

September 26, 1963

AIR MAIL

Mr. Abraham Lerman
12 Geological Museum
Harvard University
Oxford Street
Cambridge 38, Massachusetts

Dear Mr. Lerman:

Your last letter would have been answered much earlier, had I not been out of town for a month.

In order to check on some of your observations I had to obtain shells of Ostrea gigas. These arrived recently and have been tested with Feigl's solution. All the several specimens tested showed the adductor muscle pad to consist of aragonite. The tests were quite clear and unequivocal.

I had always suspected that those of your results that showed only calcite as the constituent of the adductor muscle pad were erroneous. Probably, for some reason or another the aragonite layer was lost when you extracted the material to be tested from its original place in the valve. I suspect the same error happened in your samples of Ostrea frons, lurida, and edulis. You would not want to publish statements that can be proved to be wrong.

The adductor aragonite pad is very tightly attached to the underlying calcitic shell material so that it is impossible to peel it off cleanly. For this reason, all samples obtained by chiseling or grinding will contain calcite adhering to the overlying aragonite pad, and all X-ray analyses of materials obtained by these methods must show aragonite and calcite. However, such results do not prove that the adductor pad consists of aragonite and calcite. Very probably the pad consists only of aragonite and conchiolin. I believe you would do well to indicate this probability in your manuscript.

With these thoughts in mind I have gone over your manuscript and made corrections. Of course, you are entirely free to disagree and disregard

any of these changes or all of them. However, I imagine you would not want to publish results that anyone can readily disprove. If you restrict yourself to those results which are unavailable you have a good manuscript that should help you to enhance your status as a scientist.

Enclosed is my manuscript, which is to appear in Science with some minor changes. "Pad" is used for the last layer of the hypostracum. The hypostracum is composed of a succession of pads, one laid down over the other to form a continuous stack, which is the hypostracum. The treatise committee has decided to use Bivalvia (Linne, 1758) instead of Lamellibranchiata, applying the priority rule to these class names. So let's all get together and use Bivalvia from now on.

After you have gone over your manuscript, you could send it to Science for publication.

With best wishes.

Sincerely yours,

H. B. Stenzel

HBS:jmf

Enclosures: Your manuscript
and EPR Publication No. 359

SHELL DEVELOPMENT COMPANY
Exploration and Production Division