

# **Dominant Ninth Harmonies in American Songs around 1900**

**David Neumeyer  
Professor Emeritus of Music  
The University of Texas at Austin**

**July 2019**

## Abstract:

Among many changes in creative practices in music during the nineteenth century was the freer treatment of the ninth above the dominant, including independent V9 harmonies. This essay discusses songs composed, performed, and published in the United States from roughly 1890 to 1920. Composers include, among others, Beach, Hageman, Herbert, MacDowell, Nevin, Rogers, and Sousa.

Unless indicated otherwise by note or citation, nothing in this file has been published previously, with the exception of referenced and unreferenced material that has appeared in other essays of mine published on the Texas ScholarWorks platform or in my blogs. Musical examples come from public domain sources, most of them downloaded from IMSLP (<http://imslp.org>) or the Internet Archive. Any figures occasionally drawn from published sources that may still be under copyright are condensed, edited, and/or annotated and conform to Fair Use guidelines. The license under which this essay is published is: [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs 3.0 United States](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/). All new material and the compilation copyright David Neumeyer 2019.

## Table of Contents

### Introduction

Amy (Mrs. H. H. A.) Beach

“Sweetheart, sigh no more!” (1891)

“The Summer Wind” (1891)

“The Thrush” (1891)

“Far awa’!” (1899)

“Forget-Me-Not” (1897)

“Good Morning” (1902)

“Juni” [June] (1903)

Edward MacDowell

“Long ago, sweetheart mine,” op. 56n1 (1898)

“Constancy,” op. 58n1 (1899)

“Tyrant Love,” op. 60n2 (1902)

Rupert Hughes, ed., *Songs by Thirty Americans* (1904)

James H. Rogers, “April Weather” (1899)

Harry Rowe Shelley, “The Ride” (1904)

Nathaniel Hyatt, “The Spring of Love” (1900)

Rubin Goldmark, “The Passionate Shepherd to His Love” (1904)

*Anthology of American Songs: A Collection of Twenty-Six Songs by Representative American Composers* (1911)

James H. Rogers, “At Parting” (1886)

Harry Rowe Shelley, “Love’s Sorrow” (1888)

Ethelbert Nevin, “Serenade” (1884)

C. Whitney Coombs, “Her Rose” (1905)

Henry Hadley, “Rose-Time” (1910)

Victor Harris, “April” (1908)

Albert A. Mack, “Forever and a Day” (1903)

Richard Hageman, “At the Well” (1919)

### Appendix

### Bibliography

## Introduction

Among the many changes in creative practices achieved by European and European-influenced musicians in the nineteenth century were much freer treatments of the upper tetrachord in the major key, and prominent among them were the sound of the ninth above the dominant, including independent V9 harmonies. This essay explores their use—along with the occasional V13—in songs composed, performed, and published in the United States from roughly 1890 to 1920. With only two exceptions (song numbers in operettas), I have restricted attention to songs for salon, recital, and concert.

For more information on historical and theoretical background about the dominant ninth chord, see the introduction to item (1) in the list below.

This essay is part of an evolving series whose entries emphasize documentation rather than interpretation. Two previous publications to Texas ScholarWorks are closely related and provide the grounding for the present one. They are:

1. *Scale Degree ^6 in the 19th Century: Ländler and Waltzes from Schubert to Herbert* (April 2016) ([link](#))
2. *Dominant Ninth Harmonies in the 19th Century: A Gallery of Simple Examples Drawn from the Dance and Theater Repertoires* (November 2018) ([link](#))

In *Scale Degree ^6 in the 19th Century: Ländler and Waltzes from Schubert to Herbert* I described and provided examples for categories identified by Jeremy Day-O’Connell (2002) as treatments of scale degree 6 in the major key in the nineteenth century: (1) classical ^6; (2) pastoral ^6; (3) non-classical ^6. To those three I added a number of subcategories for classical ^6 and two related “species” of non-classical ^6: “extended ^6,” as 9 in V9; and “rising ^6.” The history of the dominant ninth chord—the focus here—was not just a matter of adding ^6 to a dominant seventh chord, but far more so a part of the rapidly evolving expressive melodic and harmonic treatment of the upper tetrachord. The harmonic entity we call the V9 chord must be fitted into that context. Or as Day-O’Connell puts it, “Nineteenth-century composers’ seeming infatuation with ^6 [powered] the evolution from ^6–^5 appoggiaturas to the use of additive harmony” (2002, 46).

The repertoire covered in *Scale Degree ^6* spans the period from 1795 to 1875, with music for social dance before 1860 predominating. The survey function was enhanced by sixty examples in the second essay, *Dominant Ninth Harmonies in the 19th Century: A Gallery of Simple Examples Drawn from the Dance and Theater Repertoires*. Neither of the essays looks at American songs, but for reference purposes, here is a list of all the pieces: [go to Appendix](#) (p. 40).

The present essay is the first in what I hope will be a set of several focused on music composed, performed, and published after 1880, by which time the dominant ninth as an independent harmony was well-established in most styles and genres. The musicians of the nineteenth century were creative artists—most of them pianists or violinists skilled at improvisation as much as composition or score-compliant performance—and in the last decades, continuing into the early twentieth century—they continued to test multiple ways to exploit the dominant ninth's expressive potential even as harmonic resources in both progressions and acceptable chord types rapidly became much richer (and less “orderly”) than they had been earlier.

\*       \*       \*

The dominant ninth chord belongs first of all to the history of music in the nineteenth century. There is a theoretical thread to the story in the eighteenth century, too, but that is almost entirely irrelevant to musical practice. And of course the ninth chord—along with other complex chords—is a common feature of Tin Pan Alley, Swing, and post-WWII ballad styles, but its treatment in those repertoires largely follows later nineteenth-century practices (and is much more restricted than harmonic practices that follow from bebop).

To be clear, I am only writing about the dominant seventh with major ninth. The dominant seventh chord with minor ninth already had a place in 18th century music and is quite a different expressive entity, even though as a harmony it functions as a V in the same way as the dominant seventh with major ninth. Nor am I concerned with the non-dominant ninth chords—these differ substantially from the dominant ninths and play perhaps a surprisingly small role in 19th century music before about 1890.

The ninth above a V7 harmony can be categorized in two ways: (1) in terms of its resolution (and the distinction between what I call internal and external); (2) in terms of its duration (that is, sound or “color” versus harmonic function). The internal resolutions are within the dominant harmony and create a variety of effects of expression and color. For more on internal resolutions, including many examples, see the essays listed on the previous page and also my blog *On the Dominant Ninth Chord*, entries for October 28 ([link](#)), November 2, and November 3, 2018.

Directly relevant to the present essay, here are examples of internal resolutions from two waltz-songs in an operetta by Victor Herbert and one in a song collection by Amy (Mrs. H. H. A.) Beach, plus two songs in different styles from operettas by John Philip Sousa.



The tenth number in Victor Herbert's *The Only Girl* (1914), "Tell It All Over Again," is a moderately slow waltz in verse-refrain design. The introduction gives a simple instance of an internal resolution of the ninth (circled).

Tempo di Valse, Moderato

Ah! When in sweet

*mp* *poco rit.* *p a tempo*

**9-b9-8**

The opening of the refrain is only modestly more complex but quite expressive as 9 resolves to 8 in the upper octave (bars 5-8 below). The other points of interest are that 9 is freely introduced (no suspension as was heard in the introduction) and its sound is expanded across two bars.

As an aside, the arrow in bar 3 points out the voice's 7 in a  $I^7$  chord: these begin to appear in isolated examples in the later waltzes of Johann Strauss, jr.—such as the Kaiser-Walzer, op. 413—and then more regularly with Emile Waldteufel, a famous instance being the first waltz of *Les Patineurs* [Skaters], op. 183.

REFRAIN

swear to love me for ev er! Just as you love me to - day!\_\_\_\_\_

*p a tempo*

9 ——— 8

“Forget-Me-Not” is the fourth number in Amy Beach’s op. 35. The approach to the final cadence is shown below. In a figure we shall see often in Beach but also in others, a complex chord arrives at the song’s climactic moment: here it is V9/V, whose ninth (A4/A5) resolves *externally* to the same tone, the third of the tonic 6/4. The *internal* resolution is in the fifth bar, on the cadential dominant itself, and the voice leading—as the annotations show—is striking in that 9 resolves in both directions, up in the voice, down in the piano.

The image displays two systems of musical notation for the song "Forget-Me-Not" by Amy Beach. Each system consists of a piano accompaniment (grand staff) and a vocal line (treble clef). The lyrics are: "tect thee for aye, To love and pro-" in the first system, and "tect thee for aye." in the second system.

**First System:**

- Vocal:** Starts with a half note, followed by a quarter note, then a half note. Dynamics: *ff* (fortissimo), *rall.* (ritardando), *appassionato*.
- Piano:** Features a complex chord structure. Dynamics: *ff*, *rall.*, *a tempo*.
- Annotations:** An arrow points to a chord labeled **F: V9/V**. A star symbol (\*) is placed below the piano part.

**Second System:**

- Vocal:** Continues the melody. Dynamics: *rit.* (ritardando), *a tempo*.
- Piano:** Continues the accompaniment. Dynamics: *rit.*, *a tempo*.
- Annotations:** An arrow points to a chord labeled **9 → 10**. A star symbol (\*) is placed below the piano part.

**Chord Progression Diagram:**

```

9 — 10
9 — 8
7 —
4 — 3

```

External resolutions like the one in the example above raise the possibility of V9 as a harmony (through indirect resolution to  $\wedge^5$  or to  $\wedge^6$ ) and can sometimes truly supplant V7 with an independent V9 (through direct resolution to  $\wedge^5$  or  $\wedge^6$ ). As we will see—but which I think is already quite apparent in Beach’s dramatic treatment of V9/V—tension between melodic qualities and harmonic function is a constant with the dominant ninth, much more so in fact than it is with the V11 and V13 chords.

*Indirect resolution to  $\wedge 5$ .* Though status of the dominant ninth as a harmony is still less obvious than in the direct resolutions, the melodic parallelisms and registral constraints in the indirect resolutions can make them entirely convincing.<sup>1</sup> A classic example, very similar to those one finds in Schubert waltzes, is from “He was a Knight of ancient familiee,” a solo section in John Philip Sousa’s *The Charlatan*, n1d (1898).

**G: V9** ————— **1**

The closing cadence in “Tell It All Over Again,” on the other hand, again uses voice leading that is oblique: B4 is the ninth in V9/V and also the thirteenth in the subsequent V, which I have labeled “V7,” however, because B4 resolves internally to A4.

**G: V9/V** **V7\***

<sup>1</sup> For the indirect resolution to  $\wedge 6$ , see my essay *Dominant Ninth Harmonies in the 19th Century*.

Direct resolution to  $\wedge 5$  or  $\wedge 6$ . Here are several examples. The first is from Sousa's *El Capitan* (1896), n2b "If you examine humankind." The V9 is the second element in the sequence. The second example is again from *The Only Girl*, n3b "When You're Away." Here the resolution note, D5, is "required" but not present. (You can see it in the accompaniment. I do not have an orchestral score in hand, but undoubtedly one of the parts—perhaps clarinet or viola—plays E4-D4.)

**Moderato sostenuto.**

you ex - a - mine hu - man kind, I'm al - most cer - tain you will  
find; That ful - ly nine - ty nine per - cent, Per - haps a tri - fle

V 9

**Slower, starting very softly**

When you're a - way, dear, how wear - y the lone - some hours! —  
Sun - shine seems gray, dear! The frag - rance has left the flow'rs! —

10 9 10 9 —

G: V7 (9) 7 9 —

Also from “When You’re Away,” and again an inner-voice resolution (bars 8-9 of the example). In bar 5 an internal resolution of the ninth within a secondary chord.

Ah! If I knew 'twere but dream-ing! Ne'er to be! Then

**G: V4/3/V V**

(5 — 4) 6 9  
4 4 — 3

In Beach's “The Thrush” (1891), another dramatic dominant ninth in the structural cadence. Here the direct resolution is delayed over the cadential dominant. Beach's version is sketched at (a), the formula at (b).

no won - der the thrush can sing.

**Bb: V9/V**

(a) (b)

And, since I am at it, here are samples of the varied forms of direct resolutions one finds in nineteenth-century songs of all styles and genres, all keyed to the Bb major of the previous example. At (c): an oblique resolution in a deceptive progression. At (d): a second-inversion ninth chord. At (e): another oblique resolution, in the chord progression of (b) above. At (f): substitution for the resolution note, and at (g) in the final tonic chord as well. At (h) through (k): various expressive leaps. At (m): the dominant “takes over”—in nineteenth-century theory and criticism the dominant was commonly regarded as the “life” of music.

(c) (d) (e) (f) (g)

(h) (j) (k)

(m)

The final example, (m), above is already an instance of the second category—duration, including sound or “color”—in which the ninth chord is considered independently of harmonic function, but only initially: the goal is to interpret the (potential) dominant ninth harmony in terms of a *balance* of status of harmony and other elements, especially (and largely following Lerdahl & Jackendoff 1983) metric position, relative length, register, and loudness. It was the more radical position—*detaching* sound or color from functional syntax—that drove the style innovations of Debussy and his successors.<sup>2</sup>

The final cadence from *The Only Girl*, n3b “When You’re Away” is a *pianissimo* “anti-climax” in which the sounds of dissonances and complex dominants occupy almost all the expressive space and make for a fine contrast with the *tranquillo* tonic triad that finally arrives.

allarg. rit. pp rit. allarg. rit. pp rit. tranquillo a tempo

Hold me a-gain to your heart! I love you a lone! —

G: V4/3/V 9 -- (8) 4 -- 3 V ----- I

And—at the opposite pole—here again is the V9/V at the climax in Amy Beach’s “Forget-Me-Not.”

ff rall. appassionato

tect thee for aye, To love and pro-

F: V9/V

<sup>2</sup> The other main factor was the undermining of the syntax itself. The principal, though not exclusive, agent was the extension of third substitution to thirds-of-thirds, so in C major vi is a functional representative of I; VI is also; and therefore vi of VI, or f# minor, might represent I. And so on.

## Amy (Mrs. H. H. A.) Beach

“Sweetheart, sigh no more!” (1891).

The first verse poses a question answered at the end, and then with increasing emotional energy at the end of the second and third verses as well. Here is the opening for reference.

Andante. *p dolce* Mrs. H. H. A. BEACH.

It was with doubt and trembling I

*pp* *sempre legato*

And here is the cadence to verse one.

*dim.* *p* ^4

That all the world may hear Sweet-heart, sigh no more!

*dim.* *p* *pp*

In the cadence to the second verse, “sigh” reaches a third higher: it is now the dominant ninth’s ^6 (C5) rather than ^4 as in the first verse. Note that the resolution is internal (circled notes): C4-Cb4-Bb3 within V.

*p* ^6 *poco rit.* *a tempo*

Sweet-heart, sigh no more!

*p* *pp* *poco rit.* *a tempo*



The cadence in the third verse goes even higher, in both the voice and the piano accompaniment. The voice reaches  $\wedge 9$  (F5), but the piano goes Eb6, which marches by step down, first completing the 4-3 over V, then going through 9 and b9 to reach 8. The strong emphasis on the ninth comes earlier this time, as all of the first bar of this example is V9, voiced in an interesting way as if F-minor6/3 over the bass Bb. The box suggests that we continue to hear V9 through the first two beats of the following bar as well, as if the voice's and piano's first notes overtop the "proper" 9 of the underlying chord. This is one of those cases where the sound of the chord and its expressive power match (at least) and balance any reduction to harmonic functions we might make.

The musical score is for a song in 4/4 time, featuring a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The key signature has two flats (Bb and Eb). The vocal line has the lyrics: "song — Sweet - heart, sigh — no more!". The piano accompaniment consists of a right hand and a left hand. The left hand has a bass line that is boxed in the first two beats of a bar, with a "Red." label below it. The right hand has a melody that includes a "ff" (fortissimo) dynamic and a "rall." (rallentando) marking. The box highlights the first two beats of a bar, suggesting a V9 chord (F-minor6/3 over the bass Bb) that continues into the following bar.

# Amy (Mrs. H. H. A.) Beach

The trajectory of cadential harmony in “The Summer Wind” (1891) is simpler than that in “Sweetheart, sigh no more!” but similar in that a figure of the first verse’s cadence (first example below) is intensified in the final cadence (second example).

The fair fields o - - ver.

ev - er he goes, The per - fume, the

per - fume of ro - ses.

# Amy (Mrs. H. H. A.) Beach

“The Thrush” (1891). In four verses, where the music is laid out as A-B-A'-C. The first example is from the chromatic inner section of A', and the second is the final cadence already discussed in the introduction to this essay.

While he sees his mate close on her nest, And the woods are full of spring.

Chord symbols: Db: vi, viiø6/5/V, V, I

and so No wonder, no wonder the thrush can sing.

Chord symbols: Bb: V9/V

**Amy (Mrs. H. H. A.) Beach**

“Far awa’!” (1899). The cadence of the first verse: every note of the diatonic scale finds a place above the dominant bass, with the sound of the dominant ninth (boxed) prominent.

First system of the musical score for "Far awa'!". The vocal line (treble clef) and piano accompaniment (grand staff) are shown. The lyrics are: "tend me, Talk of him that's far a wa'". The first box highlights the vocal line for "Talk of him that's far" and the piano accompaniment for "Talk of him that's far". The second box highlights the vocal line for "a wa'" and the piano accompaniment for "a wa'". The piano accompaniment features a prominent dominant ninth chord in the first box, which is boxed. The piano part ends with a *dimin.* marking.

The final cadence, with a secondary dominant ninth (first box) and the final V-I with its repetition.

Second system of the musical score for "Far awa'!". The vocal line (treble clef) and piano accompaniment (grand staff) are shown. The lyrics are: "Care - un - trou - ble, joy - sur - round - ed, Gau - dy day to you is dear." The first box highlights the vocal line for "Care - un - trou - ble, joy - sur - round - ed, Gau - dy day to" and the piano accompaniment for "Care - un - trou - ble, joy - sur - round - ed, Gau - dy day to". The second box highlights the vocal line for "you is dear." and the piano accompaniment for "you is dear.". The piano accompaniment features a secondary dominant ninth chord in the first box, which is boxed. The piano part ends with a *dim.* marking.

The voice leading for the secondary dominant ninth is straightforward, but not so for the final V-I, a situation not that uncommon by the 1890s (balance between sound and traditional functional syntax is echoed in a balance between smooth, coloristic movements and the traditional strictures of voice leading). Here are the formulas for two substitutions: at (b) for (a), at (d), as above, for (c).

Neither (c) nor (d) quite fits the ending of “Far awa’!” As the voice offers both Eb5 and Bb4, the latter being such a characteristic note of Scots ballads that we can’t will it away as a “free” non-harmonic note.

The simplified version offered by the piano—the third box in the example on the previous page—solves the puzzle. The unusual move of the leading tone downward to  $\wedge 6$  (Bb3), shown at (1) to the right, allows Beach to avoid implied parallel octaves, as at (2), but in fact her version is a subtle (and much better sounding) variant of the figure commonly used in harmonizations of the  $\wedge 6$ - $\wedge 8$  melodic cadence of Scotch and Irish songs, as at (3).

# Amy (Mrs. H. H. A.) Beach

“Forget-Me-Not” (1897).

The climax in the final verse was discussed in the introduction to this essay. Here is the earlier, less dramatic version that ends the first verse. Note that the persistent A4 eventually generates a V13 in a direct resolution to I.

Here are two internal resolutions of 9 from the ends of the first and second verses, respectively. The first is over a dominant bass, the second is identical except for the tonic bass.

# Amy (Mrs. H. H. A.) Beach

“Good Morning” (1902).

The poem is in four verses (quatrains), which the composer sets overall as A-A' and within those as A1-A2, then A1'-B. A distinctive feature of her setting is a motivic treatment of scale degree  $\hat{3}$ , both melodically and harmonically. We can see this in the opening: the first harmonic move is from I to iii (boxed), the completion of the progression and first voice's first notes, include a V13 chord (boxed in the second system), and the voice offers an expressively marked emphasis on C4 for “a soft, sweet roundelay.” The setting of the first verse leads to a III harmony for “To whisper, love,

*Allegretto con anima.*

*dolce espressivo*

*pp*

*Red.* \*

*p*

“Good morn” the lark is sing - ing, A soft, sweet roun - - de -

*simile*

*Red.* \*

*cresc.*

lay, — And the pan - sies ope their pret - ty eyes To whis - per, love, “Good

*pp*

*cresc.*

*Red.* \*

day!"

The grass - es on their

*pp*

*poco rit.*

*a tempo*

*Ped.*

*\* Ped. \**

‘Good day!’” (boxed). This III harmony is understood as V/vi, but remains independent of a resolution, a device already used by the 1820s and reaching the status of a cliché by no later than 1840. Finally, note a subtly more prominent V13 to open the second verse (boxed above). The second verse ends with a cadence to the tonic. The third verse again moves to III—see below—and the voice gives even more emphasis to  $\wedge 3$  and its octave leap (first box below). And again see V13 to begin the fourth verse, but now with the voice taking a  $\wedge 3$  of its own, as C5 (boxed)

too, my se - cret guessed!

“Good morn!”

*mf*

*pp*

*poco rit.*

*a tempo*

*Ped.*

*\* con pedale \**



The motivic  $\wedge^3$  remains prominent in the final cadence, first as 9 of V9/V—see the first box—then as a surprising climax chord: iii over a dominant bass with  $\wedge^3$  in the voice (second box). That iii shifts to an expected V7 at the *molto rit.* but the final moment of V is again the sound of V13, whose 13th remains in the piano part as the third of the closing tonic—boxed in the second system below.

The musical score is presented in two systems, each with a vocal line (treble clef) and a piano accompaniment (grand staff). The key signature has three flats (B-flat, E-flat, A-flat).

**First System:**

- Vocal line: "too, "Good morn! — Good morn! — My love, —"
- Piano accompaniment: Features a rhythmic pattern of eighth and sixteenth notes. A box highlights the first two measures of the piano part.
- Annotations: *ff* (fortissimo) is marked above the vocal line at the end of the system. *Ped.* (pedal) is marked below the piano part.

**Second System:**

- Vocal line: "my love!"
- Piano accompaniment: Continues the rhythmic pattern. A box highlights the first two measures of the piano part.
- Annotations: *molto rit.* (molto ritardando) is marked above the vocal line. *a tempo* (al tempo) is marked above the vocal line. *ff* (fortissimo) is marked below the piano part. *Ped.* (pedal) is marked below the piano part.

There are several asterisks (\*) placed below the piano part, likely indicating specific harmonic or structural points.

# Amy (Mrs. H. H. A.) Beach

"Juni" [June] (1903)

This song has both the V13s and the gradually accumulating cadence climaxes we have seen in previous examples. At the opening, in addition, is a passing but still expressively distinctive non-dominant ninth chord, ii9, boxed.

*Allegro assai.*

*mf*

O Ju - ni - ta - - ge im  
O sun - ny days \_\_\_\_\_ of

*f* *p*

*Ped.* \*

Here is the succession of climax points and cadences. First verse:

*f* *poco rit.*

Herz - - - kir - - schen und Ro - - - sen!  
Hearts - - - ease \_\_\_\_\_ and Ro - - - ses!

*f* *poco rit.*

*Ped.* \*

Second verse:

*f* *poco rit.*

So won - - - nig das Le - - - ben!  
Such joy \_\_\_\_\_ but \_\_\_\_\_ in liv - - - ing!

*f* *poco rit.*

*Ped.* \*

And close:

The musical score consists of two systems. The first system features a vocal line with the lyrics "ü - ber - all / ev' - ry - where" and "Herz - kir - schen und / Heart's - ease - and". The piano accompaniment includes a prominent V9 chord (A5) in the right hand, marked with *ff* and *rall - en - tan - do*. The second system features the lyrics "Ro - sen! / Ro - ses!" and "a tempo". The piano accompaniment continues with the V9 chord and includes a long note on "do" in the first system and "ses!" in the second. The piano part has a long note on "do" in the first system and "ses!" in the second. The piano part has a long note on "do" in the first system and "ses!" in the second.

The voice now reaches A5, *fortissimo*, and the secondary dominant leading-tone seventh/ dominant 9th sound is a half-bar longer (still more than earlier actually, as *rallentando* replaces *poco rit*).

## Edward MacDowell

Four Songs, op. 56n1 “Long ago sweetheart mine” (1898)

In a style unique to MacDowell—somewhere between folk song, earlier American popular song, and art song—this song of remembrance and resignation sets the third and fourth lines of the first quatrain with a half cadence that includes V9/V and a direct resolution.

*pp*

Fields of vel vet, a - zure skies\_\_ Whisp'ring trees\_\_ and murm - 'ring stream:

*pp very softly.*

“Constancy,” the first song in opus 58 (1899) begins in a manner very similar in style and sentiment, down to the harmony setting the third line:

*p*

Di - shev - elled ros - es blush in vain;

*p*

The first verse ends with a half-cadence to V of vi (D minor). After that, the song takes a strongly chromatic turn, beginning with the passage below, including a phrase-ending V9 of F minor (box). The goal keys of the middle section, though, are quickly reached—Db major and Bb minor—before a return to F major and a harmonically simpler style in the final verse.

*mf*

The tan sy creeps e'en to the door Through gar den tan gles sweet\_\_

*mf*

*p*

*pp*

## Edward MacDowell

“Tyrant Love,” op. 60n1 (1902), sets a poem of three quatrains in three short sections where the first and third are almost identical. All of the first section is shown below. The descending figure in bar 1, in a light-hearted staccato, quickly turns into a traditional sighing figure by bars 3-4. Bars 1-2 (and their repetition in the third verse) are the only place where V9 is heard.

Lightly, yet with tenderness. (♩=about 88.)

Where e'er Love be, Ty-rant he, — With-out mē- ci;

Plead as thou may, Ah me! He ne'er thy tears will see, Ah me! Ah me!

*ret.* *pp slightly slower* *p* *pp*

**Rupert Hughes, ed., *Songs by Thirty Americans* (1904)**

James H. Rogers, "April Weather" (1899)

Like so many Americans at the time, Rogers trained in Europe, though he is somewhat unusual in that he studied in both Germany and France, in the latter as a student of the famous organist and composer Alexandre Guilmant. Originally from New England, Rogers settled in Cleveland and became an important fixture in the city's musical life.

*Molto animato* (♩ = 120)

VOICE

PIANO.

*p*

*con anima mf*

Be - loved, it was A-pril weather, — When Love went

*sempre col pedale*

## Harry Rowe Shelley, "The Ride" (1904)

Shelley was born in New Haven, CT, and studied with Yale faculty. Only later did he go to Europe for further training. His professional positions were as organist for churches in New York (Brooklyn and Manhattan), and he composed music for organ and for choirs, in addition to many hymns.

"The Ride" is a vigorous hunting/riding song in multiple verses, the midpoint of each bringing the now familiar climax point with a dominant ninth. In this case the resolution is indirect but easily heard: in the voice, F#5-E5 above B4-C#5.

dwel - lings of men in the hol - lows massed, - we

*rit.*

*p*

(C#add6) (C# triad)

see - them like dreams, and are past, and are past.

*recit. ad lib.* *a tempo*

*colla voce* *p* *a tempo*

## Nathaniel Hyatt, "The Spring of Love" (1900)

Hyatt was at the Leipzig Conservatory in the late 1880s. He was born in east-central New York and returned there after his European studies. He was active early in Syracuse but spent most of his career in Albany.

*Allegro moderato*

PIANO

The musical score is for "The Spring of Love" by Nathaniel Hyatt. It is in G major (one sharp) and 2/4 time. The tempo is marked *Allegro moderato*. The score is for piano and voice. The piano part begins with a *mf* dynamic and features several boxed sections highlighting specific chords and textures. The vocal line includes lyrics: "A lit-tle sun, a lit-tle rain, A". The piano part includes several boxed sections highlighting specific chords and textures. The score is for piano and voice.

*mf*

*f*

*p*

A lit-tle sun, a lit-tle rain, A



## Rubin Goldmark, "The Passionate Shepherd to His Love" (1904)

Goldmark was the nephew of Carl Goldmark, was born in New York City and lived there for most of his life except for study in Vienna and a six-year stint in Colorado Springs. Late in life he became head of composition in the Juilliard School.

*Molto appassionato*

PIANO *f con fuoco*

*f*

*mf*

Come live with me and be my love,

*p*

i - vy buds, With cor - al clasps and

am - ber studs. And if\_

*p*

move, Then live with me and

*a tempo*

*ff*

be\_ my love, Then live with me and be\_ my love, Then

*ff*

*con somma passione*

live with me and be my love, and be my love, and

be my love, my love.

*rit. molto*

*rit. molto*

*a tempo*

*ff*

The musical score is written for a song in G major (one sharp). It features a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The piano part consists of a right hand with chords and a left hand with a simple bass line. The tempo markings are *rit. molto* (rhythmically slow) and *a tempo* (return to the original tempo). The dynamics include *ff* (fortissimo, very loud). The lyrics are: 'live with me and be my love, and be my love, and be my love, my love.'

*Anthology of American Songs: A Collection of Twenty-Six Songs by Representative American Composers (1911)*

James H. Rogers, "At Parting" (1886)

The song "April Weather" was discussed under "30 Songs" above. "At Parting" puts together the colors of Iadd6 and V9, with their common  $\wedge 5$ ,  $\wedge 6$ , elements—see boxes. The resolution in bars 4-5 is direct, but even more immediate at the end (box; second example).

Non troppo vivo, con anima

Voice

The sweet - est flow'r that blows \_\_\_\_\_

Piano

*dolce egualmente*

*con Pedale*

$\wedge 6$

I give you 'as we part. \_\_\_\_\_

$\wedge 5$

For you, it is

^6 ----- ^5

heart! You think it but a rose! Ah me! it

*più tranquillo* *molto p* *espressivo*

is my heart! \_\_\_\_\_

*cantando* *sempre rall.* *dolciss.*

*perdendosi*

## Ethelbert Nevin, "Serenade" (1884)

Nevin was known equally as a composer of songs and piano music that became quite popular for salon and recital. He was born near Pittsburgh and returned there on occasion, but his was a peripatetic life: he studied in Berlin, settled in Boston, went to Paris, etc.

In the opening, the accompaniment overtops the voice by a third and follows it through the phrase.

*cresc.* *dim.*

I come to — watch o'er thee, — — —

Later a direct resolution in the voice:

near — thee, — a - lone is peace for me. — — —

## Charles Whitney Coombs, "Her Rose" (1905)

Coombs was born in Maine, studied in Stuttgart and Dresden, and spent his career as a church organist in New York (Manhattan).

The first chord is a dominant 13th, and presumably sounds throughout the bar—the notation is unclear (see arrow)—as it is plainly meant to do in bar 4. The second example is the end of the verse, the third is the end of the song.

*Andante con estro poetico* (♩ = 66)

Piano

*p* *con sordini*

*rit.*

Rose - bud, you touched her, You breathed \_\_\_\_\_ with her breath And her

*a tempo*

kissed her, You bloomed \_\_\_\_\_ in the light Of her eyes.

*rall.* *più rit.*

*rit. molto*

mine now, You've brought me the warmth \_\_\_\_\_ Of her heart.

*colla voce*

## Henry Hadley, "Rose-Time" (1910)

Early life in Boston, study in Vienna, then New York, Munich for further study, and then primarily work as a conductor in New York, with side trips to Seattle, San Francisco, and Buenos Aires. Memorable achievements include conducting the New York Philharmonic for the first synchronized feature film score, Warner Bros. *Don Juan* (1926), and starting the summer festival that later became known as Tanglewood.

Two excerpts from the song, the first with a particularly clear instance of two V9 chords in a row (though the latter does resolve internally), the second showing at the beginning (\*\*) the ninth's participation in a persistent pattern of appoggiaturas.

With the crim-son of the ros-es on the trees,

**ii7 V9**      **9** ——— **8**  
**4** ——— **3**  
**Db: V**      **V** ———

*p* Ros-es in the gar-den That shame my sweet-heart's lips,— Red ros-es, blooming here and

**Db: V** ———

there,— Red ros-es, bloom-ing ev-ry where,— Un-

*cresc.* *cresc.* *f*



## Victor Harris, "April" (1908)

Born in New York, Harris spent his entire career there as a very successful song accompanist, opera coach, church organist, and conductor. The end of "April" gives another instance of the now familiar complex harmonies at a climax, here the second inversion of V9/V followed by V13.

The musical score for "April" by Victor Harris is shown in three systems. The first system contains the vocal line with the lyrics "A - pril, Laugh thy gold-en-" and the piano accompaniment. The second system is boxed and contains the vocal line with the lyrics "laugh - - ter." and the piano accompaniment. The third system contains the vocal line with the lyrics "laugh - - ter." and the piano accompaniment. The piano part in the boxed section features a complex harmonic progression, with a V9/V chord in second inversion (marked with an asterisk) and a V13 chord. The score is marked with a forte (ff) dynamic and includes a key signature of one sharp (F#).

**D: I** **V9\*/V V13 I**  
\* 2d inversion

## Albert A. Mack, "Forever and a Day" (1903)

(I was unable to find biographical information.) Despite the motivic attention to  $\wedge 6$  at the outset (circled), the song does not develop the idea. Instead, V13 is especially prominent (boxed).

The musical score for "Forever and a Day" by Albert A. Mack is shown in two systems. The first system contains the vocal line with the lyrics "I lit-tle know or care If the" and the piano accompaniment. The piano part in the first system features a circled  $\wedge 6$  motif. The second system is boxed and contains the vocal line with the lyrics "black-bird on the bough" and the piano accompaniment. The piano part in the boxed section features a V13 chord. The score is marked with a key signature of three flats (Bb, Eb, Ab) and a 4/4 time signature.

**Gb: V13 ————— I**

And the first short verse closes with a half-cadence that includes V9/V.

The musical score for the first short verse is shown in three systems. The first system contains the lyrics "all the air With his" and the second system contains "soft crescen-do now;". The music is in 3/4 time and features a half-cadence at the end of the first system, which includes a V9/V chord. The second system continues with a V chord. The score is written for voice and piano.

V9/V ——— V

At the end, a protracted play between  $\wedge 9$  and  $\wedge 8$  enriches the sound but does not disturb the priority of V7 over 9.

The musical score for the second short verse is shown in three systems. The first system contains the lyrics "what he calls a week, Is for ev - er, for" and the second system contains "ev - er and a day.". The music is in 3/4 time and features a protracted play between  $\wedge 9$  and  $\wedge 8$  chords at the end of the first system. The second system continues with a V7 chord. The score is written for voice and piano.

slower

very slow and soft

## Richard Hageman

The only European-born composer represented in this essay, Hageman came to the U. S. at age 25 and stayed, becoming a naturalized citizen a couple decades later. He was associated with the Metropolitan Opera, the Curtis Institute, the Chicago Civic Opera, among others, but is best known now for his contributions to the underscores for John Ford films. Two of his earliest songs, “Do Not Go, My Love” and “At the Well”—both published by G. Schirmer—were very successful and are still performed occasionally.

Scale degree  $\hat{6}$ , in Iadd6 and V9, is basic to the sound of “At the Well”—see below. These sounds are heard again in the reprise, but they do not invade the interior of the song and, perhaps more significant, the final cadence, also the climax (not shown), is set to a most traditional IV-ii-V7-I harmonic progression.

Allegro

Voice

Piano

*Peggiero molto*

When the two sis - ters

go to fetch wa - ter, they come to this spot and they smile.

♩. \* ♩. \* simile

**Gb: Iadd6 V9**

**V13**

## Appendix: Repertoire list for two related essays

Legend:

“Part 1” = *Scale Degree ^6 in the 19th Century: Ländler and Waltzes from Schubert to Herbert*  
(April 2016) ([link](#))

“Gallery” = *Dominant Ninth Harmonies in the 19th Century: A Gallery of Simple Examples*  
*Drawn from the Dance and Theater Repertoires* (November 2018) ([link](#))

Titles given as in the tables of contents for each essay.

Henry Appy, <i>Elizabeth Polka</i> (1853)	Gallery
W. P. Badger, <i>Union Polka</i> (The Pascagoula Melodies, n1) (1853)	Gallery
Beethoven, 12 deutsche Tänze, WoO8n2, trio (1795)	Gallery
Beethoven, <i>Ländlerische Tänze</i> , WoO11	“Part 1”
Brahms, Walzer, op. 39	"Part 1"
Brahms, Liebeslieder-Walzer, op. 52	"Part 1"
Brahms, <i>Liebeslieder</i> , op. 52n13 (1869)	Gallery
Brahms, <i>Liebeslieder</i> , op. 65n10 (1869-74)	Gallery
Chaminade, <i>Valse-Caprice</i> , op. 33	"Part 1"
Chopin, Waltz, op. 42 (1840)	Gallery
Chopin, Waltz, op. 64n1 (1846-47)	Gallery
Czerny, <i>Les Etrennes: 24 Waltzes</i> , op. 32	"Part 1"
Debussy, <i>Valse romantique</i>	"Part 1"
Allen Dodworth, arr., <i>Princess Helena's Polka</i> (1847)	Gallery
Allen Dodworth, <i>Very Best Polka</i> (1850)	Gallery
Fauré, <i>Dolly-Suite</i> , Kitty-Valse	"Part 1"
Herbert, <i>The Only Girl</i> (1914), Overture	"Part 1"
Hummel, 12 deutsche Tänze, op. 44, coda: Ländlerisch	"Part 1"
Theodor Lachner, <i>Sechs Ländler</i>	"Part 1"
Lanner, “Die 28er” Ländler, op. 20	"Part 1"
<i>Flora Walzer</i> , op.33 (1829 or 1830)	Gallery
<i>Altenburger-Ländler</i> , op. 40	"Part 1"
<i>Redout Carneval Tänze</i> , op.42 (1830)	Gallery
<i>Alpen-Rosen Walzer</i> , op. 162 (1842)	Gallery
<i>Die Romantiker Walzer</i> , op. 167 (1842)	Gallery
Mozart, <i>Deutsche Tänze</i> , K602	"Part 1"
Mozart, <i>Ländler</i> , K606	"Part 1"
Offenbach, <i>Orphée aux Enfers</i> , Finale (1858)	Gallery
Michael Pamer ( <i>Neue brillante Solo Ländler</i> , book 9 (1827)	"Part 1"
František Pechacek, 12 Laendler, n1 (1801)	Gallery
Schubert, D 145, nos. 1, 3, 4, 5, 9, 11, 13, 14, 15	"Part 1"

Schubert, Original-Tänze, D365n1 (1821)	Gallery
Original-Tänze, D365n13	Gallery
Original-Tänze, D365n30 (1821)	Gallery
Ländler, D 366, nos. 1, 2, 6, 7	"Part 1"
Laendler, D366n17 (post.)	Gallery
D 378n2	"Part 1"
<i>Wiener-Damen Ländler</i> , D 734, nos. 2, 5, 8, 13, 15	"Part 1"
<i>Wiener-Damen Laendler</i> , D734n5 (1826)	Gallery
<i>Wiener-Damen Laendler</i> , D734n16	Gallery
D 769n1	"Part 1"
<i>Valses sentimentales</i> , D 799, nos. 2, 4, 5, 9, 10, 16, 17, 18, 20, 30, 33, 34	"Part 1"
<i>Valses sentimentales</i> , D779n2 (1825)	Gallery
<i>Valses sentimentales</i> , D779n17	Gallery
<i>Valses sentimentales</i> , D779n20	Gallery
Deutsche Tänze, D783n2 (1823-24)	Gallery
Laendler, D790n12 (1823)	Gallery
D 814n1, 4	"Part 1"
William Schubert, arr., <i>Charlotte Grist Polka</i> (Three Favorite Polkas, n1) (1845)	Gallery
William Schubert, arr., <i>Baden Baden Polka</i> (Three Favorite Polkas, n3) (1845)	Gallery
Eduard Strauss, <i>Das Leben ist doch schön</i> , op. 150	"Part 1"
Johann Strauss, jr., <i>Die jungen Wiener Walzer</i> , op. 7 (1845?)	Gallery
<i>Jugend-Träume Walzer</i> , op. 12 (1845)	Gallery
<i>Jux Polka</i> , op. 17 (1845?)	Gallery
<i>Fidelen Polka</i> , op. 26 (1846?)	Gallery
<i>Hopser Polka</i> , op. 28 (1846?)	Gallery
<i>Champêtre</i> , polka-mazurka, op. 239 (1860)	Gallery
<i>Hesperus polka</i> , op. 249 (1861)	Gallery
<i>Demolirer Polka</i> , op. 269.	Gallery
<i>An der schönen blauen Donau</i> , op. 314	Gallery
<i>An der schönen blauen Donau</i>	"Part 1"
<i>Künstlerleben</i> , op. 316n3 (1867)	Gallery
<i>Künstlerleben</i>	"Part 1"
<i>Geschichten aus dem Wiener-Wald</i> , op. 325	Gallery
<i>Geschichten aus der Wiener-Wald</i>	"Part 1"
Polka 'Auf freiem Fusse," op. 345 (1871?)	Gallery
<i>Die Fledermaus</i> n5, Act I Finale, "Herr, was dächten Sie von mir" (1874)	Gallery
Johann Strauss, sr., <i>Josephstädter-Tänze</i> , op. 23 (1829)	Gallery
"Heiter auch in ernster Zeit," op48n1 (1832)	Gallery
"Heiter auch in ernster Zeit," op48n2 (1832)	Gallery
<i>Rosa Walzer</i> , op. 76n4 (c. 1834)	Gallery
<i>Rosa Walzer</i> , op. 76n5 (c. 1834)	Gallery
<i>Rosen-Blätter</i> , op. 115n1 (1840)	Gallery

<i>Die Schwalben</i> , op. 208n3 (1847)	Gallery
<i>Feldbleamel'n (im Ländler-Style)</i> , op. 213	"Part 1"
<i>Die Adepten</i> , op. 216 (1848)	Gallery
<i>Wiener Kreuzer Polka</i> , op. 220 (1848)	Gallery
<i>Damen Souvenir Polka</i> , op. 236 (1848)	Gallery
<i>Frederika Polka</i> , op. 239 (1848)	Gallery
<i>Exeter Polka</i> , op. 249 (1849)	Gallery
Josef Strauss, <i>Mein Lebenslauf ist Lieb' und Lust</i> , op. 263	"Part 1"
Tchaikovsky, <i>The Nutcracker</i> , "Waltz of the Flowers"	"Part 1"
Wagner, Tannhäuser, Prelude to Act II (1845; 1860-61)	Gallery
Waldteufel, <i>Myosotis</i> , op. 101n3 (c. 1865)	Gallery
<i>Toujours ou Jamais</i> , op. 156n3 (1877)	Gallery

## Bibliography

Day-O'Connell, Jeremy. 2002. "The Rise of  $\hat{6}$  in the Nineteenth Century." *Music Theory Spectrum* 24/1: 35-67.

Day-O'Connell, Jeremy. 2007. *Pentatonicism from the Eighteenth Century to Debussy*. Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press.

Lerdahl, Fred, and Ray Jackendoff. 1983. *A Generative Theory of Tonal Music*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Neumeyer, David. 2018. [Dominant Ninth Harmonies in the 19th Century: A Gallery of Simple Examples Drawn from the Dance and Theater Repertoires.](#)

In European music, freer treatment of the sixth and seventh scale degrees in the major key encouraged the use of independent V9 chords, which appear already early in the nineteenth century, are common by the mid-1830s, and are important to the process by which the hegemony of eighteenth-century compositional, improvisational, and pedagogical practices were broken down. This essay provides multiple examples of the clearest instances of the V9 as a harmony in direct and indirect resolutions.

Neumeyer, David. June 2018—. *On the Dominant Ninth Chord*. Blog: [link to the introductory post 21 June 2018.](#)

Neumeyer, David. 2016. [Scale Degree  \$\hat{6}\$  in the 19th Century: Ländler and Waltzes from Schubert to Herbert.](#)

Jeremy Day-O'Connell identifies three treatments of scale degree 6 in the major key through the nineteenth century: (1) classical  $\hat{6}$ ; (2) pastoral  $\hat{6}$ ; and (3) non-classical  $\hat{6}$ . This essay makes further distinctions within these categories and documents them in the Ländler repertoire (roughly 1800-1850; especially Schubert) and in the waltz repertoire after 1850 (primarily the Strauss family). The final case study uses this information to explain some unusual dissonances in an operetta overture by Victor Herbert. Other composers include Michael Pamer, Josef Lanner, Theodor Lachner, Czerny, Brahms, Fauré, and Debussy.