers in this period, much more might have been said: but, as an historian, I am chiefly concerned to represent facts; and having given the representation of matters in the very terms used by the persecutors themselves, their severity, and the innocence of the persecuted, will appear the more brightly.”⁷⁴ Wodrow’s ideal historian practices rhetoric within an ethics of public memory grounded in the importance of evidence and testimony. He values the voices of witnesses over his own voice as historian. For Wodrow, facts are recorded in the public record and any legitimate history would pull facts from that record.

⁷² Peter Simonson’s heuristic of “inventional media” incorporates Debra Hawhee’s conception of kairos as an inventional tool. The marked quotation is his borrowing of the term from Hawhee in his discussion of the revival of kairos theory by James Kinneavy in the 1980s. See, Simonson, Peter. “Reinventing Invention, Again.” *Rhetoric Society Quarterly* Vol. 44, No. 4, p 310. p 299-322.

⁷³ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P Xxxix.

⁷⁴ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P Xl.

It is useful to think about this piece as illustrating an aspect of argumentation specific to the epideictic tradition described by Jeff Walker in *Rhetoric and Poetics in Antiquity*. Walker's definition of epideictic includes work like Cicero's *In Defense of Milo*, which asked audiences to rethink the justice of Milo's conviction. According to Walker, epideictic rhetoric works "to challenge or transform conventional beliefs" and is not limited to "merely ornamental displays of clever speech."⁷⁵ Walker's articulation of the epideictic category, derived from his analysis of the theories of Hermogenes of Tarsus, speaks to the same Greek tradition of historiography and public memory that Wodrow invokes in the introduction to *History of the Suffering*.

Wodrow sees *History of the Sufferings* not as praise for praise's sake, but rather as a refutation and rebuttal of philippic discourse against the Covenanters. The first page of the Author's Preface declares: "It is boldly asserted, and published to the world, that no man in Scotland ever suffered for his religion."⁷⁶ Wodrow disputes both the justice and the accuracy of prior arguments made against the Covenanters. "Multitudes of pamphlets were going about after the revolution, larded with these and such like aspersions upon the church of Scotland, to which some just answers were given...but the last four years of queen Anne's reign were though a most proper juncture for propagating those falsehoods."⁷⁷ Thus, like Weever, Wodrow associates monument making with discourses on national honor. He asks his various audiences--the King, English readers, and Protestants--to reconsider their opinion of the Covenanters and of Scots.

⁷⁵ Walker, Jeffrey. *Rhetoric and Poetics in Antiquity*. New York: Oxford University Press 2000. P 9.

⁷⁶ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P xxxvii.

⁷⁷ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P xxxviii.

Recall that the composition of the epitaph genre was interrupted for the Covenanters in the period 1660-1688. According to Wodrow, Presbyterians suffered various forms of official and unofficial reprisals like fines, seizures, and the quartering of military troops, which had significant socio-economic impact on monument building.⁷⁸ If one were English or Anglican Covenanter martyrs could be read as villains, outlaws or traitors rather than victims, martyrs or heroes. According to Wodrow the outlaw/traitor discourse rose to dominance and specifically targeted English audiences: “Libels have been printed, and carefully handed about, containing these glaring untruths; and no small pains is taken, and many artifices used, to impress the English nation with them.”⁷⁹

The legal and theological status of a person at death had a great impact on whether or not an epitaph or other monument would or could be erected in their honor. Criminals, suicides and the unbaptized were grouped together in a section of unmarked graves if their burial were allowed at all.⁸⁰ In other words, not everyone was buried. Burial was a privilege dependent on cultural membership in the church, the state, and the economy a membership that could be revoked by violating the rules of governing any of these areas of social life. Public displays of memory, such as epitaphs, regarding the

⁷⁸ Defoe also confirms punishments for Covenanting. He quotes regulations treating Covenanter preaching, protesting and public prayer as sedition. He also lists out fines according to rank (generally 25% of either income or property). His account also confirms quartering and alleges harassment of women and children. Defoe, Daniel. *Memoirs of the Church of Scotland, in Four Periods*. Edinburgh: DeMcLeod & Son 1844. Oxford University facsimile via *Internet Archive*. www.archive.org. 22 March 2016. 62-65.

⁷⁹ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P Xxxvii.

⁸⁰ A graveyard is a space adjoining a building, usually a church, in which the dead are buried. A kirkyard specifically refers to a Scottish yard for the dead attached to a kirk. Kirk is the Scottish word for church. A cemetery is a park for the burial of the dead. Cemeteries begin to gain popularity in the United Kingdom and Europe from the end of the 18th century. See Karl Guthke's *Epitaph Culture in the West: Variations of a Theme in Cultural History*.

dead were further limited. Sometimes criminalized bodies or their parts were sent to various posts and hung on display, part of the punishment being the withholding of the corpse and associated rites from the family of the deceased.

Wodrow's anxiety over loss stems from alleged corruption of public records in his time. He points out specific high profile cases mysteriously missing from court records, such as the "processes against the marquis of Argyle, Mr. James Guthrie, and the Lord Warriston."⁸¹ Although he does not present these losses as an organized conspiracy, he does imply that there is widespread systemic corruption such that many individual persecutors either destroyed, withheld or failed to produce records with a high enough level of frequency that there is a nationwide gap in the public records for the period spanning 1660 to 1688. With the deaths of witnesses in subsequent years Woodrow sees the gap rapidly widening into a chasm. As such, Wodrow responds to the exigency of loss with what could be termed as an early prototype for social media. Although Wodrow did not have access to the technology of a Mark Zuckerberg, or a Timothy Vanderhook, a similarly innovative spirit of inclusion permeates both their processes and products as writers.

Wodrow invokes Josephus on the importance of monuments in the public record, "The Egyptians, Chaldeans and Phenicians, to say nothing of ourselves, have from time to time recorded, and transmitted down to posterity, the memorials of past ages, in monumental pillars and inscriptions, according to the advice and direction of the wisest men they had, for the perpetual memory of all transactions of moment, and to the end that

⁸¹ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P xl.

nothing might be lost.”⁸² Wodrow argues that the record gap presents a potential pitfall for future historians, much like that into which fell his Greek predecessors. He quotes Josephus’ critique of Greek scholars, “The first and great reason of their disagreement, is the failing of the Greeks, in not laying a timely foundation for history, in records and memorials, to conserve the memory of all great actions; for, without these monumental traditions, posterity is left at liberty to write at random, and to write false too, without any danger of being contradicted.”⁸³ Wodrow agrees with Josephus’ view that the many inconsistencies in Greek tales and histories as proof of the danger of neglecting recorded facts.

It is exactly this pitfall Wodrow hopes to avoid in his creation of “this history, or rather collection of materials for a history, contains a number of facts, and well attested accounts which will set the circumstances of Presbyterians, during twenty-eight years, in a clearer light than hitherto they have appeared, and if possible, may stop the mouths of such who have most groundlessly aspersed this church, and do justice to the memory of those excellent persons of all ranks, who, as confessors and martyrs, were exposed to the fury of this unhappy time.”⁸⁴ Therefore, we may read twin ethical obligations in Wodrow’s theory of monument writing—the first to the memorialization of individuals and the second to the timely preservation of an accurate archive of facts for future historians.

⁸² Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P xxxix.

⁸³ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P xxix.

⁸⁴ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P xliv.

In sum, Wodrow presents his ethics as an appeal to persona and more specifically to a sense of good will and honesty implied by the raw appeal to authenticity of Calvinist poetics—or perhaps better stated, a fact-driven anti-poetics.⁸⁵ In the next section we'll look at the way Wodrow's gathering of facts in their artifact form and his notion of the self-voucher creates a gravescape in his work. In terms of poetics, Wodrow's resultant priority is clarity of style over ornamentation. He modestly claims "there is but a small part of the history in my words, which, I presume, may be understood even by English readers, who, it is hoped, will bear with me, though I come not fully up to the propriety of the English language, nor to the accuracy and neatness of their writers."⁸⁶ Wodrow's identification with the Hebrew slave Josephus is one of parallel subjectivity--each is writing within the tradition and language of an empire rather than within his native tongue. Thus, in the opportune moment of the Hanoverian succession, Wodrow presents a monument that humbly submits to the reading of the new monarch while subverting the authority of princes past.

“BURIED IN OBLIVION:” DILEMMAS OF PLAIN STYLE MONUMENTS

Plain style monument might seem like a contradictory term, but for anyone who has walked the streets of Edinburgh it is the *mot juste*. The eighteenth century buildings of New Town characterize a distinctive Scottish style generously-sized, exquisitely crafted and unbroken lines. Plain style does not mean ugly. The plain style can be

⁸⁵ It might be too strong to say that Scottish Calvinists of the period were anti-poetics but rather that their aesthetic had an element of anti-*techné*. The appeal to authentic spontaneous inspiration does not contradict beauty or eloquence, but rather that these qualities are most likely to be found in heartfelt extemporaneous utterances and not in texts carefully engineered or highly decorated.

⁸⁶ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P xli.

beautiful, stately and striking in its simplicity like the heroine of Richardson's *Pamela* in her modest black dress. Although there is a tendency to associate British style with Anglican London, the aesthetics of post-Reformation protestant groups varied considerably according to denominational values.⁸⁷ Denominations like the Presbyterians, Puritans, Quakers, Shakers, Amish and Mennonites considered the Anglicans too Catholic in the ornamentation and decoration of everything from their clothes to their speech to their music to their hair. Reformist denominations transformed their material culture and daily experience to reflect radical new values of authenticity, simplicity, and piety. So we find that while Weever and Wodrow responding to critically different kairos, the former dealing with the destruction of monuments and the latter with the interruption of monuments, they nevertheless share epitaphic exigency in their erections of monuments in book form. The one attempting to publish the inscriptions of lost epitaphs by which hoping to recover part of their legacy. The other published vignettes which would inspire dozens of monuments across centuries.

For Wodrow's detractors, the copiousness of evidence in the form of allographic accounts constitutes one of the major failures of the work. In the Author's Preface, Wodrow focuses less on what he will argue and more on why he put his argument together the way he did. In his own words, "it may be of more use to give some account of the materials I had, and somewhat of the method I have followed putting them

⁸⁷ See John F. Wilson's discussion of plain style sermons used by Puritan Presbyterians to mark group identity by contrasting with court preaching during the Long Parliament. John F. Wilson. *Pulpit in Parliament: Puritanism during the English Civil Wars 1640-1648*. Princeton: Princeton University Press. P 138-165.

together.”⁸⁸ Wodrow raises the use of forensic evidence to an unusual frenzy for epideictic genres. In particular he quotes primary accounts extensively throughout and the publication of the second volume included appendices of letters and accounts that trickled in from contributors all over Scotland. Wodrow’s inclusiveness of the voices of others make this text polyphonic in ways that mirror the polyphony of a graveyard. For example, readers of the first volume spread the word of his project and inspired the friends, relatives and descendants of Covenanters to send him additional materials. In this manner the project grew through additions of memories from individual families, much like the addition of new epitaphs in a graveyard.

Presbyterian values and outdoor conventicles favored styles resembling parrhesia. The concept of parrhesia relates to the notion of free speech in the sense of speech compelled by a moral imperative overriding the speaker’s regard for their own welfare. Parrhesia is sometimes thought of as anti-rhetorical, but I would not categorize it that way—the act of speaking from the heart is highly persuasive and can manifest the full power of eloquence. Instead, I would term parrhesia as a mode of anti-*techne* with an emphasis on extemporaneous *kairos*.⁸⁹ In other words, hand in hand with plain style is the symbolic act of speaking without art. While in control of Scotland, the Covenanters applied the value of plainness to multiple types of media and performance. For example,

⁸⁸ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. Xxxix.

⁸⁹ Jeffrey Walker’s discusses *techne* rhetorike as the art of persuasion. In other words it is the use of the technique or technology of rhetoric in an overtly sensual manner that raises objections amongst Protestant practitioners of plain style, and Plato as well. Walker, Jeffrey. *Rhetoric and Poetics in Antiquity*. New York: Oxford University Press 2000.

they eschewed the formal trappings of traditional church ceremonies, outlawed religious festivals and banned theatrical productions.

As hinted by the epigraph to this chapter, *History of the Suffering* stands out as a plain style monument in the context of a much more sophisticated tradition of both historiography and martyrologies. Wodrow explains his plain speech as part of the long habit of sermon making for his village audience: “A country life for eighteen years, with my necessary converse among my people, and discoursing to them in my sermons, as much as I can, according to their capacity, hath brought me insensibly to express myself in a manner which in print may appear low and flat.”⁹⁰ The passage demonstrates a sense that the decorum, register and style of the speaker should represent not his own status in the community, but rather should be tailored to the audience. This departure from the Catholic tradition of delivering mass in Latin, a language inaccessible to many, represents a leveling attitude, which impacted not only the production of texts in Scotland but their entire education system. The difference between a presbytery and an episcopacy underlies the values of the poetics of the work. In a presbytery, leadership is horizontally distributed, whereas in the Episcopalian tradition, leadership is hierarchized vertically. These different church government structures represented a crucial value difference over who should control the interpretation of religious texts. Like the Quakers, the

⁹⁰ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. P Xli.

Presbyterians favored individual interpretation of the Bible. The Catholics and Episcopalians, on the other hand, emphasized interpretation by priests.⁹¹

Nevertheless, Wodrow claims some trouble in adapting to a larger audience and his solution is clear plain speech. He writes, “there is but a small part of the history in my words, which, I presume, may be understood even by English readers, who, it is hoped, will bear with me, though I come not fully up to the propriety of the English language, nor to the accuracy and neatness of their writers.”⁹² Here Wodrow’s identification with Josephus becomes more personal--each historian writes within the forum of an imperial language rather than that of their native tongue. Here Wodrow alludes to the differences between “high” and “low” styles of ornament in English literature and the tendency of Scottish writers tend to value clarity and comprehensibility when speaking English as opposed to their native Scots.⁹³

As with any highly persuasive genre a *techne* has developed mimicking aspects of the anti-*techne* of radical Protestant denominations. This *techne* lingers in academic writing pedagogy in the form of humility tropes, tropes of subjectivity, an emphasis on active verbs, and various editing strategies to produce a clean, clear style. This style may seem conservative to some but it was a wild departure in its time. In contrast, today’s social media promote values more similar to those of the Stuart court. Internet celebrities

⁹¹ The Covenanters pushed for universal male literacy in Scotland due to this belief. The Scottish education system still butts heads with the English over how to allocate funds for universities—the Scots favoring state sponsored tuition models for the flagship University of Edinburgh.

⁹² Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. Xli.

⁹³ This distinction between English and Scots became the subject of both commentary and pedagogical tools in the eighteenth century as authors like Robbie Burns published in the Scottish dialect, while others like James Boswell moved towards assimilation of London print styles using lists of Scotticisms to edit the accent out of their writing.

and popular artists make millions off texts that center quite blatantly on tropes of self-promotion, lessons on self-branding, and the genre of the self-celebrating anthem. Thus, one can see vestiges of both styles alive and well today. Self-promotion that would lead to ostracizing in some groups, in other groups results in millions of hits and an advertising contract. Humility tropes, of course, do not always stem from underlying theological values but can reflect other hierarchies such as gender. For example, Aphra Behn in her introduction to *Oroonoko* have had to justify or self-authorize her right as a female author to write at all. She lays out a humility trope variant on an appeal to parrhesia, by arguing her moral obligation to act as witness when none more suitable were available.⁹⁴ So, humility tropes vary not only by denomination but by other compounding factors. Plain style and humility should not be arbitrarily confused as the plain style often carries connotations of masculinity at times when the frills and frivolities of imagery and rhetorical figures are associated with the feminine.⁹⁵

Style considerations aside, Wodrow might have been a fan of the technology of social media had he lived to see it. Wodrow's concern for the loss of individual voices saturates his stylistic choices in *History of the Sufferings* in a way that might seem surprising or even tedious to those familiar with other traditions of protestant martyrologies such as Foxe's *Acts and Monuments* with its decorative woodcuts.⁹⁶ Wodrow expresses his anxiety over the relationship between martyrdom, memory and the

⁹⁴ Behn, Aphra, *Oroonoko, or, The royal slave*. Boston: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2000.

⁹⁵ The novels of Ernest Hemingway are considered an archetypal example of masculine, muscular plain prose.

⁹⁶ Article/book chapter about the wood cuts and their theatricality

interruption of epitaphs as follows: “they were unwilling to seem in the least to stir up the government to deal with the persecuting party in a way of retaliation; and, till forced, in their own necessary defence, to set matters in their true light, and expose the severe treatment they met with, they could have wished the inhumanities of professed protestants, towards those who were really such, had been buried in oblivion.”⁹⁷ With the relative absence of public monuments to Covenanter martyrs in the streets and kirkyards, Wodrow’s feels an obligation to create a public monument of another sort to stand as a primary source for future generations.

Wodrow’s information gathering process develops like a gravescape with the unpredictable arrival of a new corpus of letters and testimonies. This influx of new material leads to suboptimal yet nonetheless meaningful arrangement strategy for the work. He writes, “After I had formed this history, and published my proposals for printing it, many informations were sent me, and I had access to some records I wanted before; yea, even during the time of printing this volume, some papers of consequence came to my hand: the inserting of what was necessary from these, in the proper places, hath not a little altered this work, and made the connexion of purposes in some parts less natural than it might have been, if all my materials had been under my view at first.”⁹⁸ In both literary and literal ways the identity of the dead have not been fully accounted for and Wodrow adds newly discovered texts to his history like a mason erecting stones to the recently deceased. Wodrow’s histories of the dead identify them not as political

⁹⁷ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. xxxviii.

⁹⁸ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. xlii.

traitors but as Protestant martyrs who died not in defiance to the monarchy but in righteous opposition to the Papist-flavored tyranny of the Catholic leaning Stuarts.

The use of lengthy direct quotes from records related to Wodrow's notion of a "self-voucher." Here a self-voucher is an artifact of public memory, which like a tombstone stands on its own and is best understood in its entirety. Wodrow says, "As they now stand, they are self-vouchers: had I shortened them, and given them in mine own words, perhaps, such as know me might have the charity to believe, I would not knowingly have falsified or misrepresented matters; but it is much better things stand as they are in the records. I design, that as little of this history as may be should lean upon me: let every one see with his own eyes, and judge for himself, upon the very same evidence I have; this is certainly the fairest and justest way."⁹⁹ This notion of the self-voucher relates to Presbyterian emphasis on the individual interpretation of Biblical text. The devices of the summary, the paraphrase, or the gloss have no value in this model due to their potential to stand in the way of the reader's direct relationship with the text. Note that Wodrow's use of the term "light" throughout the piece does not refer to the Enlightenment. The references to light function as a metaphor for an ideal moment when the triangle of rhetor, text and reader synthesize into meaning.

Thus, despite undeniable differences in materiality, Wodrow's book shares all the functions of a self-voucher composed of allographic self-vouchers with graveyards and cemeteries. To shine light on how Wodrow manages (or refuses to manage) the composition of these vouchers it is important to think of how texts are sometimes

⁹⁹ Wodrow. *History of the Sufferings*. 1721. xl.

composed of other texts that in their own right form semiotic units, but taking on a meaning greater in their composite form.

WHEN IS A BOOK A MONUMENT? MUSINGS ON MONUMENTS AS INVENTIONAL MEDIA

Throughout this essay the term monument has been applied to books. Presenting a book monument as case study, rather than the kind of outdoor landmark text more stereotypically associated with the word currently may have raised some objections in the mind of the reader up until this point. Contrast the above with the more common academic usage illustrated here: “As abbot of the Augustinian monastery on “Columba’s Island” (Inchcolm) in the Firth of Forth north of Edinburgh, Walter Bower penned the monumental *Scotichonicon* (c. 1449), another chronicle which continued to built on a chronicle by that name started by John of Fordun.”¹⁰⁰ Notice the way that the more adjective ‘monumental’ is used to modify the book as represented by its title. The sentence is not phrased ‘penned the monument’, or even ‘penned the bookish monument’. Could one of these usages of monument or monumental be the ahistorical imposition of a twenty-first-century notion of textuality onto a fifteenth century text, or did earlier Textual Cultures recognize the chimeric material nature of monuments¹⁰¹?

¹⁰⁰ Von Contzen, Eva and Luuk Houwen. Eds. “Introduction.” *Medievala et Humanistica: Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Culture*. NS No 41. Special Issue Writing Identity in Medieval and Early Modern Scotland. London: Rowman & Littlefield 2016. P3.

¹⁰¹ As the origin myth goes, the term Textual Cultures in its proper noun form came about at the University of Stirling, Scotland in 2005 when an interdisciplinary conference of scholars wrote a sort of manifesto to define a growing field. The manifesto defines the term, which is now the name of a journal. The definition, though long, merits quotation here due to its commentary on interdisciplinarity: “Textual Culture refers to the material processes and ideological formations surrounding the production,

The first challenge to approaching pre-twentieth century monuments involves finding the right sort of visa to pass through the disciplinary borders territorializing how and when material objects are divided up for study in the academy. Epitaphic genres question these boundaries in two ways. First, epitaphs occur in multiple media including, but not limited to stone, cast iron, wood, cardboard, paper and composite forms. These materials are all valid materials for monument composition, and epitaphs remain recognizable even with drastic differences in material. The term monument presumes, perhaps includes, mediation. Nevertheless, try convincing an English scholar that a book like Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings* is a monument and not a *monumental* book. There is real danger of falling down a materialist rabbit hole in which one scholar gently explains, *no, books are books and monuments are monuments*. Implied in the distinction is that one is a text and the other is an object.

Second, scholars have a fraught relationship to monuments due to the conundrum of how to close read epigraphic texts. Epitaphs defy most of the current methodology based on the canon of close reading (now called active reading in high schools) with its implied hierarchy of linguistically grammatical categories of poetry and prose. Without an optimum quantity of words, close reading strategies fall short for lack of data. Epigraphic genres rely heavily on the interaction between graphic layout, words and

transmission, reception, and regulation of texts. It studies the interactions between these processes and formations in order to show how texts get made and how they are understood. It works within and across intellectual history, literary criticism, critical theory, linguistics and critical discourse analysis, history of the book, and publishing-as-process. It does not have an allegiance to a single disciplinary area, and it contests the boundaries and traditions of existing categories.” Bray, Joe and Ruth Evans. “Introduction: What is Textual Culture?” *Textual Cultures: Texts, Contexts, Interpretation* Vol. 2, No. 2, Autumn 2007. P 1-9.

image often creating unique composite forms that ask readers to read in novel ways. This requires spatial-linguistic inferences on the part of the reader. Currently, this type of reading is not formally taught, and therefore, it's interpretative power remains uncontrolled. Instead, epigraphic reading is casually acquired through exposure and sociality.

However, close reading isn't the only challenge, the ambiguities rife in this shortage of words raises issues for argumentation studies. Try convincing an argumentation specialist that epitaphs have logic and you will fall into an implied rabbit hole while the argumentation specialist attempts to translate the descent into symbolic notation. One can start to sense how these issues could quickly lead to a disciplinary fracturing of monuments into materially based genres. The division of histories and epitaphs seem naturalized rather than embedded in the hierarchies that humans construct to control materiality and epistemology.

So, when and how did the text=book/monument=object divide begin? Or perhaps more accurately, when did this round of the text/object divide begin? The historiographer, Neville Morley, sheds light on key disciplinary issues that led to the situation in an essay titled "Monumentality and the Meaning of the Past in Ancient and Modern Historiography." Published in Cambridge Press's 2011 collection *The Western Time of Ancient History: Historiographical Encounters with the Greek and Roman Pasts*, the essay pegs the monument-document split to the late nineteenth and early twentieth century. He writes, "by the date of Nietzsche's essay, the work 'Denkmal' and its cognates, like 'monument' in English, were increasingly applied only to physical

objects of an imposing and symbolic resonance—tombs, statues, buildings and the like—whereas in earlier usage the terms could be used for surviving written texts, including historical accounts.”¹⁰² Morley claims that by the time of Alois Riegl’s influential *Der Moderne Denkmalkultus* the term monument has defaulted to the physical object as references to document-based monuments like history books become increasingly metaphorical, and certain strains of object-based historiography found themselves in the dustbin of antiquarianism.

Morley’s outline of the ethical and methodological criticisms of monumental histories for contemporary historians reveals disciplinary nervousness over the persuasive power of monumental approaches. Specifically, he traces attitudes towards materiality in Herodotus, Nietzsche, Riegl and Foucault and their impact on history writing. While *de rigueur* for ancient Rome, the *ethos* of monumental histories often conflict with the ethics of ‘scientific,’ ‘modern,’ ‘objective’ historiography popular today.¹⁰³ Morley’s words echo the lingering pressures on literature and rhetoric scholars to extract data from texts using close reading—a methodology that remains nearly ubiquitous despite the fall of New Criticism and the rise of cultural studies.

Morley’s observation that broader, multimedia definitions of monument isn’t isolated to German culture but is seen in Great Britain as well suggesting a lingering

¹⁰² Morley, Neville. “Monumentality and the Meaning of the Past in Ancient and Modern Historiography.” In *The Western Time of Ancient History: Historiographical Encounters with the Greek and Roman Pasts*. New York: Cambridge University Press. P 4.

¹⁰³ At history conferences one hears the term “activist historiography” when referring to works that wear their rhetorical power too openly. The term is sometimes accompanied by a disparaging reference to tendencies towards bias, nationalism, or cult of personality (in the case of biographers). This bit of hostility towards the illocutionary possibilities of history writing seems to be an identifying move distinguishing academic historians from popular historians.

influence of Roman or Catholic culture. During the aftermath of the Protestant Reformation a scholar named John Weever made an attempt to catalogue both the extant and the lost funerary monuments of Great Britain, Ireland “and the isles adjacent.”¹⁰⁴ Weever includes Scotland in his travels to gather materials for the work. The introductory matter to the work includes an essay on methodology called “Discourse on Funerall Monuments.” In this essay Weever defines terms: “A Monument is a thing erected, made, or written, for a memorial of some remarkable action, fit to be transferred to future posterities.”¹⁰⁵ In this definition monuments respond to the exigency of connecting the most significant events of the past to the future generations through the materialization of memory. Human memory, after all, depends on individual human health. Humans for all their resilience and adaptability remain vulnerable to plagues, to wars, in sum, to mortality. Textuality ameliorates the issues of memory and mortality by providing possibilities for intergenerational continuity of ideas. However, the definition also implies prioritization—this isn’t a memory storage device full of just any old data—monuments are the media for transmitting the most important memories.

Weever’s flexible view of the materiality of British monuments reflects an expansiveness towards media forms similar to what Morley noticed in German works. Weever writes, “and thus generally taken, all religious Foundations, all sumptuous and magnificent Structures, Cities, Towns, Towers, Castles, Pillars, Pyramids, Crosses, Obelisks, Amphitheatres, Statues, and the like, as well as Tombes and Sepulchres, are

¹⁰⁴ Weever, John. *Ancient Funerall Monuments within the united monarchy of Great Britain, Ireland and the isles adjacent*. Facsimile of 1631 original. Norwood, NJ: Walter J. Johnson, 1979. P 1.

¹⁰⁵ Weever, *Ancient Funerall Monuments*. P 1.

called Monuments.”¹⁰⁶ In this view the arts and architecture work as texts documenting the past. He does not limit monumental media to what might be considered outdoor works, or even large works in any physical sense: “now above all remembrances (by which men have endeavored, even in despite of death to give unto their Fames eternity) for worthiness and continuance, books or writings, have ever had the preeminence.”¹⁰⁷ Here we see that Weever not only defines genres of books as monuments but he places them at the top of a media hierarchy¹⁰⁸. This tendency to hierarchize media with writing and books at the top runs strongly through various Protestant denominations often appearing descriptive when the underlying values of the hierarchy are theologically prescriptive and/or proscriptive.¹⁰⁹ The prioritization is reflected in Weever’s selection of words over image--he records around a thousand epitaphs and inscriptions, but only includes eighteen woodcuts.

Of great interest here is that, Weever in no way, shape, or form ties the category of the monument to any one material. This presents a puzzle: is the category of monument a genre, or a medium? If the latter, than it would follow that there were past notions of media that were pragmatically intentional and not bounded by the technology

¹⁰⁶ Weever. *Ancient Funeral Monuments*. P 1.

¹⁰⁷ Weever. *Ancient Funeral Monuments*. P 1.

¹⁰⁸ Holger Schott Syme’s assertions about the “pictorial slippage” between writing and orality in sixteenth-century visual representations of speech supports a richer more nuanced approach to media and textuality in Great Britain prior to and during the Protestant Reformation. His argument engages with Walter Ong’s work on orality and literacy. Syme, Holger Schott. “The Look of Speech.” *Textual Cultures: Texts, Contexts, Interpretation* Vol. 2, No. 2, Autumn 2007. p 34-60.

¹⁰⁹ As will be elaborated on in the following chapter, these media hierarchies can be seen in the works of Scottish rhetoricians Hugh Blair and George Campbell. Their contemporary, Lord Kames received criticism for his overly broad treatise on *Elements of Criticism*, which addressed texts from a variety of media. Kames work seems to have escaped the notice of conversations around multimodal approaches to rhetoric.

of delivery. Instead, the monument as a medium is bounded by the telos of freezing memory in time so that it may recur in the future through textual form. Therefore, one can point to a thing and say “that is a monument” in the same manner as one would say “that’s a film” but unlike a film the material is not specific. This indicates an alternate heuristic of pragmatics rather than the empirically observable kind of media that can be easily traced to the periodic table of elements. In 2014, Peter Simonson proposed a new framework for categorizing media expanding beyond the physical. Simonson offers eleven categories of what he terms intentional media, but the category that stands out as the most useful to understanding is media as a habitat for regulative time either immediate or historical.

Weever’s monument to monuments like Wodrow’s monument to men has specific ways of using the intentional medium of time. Morley traces attitudes towards materiality in Herodotus, Nietzsche, Riegl and Foucault and their impact on history writing. Weever, like Wodrow, wrote in the wake of destruction, and struggled to find primary sources—in his case monuments. Like Wodrow, Weever expressed an impulse to create a new primary source to record a lost cultural archive. Whereas Wodrow memorializes people, Weever erects a monument to monuments themselves. Weever’s epistle to the reader yields valuable insights into the conversations in which he felt the lost monuments participated: “Having seen judicious Reader how carefully in other Kingdoms, the Monuments of the dead are preserved, and their Inscriptions or Epitaphs registered in their Church-Bookes; and having read the Epitaphs of Italy, France, Germany, and other Nations, collected and put in print by the pains of *Schraderus*,

Chytreus, Swertius, and other foreign writers.”¹¹⁰ Weever paints a picture of an international conversation between national archives of memories of the dead. He implies that Continental anthologies of epitaphs should be answered by British equivalents.

Weever manages to leave explicit references to religion out of his argument. He does not argue that epitaphs constitute sacred texts in a theological sense. Instead he condemns the iconoclastic behavior by reshaping the context from the Protestant Reformation’s notion of progress to one of degeneration: “knowing with all how barbarously within these his Majesties Dominions, they are (to the shame of our time) broken down, and utterly almost all ruined, their brazen Inscriptions erased, torn away, and pilfered, by which inhumane, deformable act, the honorable memory of many virtuous and noble persons deceased, is extinguished.”¹¹¹ The term “barbarously” implies that the opposite behavior, i.e. the preservation of the stones and their inscriptions, is civilized.

Weever further draws home the notion of a civilization built upon history by drawing a parallel between the relationship of his present time with that of antiquity and that of future generations with his time. He writes:

the true understanding of divers Families in these Realms descended of these worthy persons aforesaid is so darkened, as the true course of their inheritance is thereby partly interrupted: grieving at this insufferable injury offered as well to

¹¹⁰ Spelling is partially modernized for readability. Weever. *Ancient Funeral Monuments*. Epistle, p 5.

¹¹¹ Weever. *Ancient Funeral Monuments*. Epistle p 5.

the living, as the dead, out of the respect I bore to venerable Antiquity, and the due regard to continue the remembrance of the defunct to future posterity...¹¹²

In the lament above, Weever articulates not only his feelings of loss but also the blurry line between audiences and subjects of epitaphic genres. He sees a European audience, a Christian audience, an audience of noble families, of the local living, or the local dead, of the future living and of the future dead. Any of these audiences doubles as a pool of potential subjects for an epitaphic text. Thus his expression of loss focuses not so much on the value of the physical objects themselves but on the potential impact they had for human audiences to think about their collective past and leave a legacy for future generations. For Weever, the destruction of monuments makes memories mortal. The mortality of memory jeopardizes a society's ability to move forward by undermining its ability to learn from and build on a foundation of historical knowledge.

In sum, monuments can and do freeze time in so far as cultures can regulate time. outlive disciplines and outlast methodologies but only up to a point. Iconoclasms occur not only in physical spaces with sledgehammers and bonfires but in academic metadiscourse spaces with shifts in paradigms and epistemologies as well. How many history books over the course of the twentieth century lost their monumental status and fell out of print due to the changing tides of historiography? Nonetheless, one can say that in spite of the impossibility of eternal textual life, monuments undoubtedly have a longer multigenerational sense of *kairos*, i.e. the opportune moment. Epitaphic genres in particular provide an opportunity to explore the ever-changing relationships between

¹¹² Weever. *Ancient Funeral Monuments*. Epistle p 5.

people and texts and people and things. Attempts to bind the object nature of the monument genre to a particular set of media are bound to fail as new materials are introduced and old materials become obsolete.¹¹³ Therefore, acknowledging that monuments slip fluidly between the specific sense of “that monument over there” (a text) and “monuments” in the broad sense of an inventional media brings us closer to an integrated view of content and form needed to understand epitaphic genres.

CONCLUSION: THE MONUMENTAL CASE FOR INTERDISCIPLINARY RHETORICAL METHODOLOGIES

Wodrow’s *History of the Sufferings* and similarly epitaphic martyrologies and histories of prior eras indicate that multimodal notions of media and textuality are not as new as we think. The rapid proliferation of digital media has inspired theorists like Gregory Ulmer to push on the boundaries between text and object; word and image.¹¹⁴ Some of these theories take innovation for granted as a narrative of progress, forgetting the longer and sometimes cyclical histories of power hiding behind the seemingly natural hierarchies of genre and media. The following examples illustrate that the need for new approaches to old media and pre-silicon materials to recover lost textualities and reveal forgotten contributions to the cultures of the past. Drawn from state-of-the-discipline monuments, otherwise known as themed edited collections, these examples demonstrate the need for rhetorical theories of monuments beyond English and Communications

¹¹³ For example, Mark Zuckerberg used Facebook’s technology to create memorial pages for loved ones to memorialize deceased users.

¹¹⁴ Ulmer, Gregory L. *Electronic Monuments*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press 2005.

departments in the fields of archaeology and urban studies.¹¹⁵ These works, together with that of Morley, the historiographer mentioned above, represent the tip of the iceberg of humanities departments with monumental territory. Other disciplines include, but are not limited to, art history, architecture, media and communications, film studies, comparative literature and various multidisciplinary programs.

Although these collections each represent the point of view of a distinct discipline, they have in common the recognition of the persuasive power of monuments or ‘monumentality’ paired with a call for ethical or theoretical interventions. In other words, they display a need for rhetorical theories suitable for multidisciplinary applications. Archaeologist, Brian Molyneaux, expressed the need for rhetorical analysis of ancient monuments as early as 1992 in his call for an “archaeology theory group.” *The Cultural Life of Images: Visual Representation in Archaeology* answered that call in 1997 with a series of edited chapters addressing topics like “pictures and words” “reconstruction” and the “rhetoric of the image.” In the introduction Molyneaux writes that “the use of intense visual stimuli in a similar way helps generate the power of persuasion that is used so effectively today in advertising and entertainment, as the beautifying of non-essential commodities lures the consumer.”¹¹⁶ Molyneaux’s training stems from the field of archaeology and he works in a department of anthropology, nevertheless, by invoking the “power of persuasion” he sounds like a rhetorician. The

¹¹⁵ The disciplines of archaeology, urban studies and history rank prominently amongst those with disciplinary claims to epitaphic texts in their roles as objects representing ancient cultures, as features in cityscapes and as concluding tropes in biographies.

¹¹⁶ Molyneaux, Brian. “Introduction: The Cultural Life of Images.” *The Cultural Life of Images: Visual Representation in Archaeology*. Ed. Brian Molyneaux. New York: Routledge, 1997. 1-10.

linkages he sees between modern advertising and monuments highlight the important rhetorical features shared by these forms at the generic level. Monument builders and advertisers alike go to great lengths to compose texts to accomplish the goal of drawing attention to its own readability. This attention-focusing quality creates possibilities for comparative analysis across seemingly incomparable texts like a Holocaust Memorial Museum, a Super Bowl commercial, a campaign poster for George W. Bush and an eighteenth-century Covenanter martyrology. Molyneux recognizes the same argumentative quality in the focusing of a viewer's attention as Wysocki and Lynch but lacks a theoretical framework for analysis.¹¹⁷

Molyneux's interest in interpreting the attention-getting persuasive potential of ancient monuments indicates a realization of their textuality. Scholars in urban studies approach monumentality with a similar sense of expansive critical excitement from a more Continental angle. For Michiel Dehaene and Lieven De Caeter, the persuasive power of not just objects but also the spaces and places they inhabit carry implications for understanding power in public memory studies. The collection *Heterotopia and the City: Public Space in a Postcivil Society* (2008) bundled a new translation of Foucault's essay "des espaces autres" with critical case study chapters from urban studies scholars. Dehaene and De Caeter introduce their exigency for returning to Foucault's neglected essay on architecture:

¹¹⁷ Wysocki, Anne Frances and Dennis A. Lynch. *Compose design advocate: a rhetoric for integrating written, visual, and oral communication*. New York: Pearson Longman 2007, 18.

The contemporary transformation of the city displays a profound redrawing of the contours of public and private space, bringing to the fore an equally treacherous and fertile ground of conditions that are not merely hybrid, but rather defy an easy description in these terms. It is on this treacherous terrain that Foucault's notion of heterotopia can shed a new light.¹¹⁸

Implied in Foucault's theory of the heterotopia is the separation of the material and the representational, with the tantalizing possibility of their theoretical coexistence in the metaphor of the mirror. The mirror works simultaneously as an object and a representation. Foucault's notion of the mirror as space/place raises exciting possibilities for the study of monumentality in urban studies. For rhetoric scholars the heterotopia articulates certain types of urban spaces like cemeteries, museums and hospitals as fulfilling textual functions, satisfying cultural exigencies.

Each of these state-of-the-discipline monuments do the work of marking the metaphorical landscape of their respective fields signaling the divergence from an old course to a new path. Although the exigencies of anthologies such as these are bundled differently than the epitaphic impulses of Wodrow or Weever, they share features indicating how the anatomy of book monuments has standardized with the academic publishing industry in the years between their works. Remaining the same is the self-conscious editors' introductory essay defining terms, explaining the ethics behind key

¹¹⁸ Lieven De Caeter. "Heterotopia in a Postcivil Society." *Heterotopia and the City: Public Space in a Postcivil Society*. Ed. Michiel Dehaene and Lieven De Caeter. New York: Routledge, 2008. P 3-10.

decisions, calling attention to texts within texts and justifying the timing of the work. The potentially chaotic polyphony of allographic voices is organized into clever associations on the table of contents. The citations mark the unseen corpus of knowledge, while appendices reveal the bits and pieces that must be displayed for public view.

Heterotopia and the City: Public Space in a Postcivil Society does more than the memory work of academic genres, it features the epitaphic exigency of honoring Foucault and situating his theoretical contributions marking him as a posthumous member of their group. The most successful monuments do more than one thing. Here, the combination of exigencies does the work of bringing together two overlapping scholarly communities. The book marks a new direction to those scholars invested in urban studies, and honors a fallen colleague for those who simply enjoy the praise of one of the most iconic characters in Continental philosophy, Michel Foucault.

In closing, *Heterotopia and the City* probably won't remain in print as long as Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings*, but it provides an important clue to that eighteenth-century monument's mysterious longevity. By all accounts Wodrow successfully captured the imagination of the new Hanover dynasty meriting a stipend from the King. But as any discarded royal mistress will tell you, capturing the imagination of a monarch doesn't guarantee a long shelf life, even if he does award you a stipend. In spite of Wodrow's humble stylistics and overwhelming approach to evidence, his conscientious concern with the representation of the Covenanter dead resulted in overlapping exigencies. This near merging of key exigencies from the epitaph and history genres gave the work a special flexibility in its confrontation with each new generation—that

moment when a text awaits its acceptance or banishment into oblivion. His approach made the text relevant not only to his British contemporaries, but to the ever expanding diasporas of Scots and Presbyterians some of whom were pushed out of their homes by the very events he recorded. As a book monument it became a regular feature in the established Church of Scotland. It was stowed and shipped over long distances commemorating the Covenanters and inspiring a discourse of monuments across the British Commonwealths. In the nineteenth-century, *History of the Sufferings* is reprinted during the Great Disruption when the Church of Scotland traumatically split.¹¹⁹ The book became a rallying point commemorating Reformation values for the new Free Church's nascent identity.

¹¹⁹ The new edition featured a new introduction by the Robert Burns, the theologian. This new introduction added honorifics for the author, giving Wodrow an epitaphic nod. It also reframed the kairos of the work for a new generation. Wodrow, Robert. *History of the Suffering of the Church of Scotland from the Restoration to the Revolution by the Rev. Robert Wodrow...and notes, by Robert Burns*. Vols 1-4. Glasgow: Blackie and Son 1835-6. Harry Ransom Center: Austin, Texas.

Chapter 2--Margaret Wilson Wasn't Buried Here?

What Epitaphic Genres tell us about Rhetoric & Media

I remember once standing in the cemetery of Stirling and gazing upon the monument of two Christian sisters who suffered martyrdom for Christ, and as I read the inscription on the tombstone, I thought of how much we were indebted to those who have borne the burden and heat of the day. –Rev. Duncan McNeill Young¹²⁰

In 1685, Margaret MacLachlan, aged 63, and Margaret Wilson, aged 18, were found guilty of supporting extremist Covenanters. As punishment, they were tied to stakes on the Solway shore and drowned by the incoming tide. –Claire Watts¹²¹

A tourist hikes up steep stony streets to Stirling Castle, pausing to peer through a black cast iron gate. Curiosity piqued, the tourist enters a cemetery and wanders down a path lined with eight-foot tall Celtic crosses and a variety of obelisks. Pulling out a cell phone, the tourist photographs the inscription on a rosy granite gravestone, and shielding the screen from the falling mist, sends a text message to a friend with the same family name. In the distance, the tourist glimpses an unexpected bit of blue standing out against the gray sky. The gritty walkway crunches underfoot--a texture somewhere between sand and gravel. Slowing to a stop, the tourist encounters the life-size marble statue of a

¹²⁰ Epitaphic genres in graveyards find their print matter soul mates in the epigraphs of books, in miscellanies and in anthologies. This essay acknowledges this generic relationship through a series of footnotes mapping not only the corpus of knowledge, but a number of corpses as well. Young, Duncan McNeill. Ed. *Gathering Jewels; or, The Secret of a Beautiful Life. In Memoriam of Mr. & Mrs. James Knowles. Selected from their Diaries.* New York: William Knowles, 1887. *Books.google.com*. Web. Accessed 25 March 2016. Pp 241-2; 261-2.

¹²¹ This efficient gloss of the deaths of Margaret MacLachlan and Margaret Wilson appears in a recent children's book sold in Edinburgh shops and museums. The words accompany a photograph of the stone pillar monument marking the place where the women were executed. Watts, Claire. *The Covenanters.* Edinburgh: Scottie Books 2011. P 35.

young woman sitting serenely with her little sister; bible lies open on their laps; they are flanked by an attentive angel with stone wings, which defying all laws of physics, might sustain divine flight; the group, each exquisitely carved in pearly marble, stands on an octagonal pedestal surrounded by a white cast iron canopy topped with blue etched glass in the manner of a nineteenth-century *immortelle* standing out against the sea of granite monuments that ripple around it.

A bit overwhelmed, the tourist trips over an interpretation plaque planted in the damp, yielding lawn, then reads it. Finally noticing the inscriptions along each side of the monument's base and inscribed on the glass windows, the tourist moves from panel to panel. Drawn off the path to peer through some flowers at the writing, the tourist notices subtle inconsistencies on the statues of Margaret and Agnes Wilson. Slight color variations in the marble call attention to the deliberate inferiority of some of the carving-- here a hand had been replaced, there a head or wing. The museum quality restoration asserts itself quietly but firmly—*vandalize her if you dare, we can rebuild her*. The tourist snaps a close-up of a wee marble lamb gazing adoringly up at Margaret and Agnes. Delighted with the shot, the tourist uploads it to a social media account where it receives seventy-two likes from acquaintances in three countries¹²².

Inspired by a passage from Robert Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings*, the monument commemorates the martyrdom of Margaret Wilson on May 11, 1685. Wilson

¹²² All observational details of monuments are based on fieldwork by the author in Scotland, England, Canada and the United States in the period 2009-2015, unless state otherwise. Thank you to the Social Science Research Council, the Andrew Mellon Foundation, and the departments of Rhetoric & Writing, and English at the University of Texas at Austin for supporting my trips to the field. Special thanks to colleagues at the business schools of the University of Texas and the University of Edinburgh for the opportunity to work with their talented undergraduates in the McComb's study abroad program.

with her younger sister Agnes, along with a mentor, Margaret Maclauchlan refused to toast the King at a dinner party. Their host turned them over to the local authorities. Their sentence was to be tied to a stake and drowned by the rising tide at the floodmark of Solway. In Wodrow's version, the pair are presented as complementary foils of female innocence and wisdom: Wilson is eighteen, homeless, and virginal; and Maclauchlan is sixty-three with "more than ordinary Knowledge, Discretion, and Prudence."¹²³

The history gets more detailed as Gilbert Wilson, the girls' father and an Episcopalian conformist, is "fined for his Childrens' alleged Irregularities and Opinions, which he had no Share in, and harassed by frequent Quarterings of the Soldiers, sometimes an Hundred of them upon him at once, who lived at Discretion, upon any thing in the House or Field belonging to him."¹²⁴ Gilbert had been under pressure for some time to inform on his covenanting daughters and sons who had been wandering the local mountains for several months as outlaws. Gilbert persistently visited various authorities until he was able to bail out Agnes, thirteen years old, for 100 pounds Sterling—a small fortune in 1685. He travelled to Edinburgh to attempt to appeal for the two Margarets at the central authority there.

Meanwhile, Margaret attempts to comfort her family by writing a long letter from jail declaring that she is at peace with God and prepared to die. On May 11th, the two

¹²³ Wodrow, Robert. *The History of Sufferings of the Church of Scotland from the Restauration to the Revolution*. Vol. 2. Edinburgh: James Watson 1722. Harry Ransom Center: Austin, Texas. Pp 505-507.

¹²⁴ Wodrow, Robert. *The History of Sufferings of the Church of Scotland from the Restauration to the Revolution*. Vol. 2. Edinburgh: James Watson 1722. Pp 505-507.

Margarets are bound to stakes at different points on the floodmark such that young Wilson would watch her wise friend Maclauchlan drown first. Rather than break down at the sight, Wilson sings psalms and recites what she remembers of the bibles. She drowns praying. The authorities resuscitate her and offer to spare her life if she will take the oath. She refuses. They re-drown her. Tragically, a reprieve from Edinburgh exists in the records. Either it never arrived or was ignored by the Wigton authorities. Little Agnes, ransomed by her father's silver, escaped.¹²⁵

The Margaret Wilson Monument commemorates the young martyr in the town of Stirling's Victorian-era Valley Cemetery illustrating the power and limitations of epitaphic genres. Something that might make scholars with strict definitions of argumentation nervous about monuments like these is the degree of control they grant to the interpreter, or rather the seeming lack of control on the part of the rhetor. For example, the *Margaret Wilson Monument* can be approached along perpendicular paths or by cutting across a lawn allowing multiple arrangements of the octagonal faces. Furthermore, most monuments depend on generic conventions to implicitly state their thesis, which the reader strongly infers through context. Thesis statements for this monument could include: "Margaret Wilson is worth remembering," and "Learn from the example of Margaret Wilson" and "The Citizens of Stirling think this woman is worth of

¹²⁵ According to rumor former U.S. president and devout Presbyterian, Woodrow Wilson, was connected by blood through the intermarriage of this Wilson family with Robert Wodrow's family.

your attention.” The presence of multiple equally valid thesis statements can cause considerable public controversy as monumental texts encounter new generations.¹²⁶

First erected in 1859, today the *Margaret Wilson Monument* is accompanied by an official interpretation plaque. A local consulting firm, Art is an Option, designed the interpretation plaque for the *Margaret Wilson Monument* as part of a thirty-seven-piece set of “heritage plaques” for historic sites in the town of Stirling.¹²⁷ Flanked by the heraldic image of an archer, the plaque states:

THE STATUES

Statues of heroes of the Scottish Presbyterian Reformation, set up when the Valley Cemetery was opened, were part of the educational and ‘improving’ atmosphere of Victorian Stirling: there were even cemetery guides. These enclosed figures represent the traditional story of Margaret Wilson who, aged 18, was executed by drowning in the Solway Firth for refusing to renounce her Protestant faith. She had no connection with Stirling. The monument avoids the horror of her death and presents a more sentimental Victorian idealization of women.

An unintended irony of the plaque is that it is itself intended to be “educational and improving.” It provides a cheap substitute for tour guides and is designed to authoritatively teach twenty-first century visitors a seemingly objective insight into the text.

¹²⁶ For perspectives on the rhetoric of iconoclasm and of destruction of monuments in the Protestant Reformation see, Boldrick, Stacy, Leslie Brubaker and Richard Clay, eds. *Striking Images, Iconoclasm Past and Present*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate 2013. See also, Capp, Bernard. *England’s Culture Wars: Puritan Reformation and its Enemies in the Interregnum, 1649-1660*. Oxford: Oxford University Press 2012.

¹²⁷ Art is an Option includes the heritage plaque project in its on-line portfolio. “Heritage Plaques.” Art is an Option. <http://www.artisanoption.co.uk/interpretation/heritage.html>. Web 29 April 2016.

One can think of metagenres like guided tours, pamphlets and interpretation plaques as an attempt to guide readers to the ‘right’ interpretation of publicly displayed works. Often mistaken as purely informational, these curatorial genres often do more than describe a monument, they give prescriptive and proscriptive arguments attempting to control how a work should be read. As such, plaques often say as much about the values of the generation in which they are written as they do about the values of the generation that designed the monument.

This heritage plaque demonstrates anxieties about how people read, or worse might misread, the monument. First, it seems to worry a bit about who is ultimately held accountable for the monumental text, i.e. is the town the rhetor? The need of this town to curate the monument implies that there might be more than one answer to that question. Third, by pointing out that Wilson “had nothing to do with Stirling” the plaque makes distinctions between epitaphic genres. In this case, the fact that Margaret Wilson’s body rests elsewhere points to the distinction between epitaphs and cenotaphs. Second, the plaque expresses concern about the appropriate representation of gender. The concern seems to stem from the “sentimentalism” of its style and manner of presenting Wilson as a topic. Finally, the plaque presents its official interpretation in a concise prose paragraph that circumvents the epigraphic inscription on the actual monument. This chapter offers alternatives to the plaque’s official reading of the *Margaret Wilson Monument*, and in doing so, hopes to create paths for approaching the rhetoric of monuments with a more holistic sense of their textuality and its implications for understanding epitaphic style.

WHO IS THE MONUMENTAL RHETOR? OR, LEARNING FROM ERECTIONS

The interpretation plaque described above indicates discomfort about the responsibility for monumental texts. It attempts to clarify that the rhetor is a prior generation, i.e. Victorian Stirling, not today's Stirling. Outdoor monuments do not have standardized attribution conventions, in contrast to book monuments which fall under the highly developed conventions of authorship that keep a designated rhetor to the straight and narrow of the byline. The equivalent on a monument, "this monument was erected by the magistrates and town council" credits a person or group but the convention is far from standardized.¹²⁸ In contrast, print conventions of onymity are often regulated by law. Thus, the verso of most title pages also acknowledges a legally recognized copyright holder.¹²⁹ Similar moves in the music industry have led to a new convention of listing not only the lead vocalist, but also well-known contributing singers under the new designation "featuring." Academic and publisher style guides reinforce these standards through citation conventions. Currently, the APA style still lacks an official convention for citing works of art. The Chicago and MLA styles both default to the "artist" as

¹²⁸ This wording appears on a monument to William Drummond located on the West wall of the Stirling Church of the Holy Rude adjoining the Valley Cemetery. Erected in 1873, the inscribed marble tablet honors him for his "professional skill and his unrivalled taste" among other things. It is part of a seven-panel memorial screen forming an honor wall for seven town worthies, which was filled gradually by vote from 1818 to 1873. *Memorial Screen: William Drummond Tablet*. Holyrude Church, Stirling, United Kingdom. July 2015.

¹²⁹ This was not always the case. As recently as the late 19th century a great deal of print matter was published anonymously making the guessing game "who is the rhetor?" a lively part of the reading experience in genres such as the novel (Sir Walter Scott and Jane Austen's works being canonical examples). Anonymity protected writers in pamphlet genres that commented on controversial political or religious events in times of censorship.

fulfilling the author role in a citation. Nonetheless, the interpretation plaque doesn't bother to mention who constructed the *Margaret Wilson Monument*.

The evaluation of situated ethos appeals ties tightly to the identity of the rhetor. Ethos appeals depend on the mediation of relationships situated, invented, whether explicit or implied, between the rhetor and audience. Monumental texts represent the extreme ends of mediation stretching from Wodrow's first-person introductory chapter in which he directly addresses the audience from his real life persona as a preacher and historian to Drummond's message, which is presented through the embodiment of the subject herself. A Presbyterian pastor in New York recalled his visit to the monument without any indication of who erected it in his funeral sermon for Matilda Knowles, a popular member of the congregation and former missionary. The sermon recollects that: "the elder and younger sister are exquisitely sculptured, seated together with an open Bible on their laps, and a lamb by their side, while an angel is standing behind them gazing intently on the scene. Who can tell but the departed one gazed upon this very scene in the days of her sunny childhood, for the Bible was her daily delight."¹³⁰ The rhetor's persona is so subordinated to the topic, Margaret Wilson, as to go unnoticed. Instead it is the sculptural representation of Wilson that becomes the conduit of identification, or consubstantiation, for the pastor.

¹³⁰ This recollection occurs in a book with epitaphic exigencies of its own. It appears in the half of the book dedicated to the memory of Matilda Knowles and reflects a tendency in the travel narratives of American Presbyterians to invoke the monuments of Scotland. Another passage in the book recounts a visit to the grave of the militant Covenanter Richard Cameron. Young, Duncan McNeill. Ed. *Gathering Jewels; or, The Secret of a Beautiful Life. In Memoriam of Mr. & Mrs. James Knowles. Selected from their Diaries*. New York: William Knowles, 1887. *Books.google.com*. Accessed 25 March 2016. Pp 241-2; 261-2.

Interpretations of unattributed monuments tend to have a Galatea effect where, in the mind of the viewer, the monument is perceived to take on the role of the rhetor rather than simply acting as a medium for the rhetor.¹³¹ Daniel Defoe describes the phenomenon in *Memoirs of the Church of Scoland*: “the Mob rose upon the Priests, and put an End to their Pageantry: For they pulled St. *Giles* out of his Throne, which was erected on the Shoulders of the Priests, threw his Saintsship into the Dirt, and in short, the sacred Image suffered immediate Martyrdom. But the Priests had no Mind to die with their Deity; for they fled every Man as he could.”¹³² Here St. Giles is a statue, not the actual St. Giles. Defoe takes advantage of the confusion in readings of iconic texts to poke a bit of fun at both Catholics and Protestants. Nonetheless, iconoclasms were a serious part of the Protestant Reformation. Cognitive scientists most likely will find an explanation for this anthropomorphism of texts, but in the meantime, one can easily imagine how notions of idolatry may have originated from the seeming ability of some texts to come to life.

In addition to the confusion over anthropomorphism, bundled exigencies can obscure the rhetor from interpretive view. As described in the Introductory Chapter above, there are multiple generic exigencies for epitaphic genres, some of which are

¹³¹ By Galatea effect I do not mean the conceit used by social psychologists to describe boss-employee relationship expectations. Instead, I mean a situation in which a text seems to come to life and speak for itself as in the ancient Greek myth of Pygmalion. In that legend Pygmalion sculpts a beautiful woman in marble and falls in love with his own work. Taking pity on him Aphrodite breathes life into the work. Now a living woman named Galatea, the former statue develops a will of her own. In some versions she rejects him and in others she marries him.

¹³² Defoe, Daniel. *Memoirs of the Church of Scotland, in Four Periods*. Edinburgh: DeMcLeod & Son 1844. Digitized copy from Oxford University. [Internet Archive](http://www.archive.org). www.archive.org. 22 March 2016. P 8.

speech acts. The heart of the matter seems to be that the genre-specific speech act of erecting a monument, and the specific argument made by the actual monument are viewed holistically by most interpreters. Therefore, monuments illustrate the overlap of multiple utterances by multiple rhetors in a single composite textual object.

Furthermore, custodianship and display of the monument seems to be further interpreted as speech act associated with maintaining an erection. Further complicating matters, *The Margaret Wilson Monument*, like many in the cenotaph genre, consists of diverse materials by different artists who did not collaborate. Thus, different configurations exist for what is considered “the Text” of any particular monument. This combination of factors yields several models for identifying the rhetor, which can be seen as different ways that communities prioritize the answers to the following questions related to its erection and maintenance:

Who displays the monument? (Custodianship)

Who sponsored the monument? (i.e. Where’s the money?)

Who physically built the monument? (The artist or craftsperson)

Who organized the effort? (The committee model)

Who erected the monument? (A compound notion involving design decisions)

The answers to these questions for *The Margaret Wilson Monument* demonstrate how notions of monumental rhetoric depend on the priorities of local symposia.¹³³

¹³³ Jeffrey Walker’s work theorizes the symposium to account for understandability in spite of extreme shortening or informality in argument structures used by short classical epigrams and poetry. The symposium is a group of insiders with relatively high levels of “likemindedness.” Today Stirling boasts a population of almost 50,000 people but in the late nineteenth century was much smaller creating the ideal

As mentioned above the interpretation plaque makes careful distinctions between present and past citizens of Stirling. We can think of towns like Stirling and cemeteries in general as having both the qualities of a symposium and a public. The heritage plaque acts as a translator or adaptation instrument between the two. For *The Margaret Wilson Monument*, the heritage plaque also raises the question of who is the rhetor and makes the move to tell the mobile reader exactly whose message they are reading: those sentimental Victorians with their funny views about women. The plaque, like many introductions to controversial books, uses narratives of progress as tropes to make critical distancing moves. The result is a hierarchy of generations in which the “us-now” is superior to the “them-then” of primitive prior generations. Plaques like this make clear the importance of the symposia in monumental rhetoric. Here that symposia is defined generationally--today’s reader is not the reader of 1800 Stirling or even the reader of 1745 Stirling. The plaque implies that generational symposia have different standards for taste as well as gender politics.

When it comes to monumentality, money talks. William Drummond, a prosperous Stirling seed merchant and nurseryman is the man most frequently credited as the rhetor for this monument, and he paid for it out of his own pocket. Monuments of any size entail considerable expense, and thus are as frequently funded by subscription or institutions, as they are private individuals. After the original work was severely damaged by a mysterious marble-eating environmental contaminant, Drummond funded

conditions for symposiastic argumentation in public display. Walker, Jeffrey. *Rhetoric and Poetics in Antiquity*. New York: Oxford University Press 2000. P 250-251.

the cleaning and polishing of the stonework. Next, he funded the addition of a protective cast iron and glass copula transforming his original vision of an open-air work into a literal femme covert. He transferred control over the trust for the care of the monuments to his Trustees before he dedicated the monument.¹³⁴ Finally, he made sure the trust fund¹³⁵ for the maintenance of the monument went into his will.¹³⁶ Articles and brochures frequently mention his financial contributions and his rhetorical goals together. For example, the cemetery's official cemetery website gives him the following credit: "several other examples of William Drummond's munificence are to be found in the graveyard each with its own story. The story behind this one has no connection to Stirling whatsoever with Stirling, but is an eloquent indicator of Drummond's obsession with religion."¹³⁷ Here his level of financial responsibility becomes associated with evangelical exigency. Although the website echoes the language of the plaque writer in its disavowal of Margaret Wilson as an appropriate, it acknowledges that the text's eloquence merits notice as does the generosity of Drummond as sponsor.

Perhaps surprisingly, one of the least acknowledged possible rhetors for the monument is the man whose signature indicates he sculpted the statues, Alexander

¹³⁴ The other popular option being to retain control during his lifetime and only turn over matters to trustees upon his death. "Martyr's Memorial." *Stirling Observer*. 30 April 1863, p 4. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.

¹³⁵ The money remained in a private trust until 1923 when the trustees proposed turning it over to the Town Council in an attempt to circumvent the rules limiting the trustees from spending the capital, which limited their ability to make repairs. "Ornamental Ground at Stirling Cemetery, The Martyr's Monument, Proposal that Town Council Take over the Trust." *Stirling Observer*. 20 February 1923. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.

¹³⁶ Drummond, William. "Will and Trust." SC70/1/42/315-337. 1868. National Records Office: Edinburgh, United Kingdom.

¹³⁷ "History: The Martyr's Monument." *Old Town Cemetery Stirling*. www.oldtowncemetery.co.uk. Web. Accessed 25 March 2016.

Handyside Ritchie. Scotland was experiencing a miniature Renaissance in sculpture. During the nineteenth century world-class instruction in the arts became available in Edinburgh, Glasgow and Aberdeen. Notable public statues to Queen Victoria by artists like Alexander Brodie and Sir John Steell garnered royal approval. Ritchie was a successful native Scottish sculptor who studied in Rome at several points in his career honing his craft in marble. He kept a studio in Edinburgh with a team of assistants and students. He exhibited at the Royal Academy and was elected an associate of the Royal Scottish Academy. Ritchie can be seen as Drummond's sculptural amanuensis. Drummond commissioned a number of works from Ritchie including the "wee" William Wallace statue, the five Reformer heroes in Stirling Cemetery, a statue of Ebenezer Erskine and *The Margaret Wilson Memorial*.

In spite of his fame in the Scottish art world, Ritchie is not associated with the statue as frequently or as directly as William Drummond and even more rarely is credited with anything like persuasive intent. For example, a visiting pastor from Philadelphia declared in 1878: "Here is a prize monument by Ritchie, erected in memory of "Margaret Wilson, virgin martyr of the wave."¹³⁸ Although the statement acknowledges the quality of Ritchie's carving it immediately engages with the inscriptions on the work, which are the choices of Drummond. Another attributes the beauty of the figures to Ritchie, but their "taste" to Drummond.¹³⁹ Furthermore, the cast iron cupola stamped by the Sun

¹³⁸ Hutton, William. *Twelve Thousand Miles over Land and Sea: Or, Wanderings in Europe*. Philadelphia: Grant, Faires & Rodgers, Printers. 1878. 123-125. *Books.google.com*. Web. 29 April 2016.

¹³⁹ "The New Cemetery—Erection of Statuary." *Stirling Observer*. (Tho ed.) 7 April 1859, p 3. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.

Foundry in Glasgow, and its architect John Rochhead, complicate how one defines the ‘artist’ for a composite work of this sort.¹⁴⁰ These artisans did not collaborate, but were separately contracted by Drummond at different times.¹⁴¹ This indicates that if one were to attempt to cite the monument using the analog of the artist as author, then the strategy would need to incorporate the sculptor, the architect and the foundry.

The use of teams to compose outdoor monuments extends beyond material craftsmanship and fundraising and often involves an organizing committee. This monument is no exception. In an article lauding Drummond’s contributions to the cemetery, the authors pauses to acknowledge the committee, “it would here, however, be an act of ingratitude, were we not to refer...to the excellent and important service rendered to the community by the Cemetery Committee, in aiding or facilitating, and even in personally carrying forward the general course of improvement in the Castlehill.”¹⁴² It just so happens that Drummond played a key leadership role on that committee. Sources that mention the committee sometimes acknowledge an additional

¹⁴⁰ In the late 1980s an archivist for the Central Regional Council documented who made each portion of the monument as follows: “the sculpture was from the studio of Handyside Ritchie, Edinburgh. The figure of the angel was cut in Rome; and the other two pieces were specially prepared for the Monument. The glass, and most probably the ironwork, surrounding the monument, was put up in 1867. At the same time, the figures were re-polished by Mr. William Barclay, sculptor, Stirling. Robert Finlayson did the glazier work; and George Smith and Co., the Sun Foundry, were responsible for the ironwork. Dixon, George A. Letter. 5 March 1987. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.

¹⁴¹ The cupola was added several years after the original 1659 erection of the statue group and was never a part of the original design. The Sun Foundry was one of the premiere providers of ironmongery in Scotland at the time. Many extant examples of their work can be found in Glasgow and Edinburgh. John Rochhead, the architect, gained fame for the enormous gothic style William Wallace memorial tower on Abbey Craig just outside of Stirling. Thus, the “wee” William Wallace monument is a distinction made to designate the smaller statue in downtown Stirling.

¹⁴² “The Cemetery Statuary.” *Stirling Observer* 7 April 1859. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P 3.

leader, Dr. Charles Rogers, an Army chaplain based in the Castle.¹⁴³ Rogers pushed to obtain the Valley space below the Castle for the cemetery project. The land had previously been used sporadically by locals for pig farming or drying laundry but had no designated purpose. During this period, legislation impacted who had control over the aesthetics of Scottish cemeteries and the right to build or expand them. The Burial Grounds (Scotland) Act 1855 outlined the opportunity for new cemetery designs and layouts, but it also included language guiding leadership and decision-making. In Scotland the Burial Act allowed for the decoration of cemeteries by committees of townspeople under the final authority of the local sheriff called parochial boards. In other words, the acts created a system of cemetery rhetoric distinct from that in England. In England, veto power over new cemetery decorations was held by an established church Bishop (i.e. Anglican Episcopalian) or his representatives.¹⁴⁴ In Stirling, Rogers took the lead on clearing the land, while Drummond designed the monumental figures and the plant scape, together leading the committee in the design of a distinctive new community display space.

The reappearance of Drummond in the answers to multiple questions regarding the production of the monument indicate a compound notion of monumental rhetoric: the erector. The term originates from architecture (to erect a building) and reflects the

¹⁴³ For example, a three hundred year anniversary article mentions both Rogers and Drummond. The article also paraphrases much of Wodrow's passage on the martyring of Margaret Wilson. "Haggerty File/Notelets: Tribute in stone to a young martyr's death on the sands." *Stirling Observer*. 15 May 1985. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P 14.

¹⁴⁴ Burial Grounds (Scotland) Act 1855. 1855 Chapter 68 18 and 19 Vict. *Legislation.gov.uk*. Accessed 25 March 2016.

multi-disciplinary nature of epitaphic genres.¹⁴⁵ It's meaning in terms of the rhetorship of multimodal texts is closer to the citation conventions used in film studies, i.e. that the director is the rhetor. The types of organizing, leading, and executive design decisions made by film directors are analogous to the work done by monument erectors. The closest convention in print matter would be that of a managing editor of a scholarly collection or series. If one entertains the 'erector' as the monumental rhetor, part of the tension in the interpretation plaque analyzed above can be explained by shifting generational answers to who is responsible for the message of a text. Multiple sources from the symposium of Stirling's mobile visitors shows that most credit Drummond and not Handyside Ritchie for the monument. The erection of monuments reveals that the material contribution of the artist who crafts the work might lead to a misunderstanding of who the key stakeholders are in commemorative discourse. It is difficult to say how much is lost when conflation of rhetors occurs, but it is safe to say that in this case it would have shifted the conversation about the monument away from Stirling, its committees and its cemetery to the Edinburgh studio of Ritchie and perhaps his circles of colleagues in London or Rome. That would be an interesting conversation too, but a very different one. The persona and decorum of the work might be analyzed very differently than when it is associated with William Drummond, the evangelical nurseryman of Stirling. Would we notice that in the same week that *the Margaret Wilson Monument*

¹⁴⁵ John Ruskin, the nineteenth century art critic, theorized that the twofold practical duties of buildings are: "acting and talking;--acting, as to defend us from weather or violence; talking, as the duty of monuments or tombs, to record facts and express feelings; or of churches, temples, public edifices, treated as books of history, to tell such history clearly and forcibly." Ruskin, John. *Stones of Venice*. London: Collins 1960. P29.

was erected, Drummond's colleague, Rogers was invited to give a public sermon on the Scottish Reformers and their role in fighting for religious liberty?¹⁴⁶ In conclusion, in the vacuum of theorization for monuments and their rhetoric, the richness of their ethos appeals prove as vulnerable to the erosion of local history as their obdurate surfaces to the soft patter of rain.

MARGARET ISN'T BURIED HERE? EPITAPHS AND CENOTAPHS

Wilson "had no connection with Stirling." The statement implies the monolithic expectation that graveyards should only include epitaphs, and that epitaphs should have corresponding human remains. The text dismisses Margaret Wilson, whose bodily remains rest in Wigtown, as having nothing to do with the local town.¹⁴⁷ The heritage plaque refers to Wilson's hero monuments as "statues," and carefully distinguishes them temporally from the surrounding epitaphs for the local dead by mentioning that they were "set up when the Valley Cemetery was opened." The explicit distinction arises from nervousness that the epitaph and cenotaph genres look too much alike--indistinguishable in fact without a shovel. The epitaph functions to mark the location of the remains of the dead and record them into the public memory. The cenotaph works to mark a site at which the memories of any dead can be displayed and read into local public memory.

¹⁴⁶ "Local News: Sermon." *Stirling Observer* 7 April 1859. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P 3.

¹⁴⁷ Wilson's body could rest in a group grave with the rest of the Wigtown martyrs, including her friend Margaret Maclauchlan. The grave is marked with a set of stones with all of their names and marked by a cast iron fence, which clusters them neatly together. *Martyr's Gravestone*. Wigtown Parish Church Graveyard: Galloway, United Kingdom.

The cenotaph draws on its iconic resemblance to the epitaph to do that work. In other words, by taking on the recognizable formal features of an epitaph, the cenotaph intimately draws meaning from form associated with death and memory. The association of the epitaph to the body limits it to legally and theologically accepted locations for the burial of human remains. Cenotaphs, on the other hand, not only find homes in burial grounds but also in any legal location for public display including town squares, government buildings, museums, and community libraries. In rhetorical terms the epitaph's appeals are situated in the biological remains of the person, while the cenotaph invents a relationship between the location and the dead using the formal conventions of epitaphs and tombs.

The heritage plaque accompanying the Stirling *Margaret Wilson Monument* creates an *us-here* versus *them-elsewhere* schema that strictly groups community membership by location and interpretative membership by time. In this schema, the monument fails to fit a tightly circumscribed notion of generic decorum that renders a woman of symbolic importance to a national movement when she is materially extraneous to local history. One can almost imagine the plaque writer's exasperated question: *if Margaret Wilson's body was buried in Wigtown where she was executed, why should she get an extra epitaph in Stirling?*¹⁴⁸ Nonetheless, there are no plaques making such a protest to the statues of male Reformation heroes John Knox or Ebenezer Erskine featured in the same cemetery. None of the male statues feature such an

¹⁴⁸ Wilson never wins on this point. In Wigtown, a stone martyr's monument in the shape of a stake marks a spot on the floodmark of Solway where Wilson may have drowned. A guidebook for the area declares that "the 'martyrs' were not from Wigtown" implying they were interlopers. MacLeod, Innes *Discovering Galloway*. Edinburgh: John Donald 1986.

explanatory heritage plaques—not even John Knox. Instead a single plaque acknowledges them as statues of “heroes of the Reformation.” The concern over the body seems inconsistently applied--the memorials to bodiless heroic men go unquestioned, but the interloping heroic woman doesn’t know her place.

The role of Wilson’s body in the implied critique questions the place of the cenotaph at the generic level as well. *The Margaret Wilson Monument* includes a longer inscription, a larger base and a cupola making it more tomb-like than the monuments to male reformers--all of which can be safely compartmentalized to the land of the arts as statues. Wilson’s memorial illustrates the not-so-subtle similarities between the epitaph and cenotaph. The presence of such a cenotaph in a cemetery presents a conundrum for concepts like “publicness” and “privateness” in memory studies of pre-twentieth century monuments to women. The Victorians—who were experimenting with their own notions of proximity deliberately mixed epitaphs and cenotaphs making possible new arrangement strategies transforming the cemetery genre with the full force of eighteenth and nineteenth century garden aesthetics. This proximity, suggests that Habermasian notions of the private are ahistorical when applied to cemeteries. Post-Warner notions of the public as ‘stranger facing’ more accurately describe how rhetorics of display work.¹⁴⁹ Cemeteries and burial grounds, once public places for the display of memory, seem to be

¹⁴⁹ Robert Hariman and John Louis Lucaites present a post-Warner approach to the public in their book length study of the role of iconic photographs in liberal democracy. Here, I bring together their notion of public discourse as “collective construction of identity, community and power” with Jeffrey Walker’s notion of the symposia as a group in which commonly held ideas are used in the production and consumption of epigrammatic texts. Hariman, Robert and John Louis Lucaites. *No Caption Needed: Iconic Photographs, Public Culture, and Liberal Democracy*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press 2007. Pp 4; 26.

increasingly associated with private mourning and private religious beliefs in a progressive narrative of Western secularization. Meanwhile, cenotaphs are increasingly associated with notions of the public, therefore, monuments classifiable as ‘public’ get read as a marker of progress in the history of women. The *Margaret Wilson Monument* illustrates that for Victorians the epitaph and cenotaph genres comingled. The display of both genres in the same place provided opportunities to identify the local with national dead presenting broader notions of community.

The concern over Wilson’s place indicates tension over the Victorian usage of epitaphic genres, which are a bit different from how they are used in the twenty-first century. The Victorian era saw a rise in the number of cenotaphs, or things that look like tombs or gravemarkers without the bodies. There was a corresponding broadening of the acceptable topics for epitaphic texts as well as locations to erect them. The cenotaph indicates an expansion of memory making from the marking of bodily remains, which remembers the dead into the local community, to the marking of the town through commemoration of dead who are connected through a corpus of ideals and virtues. Through this association with the dead, the cenotaph pulls the town into a larger symposia or discourse on identity by invoking what William Wordsworth called “departed worth.”¹⁵⁰ In other words, by putting memorials to popular figures on display a town can tell visitors and future generations about how it values and defines virtue.

¹⁵⁰ Wordsworth, whose interest in cemeteries and epitaphs is well known, particularly enjoyed the Old Town Cemetery in Stirling. *The Margaret Wilson Monument* marks a point fully visible to the old cemetery from the new. The statue grouping faces the older monuments that were there in the time of Wordsworth’s visit. Many Stirling websites brag about the Wordsworth connection quoting him as follows: “we know of no sweeter cemetery in all of our wanderings than that of Stirling.” See, for

Lawrence Prelli asserts the ubiquity of rhetorics of display given that “much of what appears or looks to us as reality is constituted rhetorically through multiple displays that surround us, compete for our attention, and make claims upon us.”¹⁵¹ Prelli’s notion of rhetorical display synthesizes contemporary notions of visual rhetoric, rhetorics of the body, and spatial rhetorics inspired by the broadening theories of epideictic genres in the work of Kenneth Burke, Chaim Perelman and Richard McKeon, together with the innovative work on classical traditions by Jeffrey Walker. Of these, Walker’s work highlights that “epideictic suasion is not limited to the reinforcement of existing beliefs and ideologies, or to merely ornamental displays of clever speech (though clearly it can serve such purposes as well). Epideictic can also work to challenge or transform conventional beliefs.”¹⁵² The *Margaret Wilson Monument* presents an epideictic challenge to its mobile readers.

Relative to its longevity in the Christian tradition the movement of epitaphs to exterior spaces is relatively recent and can be dated in Scotland to the Reformation.¹⁵³ Prior to the Reformation, Catholic tombs would have been located in or under churches, but Calvinists like John Knox argued that churches were places for the living. The remains of the dead, therefore, should be buried underground, outside, and with a

example, the social media style database Find a Grave’s entry. “Old Town Cemetery.” Find a Grave: findagrave.com. Web. Accessed 25 March 2016. See also, Ross Wilson’s discussion of Wordsworth’s notion of “departed worth.” Wilson, Ross. *The Meaning of “Life” in Romantic Poetry and Poetics*. New York: Routledge 2009. P 50.

¹⁵¹ Prelli, Lawrence J. “Rhetorics of Display: An Introduction.” In *Rhetorics of Display*. Ed. Lawrence J. Prelli. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina 2006. P 1-9.

¹⁵² Walker, Jeffrey. *Rhetoric and Poetics in Antiquity*. New York: Oxford University Press 2000, p9.

¹⁵³ Guthke, Andre. *Epitaph Culture in the West: Variations on a Theme in Cultural History*. Lewiston, New York: The Edwin Mellen Press 2003.

minimum of pomp, circumstance and superstition.¹⁵⁴ This shift in the relationship of sacred church space to the living moved the dead and their not-so-sacred epitaphs to the yards resulting in shifts in the ways audiences received the genre. This shift sometimes goes unrecognized in studies of colonial American graveyards when the proximity of the yard to the church is misread as closeness. Diasporic Protestants of that era would have recognized a distancing move distinguishing denominations spatially and aesthetically from Catholics and from one another.

Prior to the Reformation, kirkyards in Scotland served as mixed-use areas used for anything from airing laundry, archery practice, grazing animals, football matches to rounds of golf. Mixed usage continued for generations as seen in the adjoining Old Town eighteenth century kirkyard where surviving stones bear the scars of musket fire—granite working equally well for display or cover during a battle. According to Robert Louis Stevenson they could even be a place for romantic assignations—he describes his trembling fingers as he touched the hair of a maid servant in an Edinburgh tomb.¹⁵⁵ But by the Victorian era cemeteries become primarily a place for sociality in the form of reading and contemplation. Stevenson’s encounter of the maid is eclipsed by his reading of the epitaph of a dearly departed friend:

“I see the indifferent pass before my friend’s last resting-place; pause, with a shrug of pity, now that he is done with suffering...a pity most uncalled for, and an

¹⁵⁴ Knox’s grave lies under parking spot twenty-three of the Old Parliament building parking lot, which is the previous site of the long since paved over St. Gile’s churchyard, Edinburgh, United Kingdom. According to plaques in St. Gile’s church, he refused a gravestone as consistent with his beliefs. St. Gile’s Kirk: Edinburgh, United Kingdom.

¹⁵⁵ Stevenson, Robert Louis. “Old Mortality.” (1884) in *Essays by Robert Louis Stevenson*. New York: Chales Scribner’s Sons 1918. p 268.

ignorant wonder. Before those who loved him, his memory shines like a reproach; they honor him for silent lessons; they cherish his example; and in what remains before them of their toil, fear to be unworthy of the dead.”¹⁵⁶

Today, park cemeteries seem to retain a solemn atmosphere, while churchyards in urban areas remain mixed use for walking tours, wedding photos, or casual lunchtime picnics by people who work closeby.¹⁵⁷ The Valley Cemetery in which *The Margaret Wilson Monument* is located shares the attributions of both park cemeteries and churchyards due to its location between the historic Holy Rude church and Stirling Castle. Thus, we find it sometimes squeezed between different interpretive expectations for epitaphs. If one accepts that this cenotaph is in a public location, then it is necessary to re-evaluate if the epitaphs to all the other women in the cemetery are public too. If so, then the simpler epitaphic texts in the cemetery merit further investigation as they could yield important clues about how women were valued by Stirling and how those values were presented to a public of visiting strangers.

HIERARCHIES OF MEDIA & MONUMENTAL STYLE

A mystery in interpreting 19th century Covenanter monuments lies in figuring out why Drummond chose statuary as a media to represent his Reformist heroes. The Covenanters were iconoclasts and would have disapproved of the gesture. In other

¹⁵⁶ Stevenson, Robert Louis. “Old Mortality.” P 277.

¹⁵⁷ This practice extends to urban churchyards in the United States as well and remains common practice for many congregations both Presbyterian and Episcopalian. See for example the extant eighteenth century churchyards of Old Pine Presbyterian Church in Philadelphia, or St. Paul’s Chapel (Episcopalian) in New York City.

words, the *Margaret Wilson Monument* pushes the boundaries of both Calvinist decorum and corresponding Scottish monumental plain style. “Monumental” and “plain style” may seem to be contradictory terms, nevertheless, waves of eighteenth-century urban planning promoted architectural taste based on aesthetic values congruous to those proposed by rhetoricians like Hugh Blair and George Campbell for prose. Edinburgh’s New Town epitomizes eighteenth century Scottish thinking on taste and style at the level of urban planning, characterized by strong rectangular lines, exquisitely precise masonry work, and sparing use of neoclassical ornamentation inspired by the Greek tradition.¹⁵⁸ Entire neighborhoods of tenements and row houses appeared on new “rational” street plans. Versions of the style became popular eighteenth century cemeteries. Family vaults and tombs laid out in similar styles can still be seen in the churchyard at Canongate where Adam Smith is buried, the Calton Hill Cemetery where David Hume is buried, and the Greyfriars churchyard where Henry Mackenzie and Hugh Blair are buried.

Therefore, the *Margaret Wilson Monument* represents a significant shift in Presbyterian attitudes towards visual media. A clue to the mystery occurs in the decades just prior during the Great Disruptions of the 1830s and 1840s the Church of Scotland argued internally over an international matter of theopolitical concern--that Presbyterian churches in the United States still supported slavery. Internal audits and debates brought

¹⁵⁸ See, the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland (RCAHMS) archives for architectural plans and proposals for Edinburgh’s New Town including the area around Calton Hill, home of several historic cemeteries. There are dozens of drawings, too many to list here, but those associated with Robert J. Naismith, George Heriot’s Trust and the Lindsay Collection provide illustrations of the architectural development of Edinburgh’s distinctive new style. RCAHMS is currently going through institutional re-branding and will in the future be known as “Historic Environment Scotland.” Royal Commission of the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland: Edinburgh, United Kingdom.

to light that the profits of slavery funded projects including buildings in Scotland. A growing faction insisted that all monies from forced human labor should be sent back.¹⁵⁹ This faction grew to include nearly a third of the clergy who organized and left taking members like the prosperous Drummonds with them, to form a new Free Church. Whereas in the eighteenth century, the Church of Scotland distinguished itself *interdenominationally* from the Anglican and Catholic churches by limiting forms of public display to a theological acceptable spectrum of media, the nineteenth century Free Church members had an entirely new exigency to *intradominationally* identify itself as more Presbyterian than the slavery-tolerating established church.

Disruptions in Presbyterian communities created circumstances under which Drummond and his brother Peter could engage in public rhetoric in multiple media. Evangelism necessitates the persuasion of new audiences. Their endeavors ran the gamut from institutional to ephemeral texts including an agricultural museum, public monuments, and evangelical tract writing. Drummond commemorates Wilson, a Covenanter who died for an act of pious parrhesia, an essential component of Christian martyr rhetorics, at a time when the Free Church identified itself as resisting corruption, and promoting rights at all costs. In this sense, in spite of her gender, the *Margaret Wilson Monument's* heroine shares consistent values with Drummond's other public

¹⁵⁹ See, Smith, Donald C. *Passive Obedience and Prophetic Protest: Social Criticism in the Scottish Church 1830-1945*. New York: Peter Lang 1987.

monument projects memorializing reformist and revolutionary heroes like John Knox and William Wallace.¹⁶⁰

Nonetheless, the *Margaret Wilson Monument*, can also be read as part of a different sort of media revolution—an epideictic and aesthetic movement the likes of which would prompt John Knox to roll over in his grave (had it not long since been paved). Epitaphs were one of several visual and performance media pushed out of the churches during the iconoclasm and generic cleansings of the Reformation. By Drummond's time, Scottish Calvinists had for several generations privileged writing and oratory over other media, and preferred situated or historical genres to genres perceived as inventive or fantastic. Although scholarship on British literature often takes for granted that the Restoration of Charles II brought a resurgence of theater and comedy (many departments even dividing British periodicals at 1660) this was not the case in Scotland.

For example, in Edinburgh the theater teetered back and forth across the line of illegality from the sixteenth through the time of eighteenth century writers like Hugh Blair. As late as 1756, the *Douglas* scandal divided the orthodox and moderate factions of the Church of Scotland along media lines. John Home, a Church of Scotland minister, wrote and staged a tragedy, *Douglas*, in Edinburgh after it was rejected in London. The ensuing pamphlet war and presbytery court cases reveal that the orthodox ministers objected to moderates writing plays and even attending performances. A pamphleteer

¹⁶⁰ In addition to the *Wilson Monument* Drummond erected five other landmark monuments in the Valley Cemetery and ornamented every one of them with books and scrolls. The four male figures stand in oratorical poses with either a book, or scroll in hand. The Star Pyramid, which is exactly what its name describes, features a marble bible on each face. *The Star Pyramid*. Valley Cemetery: Stirling, United Kingdom. July 2015.

publishing under the initials A.B. emphatically expressed the orthodox point of view that “if they are to act in a public capacity, *preaching*, and not playing, or furnishing with materials for it, is their duty. If they are to *reprove*, *rebuke*, and *exhort*, these must be done with doctrine, or according to the doctrines of the holy scriptures, and not with dramatic representations, which, at the very best, are but the ‘commandments of men.’”¹⁶¹ The italics of the printer create an iconic sense of movement across the verbs associated with a minister’s job prioritizing associations with work over play. This attitude reflects orthodox attitudes towards genres of enterprise as superior to those of entertainment and frivolity.

In the aftermath of the *Douglas* affair, John Home left the clergy and moved to London, and another minister narrowly missed losing his pulpit over being in the audience. Hugh Blair (who had read the part of Anna in a private rehearsal of *Douglas*) escaped official censure. Blair, a prominent moderate minister in the Church of Scotland includes a theory of media in his highly influential *Lectures on Rhetoric and Belles Lettres* (1783).¹⁶² Blair’s lecture on the history of writing consists of a narrative of human progress and development with hierarchical implications for both media and nations. In this story writing develops from primitive paintings and marks on wood and stone to Egyptian hieroglyphs, to Chinese pictograms, and culminating in the genius of the

¹⁶¹ A. B. “Douglas, a tragedy, weighed in the balances and found wanting. Being an answer to two important questions respecting that performance...” Edinburgh, [1757]. *Eighteenth Century Collections Online*. Gale. University of Texas. Web. 16 Oct 2014.

¹⁶² Blair’s work went through fifty subsequent editions influencing rhetorical education well into the generation of William Drummond. See Conley, Thomas M. *Rhetoric in the European Tradition*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press 1990, 220. See also, Gregory Clark on the transatlantic implications of Blair’s work for education in the United States. Clark, Gregory. “Timothy Dwight’s Moral Rhetoric at Yale College, 1795-1817. *Rhetorica* Vol 5 No.2 (Spring 1987) pp 149-161.

phonetic alphabet.¹⁶³ For Blair, the arbitrary markings of the phonetic alphabet efficiently represent speech, in a manner far superior to ideographs, which represent things and thoughts. Blair interprets the diversity of Chinese ideographs as a disadvantage impeding progress in science. Perhaps he could not envision the advantages offered by a writing system independent of orality in a diverse empire consisting of multiple oral languages and dialects. The narrative implies a spectrum of ancients, pagans, savages, Catholics, and modern-scientific-Protestant civilizations that can be ranked according to their reliance on pictures, hieroglyphs, ideographs, icons, emblems, and alphabets. One finds Blair's hierarchies of media reproduced in criticisms of the *Margaret Wilson Monument* by Drummond's contemporaries, and ironically, in the monument's iconography.

Recall that Wilson is portrayed as looking up from reading the Bible with Agnes.

An inscription on the base below the front of the statue exhorts:

Love, many waters cannot quench¹⁶⁴—GOD save

His chaste imperled¹⁶⁵ One! Covenant true

O Scotia's Daughters! Earnest scan the Page

And prize this Flower of Grace, blood-bought for you.¹⁶⁶

¹⁶³ Blair, Hugh. *Lectures on rhetoric and belles lettres, Part 1. Lecture VI*. Dublin: Messrs. Whitestone, Colles, Burnet, Moncrieff, Gilbert 1783. *Eighteenth Century Collections Online*. P 120-127. Accessed 25 March 2016.

¹⁶⁴ This line refers to the Old Testament, *Song of Solomon* 8:7.

¹⁶⁵ This spelling appears to be a play on the words imperiled and imperled. The cupola to the monument was once topped with "a handsome Oriental crown, resting on a velvet cushion...a costly pear is placed near the crown, in front of the cushion." The pearl as a beautiful jewel that grows in an oppressively shelled watery environment may have seemed an apt metaphor for Wilson to Drummond. "The Virgin Martyrs." *Stirling Observer* 20 June 1867, p 4. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.

The relationship of the young women to the Word forms a key part of the monument's enthymeme.¹⁶⁷ The inversion of defeat and victory features heavily in martyr rhetoric, here, the Word is the medium by which the defeat of Wilson's execution rhetorically converts into a baptismal victory for future generations of women. Martyr rhetorics disrupt hierarchies of power, and the commemoration of Wilson's martyrdom associates the Free Church movement with the hierarchy-flattening mythos of the Covenanter movement, which radically opposed the episcopal bishopric structures imposed by Charles I, Charles II and James II. Thus, the statuary media as a composition choice in the creation of the *Margaret Wilson Monument* simultaneously exists as paradox and compromise—it simultaneously promotes and disrupts the hierarchies that produce it.

DISRUPTIVE WOMEN, MEMORABILITY & MONUMENTAL STYLE

To address where gender might fit into the relationships between media, genre and plain style described above, it is necessary to pause for a moment and consider what style means for epigraphic genres. Mark Garrett Longaker's recent book investigates what he calls 'bourgeois style' putting into conversation canonical Scottish rhetoricians Hugh Blair and Adam Smith with English writers John Locke and Herbert Spencer on the

¹⁶⁶ For the purposes of this analysis, the 'front' of the monument is treated as the side from which Wilson's face looks out towards a potential audience. The main inscription marks this side as the front, and there was once a small iron gate as well. See, McWilliam, C.E. "Wilson Monument." (Photo). F2/34, or NS79SC39.01. c. 1940. National Monuments Record of Scotland: Edinburgh, United Kingdom. See similar: "Wilson Monument." ID253558. CANMORE. <http://canmore.org.uk/site/253558>. Web. April 29, 2016.

¹⁶⁷ The Word is capitalized here to refer to the textual content associated with the Bible, which should not be confused with the Bible as object. The Word has multiple material and medial forms in Drummond's iconography including the scroll, the book, and oratory.

style concerns of clarity, probity, moderation, and economy¹⁶⁸. Let's take this bundle of style concerns and apply them for a moment to Robert Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings* from which the story of Margaret Wilson is most frequently pulled. Wodrow's history, a monument in its own right, could be rated on a scale of 1-10 as follows: Clarity 8; Probity 12; Moderation 0; and Economy 4. The manner in which Wodrow produces a cornucopia of evidence and documentation of the events stands out amongst histories of the period and ensured its longevity across generations but it could never be called moderate. As a book fails on many style concerns, yet people keep reading it, citing it, and building monuments to perpetuate its stories. Next, a rating of *The Margaret Wilson Monument* would tally to something like: Clarity ?; Probity 8; Moderation 5; and Economy ? Again, the conventions for style in prose and poetry begin to break down in for a monument in this case the difference in media making it hard to even rate the text on clarity and economy.

Therefore, to accommodate the material diversity of monuments, style can be considered as a set of choices from the available medium's techne to accomplish the persuasive goals of a text. As Ruskin would undoubtedly agree, monuments are composed of multiple media and different media at different time have different style concerns and delivery options making it impossible to address them all.¹⁶⁹ However, they

¹⁶⁸ Longaker, Mark Garrett. *Rhetorical Style and Bourgeois Virtue: Capitalism and Civil Society in the British Enlightenment*. University Park, Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania University Press 2015.

¹⁶⁹ Ruskin expressed the futility of attempting to create style laws for the epigraphic talking nature of architecture: "because there are countless methods of expression, some conventional, some natural: each conventional mode has its own alphabet, which evidently can be no subject of general laws. Every natural mode is instinctively employed and instinctively understood, wherever there is true feeling; and this instinct is above the law. The choice of conventional methods depends on circumstances out of calculation; so that

do have a common style concern--memorability. Memorability is built on the techne of calling attention to the subject and sustaining that attention actively enough to make a lasting impression on the interpreter's mortal mind. *The Margaret Wilson Monument* demonstrates three types of style choices relating to memorability of which the remainder of this essay will focus on the first. First, it is spectacularly disruptive breaking the patterns around it in its presentation of a woman sculpted in marble. Second, it is didactic, engaging the interpreter by offering to teach them something—here a moral lesson. Third, it invites the interpreter to retrieve knowledge they already have and connect it to the text both in the intertextuality of Bible references and in the manner of an multi-modal epigram through the verbal-visual play of pearls, water, drowning and baptism. Of these, Drummond's effective use of spectacular disruption is specifically dependent on the context of Stirling and the most distinctive to monumental texts and epigraphic genres.

Jonathan Balzotti and Richard Crosby use the term spectacular disruption in their discussion of Diocletian's *Victory Column*.¹⁷⁰ In that article spectacular disruption is discussed in relation to megethos, or the 'greatness,' of an enormous victory column thirty meters tall. Although one might accurately say that when it comes to a monument size matters, but *The Margaret Wilson Monument* demonstrates that it is how size is used

we can only say that the choice is right, when we feel that the means are effective; and we cannot always say that it is wrong when they are not so." Ruskin, John. *Stones of Venice*. London: Collins 1960. P 30.

¹⁷⁰ Balzotti, Jonathan Mark and Richard Benjamin Crosby. "Diocletian's Victory Column: Megethos and the Rhetoric of Spectacular Disruption." *Rhetoric Society Quarterly* Vol 44, no. 4, pp 323-342.

that counts—the megethos of a phallic column is only one of many options.¹⁷¹ The amount of attention drawn by Drummond’s life size portrayal of Wilson demonstrates that when it comes to attracting attention or ensuring memorability Balzotti and Crosby’s notion of disruption has other dimensional implications.

It is hard to explain how rare it is to find a sculpture of a woman on the streets of Scotland to a new visitor. It’s like finding a rampant unicorn in the park.¹⁷² Therefore, the disruptive elements of the *The Margaret Wilson Monument* stem from the choice of portraying her using statuary as a medium. Drummond further disrupts visual conventions with the inclusion of a large winged guardian angel and a tiny lamb veering dangerously into Catholic iconography after several hundred years of Presbyterian styling.

Epitaphic genres like the cenotaph do more argumentative work than just remember, record, praise or blame the dead. They can also push, nudge and motivate the living towards understandings of new values and identities. According to the officious reading offered by the history plaque *The Margaret Wilson Monument* “avoids the horror of her death.” In point of fact, it does not. The inscription on the monument describes her as a martyr of the wave. This is a poetic description of drowning, but it is clear that

¹⁷¹ The megethos of the phallic column distinguishes the Melville Monument in Edinburgh’s St. Andrew Square. At 42.6 meters tall, it is Category-A listed. *Melville Monument*. St. Andrew’s Square: Edinburgh, United Kingdom. July 2014.

¹⁷² The rampant unicorn is a heraldic symbol of the Stuart family. If one discounts the numerous depictions of Queen Victoria, there very possibly are more street facing statues of imaginary unicorns than real women in Edinburgh and Stirling. Glasgow, on the other hand, features more female figures in its architectural decorations but they tend to represent muses or the personification of the virtues than historic women. The demographics of Glasgow included more Catholics and became a destination for Irish immigrants to Scotland, which could account for the style difference.

she died a horrible death as indicated by the phrase “blood-bought.” Drummond’s choice to portray the sculpted Wilson calmly seated reading to her sister seems to be the avoidant choice implied by the plaque. Other choices for how to represent Wilson include John Millais’s painting of her contemplating the rising water around her waiting for death, or the stripped to the waist statue version of her tied to a stake at the University of Toronto.¹⁷³

As previously mentioned, the heritage plaque designed by Art is an Option refers to “Victorian Stirling” and “sentimental Victorian idealization of women” to create a temporal distance between twenty-first century visitors and the monolith of the nineteenth century. The “sentimental Victorian” creates an *us-now* versus *them-then* binary undergirded with the assumption that the objective us-now has progressed and improved since the sentimental them-then. The heritage plaque invokes a post-Darwin tone of disparagement towards less evolved prior generations. Of course, each generation likes to think it has surpassed the previous one but the connotations of concepts like progress and evolution significantly impact how generations value the past.

Enlightenment thinkers had an attitude of spirited competition towards the ancients with whom they felt they shared qualities like moderation and order, but found their more immediate forebears warmongering and fanatical. The warmongering fanatics of the Reformation found their predecessors to be corrupt, decadent idolaters standing in the way of spiritual progress, and so on. Each generation puts a new spin on the past to take

¹⁷³ The Millais oil painting depicts her with long wavy red hair, plaid, chained to a stake and up to her skirts in water. An x-ray of the work revealed that she was originally painted naked to the waist. Painted in 1871, and titled “Martyr of Solway” the work is now owned by the Walker Gallery, Liverpool, United Kingdom.

ownership of it. The mystery here is simply why the makers of the history plaque considered progress consider the sensationalized portrayal of violence against women as progress when the depictions of martyred men nearby, such as James Guthrie who was beheaded in Edinburgh, receive no such criticism. Nowhere in the cemetery does a plaque complain of the lack of a gory head-on-a-pike statue for Guthrie, nevertheless, it would be appropriate to see Wilson drown, (especially if she is not only virginal, but shirtless).¹⁷⁴

Instead of visually portraying her death, Drummond's spin picks up a thread from Wodrow's history involving a small detail indicating her literacy level. Similar to Martin Luther King, Jr., Margaret writes a letter from jail. Then, her death speech takes the form of Bible passages cited and sung from memory. Drummond ties her martyrdom to the issue of women's literacy making it explicitly Protestant and distinctly Scottish. In doing so he makes an intervention into a larger imperial issue referred to as "The Woman Question."

During Drummond's lifetime women, not only could not vote, but frequently went uneducated--even in Scotland with its legendary male literacy levels. The Great Disruption of the Church of Scotland not only opened debates about Presbyterian obligations regarding slavery, it became a moment to reconsider the roles of women in

¹⁷⁴ As mentioned in the introduction to this essay, *The Margaret Wilson Monument* underwent restoration including replacement of the lamb, Margaret's head, parts of wings, and several hands. Part of this damage can be attributed to the delicacy of the imported marble as compared to the native sandstone or tough granite used in other parts of the cemetery. However, the larger part of the damage is from vandals. In spite of the glass cupola, vandals decapitated the statue of Margaret while John Knox and the other male Reformer statues in spite of being more accessible retained their heads. The restoration deliberately carved the replacement parts to be a little less fine than Ritchie's original work to making it clear that they represent the lost pieces without trying to duplicate them.

the church.¹⁷⁵ The new Free Church, to which Drummond ascribed, was in some ways more orthodox than the established church, although today with their hardline stance on slavery there is the temptation to think of them as socially liberal. The Free Church did not uniformly promote women's rights, but in their evangelism some congregations provided the opportunity for Presbyterian women to expand their professional horizons in the fields of teaching, and advanced nursing to the point that one congregation sent a woman to medical school but her doctorate went un-used.

Using the persona of the Wilson sculpture, Drummond specifically addresses the women in the audience through an inscription with an argument going beyond mere admiration of martyrdom. The monument's inscription exhorts, "Scotia's Daughters! Earnest scan the Page/ And prize this Flower of Grace, blood-bought for you." It calls upon women to learn to read. Meanwhile, for any that miss the inscription, the statuary arrangement reinforces the message by featuring the figure of Margaret sitting with an arm around Agnes with a Bible open across their laps. In this manner, Drummond associates Wilson with Protestant heroes and reading, thus rendering women's literacy patriotic. The choice of Wilson for this argument utilizes the Covenanter connection to universal male literacy and the rise of the public education system in Scotland. Scottish, Presbyterian and Whig commonplaces associate the Covenanter martyrs with rights-based thinking. These rights included the right to religion, to education, and later, to vote

¹⁷⁵ Macdonald, Lesley Orr. *A Unique and Glorious Mission: Women and Presbyterianism in Scotland 1830-1930*. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers 2000.

all stemming from the Calvinist emphasis on universal male literacy and individual interpretation of the Bible.¹⁷⁶

In addition to the disruptive figure of Margaret Wilson, the iconography of the work veers into Catholic territory, making some Protestants nervous about the lack of control of iconic images. What could an uncontrolled interpretation of this monument look like? One possibility is revealed by a local nickname the “Mary Monument.” As none of the figures are named Mary, nor does the word Mary appear anywhere on the monument this might seem a strange nickname. However, in the late nineteenth and early twentieth-centuries a rapid demographic shift occurred as increasing numbers of Catholics immigrated to nearby Glasgow. In the Catholic tradition, Saint Anne taught the Virgin Mary to read. In Catholic iconology, this event is often depicted as a trinity of a woman reading to a girl with a depiction or symbol of the baby Jesus, such as a lamb, nearby. Saint Anne depictions were often found near images of noblewomen bearing books in medieval texts signaling their education (and perhaps justifying it in times and spaces hostile to women’s literacy). Therefore, although the words on the monument do

¹⁷⁶ A representation of the Protestant Reformers promoting literacy appeared again recently in the *Great Tapestry of Scotland*. The tapestry project, inspired by Scottish novelist Alexander McCall Smith, presents a monument in fabric and thread to the history of Scotland from the Ice Age forward. The panels, stitched by community groups all over Scotland, can be thought of as combining the creative media use of community rhetoric innovated for the AIDS quilt projects in the United States with the European tradition of the tapestry. The Reformer panel emphasizes literacy and the rise of schools. A book and a website, <scotlandtapestry.com> allows off site viewing and illustrates the issues of onymity for monuments: hundreds of sewing participants, a head-stitcher (Dorie Wilkie), a designer (Andrew Crummy), Alexander McCall Smith and various board members all get a mention. *Great Tapestry of Scotland*. Scottish Parliament Building: Edinburgh, Scotland, July 2014.

not fit the Saint Anne literacy narrative, the overall style of the grouping of statuary invokes it.¹⁷⁷

Even though the monument's location remains exactly the same over the course of the century the demographic of religious values (and literacies) of the interpreters shifts from a predominantly Protestant point of view to include more Catholic visitors from nearby Glasgow. In this case, the intended and accidental thesis statements of the monument's theologically diverse interpreters harmoniously coincide: women should learn to read. During this period the Free Church did a notably better job at converting Catholics from the Highlands than their Established Church brethren.¹⁷⁸ The ability of Drummond and bourgeois evangelists to leverage some aspects of Catholic visual styles might yield an important clue to their success in reaching those audiences.

Due to the popularity of "traditional stories" of Covenanter martyrs in both print and monument forms William Drummond had a reasonable expectation that his contemporaries could read heroine Margaret Wilson as a common figure in an enthymeme for women's literacy. During this period, Robert Wodrow's work experienced multiple re-prints and a new edition prefaced by Free Church theologian Robert Burns. The monumental martyr narrative recorded in Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings* formed a bridge of dialectical nature between representations of Covenanters across media. While this *Margaret Wilson Monument* is a rare piece in its depiction of a

¹⁷⁷ For an overview of British Saint Anne iconology see Sheingorn, Pamela. "The Wise Mother': The Image of St. Anne Teaching the Virgin Mary." In *Gendering the Master Narrative: Women and Power in the Middle Ages*. Eds. Mary C. Erler and Maryanne Kawaleski. Pp105-134.

¹⁷⁸ Smith, Donald. *Passive Obedience and Prophetic Protest: Social Criticism in the Scottish Church, 1830-1945*. New York: Peter Lang Publishing 1987.

female martyr, it is in other ways representative of a nineteenth-century Scottish shift toward more diverse visual representation of Covenanters.

The discourse around Sir Walter Scott's *Old Mortality* (1816) provides an extant example of this trend. Like the Wilson example, it involves a case of spectacular disruption in the posing of the figures and invokes the frame tale of a popular novel. The frame tale characterizes the historic figure of a real life itinerant mason who repointed Covenanter inscriptions. Nicknamed 'Old Mortality,' he specialized in keeping the stone archive of Covenanter gravemarkers legible to public view but also serves as a gossip-meets-bard creating encounters for storytelling.¹⁷⁹ Inspired by the character, a sculptor, John Currie responded with a life-size reclining figure of the Old Mortality character as if looking up from working on a slab monument. He is accompanied by a free-standing pony that conveys a sense of exhaustion in its posture. This unusually posed set of tired looking figures stands out amongst the usual use of equestrian figures for martial monuments in proud, active poses. The work charmed a doctor named John Sinclair who tragically died the next day. The doctor's family erected the statuary as an outdoor memorial honoring him. The resulting monument brings a local man into the national story of the Covenanters in a manner simultaneously intimate and public.¹⁸⁰ These two monuments share the recurring thread of literacy in the Covenanter mythos while exhibiting a style trend in Scottish cenotaphs towards increased portrait style sculptural representations. Old Mortality's work consists of transforming texts to make them

¹⁷⁹ Scott, Walter. *Old Mortality in, The Waverley Novels*. Cambridge: Chadwyck-Healey, 1999.

¹⁸⁰ *The Sinclair Memorial* can still be found outdoors on the grounds of the Observatory in Dumfries, Scotland, and similar to the *Wilson*, it is now protected by glass.

legible to the public, while Margaret's reading and writing transformed her from victim of chance to a heroine of a cause.

In conclusion, each mobile reader experiences a recurring, yet unique, rhetorical moment in the kairos of a monumental encounter. One can conceptualize monuments as rhetorical machines, not in the Derridean sense, but in the ancient Latinate sense of complicated craftsmanship with multiple functioning parts coordinated to do specific work. Rhetorical machines need not consist of moving parts, so much as parts that *move*. Erectors of monuments with the goal to move viewers, pull from multiple media challenging academic disciplines to evaluate them and their choices. For example, the *Margaret Wilson Monument* includes a poetic inscription tying Wilson's martyrdom to women's literacy (English/History/Politics/Women's Studies); marble statues of Wilson, her sister Agnes, a winged angel and a lamb (Art History/Archaeology); an etched glass and cast iron cupola (Architecture/Art History); and an octagonal base inscribed with bible references (Religious Studies). Integrating so many materials that departments work hard to objectively separate, monuments present challenges to disciplinary notions of onymity, genre and style. In spite of, or perhaps because of these methodological challenges, monuments like *The Margaret Wilson Monument*, much like the medieval unicorn, can lead scholars of the history of rhetoric on a lively and rewarding hunt.

Chapter 3--The Battle for the Victorian Sabbath: Entertainment, Enterprise and Evangelism in the Scottish Cemetery

We know of no sweeter cemetery in all our wanderings than that of Stirling.

—Wordsworth

In any case, it is from the nineteenth century onwards that everyone has had a right to his own little box for his own little personal decomposition...

—Foucault

Sir Walter Scott constructs an image of Glasgow on the Sabbath using the point of view of Frank Osbaldistone, a self-styled ‘English Presbyterian, Dissenter’ in the novel *Rob Roy* (1817). Set in the days leading up to the first Jacobite rebellion--the same days in which Robert Wodrow wrote *History of the Sufferings* in real life--Frank storms off to Glasgow with heroic aspirations to rescue a family business partner from the clutches of greedy cousin Rashleigh. Frank, who would rather be a poet than a businessman, encounters cultural obstacles to launching a rescue mission on Sunday in Scotland. Frank’s landlady, for example, “hesitated to dress a hot dinner between sermons.”¹⁸¹ Throughout the day, Frank discovers to his surprise that Presbyterian identity varies with nationality. He compares the customs of English, French and Scottish Presbyterians as he moves through the public spaces of the town. His interpretations of spaces and bodies lead him to question, confront, and later challenge the negative stereotypes about

¹⁸¹ Scott, Walter. *Rob Roy*. Wordsworth Classics: Hertfordshire, UK, 1995.

Scotland he learned from his father. Presumably, the author wanted the reader to confront some of their negative stereotypes too.

Frank visits a castle, a cemetery, a cathedral, a catacomb, and a prison, but he does more than visit them—he interprets them like texts. Through the eyes of Frank, the spaces become the intersections of two axes of identity: denominational and national. Frank reads the spaces and worship of Scottish Presbyterians as a public display of a distinctly anti-Catholic identity. For example, Frank visits burial catacombs while searching for his friend where the young Englishman observes:

...surrounded by these receptacles of the last remains of mortality, I found a numerous congregation in the act of prayer. The Scotch perform this duty in a standing instead of a kneeling posture—more perhaps, to take as broad distinction as possible from the ritual of Rome than for any better reason, since I have observed that in their family worship, as doubtless in their private devotions, they adopt, in their immediate address to the Deity, that posture which other Christians use as the humblest and most reverential.¹⁸²

Frank's distinguishes the meaning of kneeling relative to cultural space--the humility of the gesture, which Scots considered appropriate to private communication with the divine

¹⁸² Scott, Walter. *Rob Roy*. Wordsworth Classics: Hertfordshire, UK, 1995. P 175.

was eliminated in moments of public display due to its association with Catholic identity.¹⁸³

Frank's fictional experiences illustrate the real world rhythms of cultural calendars, which regulate the use of public display spaces through a combination of civic, economic, religious and other rhythms. In countries like Scotland, religious calendars once influenced much of the flow of public life dictating when churches and cemeteries were open and when business, banks and public houses should be closed. For example, a kirkyard adjoining a church, will have many more visitors on a Sunday than on a Tuesday morning. These rhythms are in turn partially dependent on the schedules of public infrastructures. For rhetoricians this means recurring patterns of kairos creating situations for regular genres like sermons.

The significance and power inherent to the recurring kairos of a weekly day of worship is difficult to imagine in today's world of on demand communication, entertainment and transportation. Nevertheless, let's imagine that once a week a country turned off all distractions, and focused its full attention on just one thing. Imagine that sort of repeated concentration of weekly attention over several centuries and one begins to approximate the power of the Sabbath. In Scotland's case, the expansions of rail and postal service changed the ways Victorians were spending their Sundays. Resistance to these changes manifested into a public debate over the Sabbath waged by prominent Presbyterian evangelicals.

¹⁸³ The cathedral in the book is based on the conversion of Glasgow's Catholic cathedral for Protestant use. The Catholics buried their dead in and under the church. Therefore, the depiction of Protestant acts of worship in the space connotes defiance of Papist customs in multiple registers.

The nineteenth century heralds a time of renewed awareness of the power of a community to say something about its identity and values through the use of public time-space—a power previously reserved for theological or aristocratic elites. The would-be hero of *Rob Roy* watches the local population quietly drifting home at dusk leaving an impression of sincere devotion. Frank muses, “to one accustomed to the mode of spending Sunday evenings abroad, even among the French Calvinists, there seemed something Judaical, yet at the same time striking and affecting, in this mode of keeping the Sabbath holy.”¹⁸⁴ Through Frank’s observations of the use of public space, Scott presents a nostalgic ideal of Scottish piety in contrast to the whirling modern cultures of England and France. Frank concludes that in Scotland, the Lord’s Day is the Lord’s Day all day long—not just in the morning, or for a sermon, or until dusk, but rather from midnight to midnight. And, not just for select people, but for everyone in the community regardless of class or gender.

For bourgeois Scots like the Drummond brothers of Stirling, the nineteenth century heralded the development of new technologies in communications, transportation, and agriculture simultaneously with changing patterns of migration. New uses of spaces and revisions of old spaces resulted in an explosion of aesthetic innovation. Although these changes often impacted national infrastructures in positive ways, they were also perceived as threats to the Reformed lifestyles developed by Scottish Presbyterians. The degree to which aesthetic innovations were embraced

¹⁸⁴ Scott, Walter. *Rob Roy*. P 184.

depended on how the relationships between timing, rhetors, topics, and interpreters were valued.

Attitudes about cross-class decorum, in particular the interactions between the upper middle class and the laboring classes. Furthermore the re-prioritization of overall topic delivery to target interpreters over more traditional Calvinist attitudes on the theological meaning of form opened up opportunities for mixed media compositions making visual appeals, such as the *Margaret Wilson Memorial* described in the previous chapter. Victorians like the Drummond brothers composed space-places long before Michel Foucault theorized the heterotopia. What theories could they have had about spatial rhetoric? What conversations might they have seen themselves participating in? Cross referencing the works of the two brothers reveals that the Valley Cemetery of Stirling not represents an acceleration in changing local aesthetics but also serves as a demonstration of how spatial texts and the arrangement of objects played into notions of rationality and logic.

STIRLING'S NEW VALLEY CEMETERY IN THE TIME OF HETEROTOPIA

Garden cemeteries and necropolises are the texts of empire. While an epitaph says "he/she was here," a cemetery says "we were here." As an epitaphic genre the cemetery has a the exigency, not to accommodate and honor the individual dead, but to honor the town, the city and to show its relationship to the nation. In other words, it begins to take on the additional exigencies of historiography like that of Wodrow in *History of the Sufferings*. The Stirling Valley Cemetery committee led by William

Drummond and Charles Rogers asserts the place of Stirling in Scotland and in a Protestant empire—one that they were actively working to expand through a renewed evangelism of the Reformation.

To the town of Stirling the design phase of the Valley Cemetery represented an opportunity for a new kind of composition, and a new expression of the town's identity. The chosen location nestled in the tiny valley joining the Old Town Cemetery, Mar's Walk, a field, and the Castle grounds completed a set of public spaces to create an acropolis to crown Stirling.¹⁸⁵ Topographically located above the local plains and the town the Valley had been used for various sundry and sometimes sordid purposes. Clearing it for dedicated use did not come without a little controversy. Extant newspaper articles from the 1860s reveal that the middle class citizens felt the space to be underutilized. The local *Stirling Observer* reflected this attitude:

The contrast now presented between the past and present condition of the grounds is such as must strike not only every stranger, but even those most familiar with the locality. Only two years ago the Valley was the resort of the vagrant and the gipsy, while the Ladies' Rock was frequented, even on the Sabbath-day, by persons of the most disreputable description. The scene of the present Cemetery was enclosed by heavy stone walls, which however served to conceal a succession of pig-styes and other such abominations.¹⁸⁶

¹⁸⁵ The Old Town Cemetery is the kirkyard of the historic Holy Rude Church where James VI & I was crowned.

¹⁸⁶ "The Cemetery Statuary." *Stirling Observer* 7 April 1859. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P 3.

The passage implies a chaotic pre-design state in which both locals and tourists might observe low-class behaviors by humans and animals alike. The stone walls mentioned are not interpreted as a compositional arrangement but rather as a containment system separating (and perhaps protecting) higher classes of citizen from the sight of both rabble and swine. For Victorian Scotland, the drastic changes to cemeteries reflect their new function as a local forum for the development and display of new political and denominational identities in a period characterized by the progressive decentralization of religion coupled with the rise of increasingly commercial imperial priorities.

Foucault observed of this period the steep rise in public spaces like hospitals, museums, libraries and cemeteries, which he dubbed ‘heterotopia’ considering them to be a place to contain the Other keeping them both in and outside of cultural life. Much of this conversation centers on Foucault’s concept of what is known as the place/space illustrated by the metaphor of the mirror in his 1967 lecture to the Circle of Architectural Studies, later published as “Of Other Spaces.”¹⁸⁷ For Foucault, the mirror exists as a real material place while simultaneously functioning as a representational space both part of and apart from culture.¹⁸⁸ Of the major genres of heterotopia, the one that Foucault discusses the most is the cemetery.

¹⁸⁷ See, *Heterotopia and the City: Public space in a post civil society*, Eds Michiel Dehaene and Lieven De Cauter, Routledge: New York 2008, which contains a new translation of Foucault’s 1967 essay “Of Other Spaces” as well as the historical context for its emergence from a French radio lecture series.

¹⁸⁸ Krishan Kumar contrasts the realness of heterotopia with the fantasy space of utopia. Kumar, Krishan. “The Ends of Utopia” for *New Literary History*, Vol 31, No3, Summer 2010, en 43.

The local military chaplain at Stirling Castle, Dr. Charles Rogers, initiated the push to clear the land for the new Valley Cemetery of old structures.¹⁸⁹ A flashback article highlights the controversial nature of the clearance alleging: “to avoid objections many of these structures were removed during the night and a day or two after Roger’s workers had removed the old watchhouse erected during the 1820’s for the use of those guarding the Holy Rude graveyard against the resurrectionists the *Stirling Journal* described their nocturnal activities as the work of the ‘fairies.’”¹⁹⁰ The invocation of fairies softens slightly the echoes of the Clearances, which in other areas of Scotland had been occurring in rhizomatous fashion for two hundred years resulting in hardship, famine and death for displaced Highlanders and tenant farmers. For the wealthier classes, the clearances resulted in tracts of land ready for improvements of every sort.

Although popular in architectural circles since the 1960’s, Foucault’s heterotopia has only started to gain real traction in rhetorical circles in the past decade with the rise of public memory studies. This century, scholars in rhetoric and communication studies have increasingly recognized Foucault’s heterotopia as more than places, but as a form of persuasive textual spaces. For example, Elizabethada Wright’s 2009 article in *Rhetoric Society Quarterly* connected Foucault’s mirror metaphor to rhetorical studies of cemeteries. That article titled “Rhetorical spaces in memorial places: The cemetery as a

¹⁸⁹ Scottish castles tended to be military fortifications not to be confused with palaces, which are royal residences. Stirling Castle contains a restored royal palace. Edinburgh Castle still hosts not only military personnel, but also weapons and a military museum.

¹⁹⁰ “Haggerty File/Notelets: Tribute in stone to a young martyr’s death on the sands.” *Stirling Observer*. 15 May 1985. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P 14.

“rhetorical memory place/space”¹⁹¹ used the notion of the heterotopia to fill a theoretical void in which scholars had difficulty articulating how a space could not just make an argument by addressing the underlying necessary assumption that a space can be a text. The place/space, or Foucault’s mirror, has become a lens for analyzing a diverse range of complicated spatial texts from airport terminals, to unmarked African American cemeteries, to the Jewish Museum Berlin.¹⁹²

Understanding the Valley Cemetery requires looking beyond the metaphor of the mirror to Foucault’s notion of the heterotopia’s intergenerational social functions and their implications for understanding poetics and decorum in nineteenth-century monumental genres. Foucault’s translator usefully introduces the concept as follows: “heterotopias are aporetic spaces that reveal or represent something about the society in which they reside through the way they incorporate and stage the very contradictions that this society produces but is unable to resolve.”¹⁹³ The social functions of a heterotopia produce solutions through containment and display, much as the solution to the predatory lion is the zoo. The zoo does not solve the lion’s predatory instinct, but it does contain the beast and render it neutral through a mode of display. Perhaps a similar line of thought prompted Foucault to devote more analytical space to the cemetery—and the

¹⁹¹ Wright, Elizabethada. “Rhetorical Spaces in Memorial Places: The Cemetery as a Rhetorical Memory Place/Space.” *Rhetoric Society Quarterly* 35:4 (2005): 51-81. *MLA International Bibliography*. Web. 14 May 2014.

¹⁹² Saindon, Brent Allen. “A Doubled Heterotopia: Shifting Spatial and Visual Symbolism in the Jewish Museum Berlin’s Development.” *Quarterly Journal of Speech* Vol 98, No. 1, Feb 2012, pp 24-48. Wood, Andrew. “A Rhetoric of Ubiquity: Terminal Space as Omnitopia.” *Communication Theory* 13:3, August 2003, pp 324-344.

¹⁹³ See editor’s introduction to Michel Foucault’s “Of other spaces.” In *Heterotopia and the City: Public space in a post civil society*, Eds Michiel Dehaene and Lieven De Caeter, Routledge: New York 2008. P 25.

death-beast that cemeteries attempt to contain—than any other single example in his heterotopology. He states:

In Western culture the cemetery has practically always existed. But it has undergone important changes. Until the end of the eighteenth century, the cemetery was placed in the very heart of the city, next to the church. A whole hierarchy of possible burial places existed there. There was the charnel house in which corpses lost the last traces of individuality, there were a few individual tombs, and then there were tombs inside the church. These latter tombs were themselves of two types. Either simply tombstones with an inscription or mausoleums with statues. This cemetery, which was lodged in the sacred space of the church, has taken on a quite different look in modern civilizations, and, curiously, it is in a time when civilization has become, as we say crudely, ‘atheist’, that Western culture has inaugurated what is called the cult of the dead.¹⁹⁴

Foucault’s thought provoking speculations regarding the changes to cemeteries stop short of taking denominational values into account. Given, however, that the piece was originally a radio lecture, it is entirely subject to generic limitations in its attempts to historicize. Therefore, rather than consider this a fatal flaw in the theory, it can be viewed as an invitation to dig deeper into the influence of local circumstances on generic variations in heterotopia.

¹⁹⁴ Foucault. P 28.

In particular Foucault's reading underestimates the influence of religion on the nineteenth century rise of the heterotopia. He contends regarding cemeteries:

Basically, it was quite natural that, at a time when people really believed in the resurrection of the body and immortality of the soul, they did not lend cardinal importance to mortal remains. On the contrary, from the moment when people are no longer quite sure that they have a soul, and that the body will resurrect, it becomes perhaps necessary to give much more attention to these mortal remains, which are ultimately the only trace of our existence in the world and in words."¹⁹⁵

Here his argument conflates the ongoing burial of human remains with the increase in the erection of individual outdoor monuments and erroneously correlates them with the rise of atheism.

The *Stirling Observer*, however, provides a counterexample from the period lauding the transformation of a lowly place into a space for public memory using terms reinforcing rather than discounting religious values:

This spot, thanks to Mr. William Drummond, has been consecrated in our times as the memorial ground of those who nobly fought, and more nobly bled, in the glorious cause of a nation's liberties. The entire history of the Scottish Reformation is represented here.¹⁹⁶

The *Stirling Observer* further contrasts Drummond's cemetery improvements with the earlier legendary use of the space for medieval pageants and sports exhibitions. The

¹⁹⁵ Foucault, p 19.

¹⁹⁶ "The Cemetery Statuary." *Stirling Observer* 7 April 1859. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P 3.

author dismisses these practices of medieval generations as frivolous and bloodthirsty performances contrasting them with the genuine fight of the Reformers a fight not for glory, but for souls.

This example and other details like the location of the Valley Cemetery at the historic heart of Stirling rather than the suburbs suggest a more specific look at local British history is needed. An alternate history would propose something like this: in Britain, the push of corpses out of churches into the yard occurred during the Protestant Reformation. Many Protestant denominations pushed graves out of the church, to reflect the difference between the dead living and the living dead. The church was reserved for the living-living, so to speak. The relative popularity of this shift resulted in a noticeable increase in outdoor grave monument building as well as the architectural innovation of burial aisles appended to churches (but not considered part of the sanctuary). At the same time, varying waves of iconoclasm destroyed older monuments and churches giving a false impression of the overall cultural legacy of monumental forms.¹⁹⁷ Several transitional generations remember the forms in contrast with one another. Eventually, subsequent generations with increased exposure to the new plainer Protestant monumental forms without the older archives see the new forms as traditional. These plainer forms begin to look conservative, even though they were quite radical when originally conceived.

¹⁹⁷ Sir George Douglas said of an attempt to record the remaining cathedrals of Scotland, “Compendiously it is a tale of wrecking, by a blind and misguided religious zeal, of the grandest and most nobly inspired works...it cannot be denied that the spirit of the Reformers, however great the credit due to it on other grounds, chose precisely the most glorious of our national possessions among which to run amok.” Douglas, George. “Foreword.” In Lindsay, Ian G. *The Cathedrals of Scotland*. Edinburgh: W. & R. Chambers 1926.

Thus, the particular rituals of burial and the location of burial reflect specific theological, social, political, economic hierarchies. Nonetheless, this is not the only possible history even within Great Britain. Recall that the media of heterotopia is land and therefore, burial rights are tied to the ability of a particular community to acquire title to land. The clichéd but telling phrase “proper Christian burial” implies a binary in which there are also improper burials and non-Christian burials, which are nonetheless burials. The degree to which the dominant national religious group granted the right to burial varied wildly. There were many communities that did not have that status and thus their groups did not get access to the form of the heterotopia sometimes for centuries. For example, in the nineteenth century Jews in various parts of the West gain increased access to land for the burial of their dead. Yet in some places like England Jews gained rights earlier. Under the rule of Oliver Cromwell, Jews were able to open a cemetery in London at Queen Mary’s College in 1657.¹⁹⁸ North of Hadrian’s Wall, however, the first Jewish graveyard in Edinburgh would not open until 1815. Therefore, Scottish cemeteries should not be read as reflecting demographic trends in a quantitative sense but rather in the qualitative sense of which groups had power.

The social hierarchies reflected in graveyards and cemeteries can be read in the arrangement and selection of epitaphic displays. In cemeteries there are epitaphs marking graves, graves that go unmarked, and cenotaphs marking the disembodied memories of select dead. Armando Petrucci separates the act of burial from the text of the

¹⁹⁸ A centuries old Jewish graveyard survives at Queen Mary’s College, London. Its gravemarkers are notably flat, a stylistic element advertising the flattening of social hierarchies in death to passersby.

monument: “the reasons why people began to deal in any way with dead bodies—by burial, cremation, endocannibalism, and so on—never had any relationship with the reason why at a certain moment they began to attach writing to mark and identify burial grounds.”¹⁹⁹ However, once the writing of honorary texts began, the lack of a gravemarker began to carry a meaning too. Generally the lack of a marker involves theological, legal or economic factors.

John Knox, for instance, specifically requested not to have a gravemarker for reasons of belief—he found them superstitious. For many Covenanters the choice was not voluntary. During the Killing Times of the late seventeenth century, the Covenanters were legally restricted from burying their dead and marking the graves due to their outlaw status.²⁰⁰ The remains of paupers and poor relations often merited a grave but an unmarked one in a lower status or unsanctified portion of the graveyard, such as a pauper’s field. Locals versed in reading the meaning of these locations in the social hierarchy interpreted a grave’s location as a statement of praise or blame. In sum, one should not confuse a grave with a gravemarker—they are distinctly different parts of a cemetery in a grammatical sense to the difference between a subject and the object of a preposition in a sentence.

Richard Morris, a scholar of communications specializing in memorialization developed three categories for gravescape patterns he observes in the United States from

¹⁹⁹ Petrucci, Armando. Trans. Michael Sullivan. *Writing the Dead: Death and Writing Strategies in the Western Tradition*. Stanford University Press: Stanford, 1998. P xviii.

²⁰⁰ Outlaw status could be conferred in life, death or both. For example, Charles II had the body of Oliver Cromwell exhumed, hanged, beheaded and the head displayed at the Houses of Parliament. Morrill, John. “Rewriting Cromwell: A Case for Deafening Silences.” *Canadian Journal of History*, December 2003. Pp 553-578. P 561.

1632 to the post-WWII era: the memento mori, the garden romance and the epic heroism lawn cemetery. The category of the memento mori cemetery loosely corresponds to the kirkyard genre. Although Morris's article mainly concerns the ethos and pathos appeals he observes, he pauses for a moment to think about the proximity of the dead to the church, which he judges to be close and intimate, distinguishing that closeness from the later suburban cemeteries that function "to locate the dead away from the living, to enclose burial grounds with fences as if to separate the living from the dead...contravenes this world view [of closeness]."²⁰¹ Morris refers to the view that death could come at any moment and that one should be constantly prepared. In other words death is temporally near and the nearness of human remains to the church is a metaphor, the presence of a fence would indicate separation. If these logistical elements were products of invention I might agree, however, it is quite likely that these elements of the memento mori gravescape in America, like the Holy Rude kirkyard, are situated in historical circumstances of the sixteenth through eighteenth centuries in the UK and Europe when Protestants pushed bodily remains out of the intimate setting of the church into the yards.

In Scotland the change happened early. In December 1562, the Scottish Assembly declared a new uniform order for burials to be taken from the Book of Geneva, also known as the Book of Common Order or Knox's liturgy. The new ritual was strikingly simple:

²⁰¹ Morris, Richard. "Death on Display." *Rhetorics of Display*. Ed. Lawrence Prelli. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2006. 204-226. P 206-7.

The corpse is reverently to be brought unto the grave, accompanied with the congregation, without any further ceremonies; which being buried, the minister, if he be present, and required, goeth to the church, if it be not far off, and maketh some comfortable exhortation to the people, touching death and resurrection.²⁰²

Notice that the minister gives no sermons or rituals at the grave, and that grave clearly falls outside of the church. Prior to the Reformation, the Catholic tradition allowed for the burial of prominent members inside or under the church. According to archaeologist Betty Willsher “until the late sixteenth century the graveyards were virtually empty of monuments, as people of high rank were buried and commemorated inside the churches.”²⁰³ The body of a saint, or parts of the body of a saint formed the spiritual foundation, so to speak, of most cathedrals. To this day some Catholic and Episcopalian congregations bury clergy of the rank of bishop and higher in tombs or catacombs under the church. Reformers considered these practices to be theologically unsound and superstitious. John Knox and other prominent Protestants demanded that the dead be buried outside in the ground thus reserving the church interior. In opposition to this tradition, the *Book of Common Order* proscribes that funeral sermons should be for the living and given in the church where the dead need not be present.

²⁰² “Acts and Proceedings: 1562, December.” *Acts & Proceedings of the General Assemblies of the Kirk of Scotland, 1560-1618*. (1839), . 25-30. <<http://www.british-history.ac.uk>>. Web. 29 April 2016. Or see: Cumming, John, ed. *The Liturgy of the Church of Scotland, of John Knox's Book of Common Order*. London: J. Leslie, 1840. *Googlebooks*. Web. May 5, 2014. P 150.

²⁰³ Willsher, Betty. *Understanding Scottish Graveyards*. Edinburgh: Council for Scottish Archaeology and NMSE Publishing, 2005. Print. P 12.

Not everyone agreed with the new rules. A generation or so many Scots resisted the change in practice cutting deals with local ministers to pay ‘fines’ for violating the rule and burying their dead inside. The Assembly responded in 1588:

Forsameikle as in no countrey quher any religioun is allowed, it is permitted that the deid be buried in the kirks, and albeit inhibitioun hes bein diverse tymes made for avoyding of that abuse, yet the acts and constitutiouns of the Kirk are daylie brockin: Therfor the Kirk inhibites in tyme comeing, that any persons be buried in the kirks, and that no Ministers give consent therto, bot directlie oppone thereto; certifeing such persons as salbe the authors and inbringers of the deid into the kirk, they salbe suspendit from the benefites of the Kirk, quhill they make publick repentance therfor; and the Minister that gives his consent, and discharges not his conscience in opponeing therto, salbe suspendit from his functioun in the Ministrie: And to the effect this act may have the better executioun, supplicatioun salbe made to his Majestie that ane ordinance may passe be his Hienes and Counsell, discharging the said buriall within kirks, and sicklyke erecting of tombis, and laying of troghes in kirkyards, vnder such paines as his Hienes and Counsell pleases to devyse.²⁰⁴

Progressively stronger pressure begins to work and a new cemetery genre springs up across Scotland. Willsher comments that “such was the subsequent congestion in the churchyards of the largest burghs that grounds which had previously been the sites and

²⁰⁴ “Acts and Proceedings: 1588, August.” *Acts & Proceedings of the General Assemblies of the Kirk of Scotland, 1560-1618*. 1839. 729-739. Sessio 5a. <http://www.britishhistory.ac.uk/report.aspx?compid=58975>. Accessed 25 March 2016.

gardens of monasteries were made available by royal edict as places for outside burial for all. The lands of the Grey Friars at Perth, Dundee and Edinburgh were all designated for that purpose.”²⁰⁵ The aristocracy resisted the change in monumentality as it changed their traditional display of family power in the recurring setting of weekly worship. Why let your brand get pushed into the yard when it can be in front of the very eyes of your constituents while they restlessly listen to the Sunday sermon?

It is important to note however, that Reformation and eighteenth century cemeteries did have their own logical structures for the arrangement of epitaphs. Most frequently, the arrangement of the yard rests in the social hierarchy of the local community. Archeologist, Betty Willsher’s research indicates that burial place choice correlated with social rank and property ownership. As “the aristocracy, the professional classes, the Guildry, and those who could afford to pay for the privilege” move the remains of their dead outside the church building a hierarchy develops in the arrangement of the surrounding yard.²⁰⁶

Therefore, the arrangement of a churchyard develops multigenerationally as a cross product of three situations: the order in which members of the congregation die; the availability of high value spaces; and rank by birth or wealth. Proximity to the church denoted prestige as wealthy families literally built aisles, annexes, vaults and tombs onto the entrance of the building. The poor, strangers, unbaptized children, and others found plots on the north side of many churchyards, an area devoid of memorial display, yet

²⁰⁵ Willsher. P 11.

²⁰⁶ Willsher. P 18.

nonetheless present in the memory of local family members.²⁰⁷ A final corollary to this arrangement hierarchy is the location of the epitaphs for revered clergy members.

Congregations often took up subscriptions to honor revered clergy members with monuments mounted on the exterior walls of the church. These spaces usually allocated to wealthy patrons, created an equivalency of value between the very rich and the very devout. In sum, visitors can read the relative prosperity and prestige of a congregation and its members by the proportion of monuments to lawn space in the corresponding areas of the churchyard as well as by the aesthetic qualities and materials of the monuments themselves.

Returning to Morris' interpretation of the closeness of graveyards to churches in colonial America one must remember where the colonists come from and the kinds of systems they continue to adopt and those they oppose. Given that many of the early colonial immigrants in the north Atlantic area come from the radical forefront of the Reformation tradition, graveyards adjoining Protestant colonial American churches more likely display the congregation's distance from Catholicism than any metaphor of closeness. Denominational concerns figure strongly in churchyard poetics, and in a certain sense the congregation merits evaluation as rhetor for the layout of their churchyard. Morris does not designate which denominations engage in the memento mori strain he sees in his forty sites but offers this as a type of ethos appeal with theological interpretation. In other words, as noted by Foucault, the bodies used to be much, much closer to the church, the ensuing separation is simultaneously theological

²⁰⁷ Willsher. P 16.

and rhetorical. The changing situation of the location of human remains determines the constitution of graveyards in this period, which begin to take the shape recognized by Morris. Presbyterian Protestants immigrants to America, including the Puritans, the Scottish Presbyterians and the French Huguenots, could publically display their theological opposition to Rome and to Episcopacy in the new heterotopias possible with new land in the colonies.²⁰⁸

Further diversity can be found a short hop across the Channel to Revolutionary France. The catacombs under Paris now house many skeletons, which had once been buried in the city center. Under the revolutionary regime (one which Foucault might interpret as atheist with more confidence than other parts of Europe) a push began to rid the city not just of memorials to the aristocratic dead but also of human remains themselves. A great deal of labor went into exhumation and expulsion. In other words, if accepting the heterotopia as a rhetorical text written on the land then access and control of the media of land must not be neglected in the larger story of cemeteries. As local landownership patterns begin to change at the end of the long eighteenth century with a shift from landownership by aristocratic elites to capitalist elites the United Kingdom sees both a surge in number and a diversification in the forms of memorials and cemeteries. These shifts accelerate into the Victorian era.

Therefore, Foucault's heterotopia has value in its articulation of public spaces in a form recognizable as a persuasive text. He recognizes a rapid increase in the nineteenth

²⁰⁸ Slosser, Gaius Jackson. Ed. *They Seek a Country: The American Presbyterians, Some Aspects*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1955.

century and posits the changing nature of generational use and interpretation of the place/space useful to the study of spatial rhetoric. However, when studying heterotopia outside of France, more specific historical situating is required to recognize the factors affecting the values these heterotopia represent. In Scotland, the drastic changes to cemeteries reflect their new function as a local forum for the development and display of new political and denominational identities in a period characterized by the progressive decentralization of religion coupled with the rise of increasingly commercial imperial priorities.²⁰⁹ The Stirling Valley Cemetery reveals that it is not the atheist's doubt in the construct of the soul, but rather a perceived competition for souls amongst the Scottish devout that sparks a new aesthetic in the so-called cult of the dead, and its inversion: the cult of the afterlife.

THE DRUMMOND BROTHERS & AN EVANGELICAL EMPIRE

As mentioned in the previous chapter, William Drummond erector of the *Margaret Wilson Monument* operated a prosperous seed merchant business in Stirling, Scotland, the Renaissance heart of the Stuart monarchy.²¹⁰ William was not the only rhetor in the large Drummond family. Due to the early death of his mother, he became

²⁰⁹ There are several competing empires during this period that shift from the short-term slaughter-plunder-convert approaches of the sixteenth and seventeenth-centuries to longer-term convert-capitalize-commercialize forms of exploitation of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. British evangelicals played a role in the conversion phase, and the Drummonds illustrate the intimate family networks intertwining evangelical and commercial interests.

²¹⁰ After the forced abdication of Mary Queen of Scots, the infant later known as King James the VI and I was crowned in Stirling's Holy Rude Church. John Knox gave the sermon. An inscription marks the floor, unveiled by Queen Elizabeth in 1997 commemorating the coronation. "A Guide to the Memorials within the Church of the Holy Rude, Stirling, Scotland." Undated booklet. Stirling: Friends of the Church of the Holy Rude.

one of two first-born sons when his father remarried. The family would grow to fifteen siblings.²¹¹ Half-brothers William (1793-1869) and Peter Drummond (1799-1877), spearheaded the promotion of enterprise in all its personal, patriotic and spiritual senses. William had an excellent head for business while Peter, much like the fictional Frank Osbaldistone, had aspirations to wield a pen. William channeled his share of profits into charity and public works including the erection of cenotaphs and other monuments. He and Peter together founded Scotland's first agricultural museum. Peter successfully transitioned from the family seed business to full-time production of evangelical pamphlets and newspapers, which William supported financially with donations in his will.²¹² Their nephew, Henry Drummond would become a famous teacher, orator and author in both evangelical and Darwinistic circles. The Drummonds were a mutually supportive bunch not content with profitmaking—they channeled energy and capital into evangelism. In their own way, the family rhetorical enterprises became as successful as the seed business. Several of the projects, including the cemetery monuments and the Stirling Tract Depot's Christian publishing arm, lived on long after their germination period into the present day.²¹³

²¹¹ Peter Drummond made an editorial exception to the no-obituaries policy in his newspaper when his brother died. He marked the obituary with a black frame invoking mourning stationary of the period to announce his brother's death to his readers. "The Late William Drummond, Esq." *The British Messenger* 1 January 1869. *Drummond Family Collection*, University of Stirling Library, Stirling, Scotland.

²¹² Drummond, William. "Will and Trust." SC70/1/42/315-337. 1868. National Records Office: Edinburgh, United Kingdom.

²¹³ Thank you to Stirling Town Council personnel for access to Peter Drummond's former residence, now a town council building. He bequeathed his private residence to the city council along with statues of William Wallace and Robert the Bruce. Parts of the building with its exquisitely worked plaster ceiling motifs of Scottish thistles with English roses are still available for public rental for events such as weddings. The statues remain on public view flanking the entrance to a nearby Town Council building. Viewforth, Stirling, United Kingdom.

The Drummonds' works represent a new bourgeois pragmatism towards the relationship between texts and audiences. The Drummonds themselves represent a shift in rhetoric in which some of the responsibilities and privileges of public display previously associated with aristocratic classes and systems of university patronage were adopted by prosperous merchants and capitalists in the growing empire.²¹⁴ The arrangement of the Valley Cemetery in Stirling highlights the opportunities for invention afforded by changing landownership and usage patterns in Victorian era Scotland. William's inclusion of statuary and Peter's forays into the lower forms of tract genres pragmatically embrace the availability of new media and pushed the boundaries of Presbyterian plain style and Scottish middle class decorum.

This raises the question of what exactly new media means in the context of the nineteenth century? After all, print was well established by the eighteenth century and stone had been used since the classical period. For the Drummond brothers new media involved innovations some related to technological advances in materials others related to delivery as transportation changed the landscape of medial opportunities for communicating with audiences. This meant that some media were quite literally the produce of new inventions such as cast iron gravemarkers, while others were innovations on existing technologies such as the new cheaper papers available. In other cases it was not so much the media that was new so much as the innovation in delivery. For example,

²¹⁴ In some cases the aristocracy transformed themselves into capitalists and merchants by adopting new enterprises and productions onto their hereditary land with mixed success depending on one's point of view. By many accounts the success of lairds turned capitalist in the sheep industry, for instance, tended to be the ones who cleared their own feudal subjects off the land contributing to the Highland Clearances. Smout, T.C. *A Century of the Scottish People: 1830-1950*. London: Fontana Press 1986. Pp 58-84.

economies of scale and government intervention reduced the bulk mail price structures of the British post allowing Peter Drummond's tracts to cheaply reach the far corners of the empire.

During William and Peter's lifetimes, Stirling acquired a stop along a train line to the bustling port city of Glasgow. Access to Glasgow provided the town with new opportunities for trade, tourism, and audiences. Against this backdrop the Drummond brothers worked with enviable energy to run a profitable company, start a tract depot for evangelical pamphlets, launch Scotland's first Agricultural Museum, and erect a series of monuments transforming the Valley Cemetery into a tourist attraction.²¹⁵ Changes to the British mail system created special pricing schedules making mass print media available at the level of the Commonwealth. For Peter Drummond this meant an opportunity for rapid expansion of his pamphlet enterprise. He responded by moving his tract depot into space next to the post office and franchised his pamphlets to printers in Dublin, London, Glasgow.²¹⁶ If the Stirling Tract Depot's tract banners are accurate, circulation exceeded 90 million copies. One can think of these tracts as having comparable exigency to Hannah More's *Cheap Repository* tracts in England. William and Peter Drummond took full advantage of the new media opportunities of both travelling audiences and travelling texts in their advocacy work. William Drummond's expensive granite monuments and

²¹⁵ Thank you to the archivists at the Stirling Town Council Archives and the special collections librarians for assisting me in finding family papers and public records for the Drummond family. No authoritative biography currently exists for William Drummond. Birkbeck, John. *Peter Drummond: Man of Conviction and Action*. Stirling: The Saint Andrew Press, 1984. P 44.

²¹⁶ An un-catalogued set of volumes collects together approximately three hundred tracts in the *Drummond Family Papers*. 1817-1947. MS 42/2/10. Drummond Family Collection: University of Stirling Library, Stirling United Kingdom.

Peter Drummond's flimsy paper pamphlets, in spite of every scholarly division, share surprisingly similar exigencies: to maintain the Sabbath by providing didactic texts to compete for the attention of increasingly mobile Sunday audiences.

Transportation innovations of the period not only impacted the delivery of texts to readers but also the delivery of readers to texts. Over the course of the nineteenth century the possibilities for British tourism exceeded the tours of country homes by and for the equestrian classes portrayed in Jane Austen's novels. Thanks to train lines, spatial texts like a local museum or a garden cemetery became viable ways of expressing ideas to newly mobile national audiences--including the rapidly expanding urban industrial working class. The Agricultural Museum received thousands of visitors per year. The Valley Cemetery, a prominent attraction for Victorians, had its own tour guides.

The Drummonds lived in a contentious time for the Presbyterian Church called the Great Disruption. During the Great Disruption 450 ministers split from the established Church of Scotland to form the Free Church of Scotland (as discussed in Chapter Two). The Disruption affected not only the religious but also the educational infrastructure of Scotland and had ripple effects into other areas. Given the sheer size of the movement and the generous donations of its new members, a rash of building and splitting of buildings occurred in this period. The effect is not always obvious in the extant architectural archive today due to the reunion of branches of the church at the end of the century--Free Church facilities were consequently rebranded in the merger.

Extant postal directories, however, reveal the implications of the split for local infrastructures. For example, the postal directory of Hamilton during that time divided

the “Clergy” section of its postal directory into “Established” and “Free” categories and similar sections can be found dividing schools.²¹⁷ The Drummonds, siding with the Free Church, found themselves in a more literally split congregation. During this period the Holy Rude Church they attended was split with a dividing wall--local legend has it that the competing preachers would shout over each other on Sundays.²¹⁸ William Drummond’s congregation considered his monumental contributions not only religious but patriotic as indicated by the white marble cenotaph they dedicated to him on their wall of worthies. The result of the Great Disruption was the rise of two distinct ideological factions in the Presbyterian ranks. The newer Free Church faction had the exigency to distinguish itself from the official Church of Scotland, which it strongly felt was going down the wrong path and to compete with it for members. In Stirling, William Drummond asserted Free Church denominational identity by invoking radical Reformation origins through a series of Reformer cenotaphs that led visitors along paths from one part of the cemetery to another creating an opportunity for a sustained reading experience and a more controlled argument than eighteenth century tomb-centric models.

TOWARDS A THEORY OF LOGISTICAL APPEALS

²¹⁷ *Duncan & Jamieson’s Directory for Stirling, St. Ninians, Cambusbarron, Whins of Milton, Bannockburn, Bridge of Allan, Dunblane, Doune, Deanston, and Callendar.* Stirling: R.S. Shearer. 1868-69. PD16. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. Also available at the National Library of Scotland in Edinburgh, United Kingdom. Pp 52-54.

²¹⁸ Similar dividing walls were erected in Presbyterian churches in other parts of Scotland, notably, Greyfriars Kirk of Edinburgh. In most cases these walls have long since been removed but often get a mention in church history tours and pamphlets.

Heterotopia work on different semiotic principles than texts composed exclusively (or even primarily) of Hugh Blair's phonetic representations of language.²¹⁹ Heterotopia reflect elements of style, argument, arrangement, aesthetics, but their underlying values are a combination of rules and regulations that impact interpretation more idiosyncratically than other modes. Therefore, some useful analogs can be made for lexicons, grammars, syntaxes and genres in heterotopia, and in other areas expansion of theory is needed. For example, one might say that a cemetery consists of text and subtexts much like an entertaining history book or fascinating novel offers footnotes that mean as much as the narrative flowing above them. In this case, the footnotes are buried bodily remains. The metaphor works well for cemeteries in which there are gravemarkers, but what of the unmarked one described by Wright? Wright's work on the interpretative reaction to even unmarked African American cemeteries points out a classic woods-for-trees and chicken-egg issue. Is there such a thing as a footnote without a text? Or is the real text the body? But then what to do with the cenotaph genres? One quickly begins to see how theories based on metaphors to other media or to framing are potentially useful for interpreting the meaning of individual epitaphs, but also their limitations when evaluating entire cemeteries. If one can tell an epitaph is an epitaph by its context in a cemetery, how does one know one is in a cemetery, by the epitaphs?

To accommodate the semiotics of heterotopia, it is necessary to expand the rhetorical analysis toolkit with spatially specific logistical appeals. A logistical appeal occurs when the location of an object exerts suasive force through its relationship with

²¹⁹ See Chapter Two for Blair's contribution to hierarchies of language.

other meaningful objects. This creates the opportunity for arrangements exerting with syllogistic elements but with as many or more elements left to the interpreter as enthymemes. Navigable sequences or arrangements of logistical appeals in a heterotopia create compound suatory effects much like the arrangement of information in an essay contributes to its overall logic. Therefore, one can think of logistical appeals as occurring at the level of the figure, but also at the level of style and arrangement and that these levels blur considerably when considering heterotopia, monumental media, epitaphic genres or epigraphic texts more broadly.

In the Valley Cemetery, the cenotaph monuments of heroes of the Protestant Reformation create attention-focusing nodes to encourage visitors to move across and around the space. The viewer on the ground can see at least one Reformation-themed monument from any other Reformation-themed monument. The overall layout is designed to be viewed from above. Several vista points allow visitors to see the larger arrangement patterns: Ladies' Rock, the Star Pyramid and the Castle Esplanade. Newspaper coverage interprets the arrangement of the statues of the Reformers:

Looking from the Ladies' Rock towards the Castle, we have in the foreground Knox, Melville, and Henderson, the veriest champions of Scottish Presbytery. To the right and left stand Guthrie and Renwick, the first and last martyrs in the second epoch of Scotland's wrestlings for the truth.²²⁰

²²⁰ "The Cemetery Statuary." *Stirling Observer* 7 April 1859. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P 3.

Here the historiographical exigency of the space shines through and the writer places the figures in a larger arc of Scottish history with a distinctly Reformed spin.

Major pathways promote movement through sections while minor pathways give visitors access to individual monuments, thus providing ample opportunities for viewing as mourning, as a Sabbath devotion, and as tourism. In several areas loops were integrating into the design for both convenience and emphasis. For example, a kidney shaped inset marks the grouping of Knox, Melville and Henderson. The placement of a working marble font at the feet of the three orators forms the indentation of the kidney shape bringing thirsty passersby of former era closer to the feet of Knox.²²¹ These loops create opportunities for visitors to view the statues from all angles while also promoting movement from one to the next.

When considering the overall view of the cemetery it is useful to add to the idea of the logistical appeal two loose categories. In rhetorical study of both *persona* and *kairos*, the idea of appeals being either 'situated' or 'invented' distinguish between persuasion by opportunities in the social context and persuasion by invention designed particularly into the text. Tour guides make a point of guiding tourists to the *Ladie's Rock*. From there, the view not only reveals the *Valley Cemetery*, but also the adjoining *Old Town Cemetery*. The view includes all three of the cemetery genres alluded to by Foucault: the kirk itself (a pre-Reformation structure), the *Old Town kirkyard* (seventeenth to eighteenth century), and the new *Valley Cemetery* (nineteenth century).

²²¹ The water source for the font originated symbolically in the *Pleasure Garden*, but no longer flows due to the high cost of maintaining water features. Water symbols associated with baptism, also appear on the *Margaret Wilson Monument*. In her case the symbolic second baptism was administered by drowning, resurrection, and re-drowning.

This creates a situated logistical appeal comparing the arrangement structures of the two spaces. In this appeal the two objects for comparison are presented in proximity but a conclusion is not offered. It is assumed that the visitor will find the geometrical pathways of the Valley Cemetery self-evident in their superiority.

The ariel view hints at an element of arrangement that becomes quite striking at ground level: the undamaged stones in the Old Town Cemetery (Holy Rude Kirkyard) all face the same direction. The common orientation stems from beliefs that the body would rise at the Resurrection. The Valley Cemetery, on the other hand, discontinues the practice. The new monuments (and presumably the lairs beneath them) face the pathways walked by the living.²²² These pathways lead visitors along display spaces for epitaphs to landmark spaces containing cenotaphs. Each cenotaph landmark space contains intersections to new pathways and new corners to turn, as well as a space for contemplation of monuments themselves. The new design represents a shift from prior conceptualizations of cemeteries as resting places for the dead to a renewed vision of cemeteries as places for the education of the living.

The Drummond brothers were no strangers to the art of display. They received national level recognition—quite literally a gold medal—for the Drummond Agricultural Museum. The *Gardner's Chronicle* indicates that the museum operated on a dialectical model, “to this Museum all are admitted, and the uses and merits of each article exhibited are explained; nor does this attention always go unrewarded, for much useful information is often obtained from casual visitors, which is again circulated; and an extensive

²²² Lair is the Scottish term for a grave plot.

connexion is thus formed, through which all questions respecting agricultural matters are readily answered.” Established in 1831, the museum exhibited farm implements, and plants for “garden, field, and the forest.”²²³ Archibald Gorrie writes of their museum exhibits as nearly talking to the visitor:

Ample collections of living and dried specimens of grasses, in scientific arrangement, form another interesting feature in the Exhibition, pointing to the farmer, in language as strong as it is in the collective power of grass to express, a proffer of service, whereby he can improve its condition, and, with much advantage to himself, convert it to flesh.²²⁴

The Drummond Agricultural Museum becomes the national prototype and attracted an estimated average of 1000 visitors a month at its height.²²⁵ The brothers honed their exhibition skills in the museum, the garden, and the field, which would all contribute to the cemetery plan.

Like museum exhibits or garden features, the landmark areas of the Valley Cemetery provide the spatial analogs for a number of rhetorical devices. Heterotopia like print genres can feature plot twists, figures, epiphanies, conceits, premises and conclusions in controlled compositions but have the additional qualities of allowing

²²³ According to an advertisement on p55, the Drummond Museum also exhibited a display of tartan and had a tartan warehouse. *Duncan & Jamieson’s Directory for Stirling, St. Ninians, Cambusbarron, Whins of Milton, Bannockburn, Bridge of Allan, Dunblane, Doune, Deanston, and Callendar*. Stirling: R.S. Shearer. 1868-69. PD16. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. Also available at the National Library of Scotland in Edinburgh, United Kingdom.

²²⁴ Gorrie, Archibald. “On the Benefits to be derived from agricultural associations, and the establishment of agricultural museums.” PD155/2. Stirling Town Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P viii.

²²⁵ Drummond, Peter. “Report of the Exhibit of Agricultural Productions at Stirling at the Premises of W. Drummond & Sons...1832-1833” Stirling: W. Drummond and Sons 1833. PD16. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P 26.

individual navigation through multiple possible arrangements of the text. Each mobile reader chooses her own path, but the landmark focal points ensure common elements to the interpretation experience. In other words, the more complicated arrangement strategies of Victorian cemeteries take more control over the persuasive message of the heterotopia than the kirkyards of the prior century. The new models take advantage of the epitaphic stylistic possibilities for drawing attention, not just to a particular honored dead, but to the entire town. The strategic use of cenotaphs can extend that message to the placement of the town in a vision of the empire. The new arrangements feature walking pathways, carriage roads, trees, benches and tour guides, create opportunities for sequences and progressions of monuments each with the disruptive, didactic and intertextual potential of *The Margaret Wilson Monument* described in Chapter Two. By leveraging memorability, the Drummonds manage to spread the Covenanter mythos developed in Wodrow's *History of the Sufferings* (Chapter One) quite far afield. As seen in the descriptions of memories of the Stirling Cemetery and *The Margaret Wilson Monument* by American Presbyterian pastors in their sermons and travel narratives (Chapter Two) the heterotopia succeeds in calling attention to and perpetuating Covenanter memory and Reformation ideals.

In conclusion, Stirling's Valley Cemetery illustrates the ways longer historiographic narratives and national level calls to attention worked in nineteenth century Scottish heterotopia. The Drummond brothers worked to reform a rapidly growing empire in the Presbyterian image. Unlike the Covenanters of the seventeenth century whom they so admired, the Drummonds wielded no weapons, in their imperial

project--only texts. In their cemetery and museum monument making they attracted visitors to Stirling, while through the ephemeral media of tract and newspaper writing they sent millions of copies to readers throughout the Commonwealth competing for the minds of an empire. Their rhetorical enterprises present a vision of a Presbyterian influenced empire through the disciplining of cultural space-time, an imperial project that required the active defense and maintenance of the Sabbath.

Epilogue--Disorderly Arrangement: Monuments, Digitization, and Data

The policy of many District Councils to keep graveyards in good order has led to ‘over-tidying,’ and collapsed or damaged stones are removed from graveyards. There is widespread damage and loss of stone through vandalism...The recording work by volunteers will provide a permanent record of this important and neglected part of our historical and architectural heritage before it is lost. –Betty Willsher

A commuter crosses the street against the light, and slips through a stone gateway. Cutting across the lawn between the tombstones, the commuter greets a dog walker who looks up and smiles, waving a tiny plastic bag. The dog urinates, a golden stream washing over the inscription on a rosy granite Celtic cross. The commuter presses on, turning up the music in his earphones to drown out the sound of a lawnmower. A jogger overtakes and passes him. The commuter turns sharply at a toppled obelisk, skirts a patch of thorny wild roses, and pops out onto the street a few paces from his bus stop. He looks at his watch--three minutes early. He sinks down onto an oak bench the length of a coffin, where three strangers or four friends could sit comfortably. He runs his arm along the back of the bench feeling for the small brass placard. His fingers run lightly over the words, and his hand comes to rest lightly on the name of his mother while he reads descriptions of candidates on his phone. A bus pulls up, not his usual route, instead, this one passes a polling station. He rises to his feet, adjusts his kilt, and climbs aboard.

In Edinburgh, the bench on which our hypothetical commuter sits is termed a presentation seat. Since the end of World War II, these seats began to break the borders of Foucault’s heterotopia of the cemetery into the spaces of the living. They line the

public parks and avenues of Edinburgh's busiest tourist and shopping districts.

Numbering more than 1,500 by 2010, the large majority of these seats feature memorial plaques dedicated to deceased loved ones and family members.²²⁶ These benches are just one of the innovative ways Scots have adapted the epitaph genre since the Victorian era. The benches invite locals and tourists to sit and enjoy the weather, or lunch on a sausage roll in the friendly company of both the living and the virtual dead. The benches satisfy many of the exigencies of cemetery monuments bringing them into city centers in a time of increasing trends towards cremation. Costing a donation of approximately £1,500 to adopt, the benches require maintenance, and just like their graveyard counterparts are vulnerable to vandalism. Photographs of the bench's plaques make it onto social media, where the presentation seats are frequently called epitaph benches or memorial benches revealing that ambulatory and on-line audiences alike clearly interpret their relationship to graveyard genres.

Inspired by the spirit of sociality and sharing underlying Edinburgh's benches, this epilogue brings this project to a close with a few words about the relationships of monuments to social media. First, I will take a moment to update the context of monuments and epitaphic genres to reflect the status of Scottish identity now. This essay then segues by briefly revisiting the composite exigencies of epitaphic genres. Then it concludes with a sketch of what the remediation of monuments on the internet reveals about the way groups prioritize exigency when faced with the daunting task of recording

²²⁶ Turley, Mark. "Future Management of Presentation Seats." Report to Edinburgh City Council. 9 February 2010. www.edinburgh.gov.uk. Accessed 25 March 2016.

epigraphic texts into digital forms using the examples of *The Margaret Wilson Monument* and Robert Wodrow's tomb.

The 2014 Scottish Referendum highlighted the failures of many in either political or academic circles to notice, much less study, Scottish identity. During the days leading up to the vote, pundits like Stephen Colbert, John Oliver and John Stewart satirized American and English notions of Scotland as the land of plaid, haggis, whisky, Mel Gibson, and bagpipes. The polls split and the separatists took the lead at the last moment—suggesting that what had been taken for granted as a postcolonial period was more like a postcolonial ellipsis. Voters turned out in record numbers many voting in kilts and tartans. The final tally swung back to the side of “better together,” but not before the notion that a Scotland divided is a Britain divided hit world news. For a moment, the news shattered the monolithic English identity associated with the (barely) United Kingdom.²²⁷

Coinciding with the referendum, Visit Scotland, the national tourism agency, organized the 2014 Scottish Homecoming—a year-long national-level series of events designed to attract international tourism. One of the themes for the year was the ‘ancestral’ revealing that a target audience for the year was the Scottish diaspora many of whom claim ancestors from the Covenanter Wars, the Jacobite Rebellions, the Highland Clearances, or the potato famines. Thus, although the referendum results caught corporate

²²⁷ A Scottish reporter for *Newsweek's* World section summed up this view writing, “As the polling booths are dismantled and the dust settles across the country, one thing is gloriously clear to us. We are a Scotland rebooted, energized, empowered, and above all, after decades of feeling ignored and discounted by London, heard.” Renton, Alex. “Scottish Independence: How the Better Together Campaign Almost Threw It All Away.” 18 Sept 2014. *Newsweek*. www.newsweek.com. Web. July 6, 2015.

news by surprise, those who toured the streets of Scotland (or sat on its benches) saw a steady display of national identity manifested in monuments, museums and landscapes built over centuries. Many, like *The Margaret Wilson Monument*, were restored or renovated since the year 2000. Directed towards international audiences of ambulatory readers, this Scottish display of memorial rhetoric tells a story of resistance that corporate media missed.

Commercial immediacies drive what news outlets consider important. Therefore, it is not that surprising that corporate news reporting would miss the long steady kairos appeals of Scotland's epitaphs. As asserted previously in this dissertation, communities take a long look to kairos and a complex approach to exigency in their display of epitaphs. For example, the presentation seats mentioned above have a display span of about fifty years. Likewise, a properly maintained flint or granite monument can last centuries. Given this longer timeline the financial concerns for monuments tend towards endowments or trust funds like that established by William Drummond, and not short-term profit.

Although epitaphic texts that attract tourists can fulfill economic functions, the genres primarily fulfill the following recurring social needs: to mark a location for grief or memory making; to keep a public record of the names of the dead; to call attention to theologies of death; to praise the dead; to learn from the dead; and to connect a community to past generations. Epitaphs take part in the larger textual category of the monument which invokes a temporal conceptualization of media driven by the storage of high priority memories for future generations. Given the variation and hybridization of

their material forms epitaphic genres have a complex relationship to style. Monumental style can be seen as driven by bundles of decisions about *techne* that mix pragmatic concerns about attracting attention and achieving memorability with metacommentaries on group beliefs. As shown previously, the Covenanters had strong theologically rooted beliefs about textuality that spilled over into Scottish monumental style for approximately two centuries.

Memorability poses a challenge for rhetorical criticism, in that it is difficult, and in most places illegal, to poke around in a brain to try to sort out what an individual remembers. Social media, however, yields valuable clues as to what people think they want to remember and how it grabbed their attention through sharing. As previously asserted, monuments are designed to draw attention. One proof that the attempt to draw attentions has worked is if somebody decides to point at it, or better, takes a photo. Social media sharing can be interpreted as pointing at an object over long distances. Thus, social media is a space where people re-collect things they want to remember, and as a place where they display the texts that capture attention.

There is a temptation when talking about social media to look at the big public infrastructures of Facebook, Instagram, Twitter and Wikipedia. These sites are incalculably important, however, I would like to focus here on a boutique social media site that specifically responds to the challenges of recording epitaphic texts. Like the work of John Weever described in Chapter One, Findagraveinscotland.com records monuments. The website goes a step further mixing the public record aspects of the genre, with praise for select dead in a longer arc of history. In doing so, this social media

website demonstrates that although the digital recording of monuments is far from perfect, it can result in exciting new forms of electronic monuments on the internet.²²⁸

Before turning to Findagraveinscotland's solution to the problem of flattening the layers of a landmark epitaph into digital environments, let's look at the problem of inscriptions a little more closely. The inscriptions on *The Margaret Wilson Monument* analyzed in Chapter Two provide an exemplar case--recall that the monument stood on an octagonal base. The navigation of the eight faces bearing inscriptions seems intuitive to an ambulatory reader but quickly becomes a disorderly mess when transcribed onto a single page. The recorder finds him or herself faced with decisions. If one attempts to record the full inscription of the monument, one must first make a decision about where to start. What counts as the beginning of the inscription? Should each side get its own page? Is it better to just include a photograph, but then we would need at least three or four? And then, after that is sorted out the recorder realizes that a vertical separation of the stone and glass inscriptions creates parallel spaces with independent grammar. Finally, one might settle on something like a table format to attempt to hierarchize the levels of text (see example table in Appendix). The table, while effective for indicating the vertical and horizontal axes of the text still lacks the additional arguments made by the images of the marble statuary and other features.

The solutions to problems like these by Findagraveinscotland.com illustrate that a website can do more than just record monuments, it can take on several memorial

²²⁸ The term electronic monuments was coined by Gregory Ulmer. Ulmer, Gregory. *Electronic Monuments*. Electronic Mediations, Volume 15. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press 2005.

exigencies to become an epitaphic work in its own right. The website does so drawing on its own material features and not limiting itself to strict attempts to duplicate or remediate the original monument. Unfortunately, Margaret Wilson does not appear in the search results. Robert Wodrow, however, is included.²²⁹ Wodrow's page includes the full array of fields available to viewers including: a long prose biography; a photo of the front face of his four-sided mausoleum style tomb; metadata recording his name; date of death, age at death; and location information.

The website accommodates the need to show the stonework by including an upload for members to contribute photos of monuments but falls short of rendering the kinds of spectacular disruptions made by monuments into the space of a laptop screen or desktop monitor—the most typical consumer forms of display. Instead Findagraveinscotland.com features photos of the headstone featuring the name of the dead. This decision prioritizes the public record keeping aspect of epitaphic genres. Furthermore, given that sites like these run on databases, there is a search engine. The engine, like the photos, prioritizes the first name, last name and dates when finding the deceased. The database, therefore, is limited to the name fields and a keyword search beyond public record keeping, such as to find a line of poetry on a stone falls victim to field standardization.

²²⁹ Furthermore, as a specially designated “famous Scot” his page is also publicly accessible without a user account making it useful to readers of this dissertation. The password protected user conventions of social media sites like these makes them comparable to the notion of the readerly conventions of a symposium described by Jeffrey Walker in previous chapters. “Famous Scots: Robert Wodrow Rev.” *Findagraveinscotland.com*. <http://www.findagraveinscotland.com/grave/famousGrave/117895>. Find A Grave Ltd, 2011. Accessed 25 March 2016.

Limitations on search data aside, Findagraveinscotland.com's finds creative ways to honor the dead. The inclusion of a biography field yields the opportunity to praise Wodrow for writing *The History of the Sufferings*, lavishly attributing his "integrity, candor, liberality of sentiment, and talents" to making him "eminently" suitable as author of such a foundational work. The page goes on to tell the tale of how well received the work was by the King who promptly granted Wodrow one hundred guineas as a reward. The entry goes on for 2,340 words and is cut off in mid-word by the character limit on the field. This enormous prose entry fulfills the exigency to honor in a manner that would be prohibitively expensive on Wodrow's stone tomb. The website takes advantage of the inexpensive storage of data to combine the wordier conventions of book monuments with those of landmark genres into a new form based in digital space.

As indicated above, the photo of the monument focuses on the side of the monument bearing the inscription of Wodrow's name. Here, it falls short of what would be needed to fully portray the attention-getting aspects of the original tomb's composition and style choices. However, the website includes its own attention getting attempt in the form of a feature page titled "Famous Scots." This special section works to fulfill similar exigencies of the Heroes of the Reformation cenotaphs in the Valley Cemetery discussed in Chapter Three. Although the navigation of the Valley Cemetery via lines of site and walkways works quite differently than the clicking of links to pages, nonetheless, one can see the goal of the design decision to call attention. By including a Religion subsection under Famous Scots Wodrow's page becomes accessible from the home site with just three clicks and zero searches. The public facing Famous Scots pages work to draw

visitors into the site in the manner of tourism—they give new users a taste of what it has to offer. Then, the site invites them to become more involved in the virtual community by setting up a user account.

The site addresses the exigencies of marking the grave of the dead whilst grappling with its inability to actually mark the spot. Instead, the site includes location metadata, and a full-color aerial map view of the area around the cemetery embedded into the page from Googlemaps.com. This gives site visitors a different experience than the ground level ambling of an actual cemetery visit. It offers an alternate view allowing one to see the overall arrangement of the cemetery and its position in the town. For internet searchers interested in Scottish heroes or their own ancestors, these maps act as deictic markers connecting the epitaphic database in virtual space to geographic space. This means that tourists with GPS enabled cell phones can pause for a moment on any presentation bench they like and plot a route to Wodrow's grave while reading about his role in the history of the Covenanters. Or, after running into Wodrow's tomb, a visitor might be prompted to search the internet for context and learn more about the Covenanters. Or, if the tourist has companions the curiosity can result in oral exchanges and further sharing. Thus, monuments of almost any form can act as nexus points for intertextuality and the pleasures of sociality.

In conclusion, Scotland's warm embrace of its own lively, poignant and sometimes playful epitaphic texts creates pathways between local and national history, between scholarship and tourism, and between the fine arts and popular culture. As the commercial iconoclasm of lawnmowers, inadequate maintenance budgets and the high

value of urban real estate slowly eat away at the monumental archives of past generations new forms rise taking the genres to new spaces and places. Whether composed of stone, tapestry, Corten steel, paper, or the latest in silicon, epitaphic genres continuously reinvent contemporary identities through their representations of past Scots and Scotlands past.²³⁰ Thus, even though the British postal system lists the Valley Cemetery as St. John St., Stirling FK8 1ED, United Kingdom, every visitor knows the flint-paved street they walk upon to get there is Scottish.

²³⁰ The newest major Covenanter monument takes the form of a burning bush. The burning bush allusion to the emblem on the title page of Wodrow's first edition of *History of the Sufferings* utilizes Corten steel flames rusted to a deep red with contrasting stainless steel leaves. The leaves feature the names of Covenanter martyrs, including Margaret Wilson and Margaret Maclauchlin in negative image lettering. The negative lettering technique means that the letters are completely cut out of the steel such that the words appear as light itself bringing the illuminated manuscript metaphor into material reality. The work was donated by Bill Dunigan of the Scottish Covenanters Memorials Association. Dunigan, Bill. *Dalry Covenanter Monument*. Dalry: United Kingdom 2004.

Appendix: Inscription on *The Margaret Wilson Monument*

JUDGE	SAVIOUR	IT IS	CHRIST	IN US	LORD	JESUS	KING
			<p>MARGARET, VIRGIN MARTYR OF THE OCEAN WAVE, WITH HER LIKE- MINDED SISTER AGNES.</p> <p align="center">—</p> <p>“Love, many waters cannot quench²³¹ — GOD save/ His chaste impearled One! Covenant true./ “O Scotia’s Daughters! Earnest scan the Page/ And prize this Flower of Grace, blood- bought for you. PSALMS IX. XIX.</p>				
GOOD WILL	TOWARD MEN.”	John III:23-24	Revelation XXII:13-21	Isaiah XVII:12-14	GLORY TO GOD	IN THE HIGHEST	ON EARTH PEACE

²³¹ Song of Solomon 8:7.

Bibliography

- A. B. "Douglas, a tragedy, weighed in the balances and found wanting. Being an answer to two important questions respecting that performance..." Edinburgh, [1757]. *Eighteenth Century Collections Online*. Gale. University of Texas. Web. 16 Oct 2014.
- "Acts and Proceedings: 1562, December." *Acts & Proceedings of the General Assemblies of the Kirk of Scotland, 1560-1618*. (1839), . 25-30. <<http://www.british-history.ac.uk>>. Web. 29 April 2016.
- "Acts and Proceedings: 1588, August." *Acts & Proceedings of the General Assemblies of the Kirk of Scotland, 1560-1618*. 1839. 729-739. Sessio 5a. <http://www.britishhistory.ac.uk/>. Accessed 25 March 2016.
- Balzotti, Jonathan Mark and Richard Benjamin Crosby. "Diocletian's Victory Column: Megethos and the Rhetoric of Spectacular Disruption." *Rhetoric Society Quarterly* Vol 44, no. 4, pp 323-342.
- Barchas, Janine. *Graphic Design, Print Culture, and the Eighteenth-Century Novel*. Cambridge University Press: New York 2008.
- Bates, Jefferson. *Writing with Precision: How to Write So That You Cannot Possibly Be Misunderstood*. New York: Penguin 2000.
- Behn, Aphra, *Oroonoko, or, The royal slave*. Boston: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2000.
- Birkbeck, John. *Peter Drummond: Man of Conviction and Action*. Stirling: The Saint Andrew Press, 1984. P 44.
- Blair, Hugh. *Lectures on rhetoric and belles lettres, Part 1. Lecture VI*. Dublin: Messrs. Whitestone, Colles, Burnet, Moncrieff, Gilbert 1783. *Eighteenth Century Collections Online*. P 120-127. Accessed 25 March 2016.
- Boldrick, Stacy, Leslie Brubaker and Richard Clay, eds. *Striking Images, Iconoclasms Past and Present*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate 2013.
- Bray, Joe and Ruth Evans. "Introduction: What is Textual Culture?" *Textual Cultures: Texts, Contexts, Interpretation* Vol. 2, No. 2, Autumn 2007. P 1-9.
- Burial Grounds (Scotland) Act 1855. 1855 Chapter 68 18 and 19 Vict. [Legislation.gov.uk](http://legislation.gov.uk). [Legislation.gov.uk](http://legislation.gov.uk). Accessed 25 March 2016.
- Burns, Robert. "On the Battle of Sheriff-Muir." *The Works of Robert Burns: with an account of his life, and a criticism on his writings*. Vol 4. Liverpool 1800. P 443. *Eighteenth Century Collections Online*. Web. 29 April 2016.
- Capp, Bernard. *England's Culture Wars: Puritan Reformation and its Enemies in the Interregnum, 1649-1660*. Oxford: Oxford University Press 2012.

- Carruthers, Mary. "Editor's introduction." *Rhetoric Beyond Words*. New York: Cambridge University Press 2010. P 3.
- "The Cemetery Statuary." *Stirling Observer* 7 April 1859. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P 3.
- Clark, Gregory. *Rhetorical Landscapes in America: Variations on a Theme From Kenneth Burke*. N.p.: University of South Carolina Press, 2004. Print.
- "Timothy Dwight's Moral Rhetoric at Yale College, 1795-1817. *Rhetorica* Vol 5 No.2 (Spring 1987) pp 149-161.
- Conley, Thomas M. *Rhetoric in the European Tradition*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press 1990, 220.
- Cowan, Ian B. *The Scottish Covenanters: 1660-88*. London: Victor Gollancz 1976.
- Smout, T.C. *A Century of the Scottish People, 1560-1830*. London: Fontana Press 1972.
- "CPR Deaths and Burials." *Scotland's People*. www.scotlandsppeople.gov.uk. Web. 19 March 2016.
- Cressy, David. *Birth, Marriage, and Death: Ritual, Religion, and the Life-Cycle in Tudor and Stuart England*. New York: Oxford University Press 1997.
- Cumming, John, ed. *The Liturgy of the Church of Scotland, of John Knox's Book of Common Order*. London: J. Leslie, 1840. *Googlebooks*. Web. May 5, 2014. P 150.
- Davidson, Neil. *The Origins of Scottish Nationhood*. Richmond, VA: Pluto Press, 2000.
- Dehaene, Michiel and Lieven De Caeter, eds. *Heterotopia and the City: Public space in a post civil society*. Routledge: New York 2008.
- Defoe, Daniel. *Memoirs of the Church of Scotland, in Four Periods*. Edinburgh: DeMcLeod & Son 1844. Oxford University facsimile via *Internet Archive*. www.archive.org. Web. 22 March 2016.
- Devitt, Amy. *Writing Genres*. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press 2004. Pp 29-30.
- Dixon, George A. Letter. 5 March 1987. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.
- Douglas, George. "Foreword." In Lindsay, Ian G. *The Cathedrals of Scotland*. Edinburgh: W. & R. Chambers 1926.
- Drummond Family Papers*. 1817-1947. MS 42/2/10. Drummond Family Collection: University of Stirling Library, Stirling United Kingdom.

- Drummond, Peter. "Report of the Exhibit of Agricultural Productions at Stirling at the Premises of W. Drummond & Sons...1832-1833" Stirling: W. Drummond and Sons 1833. PD16. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P 26.
- Drummond, William. "Will and Trust." SC70/1/42/315-337. 1868. National Records Office: Edinburgh, United Kingdom.
- Duncan & Jamieson's Directory for Stirling, St. Ninians, Cambusbarron, Whins of Milton, Bannockburn, Bridge of Allan, Dunblane, Doune, Deanston, and Callendar.* Stirling: R.S. Shearer. 1868-69. PD16. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. Also available at the National Library of Scotland in Edinburgh, United Kingdom. Pp 52-54.
- Dunigan, Bill. *Dalry Covenanter Monument.* Dalry: United Kingdom 2004.
- "Famous Scots: Robert Wodrow Rev." *Findagraveinscotland.com*.
<http://www.findagraveinscotland.com/grave/famousGrave/117895>. Find A Grave Ltd, 2011. Web. Accessed 25 March 2016.
- Foucault, Michel. "Of Other Spaces." In *Heterotopia and the City: Public Space in a Postcivil Society*. Ed. Michiel Dehaene and Lieven De Caeter. New York: Routledge, 2008.
- Genette, Gerard. Trans. Jane E. Lewin. *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation.* New York: Cambridge University Press 1997.
- Gorrie, Archibald. "On the Benefits to be derived from agricultural associations, and the establishment of agricultural museums." PD155/2. Stirling Town Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P viii.
- Great Tapestry of Scotland.* Scottish Parliament Building: Edinburgh, Scotland, Summer 2014.
- "A Guide to the Memorials within the Church of the Holy Rude, Stirling, Scotland." Undated booklet. Stirling: Friends of the Church of the Holy Rude.
- Guthke, Karl S. *Epitaph Culture in the West: Variations of a Theme in Cultural History.* Lewiston: The Edwin Mellen Press 2003.
- Hariman, Robert and John Louis Lucaites. *No Caption Needed: Iconic Photographs, Public Culture, and Liberal Democracy.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press 2007. Pp 4; 26.
- Hay, Eldon. *The Covenanters in Canada: Reformed Presbyterianism from 1820 to 2012.* Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 2012.
- "Heritage Plaques." Art is an Option.
<http://www.artisanooption.co.uk/interpretation/heritage.html>. Web 29 April 2016.
- "History: The Martyr's Monument." *Old Town Cemetery Stirling.*
www.oldtowncemetery.co.uk. Web. Accessed 25 March 2016.

- Hutton, William. *Twelve Thousand Miles over Land and Sea: Or, Wanderings in Europe*. Philadelphia: Grant, Faires & Rodgers, Printers. 1878. 123-125. *Books.google.com*. Web. 29 April 2016.
- Kames, Henry Home, Lord. *Elements of Criticism*. Indianapolis: Liberty Fund 2005.
- Kumar, Krishan. "The Ends of Utopia" for *New Literary History*, Vol 31, No3, Summer 2010, en 43.
- "The Late William Drummond, Esq." *The British Messenger* 1 January 1869. *Drummond Family Collection*, University of Stirling Library, Stirling, Scotland.
- Lieven De Caeter. "Heterotopia in a Postcivil Society." *Heterotopia and the City: Public Space in a Postcivil Society*. Ed. Michiel Dehaene and Lieven De Caeter. New York: Routledge, 2008. P 3-10.
- "Local News: Sermon." *Stirling Observer* 7 April 1859. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom. P 3.
- Longaker, Mark Garrett. *Rhetorical Style and Bourgeois Virtue: Capitalism and Civil Society in the British Enlightenment*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania University Press 2015.
- The Margaret Wilson Monument*. Valley Cemetery: Stirling, United Kingdom. July 2014.
- Martyr's Gravestone*. Wigtown Parish Church Graveyard: Galloway, United Kingdom.
- Macdonald, Lesley Orr. *A Unique and Glorious Mission: Women and Presbyterianism in Scotland 1830-1930*. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers 2000.
- MacLeod, Innes *Discovering Galloway*. Edinburgh: John Donald 1986.
- "Martyr's Memorial." *Stirling Observer*. 30 April 1863, p 4. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.
- McKenzie, Brian, and Melanie Rapino. *Commuting in the United States: 2009*. American Community Survey Reports, ACS-15. Washington, DC: US Census Bureau 2011. Web. 6 July 2015. <http://www.census.gov/prod/2011pubs/acs-15.pdf>.
- McKenzie, D.F. *Bibliography and the Sociology of Texts*. New York: Cambridge University Press 1999. P 13.
- McWilliam, C.E. "Wilson Monument." (Photo). F2/34, or NS79SC39.01. c. 1940. National Monuments Record of Scotland: Edinburgh, United Kingdom.
- Melville Monument*. St. Andrew's Square: Edinburgh, United Kingdom. July 2014.
- Memorial Screen: William Drummond Tablet*. Holyrude Church, Stirling, United Kingdom. July 2015.
- Miller, Carolyn. "Genres as Social Action." *Quarterly Journal of Speech* Vol 70, No. 2. May 1984, 151-167.

- Molyneaux, Brian. "Introduction: The Cultural Life of Images." *The Cultural Life of Images: Visual Representation in Archaeology*. Ed. Brian Molyneaux. New York: Routledge, 1997. 1-10.
- Morley, Neville. "Monumentality and the Meaning of the Past in Ancient and Modern Historiography." In *The Western Time of Ancient History: Historiographical Encounters with the Greek and Roman Pasts*. New York: Cambridge University Press. P 4.
- Morrill, John. "Rewriting Cromwell: A Case for Deafening Silences." *Canadian Journal of History*, December 2003. Pp 553-578. P 561.
- Morris, Richard. "Death on Display." *Rhetorics of Display*. Ed. Lawrence Prelli. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2006. 204-226. P 206-7.
- Munro, Alice. *The View from Castle Rock*. See also: Hay, Eldon. *The Covenanters in Canada: Reformed Presbyterianism from 1820 to 2012*. McGill-Queen's University Press. 2012.
- Napier, Mark. *Memoirs of the Marquis of Montrose*. 2 vols. Edinburgh: Stevenson, 1856.
- Navarre, Joan. *The Publishing History of Aubrey Bearsdley's Compositions for Oscar Wilde's Salomé*. Universal Publishers, 1999. 100-110.
- Nelson, Holly and Sharon Alker. "Daniel Defoe and the Scottish Church." *Digital Defoe: Studies in Defoe & His Contemporaries* 5, no. 1 (Fall 2013).
- "The New Cemetery—Erection of Statuary." *Stirling Observer*. (Tho ed.) 7 April 1859, p 3. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.
- Newstok, Scott. *Quoting Death in Early Modern England*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008. P 14.
- "Old Town Cemetery." Find a Grave: findagrave.com. Web. Accessed 25 March 2016.
- "Ornamental Ground at Stirling Cemetery, The Martyr's Monument, Proposal that Town Council Take over the Trust." *Stirling Observer*. 20 February 1923. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.
- Paterson, Raymond Campbell. *A Land Afflicted: Scotland and the Covenanter Wars, 1638-1690*. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers 1998.
- Pernot, Laurent. *Epideictic Rhetoric: Questioning the Stakes of Ancient Praise*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press 2015. P ix.
- Petrucci, Armando. Trans. Michael Sullivan. *Writing the Dead: Death and Writing Strategies in the Western Tradition*. Stanford University Press: Stanford, 1998. P xviii.

- Prelli, Lawrence J. "Rhetorics of Display: An Introduction." In *Rhetorics of Display*. Ed. Lawrence J. Prelli. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina 2006. P 1-9.
- Rankin, Ian. *Fleshmarket Alley*. Also, "Creating Rebus." Web. <http://www.ianrankin.net/pages/content/index.asp?PageID=149>. Accessed 25 March 2016.
- Reid, Ian. "Genre and Framing: The Case of Epitaphs." *Poetics* 17 (1988): 25-35.
- Renton, Alex. "Scottish Independence: How the Better Together Campaign Almost Threw It All Away." 18 Sept 2014. *Newsweek*. www.newsweek.com. Web. July 6, 2015.
- Ruskin, John. *Stones of Venice*. London: Collins 1960. P 31.
- Saindon, Brent Allen. "A Doubled Heterotopia: Shifting Spatial and Visual Symbolism in the Jewish Museum Berlin's Development." *Quarterly Journal of Speech* Vol 98, No. 1, Feb 2012, pp 24-48.
- Scodel, Josh. *The English Poetic Epitaph: Commemoration and Conflict from Jonson to Wordsworth*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press 1991. P 6.
- Scott, Walter, Sir. *Old Mortality in, The Waverley Novels*. Cambridge: Chadwyck-Healey, 1999.
- . *Rob Roy*. Wordsworth Classics: Hertfordshire, UK, 1995.
- "Scottish Transport Statistics No 32 2013 Edition." *TransportScotland.gov*. <http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/statistics/j285663-03.htm>. Scotland: National Statistics 2013. Web 29 April 2016.
- Sheingorn, Pamela. "'The Wise Mother': The Image of St. Anne Teaching the Virgin Mary." In *Gendering the Master Narrative: Women and Power in the Middle Ages*. Eds. Mary C. Erler and Maryanne Kawaleski. Pp105-134.
- Simonson, Peter. "Reinventing Invention, Again." *Rhetoric Society Quarterly* Vol. 44, No. 4, p 310. p 299-322.
- Slosser, Gaius Jackson. Ed. *They Seek a Country: The American Presbyterians, Some Aspects*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1955.
- Smith, Alexander McCall. *The Forgotten Affairs of Youth: an Isabel Dalhousie Novel*. New York: Anchor Books 2011.
- Smith, Donald C. *Passive Obedience and Prophetic Protest: Social Criticism in the Scottish Church 1830-1945*. New York: Peter Lang 1987.
- Smout, T.C. *A Century of the Scottish People, 1830-1950*. Glasgow: Fontana Press 1987. Print.

- . *A Century of the Scottish People: 1830-1950*. London: Fontana Press 1986. Pp 58-84.
- Spivak, Gayatri. Rosalind Morris, ed. *Can the Subaltern Speak? Reflections on the History of an Idea*. New York: Columbia Press, 2010.
- The Star Pyramid*. Valley Cemetery: Stirling, United Kingdom. July 2015.
- Stephen, Jeffrey. *Scottish Presbyterians and the Act of Union 1707*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 2007.
- Stevenson, Robert Louis. "Old Mortality." (1884) in *Essays by Robert Louis Stevenson*. New York: Chales Scribner's Sons 1918. p 268.
- Stuart, Flora Maxwell. *Lady Nithsdale and the Jacobites*. Peeblesshire: Traquair House 1995.
- Syme, Holger Schott. "The Look of Speech." *Textual Cultures: Texts, Contexts, Interpretation* Vol. 2, No. 2, Autumn 2007. p 34-60.
- Tey, Josephine. *The Daughter of Time*. New York: The MacMillan Company 1951.
- Tribute in stone to a young martyr's death on the sands." *Stirling Observer*. 15 May 1985. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.
- Turley, Mark. "Future Management of Presentation Seats." Report to Edinburgh City Council. 9 February 2010. www.edinburgh.gov.uk. Accessed 25 March 2016.
- Ulmer, Gregory. *Electronic Monuments*. Electronic Mediations, Volume 15. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press 2005.
- "The Virgin Martyrs." *Stirling Observer* 20 June 1867, p 4. Stirling Council Archives: Stirling, United Kingdom.
- VisitScotland. *Scotland: the Key Facts on Tourism in 2013*. Edinburgh: VisitScotland 2014. http://www.visitscotland.org/research_and_statistics/tourismstatistics.aspx. Web. 6 July 2015.
- Von Contzen, Eva and Luuk Houwen. Eds. "Introduction." *Medievala et Humanistica: Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Culture*. NS No 41. Special Issue Writing Identity in Medieval and Early Modern Scotland. London: Rowman & Littlefield 2016. P3.
- Walker, Jeffrey. *Rhetoric and Poetics in Antiquity*. New York: Oxford University Press 2000.
- . *The Genuine Teachers of This Art: Rhetorical Education in Antiquity*. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press 2011. Pp 1-5.
- . *Rhetoric and Poetics in Antiquity*. New York: Oxford University Press 2000. p 251.
- Watts, Claire. *The Covenanters*. Edinburgh: Scottie Books 2011. P 35.

- Weever, John. *Ancient Funeral Monuments within the united monarchy of Great Britain, Ireland and the islands adjacent*. Facsimile of 1631 original. Norwood, NJ: Walter J. Johnson, 1979. p 1.
- Wendel, Francois. Trans. Philip Mairet. *Calvin: Origins and Development of his Religious Thought*. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Books 1987. 284-290.
- Williams, Joseph and Gregory Colomb. *The Craft of Argument*. 3rd ed. New York: Pearson Longman 2007. P 15.
- Willsher, Betty. *Understanding Scottish Graveyards*. Edinburgh: Council for Scottish Archaeology and NMSE Publishing, 2005. Print. P 12.
- “Wilson Monument.” ID253558. CANMORE. <http://canmore.org.uk/site/253558>. Web. April 29, 2016.
- Wilson, John F. *Pulpit in Parliament: Puritanism during the English Civil Wars 1640-1648*. Princeton: Princeton University Press. P 138-165.
- Wilson, Ross. *The Meaning of “Life” in Romantic Poetry and Poetics*. New York: Routledge 2009. P 50.
- Wodrow, Robert. *The History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland, from the Restauration to the Revolution: Collected from the Publick Records, Original Papers, and Manuscripts of that Time, and other well attested Narratives*. Vol. 1 Edinburgh: Printed by James Watson, His Majesty’s Printer. MDCCXXI (1721). Harry Ransom Center, Austin, TX.
- . *History of the Suffering of the Church of Scotland from the Restoration to the Revolution by the Rev. Robert Wodrow...and notes, by Robert Burns*. Vols 1-4. Glasgow: Blackie and Son 1835-6. Harry Ransom Center: Austin, Texas.
- Wood, Andrew. “A Rhetoric of Ubiquity: Terminal Space as Omnitopia.” *Communication Theory* 13:3, August 2003, pp 324-344.
- Wright, Elizabethada. “Rhetorical Spaces in Memorial Places: The Cemetery as a Rhetorical Memory Place/Space.” *Rhetoric Society Quarterly* 35:4 (2005): 51-81. *MLA International Bibliography*. Web. 14 May 2014.
- Wysocki, Anne Frances and Dennis A. Lynch. *Compose design advocate: a rhetoric for integrating written, visual, and oral communication*. New York: Pearson Longman 2007. P 18-19.
- Yeoman, Peter. *Stirling Castle: Official Souvenir Guide*. Historic Scotland: United Kingdom 2011.
- Young, Duncan McNeill. Ed. *Gathering Jewels; or, The Secret of a Beautiful Life. In Memoriam of Mr. & Mrs. James Knowles. Selected from their Diaries*. New York: William Knowles, 1887. *Books.google.com*. Web. Accessed 25 March 2016. Pp 241-2; 261-2.