

Copyright

by

Rebecca Coleman Hewett

2010

The Dissertation Committee for Rebecca Coleman Hewett  
certifies that this is the approved version of the following dissertation:

**Progressive Compromises:**

**Performing Gender, Race, and Class in Historical Pageants of 1913**

Committee:

---

Charlotte Canning, Supervisor

---

Dorothy Chansky

---

Jill Dolan

---

Steven Hoelscher

---

Stacy Wolf

**Progressive Compromises:  
Performing Gender, Race, and Class in Historical Pageants of 1913**

by

**Rebecca Coleman Hewett, B.A.; M.A.**

**Dissertation**

Presented to the Faculty of the Graduate School of

The University of Texas at Austin

in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements

for the Degree of

**Doctor of Philosophy**

The University of Texas at Austin

May, 2010

## **Acknowledgments**

Over the past three years, whenever I felt I could not look at this dissertation one more minute for fear of throwing my computer out the window, I worked on my acknowledgements instead. It always reminded me that there were many people supporting me through this process—as friends, mentors, and suppliers of comfort food. As I thought about how to thank them, I would always see how badly I didn't want to let them down. And then I would go back to work.

As members of my dissertation committee, Jill Dolan, Stacy Wolf, and Steven Hoelscher provided excellent guidance, advice, and support. I am deeply grateful for their attention to my work while a student in their classes. The training I received from them held me in good stead as I embarked on this project and taught me essential lessons not just in research and writing, but also in how I hope to move through academia.

I am equally indebted to additional faculty members from the Performance as Public Practice program at The University of Texas at Austin during the years I was in course work, particularly Deborah Paredez, Lynn C. Miller, and Joni (Omi) Jones. Their commitments to bridging theory and practice shaped me as a scholar, artist, and citizen—it is my hope this dissertation reflects that interest in praxis.

Dorothy Chansky served on my dissertation committee, although my work with her began many years earlier while I was an undergraduate at the College of William and Mary. She was the first to encourage me towards attending graduate school, and the first to suggest the Performance as Public Practice program, because, as she said to me, “You want to be a part of what’s going on there.” She’s always right. She offered advice

throughout my years in graduate school and provided generous feedback as I drafted this dissertation. My committee chair, Charlotte Canning, has served as my adviser throughout my graduate career. Her humor, patience, generosity, and attention to every detail of my writing and researching processes shaped my thinking over years of course work and dissertation writing.

For the past two years I have worked as an Assistant Lecturer in the Department of Performance Studies at Texas A&M University in College Station. Judith Hamera, the department chair through most of my tenure there, offered much support as I finished this project. Even on the hard days, I was grateful to have time with my A&M students: they continually reminded me what I was working towards, and showed me how much I still had to learn.

While conducting my research I received help from a number of excellent librarians, whose generosity and advice undoubtedly strengthened this work. The archivists at the Rauner Special Collections Library at Dartmouth College, the Special Collections and University Archives at the University of Massachusetts at Amherst, and the Houghton Library at Harvard were patient and thorough in their suggestions to me. A number of newspaper articles I use to document *Allegory* were quite difficult to track down; I would not have been able to do so without Kathryn Kenefick, Library Assistant at the Center for American History at The University of Texas at Austin; Henry Scannell, Curator of Microform and Newspapers at the Boston Public Library; and Amber Paranick, Librarian in the Serial & Government Publications Division at the Library of Congress. Mr. Scannell and Ms. Paranick were especially generous in researching

footnotes for an unknown graduate student and I am excessively grateful to them. My archival research was possible in part because of a generous Homer Lindsey Bruce Fellowship from The University of Texas at Austin; this scholarship funded my research trips and allowed me the time and space to launch this project.

I was lucky to work with a thoughtful and devoted writing group. Susanne Shawyer, Jenny Kokai, Tamara Smith, and Clare Croft offered thorough, intelligent feedback throughout my writing process. Lastly, I come to my family: my parents Ronald and Emily, and my brother Richard. I don't think they always understood what I was *doing* here, but they offered emotional (and financial) support, entertained my friends and lifted my spirits during many visits to Austin while I lived there.

**Progressive Compromises:**

**Performing Gender, Race, and Class in Historical Pageants of 1913**

Publication No. \_\_\_\_\_

Rebecca Coleman Hewett, Ph.D.

The University of Texas at Austin, 2010

Supervisor: Charlotte Canning

This dissertation explores embodiments of citizenship in three historical pageants of 1913. As historical pageantry reached the height of its popularity in the early twentieth century, the form was criticized by those who felt it represented a limited understanding of community and citizenship. Historical pageants came to prominence at a time in the nation's history when lynching plagued the south, women agitated for the right to vote, and labor unions organized to demand better working conditions. Popular historical pageants presented a history which ignored these pressing social issues and supported the status quo. As a result, while pageants gained popularity the form was taken up by groups seeking to use pageants for different political purposes.

My dissertation interrogates embodiments of citizenship in Progressive Era pageantry through three case studies: W.E.B. Du Bois wrote and staged *Star of Ethiopia*, devoted to re-telling African-American history; John Reed organized members of the Industrial Workers of the World (IWW) for a performance of *The Paterson Strike*

*Pageant* to aid laborers on strike; and Hazel MacKaye staged *Allegory* in support of women's suffrage. While each pageant aimed to promote diversity, once each pageant's historiography landed on live bodies, the gaps between what the pageant argued for and who the pageant simultaneously excluded were made visible. *Allegory* crafted an argument for white women's suffrage by excluding recent immigrant and women of color; Du Bois sought to promote the African American middle class by denigrating the working classes; John Reed painted an image of the IWW as a fully united working class while ignoring the racial and ethnic differences that had led to tensions among the group. Despite their progressive intentions, once each pageant moved its political arguments on stage, the choices they made in performance belied their inclusive aspirations.

## Table of Contents

<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
The Pageant Impulse: Attempting a Democratic Performance	
<b>Chapter One</b> .....	48
Producing Whiteness in Hazel MacKaye’s <i>Allegory</i>	
<b>Chapter Two</b> .....	93
“Looking at One’s Self Through the Eyes of Others”: Representations of the Progressive Era Middle-class in W.E.B. Du Bois’s <i>The Star of Ethiopia</i>	
<b>Chapter Three</b> .....	134
Embodying Melting Pot(s) in The Paterson Strike Pageant	
<b>Conclusion</b> .....	177
Historical Pageantry’s Varied Legacy	
<b>Bibliography</b> .....	184
<b>Vita</b> .....	195

## **The Pageant Impulse: Attempting a Democratic Performance**

In July of 1988 I performed in my first stage production as Sacagawea in my local neighborhood Fourth of July celebration. The performance was deceptively simple: each child involved was assigned an historical figure to impersonate; we lined up in chronological order based on our characters' birthdates before the group of assembled family members eating their hamburgers and hot dogs off the grill in the humid Virginia summer. One by one, we each stepped forward and delivered brief monologues, in costume, about "our" individual contributions to the United States. My family and I were stationed in a suburb of Washington, D.C. that year while my father worked at the Pentagon. We lived in a development populated by many other young families; from April to August my brother and I spent afternoons and evenings out in the streets riding bikes, roller skating, or playing tag with any number of neighborhood kids. The families on my cul-de-sac were particularly friendly with one another, and in the summer of 1988 decided to organize a block party to celebrate the Fourth of July: a barbeque followed by a bike parade for the kids and a water balloon toss for everyone, which would culminate at dusk with fireworks in the center of the cul-de-sac. In the wake of the 1987 recession in the United States, organizing a low key, family friendly neighborhood party seemed more cost effective than taking the usual trek to downtown Washington, D.C. to watch the massive fireworks display on the Mall.

A few weeks before the party, a group of children on my block roughly around my age decided to contribute to the festivities by putting on a play. This eventually resulted in my debut as a nine year-old Sacagawea, the Native American who led Lewis

and Clark in their expedition through the western United States in 1805. I've forgotten much of what was said during the performance, and how our audience responded, but I do remember how excited we were to present our skit. We wanted to add to our neighborhood's sense of patriotism that day, to be good for our parents and show them we knew the holiday was about more than eating watermelon and throwing water balloons at our younger brothers and sisters. We thought we were successful, and that was good enough for us.

Our group of six or seven white, middle class girls was committed to portraying what we understood as diverse histories: we discussed our interest in including women and some people who "weren't white" in our performance. Our final presentation lineup featured Christopher Columbus, Betsy Ross, Sacagawea, Harriet Tubman, and Martin Luther King, Jr., among others. On the morning of the 4<sup>th</sup>, we gathered in a friend's basement to try on costumes and run through our skit one last time.

The choices we made to embody our characters complicated the progressive vision of our intentions: our costume choices belied our commitment to telling progressive histories. Once we had written our scripts, we were left to decide how to embody our characters. To perform on short notice and with few resources, we each looked for one or two costume pieces. The resulting choices relied heavily on stereotype. The young girl playing Columbus found a tri-corner hat; the girl playing Betsy Ross unearthed a hoopskirt from a dress-up box. I put on a feathered headdress to play Sacagawea. The girl playing Martin Luther King smeared on black face paint. I can remember watching her apply the makeup, feeling a vague sense that something about

what we were doing, what she was doing, wasn't quite right. As nine and ten year olds, none of us had enough historical knowledge to articulate the deeply complicated politics of our performance choices that afternoon. Our choices revealed, in part, how deeply stereotypy was ingrained in our subconscious. Having our script written on the page (or our family typewriter) was one thing; making the next step to embodiment asked us to navigate different histories, something about which we knew even less. While we sought to construct a diverse sampling of United States history, at the same time we reanimated racist histories of blackface performance and "playing Indian."<sup>1</sup> Our efforts to create a diverse narrative of U.S. history took on much different meanings once our bodies took the "stage" we constructed on a concrete driveway.

It wasn't until years later, while in the midst of my Ph.D. course work, that I thought about my childhood performance again in detail: while reading about historical pageantry, I saw in the images of that American Progressive Era performance genre similarities to my own neighborhood skit. In seeing pictures of United States citizens performing historical figures and reenacting significant historical moments for an audience of their neighbors and friends, I couldn't help but remember my own experience. It was a clarifying moment, one that not only led to my eventual choice in dissertation topic, but one that showed me how much my training in theatre history and its methodologies had to teach me about my own history. As my research and work continued, I began to see the specific cultural, historical, and political frameworks that lead to historical pageantry's intense popularity in the northeastern United States during

---

<sup>1</sup> See Philip Deloria, *Playing Indian* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998); further discussion of blackface performance appears below.

the Progressive Era. I recognized the tensions between attempting a progressive historical narrative and the complicated politics of embodiment embedded in performance. This dissertation explores that space pageants animate between progressive historical narratives and their fraught embodiments in three pageants of 1913: *Allegory*, a pageant supporting woman suffrage; *The Star of Ethiopia*, W.E.B. Du Bois's pageant of African American history; and the Patterson Strike Pageant, performed to aid striking union members in Paterson, New Jersey.

My dissertation argues these three historical pageants: *Allegory*, *The Star of Ethiopia*, and the Paterson Strike Pageant, were shaped by and in turn attempted to expand Progressive Era notions of citizenship through challenging expectations for gender, race, and class in 1913. Each was created to argue for the extension of full citizenship rights to their respective publics; in doing so, each pageant simultaneously reified Progressive Era hegemonies. With this goal in mind, my dissertation explores a central question: How did each pageant's embodiment reinscribe the oppressions they sought to dispel? Each pageant sought reform, whether through extending the right to vote to (white) women, furthering civil rights to African Americans, or reforming labor practices for the working classes. *Allegory*, *The Star of Ethiopia*, and the Paterson Strike Pageant all challenged the power of the white middle class as they lobbied for equal rights. Their goals for reform took on different meanings once embodied on stage, however; my dissertation argues that choices made in performance, despite progressive intentions, ultimately compromised their messages and embraced hegemonies while they simultaneously tried to refute them.

This chapter serves as an introduction to my project by first reviewing the advent of historical pageantry in the United States before turning to a discussion of the genre's significance to the Progressive Era cultural landscape. Once historical background is established, I analyze the pageant form as a genre under construction in the early twentieth century, in part through simultaneously embracing a variety of art forms, notably dance and music. Next, I address methodology through a discussion of my research process in the archive. I conclude with a review of the texts most influential to my research and provide a brief description of each subsequent chapter.

### **Historical Pageantry Takes Shape in the Progressive Era**

The historical pageantry movement emerged in England at the turn of the twentieth century and spread to the United States, where it quickly became popular on the east coast. Pageantry emerged in the United States at a time when civic leaders in the northeast were looking for “respectable” ways to celebrate local and national holidays. By the early twentieth century, U.S. civic celebrations marking historical occasions had become increasingly dangerous and rowdy, typified by revelers drinking heavily before setting off fireworks and shooting pistols haphazardly into the air. To the “genteel” classes, “public celebrations of holidays offered yet one more example of the nation’s prosaic, provincial cultural attainments and its consequent disregard for uplifting aesthetic and moral standards.”<sup>2</sup> As its popularity grew in England, pageantry appeared to

---

<sup>2</sup> David Glassberg, *American Historical Pageantry: The Uses of Tradition in the Early Twentieth Century* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1990) 31.

civic leaders in the U.S. as a potentially productive alternative to the more disorderly celebrations.

In February of 1908, historian Ellis Paxson Oberholtzer staged the first historical pageant in the United States in Philadelphia, in honor of that city's 225<sup>th</sup> anniversary. Oberholtzer's pageant mounted sixty-eight scenes from the city's history on individual floats, which processed through the city. The performers were members of the city's middle and upper classes, with some playing their influential ancestors: one float in the pageant featured Henry W. Bache as his great-grandfather, Benjamin Franklin, in a scene of Franklin visiting the French court.<sup>3</sup> The event captured the interest of onlookers and was therefore considered a success; civic leaders and organizations spread word about their triumph because "[t]he pageant is safe and sane—a reserved, wholesome, generous form of patriotic display, dignified and artistic—not reckless and unguarded chauvinism."<sup>4</sup> Word of mouth led to further performances; by 1910 pageants were being performed throughout the northeastern United States. Historical pageantry had drawn so much interest by 1913 that a steering committee formed the American Pageantry Association (APA) to facilitate communication among pageant makers through a newsletter and annual conference. Over fifty pageants were registered with the APA that year; pageantry had truly taken off.<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> Glassberg 49.

<sup>4</sup> Ralph Davol, *A Handbook of American Pageantry*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Taunton: Davol Publishing Company, 1914) 79.

<sup>5</sup> Linda Nochlin, "The Paterson Strike Pageant of 1913," *Theatre for Working-Class Audiences in the United States, 1830-1980*, eds. Bruce A. McConachie and Daniel Friedman (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1985) 91.

Once pageantry was established as a popular performance form, its typical narrative took the shape of the producing town's local history. Pageants involved hundreds, sometimes thousands, of community members gathered together to perform their place's story. A typical pageant began with a scene of the town's origin, often featuring the founders as Europeans deciding to immigrate to the United States. The pageant's plot then unfurled around major events of local history, which might include involvement in military battles, experiences of religious persecution, or other times of hardship. Pageants frequently centered on stories of "great" individuals, and might include scenes depicting the actions of an especially well known or heroic community member.

From its earliest iterations, pageants also served a pedagogical function: they could instruct an audience in how to correctly perform their offstage roles as citizens. Pride in town and nation were important by-products of the pageant's structure. No matter how the community chose to tell its story, the pageant always culminated in a patriotic celebration as a way to underline civic pride. The big finale could include a group of performers singing the national anthem while waving American flags, or gathering around to sing in front of the "community fire," a symbolic bonfire signifying a shared community spirit. This last scene served several purposes. It demonstrated performers' pride not only in their local place, but in their country, by extension. Thus pageants were also meant to both educate residents about the history of their geographical community and teach the audience about civic engagement. The amateur performers/local citizens modeled civic pride for the audience through their performance.

In addition to demonstrating patriotism at the local and national levels, it was also meant to “help local residents visualize their town’s current problems and their future solution.”<sup>6</sup> The pageant celebrated the community’s history and worked to collectively imagine a hopeful future.

Concluding a pageant on a hopeful note might encourage the community to look ahead to a bright future, rather than dwell on the financial and social difficulties of the present. The Progressive Era in the United States, from roughly 1900-1920, was marked from the outset by a deep divide in personal wealth.<sup>7</sup> The industrial revolution earned unprecedented riches for a small minority among corporate America, whose profits were made on the backs of the working classes. By the end of the nineteenth century, the most affluent 1% in the United States possessed a little more than half the nation’s wealth in real estate and property; in contrast, the poorest 44% owned only 1.2%.<sup>8</sup> By 1900, the total United States population was 76 million; one-third lived below the poverty line.<sup>9</sup> Rural farmers in search of a more reliable living began migrating to cities: by the end of the Progressive Era in 1920, half the nation’s population was urban, compared to thirty-five percent in 1890.<sup>10</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup> Glassberg 79.

<sup>7</sup> Historians disagree on the precise dates of the Progressive Era in the United States. Generally speaking, there is a consensus that the Progressive Era began around the economic depression of 1893-1897 and ended either with the United States’ entry into World War I in 1917, or upon the war’s end in 1918. See Steven J. Diner, *A Very Different Age: Americans of the Progressive Era* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1998); Lewis L. Gould, “The Progressive Era,” *The Progressive Era* ed. Lewis L. Gould (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1974); Donald K. Gorrell, *The Age of Responsibility: The Social Gospel of the Progressive Era, 1900-1920* (Macon: Mercer University Press, 1988); John Whiteclay Chambers, *The Tyranny of Change: America in the Progressive Era, 1890-1920* (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1992).

<sup>8</sup> Diner 4.

<sup>9</sup> Gould, “The Progressive Era” 3.

<sup>10</sup> Diner 5.

Widespread economic decline in the shadow of the upper class's profligate wealth led to interest in widespread urban reform as citizens looked to local, state, and national governments for protection from corporatization.<sup>11</sup> The grassroots activism born from this moment in United States history was an "idealistic, quasi-religious vision of efficient democracy."<sup>12</sup> Grassroots campaigns emerged early in the Progressive Era to affect progressive reform on a wide range of issues, including child labor, juvenile crime law, and clean air and food standards. Outside of urban areas, considerable efforts were made to conserve land and national parks.<sup>13</sup> The "quasi-religious" nature of reform took shape as the Social Gospel, the new focus on social transformation sought by the Protestant church. Programs like settlement homes, with their focus on "rehabilitating" immigrants and the working classes, organized from within the church, forever altered Protestantism's relationship to social issues and inextricably linked Progressive Era reform with Christianity.<sup>14</sup>

### **Pageants as Progressive Era Aesthetic**

In the early twentieth century, pageant makers often imagined their productions as extensions of Progressive Era grassroots philosophies and strove to make performances accessible to many. This section of the chapter considers how pageantry developed to embody progressivism through its various performance elements of dance, language, and location. Pageant makers eschewed traditional performance venues and instead staged

---

<sup>11</sup> Diner 46.

<sup>12</sup> Chambers ix.

<sup>13</sup> Gould, "The Progressive Era" 4.

<sup>14</sup> Gorrell 2; Henry F. May, *The End of American Innocence: A Study of the First Years of Our Own Time, 1912-1917* (1959; New York: Columbia University Press, 1992) 12.

pageants among the community in vast outdoor spaces. Historical pageantry's reliance on expansive space lessened its dependency on spoken dialogue; instead, pageantry incorporated music and dance to communicate a scene's action across large distances. Percy MacKaye, a well renowned pageant writer and director, praised pageantry's reliance on visual forms, writing: "What is this elemental appeal? Is it not the appeal of symbolism, the expression of life's meanings in sensuous forms?"<sup>15</sup> Pageantry's symbolism took advantage of recent innovations in modern dance, as well: choreographers like Ruth St. Denis and Isadora Duncan were exploring movement that would "address the expressive and spiritual needs of a changing society."<sup>16</sup> To do this, Duncan, St. Denis, and others imagined dance as a medium of personal expression, an idea immediately adopted by pageant makers to tell stories without words. To accompany gesture and movement, pageants often used orchestral and vocal music to set the piece's tone. A wide range of musical genres were incorporated: although many pageants commissioned original works, familiar classical pieces were used along with religious hymns, patriotic songs, and folk music.<sup>17</sup>

Many pageant makers hoped pageantry, as an art form, would become a democratic space: one in which each citizen could have a role and find their voice. Setting pageants in expansive outdoor areas placed significant importance on pageantry's relationship to space. Percy MacKaye insisted that "Pageantry is poetry for the masses" that could "make an elemental appeal to every man in the street, as to every woman who

---

<sup>15</sup> Percy MacKaye, *The Civic Theatre* (New York: Mitchell Kennerley, 1912) 174.

<sup>16</sup> Naima Prevots, *American Pageantry: A Movement for Art & Democracy* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1990) 131.

<sup>17</sup> *Ibid.* 153. More detailed discussions of music and dance in pageants appear later as they pertain to the individual case studies of this dissertation.

throws open her shutters to look and listen.”<sup>18</sup> The key figures in the field, with MacKaye at the forefront, saw pageantry as an opportunity to invest performance with the Progressive Era importance of local grassroots movements, albeit a vision tempered by contemporary gender roles.

Pageant writer William Chauncy Langdon famously noted “place” was the “hero” of the pageant.<sup>19</sup> Acknowledging this, Ralph Davol recommended choosing pageant sites near water, as “Poetry and romance are associated with [it].”<sup>20</sup> Davol’s sentiments and instructions are evidence of the significance pageant makers placed on choosing the appropriate setting: the place shaped an audience’s experience of the performance. Finding the right “hero” was of great symbolic importance, as the correct location could remind audience members of their community’s aesthetic appeal and inspire civic duty.<sup>21</sup> More recent scholarship argues that pageants are not only shaped by place, they also create the spaces in which they appear. American Studies scholar Steven Hoelscher argues in “Making Place, Making Race: Performances of Whiteness in the Jim Crow South,” that the annual Natchez Pilgrimage pageant in Mississippi, performed to this day, demonstrated pageantry’s ability to work as a “process of racialization” through performing the everyday.<sup>22</sup> Pageants, in this context, are able to create race in local places; through their performance pageants can clarify and lay bare racialized power structures within a community.

---

<sup>18</sup> Percy MacKaye 174.

<sup>19</sup> Qtd. in Glassberg 69.

<sup>20</sup> Davol 138-139.

<sup>21</sup> Glassberg 78.

<sup>22</sup> Steven Hoelscher, “Making Place, Making Race: Performances of Whiteness in the Jim Crow South,” *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 93.3 (2003): 657.

Although leaders in the field argued pageantry could foster affiliation among community members by highlighting the constituents' similarities, there were significant omissions. Ralph Davol noted pageantry was "dedicated to the service of the commonality."<sup>23</sup> In seeking an art form that focused on what citizens had in common, whether intentional or not, many voices were excluded. Ralph Davol admitted in 1914 that despite a few efforts by pageant makers, African American histories were rarely represented in pageants. The few African American roles often went to white performers in blackface.<sup>24</sup> Although pageants were initially designed to bring together disparate populations, the form's emphasis on similarity and "commonality" worked to exclude a number of populations.<sup>25</sup>

As historical pageantry reached the height of its popularity in 1913, its omissions were increasingly noticed. Historical pageants found popularity at a time in the nation's history when various social movements were gaining momentum: lynching plagued the South as disenfranchisement laws were passed state by state; woman suffrage campaigns agitated for the right to vote; and labor unions organized to demand better working conditions. Many of the popular, rural historical pageants presented a history that ignored these pressing social issues and supported the status quo. As a result, while pageants gained popularity the form was taken up by groups seeking to use pageants for political purposes. Three pageants, all performed in 1913, sought to give voice to these groups: Hazel MacKaye staged *Allegory* to support women's suffrage; W.E.B. Dubois wrote and

---

<sup>23</sup> Davol 17.

<sup>24</sup> Ibid. 96.

<sup>25</sup> See also Prevots 2; Glassberg 126.

staged *The Star of Ethiopia*, devoted to a re-telling of African-American history; John Reed organized members of the Industrial Workers of the World (IWW) for a performance of the Paterson Strike Pageant to aid laborers on strike in Paterson, New Jersey. Each of these performances attempted to expand pageantry as a genre to increase methods for how Americans could tell their diverse histories.

### **Performing the Progressive Era Melting Pot**

Members of these respective movements at times sought to define their struggles and judge their progress against the influx of immigrants to the United States. This section delineates the nuances of immigration policies during the Progressive Era as a central issue of the time which shaped all three case studies. Leaders in the National American Woman Suffrage Association (NAWSA) claimed to lobby for a woman's right to vote so that, as a group, the votes of middle class white women in their organization could counteract those of recently immigrated white men from Eastern and Western Europe.<sup>26</sup> Prior to staging *Star of Ethiopia*, W.E.B. DuBois wrote of his hope that African Americans would rise above the weak morality of these same recent immigrants.<sup>27</sup> The strike organized by the IWW for the working class immigrant population in Paterson, New Jersey, excluded African Americans and had very few working or middle class women in positions of authority. The ways that each group found to define themselves in

---

<sup>26</sup> "Official Program, Woman Suffrage Procession" Papers of MacKaye Family; ML-5; Rauner Special Collections Library, Dartmouth College, Hanover, NH. The Papers of the MacKaye Family have been re-boxed since I visited the collection. I am therefore unable to provide current box and folder numbers for the archival documents I cite in my research.

<sup>27</sup> W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Philadelphia Negro: A Social Study*, The Oxford W.E.B. Du Bois, ed. Henry Louis Gates, Jr. (Cambridge, Oxford University Press, 2007) 134-135.

contrast to the others not only meant that the groups were continually stepping on or over each other to reach their respective goals, but, in addition, it meant definitions of an “American” citizen was constantly and consistently in play, as each group sought to stretch the definition just wide enough to let them in, but keep the others out.

The recent spike in immigration dominated social concerns during the Progressive Era and challenged American notions of what it meant to be a citizen. While a possessive use of “citizen” is not unique to the Progressive Era, the factors that shaped the usage of the word in these years were of a specific historical context. Immigration policies took center stage in Progressive Era reform movements. The late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries saw an explosion of immigration to the United States from Asia and Eastern and Western Europe. In 1880 the foreign born population in the U.S. was 6.6 million, but by 1910 that number had more than doubled to reach 13.5 million, or 14.7% of the total United States population.<sup>28</sup> While, in theory, the democracy of the United States would include any and all, in practice, the flood of new citizens seeking naturalization challenged this presumably bedrock belief. Debates emerged over how many newcomers were “too many,” and insinuated recent immigrants were to blame for the myriad problems plaguing urban centers on the east coast.<sup>29</sup> Tensions centered on

---

<sup>28</sup> Campbell J. Gibson and Emily Lennon, “Historical Census Statistics on the Foreign-born Population of the United States: 1850-1990,” 7 May 2009

<<http://www.census.gov/population/www/documentation/twps0029/twps0029.html>>.

<sup>29</sup> Lewis L. Gould, *America in the Progressive Era, 1890-1914* (Harlow, England: Pearson, 2001) 60.

whether immigrants were the cause of the problems Progressives sought to redress, or whether they were the victims most in need of Progressives' help.<sup>30</sup>

Public sentiment led to government action. Federal immigration legislation passed immediately before and during the Progressive Era did little to check the tidal wave of immigrants from Eastern and Western Europe. Instead, Congress focused on barring Asian immigrants. The Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882 refused admittance to all seeking employment, specifically in mining. The law also created stricter laws for reentry, resulting in many stranded Chinese immigrants who could not leave the United States to see their families. The Geary Act of 1892 renewed and strengthened the original Chinese Exclusion Act; the Naturalization Act of 1906 reviewed naturalization procedures and added an English knowledge requirement: immigrants had to demonstrate a basic understanding of the language. Regardless of this legislation, European immigration reached all time peaks throughout the Progressive Era. With no sign of slowing, public sentiment focused on how immigrants could be, or should be, absorbed into the fabric of the nation.

To address the issue from a legal perspective, the Dillingham Commission was formed in 1907 and was given a broad charge by Congress to “investigate immigration.”<sup>31</sup> The nine-member panel, composed of congressmen and presidential appointees, took its name from William P. Dillingham, a “nativist” senator from Vermont

---

<sup>30</sup>Arthur Mann, *The One and the Many: Reflections on American Identity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1979) 106. Also, Werner Sollors, *Beyond Ethnicity: Consent and Descent in American Culture* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986) 94-95.

<sup>31</sup>Robert F. Zeidel, *Immigrants, Progressives, and Exclusion Politics: The Dillingham Commission, 1900-1927* (DeKalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 2004) 3.

with a history of supporting stringent immigration controls.<sup>32</sup> The committee was active until 1911, when it published its findings in a forty-one-volume report. The commission concluded that European immigrants were responsible for numerous ills facing urban populations, including crime, prostitution and illiteracy.<sup>33</sup> To redress these evils, the report recommended literacy tests and strict quotas, an endorsement that indelibly shaped United States immigration policy and foreshadowed future legislation that would make good on the commission's recommendations.<sup>34</sup> The authors also claimed social ramifications from the influx of newcomers: immigrants would be unable to shed their former culture and truly adapt to American society.<sup>35</sup>

Immigrants from Eastern and Western Europe were flooding the United States in record numbers. Congress passed a law in 1790 granting the vote to "all free white persons" residing in the country for at least one year.<sup>36</sup> Although the law denied citizenship to African Americans and later Chinese and Japanese Americans, the millions of Europeans immigrating to the United States throughout the nineteenth century were granted citizenship. Historian Matthew Frye Jacobson argues in *Whiteness of a Different Color: European Immigrants and the Alchemy of Race* that this influx of European immigrants, who were considered white, led to racisms based on a "variegated" notion of whiteness.<sup>37</sup> What it meant to be white was under revision, as new racisms were directed at those who "looked white," but were not born in the United States. The anxiety over the

---

<sup>32</sup> Zeidel 26.

<sup>33</sup> Mann 106.

<sup>34</sup> Zeidel 114.

<sup>35</sup> Mann 106.

<sup>36</sup> Matthew Frye Jacobson, *Whiteness of a Different Color: European Immigrants and the Alchemy of Race* (Cambridge, Harvard University Press, 1998) 22.

<sup>37</sup> Jacobson 40.

racial categorizations of Irish, Greek, Polish, and other European immigrants led to “a shift from one brand of bedrock racism to another—from the unquestioned hegemony of a unified race of ‘white persons’ to a contest over political ‘fitness’ among a now fragmented, hierarchically arranged series of distinct ‘white races.’”<sup>38</sup> In the wake of recent European immigration, middle class anxieties focused on how to define “whiteness” amidst the proliferation of white Others in the United States.

### **Performing Whiteness**

An immigrant’s ability to assimilate socially and culturally in America became a popular fascination in the early twentieth century; performance of the time reflected this racial panic. This section explores another major performance of the Progressive Era that defined mainstream rhetoric about immigration during the Progressive Era and how practitioners frequently discussed pageantry as a solution to the “problem.” While the Dillingham Commission did not think it possible, other theories suggested immigrants could immerse themselves in the melting pot of American culture to create one single culture from the many. The phrase “the melting pot” became ubiquitous in American popular culture in 1908 when playwright Israel Zangwill used it to describe a recent immigrant’s obligation to blend into a presumably unified American culture once he or she became a citizen. To “blend in,” immigrants were expected to shed the culture of their respective home countries in favor of adopting the customs of their new home. “The melting pot” of 1908 was not the first time this rhetoric was introduced into the landscape

---

<sup>38</sup> Ibid. 42.

of American immigration philosophies. The idea of the melting pot was germinating as far back as the 1780s, but was strikingly similar to an image of the American military as a “crucible” Theodore Roosevelt introduced in his book *The Winning of the West*, when he described an army regiment as “a mechanism that would bring together Americans from different regions, ethnicities, classes, and religions and mold them into one shape.”<sup>39</sup> The persistent image of immigrants dissolving themselves into the crucible of America resurfaced again in 1908 when Zangwill debuted his play *The Melting Pot*.

Although perhaps not the first time the words were spoken to indicate a process of Americanization, once Zangwill gave them life as the central metaphor for his love story between two Russian immigrants, the phrase became a lasting national symbol in debates about immigration.<sup>40</sup> *The Melting Pot* tells the story of David and Vera, two Russian immigrants from different religious backgrounds. David is Jewish; he escaped the pogroms, but not before witnessing his family’s brutal murder. Vera is a Christian from a Russian military family. Once in the United States, David and Vera meet, fall in love, and plan to marry. Their plans disintegrate, however, when David recognizes Vera’s father, a colonel in the tsar’s army, as the man who condemned his family to death.<sup>41</sup> In the end, Vera renounces her family; the two young lovers reconcile and revel in the fact that their

---

<sup>39</sup> Gary Gerstle, *American Crucible: Race and Nation in the Twentieth Century* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001) 41. For further discussion of Theodore Roosevelt’s notion of the crucible in American culture at this time, see Gail Bederman, *Manliness & Civilization: A Cultural History of Gender and Race in the United States, 1880-1917* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995) 178-184.

<sup>40</sup> Sollors 97.

<sup>41</sup> Israel Zangwill, *The Melting Pot*, rev. ed. (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1916).

relationship could only thrive in America “where all races and nations come to labour and look forward!”<sup>42</sup>

David and Vera can continue their relationship because America-as-melting-pot is a place where immigrants can shed the conflict of the past to create a new future. The play further posits that the culture forged from the melting pot was superior to the individual elements from which it derived. In his observations about melting pot rhetoric, Harley Erdman in his book *Staging the Jew: The Performance of an American Ethnicity, 1860-1920* notes, “...the melting pot came to be seen as a process by which immigrants would lose their differences as they conformed to a higher, more valorized standard of ‘American-ness.’”<sup>43</sup> Erdman implies that through the melting pot immigrants would become more similar; they would collectively come to resemble individuals less and each other more. The play also implies, however, that immigrants can achieve this symbiosis by renouncing the unique aspects of their respective cultures. The renunciation of home and culture through the metaphor of the melting pot was a violent one—the literal image being that of humans cooked alive for the presumed “good” of the United States. The violence of that rhetoric would be reflected throughout the Progressive Era, and in the pageants studied here, in brutal beatings on picket lines and along parade routes, in lynchings and in depictions of the slave trade.

*The Melting Pot* argues that America provides immigrants with enough distance from their past lives to make assimilation possible; the result is a diluted version of the

---

<sup>42</sup> Zangwill 185.

<sup>43</sup> Harley Erdman, *Staging the Jew: The Performance of an American Ethnicity, 1860-1920* (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1997) 137.

original culture, weak enough to dissolve in the heat of the melting pot. In the play's first scene, the Irish maid in David's home complains that she has to understand three different versions of Judaism in his household: one practiced by David's grandmother, another by his uncle, and a third practiced by David himself. She notices that on the Jewish Sabbath, when no work is to be done, each member of the household treats candles differently: the grandmother will neither light nor blow them out; the uncle will not light them but *will* blow them out, and David is comfortable both lighting and blowing out his candles.<sup>44</sup> The grandmother adheres most strictly to the belief that no work should be done on the Sabbath; each succeeding generation adheres less strictly. David, who works on the Sabbath in addition to lighting his own candles, is a great source of anxiety for his grandmother, who cannot adjust to American life. David, however, is enamored of his adoptive country and works tirelessly to compose a symphony, dedicated to America, as an expression of his patriotism. The play implies the grandmother has difficulty assimilating because she cannot loosen her religious restrictions, while David is the one who can fully embrace his role as an American because he is able to leave behind the more stringent beliefs of the older generations.

Although Zangwill's play openly supported the melting pot ideal, in the world of his play assimilation came with a price. Erdman argues that Zangwill was perhaps endorsing the melting pot with some reservation, as the playwright makes clear the assimilation process is a painful one.<sup>45</sup> Despite hesitation, however, once introduced the

---

<sup>44</sup> Zangwill 6.

<sup>45</sup> Erdman 137-138.

phrase was quickly absorbed as a new shorthand in the United States to refer to a desired method for assimilation.

Progressive Era performance offered a space to publicly rehearse complex feelings about immigration through plays like *The Melting Pot*; pageantry, too, offered a space to publicly rehearse these narratives, which ran a gamut from those insinuating the genre could teach immigrants how to be “American” to others which imagined pageantry as a space to foster dialogue and mutual understanding. Prominent pageant makers envisioned pageantry as an effective tool for the “Americanization” of pageant participants. Experienced pageant directors Ralph Davol and Esther Willard Bates celebrated the genre’s ability to teach citizenship to those they felt had not yet learned to be American. Davol noted that while many European immigrants were marked by a “loss of refinement, politeness, love, gentleness, and respect for parents,” pageants could serve as the corrective which could “Americanize” the immigrant population.<sup>46</sup> Davol felt Americans were marked by the refinement and politeness of the middle classes; pageantry could instruct recent immigrants in the ways of cultivating middle class values. Davol, however, advised caution against pageants praising famous American women like Betsy Ross, Martha Washington, and Dolly Madison because the “denatured feminist who sniffs at responsibilities of home as a light and airy fiction” was not the appropriate expression of community ideals.<sup>47</sup> Davol disapproved of the “denatured,” or unnatural, woman who would reject her role in society—a choice tantamount to rejecting her status in her community, and ultimately as an American. In its early iterations, pageantry’s

---

<sup>46</sup> Davol 80.

<sup>47</sup> Ibid. 85.

vision of democracy implied the group's glorification of community was more important than individual concerns. Pageantry's form perpetuated a tension between group and individual: in devising a patriotic art form, individual concerns were expected to submit to the needs of the group.

Although Davol and Bates understood the process of "Americanization" to be a one way relationship benefiting immigrants, other pageant directors imagined the relationship as mutually enriching. Hazel MacKaye spoke publicly about pageantry's unique ability to value cultural diversity. While MacKaye applauded pageantry's potential as an "expression of loyalty from the foreign-born peoples to the land of their adoption," she also expressed appreciation for new cultures represented in the United States: "these new daughters of America, from sunny Italy, from frozen Russia, and far-away Greece have all brought gifts. They have not come empty-handed, but have come bearing their inheritance in art, literature, music, history and tradition to enrich the new land."<sup>48</sup> Although still subscribing to the melting pot theory that immigrants were expected to assimilate gratefully, MacKaye's work embodied a wider view on pageantry's use as a tool for assimilation during the Progressive Era.

### **Dramaturgy as Historiography: A Methodological Practice**

Each of the pageant case studies in this dissertation attempted to forward a political argument using performance as the medium to reach a larger audience. Through pageantry, the woman suffrage campaign and the civil rights and labor movements found

---

<sup>48</sup> Hazel MacKaye, "Americanization Via Pageantry" (Papers of MacKaye Family; ML-5; Rauner Special Collections Library, Dartmouth College, Hanover, NH) 1-2.

ways to voice their beliefs in equality. Hazel Mackaye, W.E.B. DuBois, and a number of those involved in the Paterson Strike Pageant wrote about the significance of their pageants in forwarding their respective political causes. Each group saw that performance could move an audience in ways far different from their previous strategies, in print or on the picket line, employed to find broader public support. The question of how successful each pageant ultimately was in “converting” audience members or getting more money for their movement is not the focus of my dissertation, although it remains on the edges of the conversation. These questions of “success” focus on a finished product and center on an end result. Instead, I seek to explore process by way of fleshing out how each pageant was devised.

The methodology I employ to analyze each case study’s performance of gender, race, and class is informed by my historiographical investments in feminism and cultural studies. In her 2004 article “Feminist Performance as Feminist Historiography,” historian Charlotte Canning argues that performance contributes to “...making physical, gestural, emotional, and agonistic the processes that construct history out of the past.”<sup>49</sup> My methodology relies on the belief that performance, as Canning suggests, can illuminate the process by which historical narratives are constructed. Each case study’s narrative was created to present a history, whether from the previous millennia or the previous week. I apply this theoretical lens to examine each pageant’s particular mediated representation of history in relationship to the Progressive Era definitions of gender, race, and class. I work throughout my dissertation to understand how the varying histories

---

<sup>49</sup> Charlotte Canning, “Feminist Performance as Feminist Historiography,” *Theatre Survey* 45:2 (Nov. 2004): 227.

written and performed through *Allegory*, the Paterson Strike Pageant, and *Star of Ethiopia* expressed and in return shaped the cultural attitudes of the Progressive Era.

My understanding of how pageants created history is also informed by the work of Walter Benjamin in “Theses on the Philosophy of History” and his assertion that “To articulate the past historically does not mean to recognize it ‘the way it really was.’ It means to seize hold of a memory as it flashes up at a moment of danger.”<sup>50</sup> I do not seek to investigate each pageant’s historical accuracy; I will not look for how well or “correctly” the pageants “got” events of the past. Instead, I seek to understand how, in the dangerous moment in which each group found itself, each pageant crafted images from history to create a new historical memory that ultimately sought to reshape the complicated Progressive Era understanding of who was a legitimate citizen. The history of each pageant was firmly located in 1913. The histories told through *Allegory*, *The Star of Ethiopia*, and The Pageant of the Paterson Strike were products of the time in which they were conceived. Susan Foster reminds us: “Today’s creaking knee is not yesterday’s knee jogging up the hill.”<sup>51</sup> The way in which embodiment happens will never be the same from one day to another, and the social movements embodied in each chapter are firmly located in their historical moment.

Stirring alongside Progressive Era urban, environmental, and religious reforms were social change efforts organized to give voice to minority populations. *Allegory* was a product of the National American Woman Suffrage Association’s attempts to revive the

---

<sup>50</sup> Walter Benjamin, “Theses on the Philosophy of History,” *Illuminations* (New York: Schocken Books, 1969) 255.

<sup>51</sup> Susan Leigh Foster, “Choreographing History,” *Choreographing History*, Susan Leigh Foster, ed. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1995) 3.

woman suffrage campaign through spectacle. In 1913 women still were not permitted to vote. Efforts toward enfranchisement were stalled among various factions who believed the path towards woman suffrage led in different directions. While white, middle and upper class women were allowed greater agency in reform movements through Christian church programs, public attempts at pushing Congress for the vote were met with deep ambivalence.<sup>52</sup>

W.E.B. Du Bois wrote the first version of *The Star of Ethiopia* in 1913 to coincide with the fiftieth anniversary of the signing of the Emancipation Proclamation; Du Bois's pageant, which took pride in African histories, was written in the wake of the U.S. media's attempt to assess "black progress" in the wake of that significant anniversary. His pageant premiered while civil rights campaigns were also pressing for reform. Although African American men were legally enfranchised, southern states were systematically passing laws to strip away those rights. The Progressive Era was rife with racial violence. Booker T. Washington and W.E.B. Du Bois emerged as two of the thinkers and orators who would shape their generation's vision for equality while lynchings in the South rose sharply.<sup>53</sup>

The Pageant of the Paterson Strike pled for support from New Yorkers while their strike in New Jersey ran out of money and supplies even as the performers walked the

---

<sup>52</sup> See Leslie Goddard, "'Something to Vote For': Theatricalism in the U.S. Women's Suffrage Movement," diss., Northwestern University, 2001; Nancy F. Cott, *The Grounding of Modern Feminism* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1987); Eleanor Flexner and Ellen Fitzpatrick, *Century of Struggle: The Woman's Rights Movement in the United States*, enlarged ed. (Cambridge: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1996).

<sup>53</sup> See Louise Michele Newman, *White Women's Right: The Racial Origins of Feminism in the United States* (New York; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999); Angela Y. Davis, *Women, Race & Class* (New York: Random House, 1981); John Barker, *The Superhistorians: Makers of our Past* (New York: Charles Scribner's, 1982); Michele Wallace, *Black Macho and the Myth of the Superwoman* (New York: Dial Press, 1979).

stage. The incredible stratification of wealth in the United States prior to the Progressive Era left factory workers with little leverage to advocate for livable wages and safe working conditions. Unions brought workers together to lobby for these rights against a backdrop of sharply increased immigration. Many immigrants sought factory work to support their families. With such a large population of recent immigrants among their numbers, labor unions attempted to confront their own xenophobias while battling corporations. Exploring historiography as dramaturgy in three Progressive Era pageants of 1913 provides a window into how artists imagined the histories of the woman suffrage, civil rights, and labor rights campaigns in relationship to histories of the United States. Each pageant was simultaneously a product of its historical moment as they were crafting, through pageantry, the historical narratives assigned to their respective political causes.

### **Embodying Social Movements**

While all aimed to promote diversity, once each pageant's historiographical choices landed on live bodies, the gaps between what the pageant argued for and whom the pageant simultaneously excluded were made visible. Because little scripted material remains of each pageant studied in this dissertation, I derive much of their meanings through the performance choices of scenic, costume, and sound design, but also through the narrative choices communicated through choreography and movement. This section details the contemporary performance theories of embodiment I use to interrogate the ways in which each pageant shaped history through performance.

I employ a performance analysis that builds on archival documentation to reach a clearer understanding of the live performance event. In *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas*, scholar Diana Taylor argues for the significant differences between historical knowledge derived from written archives of historical documents versus embodied cultural expressions transmitted over time and generations. Her argument delineates a clear separation between written text and embodied knowledge as two discrete forms of knowing that can and should be read together. Taylor acknowledges the historical dominance assigned to the archive's written word, but posits embodied expression can offer equally necessary points of historical analysis: "Part of what performance and performance studies allow us to *do*, then, is take seriously the repertoire of embodied practices as an important system of knowing and transmitting knowledge."<sup>54</sup> Taylor's theory of the repertoire allows the possibility that gestural movement can do historiographical labor. Qualities of movement, whether shape or pace, rhythm or composition, can communicate a shared, lived history.

Susan Leigh Foster theorizes a different relationship between body and text: she posits bodies are always shaping history because bodies in motion are constantly creating cultural context, not just responding to pre-existing cultural contexts. In describing this ability for physical motion to create cultural meaning, Foster fuses the relationship between text and body by claiming movement's potential as "a bodily writing."<sup>55</sup> Additionally, bodies have the "potential agency to participate in or resist whatever forms

---

<sup>54</sup> Diana Taylor, *The Archive and Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2003) 26.

<sup>55</sup> Foster 3.

of cultural production are underway.”<sup>56</sup> Read in this light, performing bodies can intercede in the historical narratives that would confine them through enacting rebuttals or alternatives. Whereas Taylor views writing as part of the disembodied archive, Foster understands history as perpetually written through and on bodies.

Whether written on the body, as Foster suggests, or transmitted through the body, as Taylor claims, movement reveals historical and social knowledge. Dance theorist Selma Jeanne Cohen acknowledges movement’s power to express social values in addition to artistic qualities.<sup>57</sup> Dance writer and historian Sally Banes concurs with Taylor, Foster, and Cohen about movement’s social significance through her claim that “bodies are ensembles of social meaning,” but simultaneously warns of movement’s power to discipline.<sup>58</sup> Citing a feminist Foucauldian perspective, Banes remarks “culture wreaks utter tyranny on individual bodies.”<sup>59</sup> In describing how movement can retain and reflect this discipline she goes further: “It seems that the relationship between bodies and culture, like that between bodies and nature, occupies a middle ground between discipline and creative expression. That is, we *can* make our own bodies, but only to a limited extent.”<sup>60</sup> My dissertation seeks to explore this relationship between bodies and culture, or in my case studies, the relationship between bodies and the production of histories. In each pageant, history was on display in ways that both valiantly called for greater diversity in the Progressive Era, while simultaneously forming visual images that

---

<sup>56</sup> Ibid. 15.

<sup>57</sup> Selma Jeanne Cohen, *Next Week, Swan Lake: Reflections on Dance and Dances* (Middletown: Wesleyan University Press, 1982) 30.

<sup>58</sup> Sally Banes, *Writing Dancing in the Age of Postmodernism* (Hanover: Wesleyan University Press, 1994) 47.

<sup>59</sup> Ibid. 45.

<sup>60</sup> Ibid. 47.

challenged their causes. For female, African American, and working class bodies to appear on stage as the central figures of their pageants was hugely progressive for the time; how those same individual bodies were then disciplined into narratives through performance, movement, and choreography bespoke deeply rooted divisions between gender, race, and class specific to the Progressive Era.

The performance choices made in each pageant: the plot's narrative, costumes, music, dance movement, all that mediated the bodies of the performers, illuminates the cultural shifts taking place in America during the Progressive Era. Just as pageantry was not always successful in achieving its longed for democratic art form, neither were these three pageants entirely capable of strengthening their respective political causes through performance. Each pageant was intended to create space for voices and bodies previously overlooked in the American landscape of the time period; in their efforts to rectify specific erasures, each pageant created additional exclusions. Though the intention was to communicate Progressive political goals, each pageant embodied a compromise.

My analysis of pageantry in this dissertation aims to create, within the larger understanding of the totalizing presence of whiteness, an historiography that acknowledges whiteness not just as an historically specific construction, but one that has a variety of meanings even inside of its historical moment. Each case study of this dissertation engages definitions of whiteness unique to the group performing. The NAWSA membership understood whiteness differently from Du Bois, and neither of their definitions entirely overlapped with the IWW's view. Consequently, all three pageants performed racial identities in ways that, although all grounded in same historical

moment, were vastly different. In choosing three case studies from the same year, my dissertation offers a deeper view into the complex, sometimes conflicting, definitions of race, gender, and class identities of the time.

The melting pot ideal explored in Progressive Era pageantry assumed native born masculine whiteness as the status quo against which citizens were assessed. Each case study of this dissertation challenged that constellation of identity markers by offering the perspective of an alternative public. To understand how whiteness was assumed as a default position of authority and privilege in the Progressive Era, my dissertation relies on recent critical race theory exploring the ways in which whiteness is produced discursively as a totalizing concept. Richard Dyer, Ruth Frankenberg, Peggy Phelan have each examined the significance of whiteness as an “unmarked” racial identity and how that works to create the all encompassing specter of the white body.<sup>61</sup>

My methodology is in part an answer to Richard Dyer’s call that “whiteness needs to be made strange.”<sup>62</sup> Dyer’s work, and the field of whiteness studies by extension, posits that critical race theory needs to turn a focus on how whiteness is constructed. Without theorizing whiteness as a part of critical race theory, whiteness presides as the absence of race and is allowed to remain a default, or “norm.” By analyzing and theorizing its production, whiteness studies hopes to deconstruct and dismantle “white”

---

<sup>61</sup> See Richard Dyer, *White* (London; New York: Routledge, 1997); Ruth Frankenberg, “Local Whiteness, Localizing Whiteness,” *Displacing Whiteness: Essays in Social and Cultural Criticism*, ed. Ruth Frankenberg (Durham: Duke University Press, 1997); Peggy Phelan, *Unmarked* (London; New York: Routledge, 1993). This will also be discussed in more detail later in the chapter.

<sup>62</sup> Dyer 10.

as a position of authority.<sup>63</sup> Throughout the Progressive Era as different minority groups struggled for representation in the imagined America, whiteness consistently remained a presumed position of authority. The anxiety created among the white middle class once “white” as an identity category came under revision made whiteness visible in new ways during the Progressive Era. My dissertation seeks to address how each pageant sought to make visible the powerful definition of citizen as a white middle class male in 1913.

While contemporary critical race theories are useful to my research and argument, my methodology also seeks to locate theories of whiteness at the intersection of specific cultural, political, social, and economic factors in the Progressive Era. Additional recent scholarship has worked to understand the unmarked aspects of racial identity as products of historical, social and economic relationships that construct whiteness as the sum total of intersecting structures of power in unique historical contexts. As scholar Kate Davy notes in “Outing Whiteness: A Feminist/Lesbian Project”: “Like any institution, white womanhood is not a totalizing force, but one that shifts and changes in response to historical conditions.”<sup>64</sup> In her article, Davy argues for the importance of recognizing the construction of white womanhood as a “racializing process that produces whiteness.”<sup>65</sup> Davy’s argument acknowledges the significance of the ways in which whiteness is produced by discourse, but she qualifies that discourse by noting its process: one that is constructed over time. Scholar Ruth Frankenberg has noted the notion of whiteness as

---

<sup>63</sup> Ruth Frankenberg, *White Women, Race Matters: The Social Construction of Whiteness* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1993) 6.

<sup>64</sup> Kate Davy, “Outing Whiteness: A Feminist/Lesbian Project,” *Theatre Journal* 47 (1995): 199.

<sup>65</sup> *Ibid.* 196.

unmarked is, in itself, a historically located idea.<sup>66</sup> Frankenberg offers that, instead: "...I would argue that whiteness is always constructed, always in the process of being made and unmade. Indeed, its characterization as unmarked marker is itself an 'ideological' effect that seeks to cover the tracks of its constructedness, specificity, and localness, even as they appear."<sup>67</sup> That race could exist as a relationship among these different factors has also been articulated by scholars Michael Omi and Howard Winant in *Racial Formations in the United States: From the 1960s to the 1980s*: "We use the term racial formation to refer to the process by which social, economic, and political forces determine the content and importance of racial categories, and by which they are in turn shaped by racial meanings. Crucial to this formulation is the treatment of race as a central axis of social relations subsumed under or reduced to some broader category."<sup>68</sup> Theorists Ruth Frankenberg and John Hartigan, Jr. have built on this definition by suggesting that it is these factors located in time and place that add to the meaning of an individual's whiteness; Hartigan further complicates the idea of racial formation by acknowledging the power of the local.<sup>69</sup> My work builds on these definitions by exploring the interaction of the local with the global that contributed to the dynamic of whiteness present in my case studies.

---

<sup>66</sup> Frankenberg, "Local Whiteness, Localizing Whiteness" 15.

<sup>67</sup> Ibid. 16.

<sup>68</sup> Michael Omi and Howard Winant, *Racial Formations in the United States: from the 1960s to the 1980s*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (New York: Routledge, 1994) 61-62.

<sup>69</sup> John Hartigan Jr., "Locating White Detroit," *Displacing Whiteness: Essays in Social and Cultural Criticism*, ed. Ruth Frankenberg (Durham: Duke University Press, 1997) 182-183.

### **America/n, America/s, and the United States in the Progressive Era**

Each pageant I examine imagined its performers as a part of a larger American community. I use the term “imagined community” to explicitly reference Benedict Anderson’s notion of the imagined community: in his work he reminds his readers that communities based on a sense of belonging to a nation are “*imagined*” because the members of even the smallest nation will never know most of their fellow-members, meet them, or even hear of them, yet in the minds of each lives the image of their communion.”<sup>70</sup> These communities, Anderson posits, “are to be distinguished, not by their falsity/genuineness, but by the *style in which they are imagined*.”<sup>71</sup> I emphasize the aspect of style here because it is my intent not to parse whether or not each pageant *should have* tried to imagine their respective and unique communities as a part of America, but to argue for *how* each pageant sought to bring its group, through performance, into the space of that larger imagined community referred to as America. Although pushing against the status quo, each pageant is set squarely within the rhetorical confines of what it meant to be an American.

In continuing to define the terms of my study, I want to address differentiations between America and the United States throughout my dissertation. Although not unique to this time period, during the Progressive Era, “America” and “American” were strategically invoked as an imaginary ideal. “Americans” were the white, middle class, heterosexual men I refer to above, but the word “America” itself was loaded with

---

<sup>70</sup> Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London: Verso, 1983) 6. Emphasis in the original.

<sup>71</sup> Anderson 6. Emphasis added.

additional idyllic assumptions about the destiny of the country. The best and mightiest, the richest and most deserving of that wealth, ideas and ideals of what it meant to *be an American*, to live in *America* in the Progressive Era referred explicitly to the United States. Contemporary race theory reminds us that letting the United States stand in for America omits the other nations of North and South America, and a more careful attention has been paid in recent years to keeping that division clear.<sup>72</sup>

I intentionally employ both “America” and “United States” throughout my dissertation. I attempt to strategically use “United States” to refer to the United States of America as a designated country and geographic location. I use “America” and “American” to denote an imagined community of ideal citizens, and an imagined nation itself, residing in the United States. Because the rhetoric around what it meant to be American during the Progressive Era, I chose not to excise the words America and American from my dissertation entirely. I use them, instead, to point out and hopefully make clear the moments when the pageants I discuss were using performance to define what America and being America meant to them. Each pageant challenges prevailing notions of the Progressive Era ideal citizen, but always, I argue, in ways that still assume the ideal citizen to be American.

My understanding of America as an imagined community also relies on theorist Lauren Berlant’s descriptions of the facets of citizenship in *The Queen of America Goes to Washington City: Essays on Sex and Citizenship*. For Berlant, a significant aspect of

---

<sup>72</sup> This observation has been made by many; see Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2003); Paul Gilroy, *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1993); Joseph Roach, *Cities of the Dead: Circum-Atlantic Performance* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996).

America as an imagined community lies in the social positions citizens take or are assigned to each other: “the experience of social hierarchy is intensely individuating, yet it also makes people public and generic: it turns them into *kinds* of people who are both attached to and underdescribed by the identities that organize them.”<sup>73</sup> Berlant is not writing of the Progressive Era specifically in this passage, but the tension she describes between individuation and generic identity categories is present throughout Progressive Era pageantry, and subsequently, this dissertation. The woman suffrage campaigners, civil rights leaders, and union organizers of 1913 were all singled out as groups and described in harsh tones by those who thought their agitations for equal rights as citizens of the United States were “un-American.” Each of the pageants I engage as a case study in this dissertation was seeking to more fully describe the plight of its respective political cause, so as to legitimate its members as citizens.

### **Searching for Embodiment in the Archive**

Diana Taylor’s theory that written text and embodied knowledge exist on different planes creates complications for historians attempting to excavate past performances through the remnants of historical documentation: “The live performance can never be captured or transmitted through the archive.”<sup>74</sup> I am, however, seeking to piece the pageants together through archival documentation. I interact with photographs, lithographs, newspaper articles, interviews, and memoirs to capture and explain the

---

<sup>73</sup> Lauren Berlant, *The Queen of America Goes to Washington City: Essays on Sex and Citizenship* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1997) 1.

<sup>74</sup> Taylor 20.

interpretive choices made in each pageant. I agree that I can never recapture, or entirely reconstruct, the live event for a reader, but I do seek to take advantage of lingering archival evidence to understand how each pageant embodied history. At times it feels oxymoronic to look for traces of liveness in the archive, but the task is still at hand. The limits of the traces left behind determine the way in which I understand each pageant, but also demonstrate the boundaries of the time in which each pageant was first produced.

The most archival evidence at my disposal belonged to *Allegory*; although woman suffrage was a controversial issue in 1913, the white, middle class women engaged in the cause stood at the center of a media whirlwind—interviews, pictures, speeches, and mainstream media coverage in a variety of newspapers are readily available. The quality of movement derived from the choreography is thus easiest to piece together here through the numerous articles and interviews appearing in New York, Washington, and Boston newspapers in the days leading up to and immediately after the NAWSA parade and pageant. The working class, immigrant, IWW union members of the Paterson Strike Pageant were covered moderately well in New York City newspapers—an article the day after the performance and an editorial a few days after that. While coverage of the NAWSA events was in places ambivalent, the coverage of the Paterson Strike Pageant in the *New York Times* was openly hostile and fearful of the union members' political message. The IWW leadership and the Greenwich Village writers involved in that pageant's production wrote and published extensively in socialist magazines, and later in their own memoirs. The least archival documentation exists of Du Bois's *The Star of Ethiopia*. Even the *New York Observer*, a more liberal mainstream newspaper at the time

than the *New York Times* or *The Washington Post*, only published a few lines about the Emancipation Exhibition, the venue producing Du Bois's pageant on African American history.<sup>75</sup> The only in depth coverage appeared in *The Washington Bee*, the African American newspaper in Washington, D.C. Instead, I rely on the work Du Bois published or wrote himself, largely in the NAACP magazine *The Crisis*, for evidence of how *The Star of Ethiopia* crafted movement and narrative in a live performance.

The uneven coverage of the pageants demonstrates the limitations of the mainstream presses in 1913, but also limits my archival research today. The ways in which I analyze each pageant are inextricably linked to what has been left behind, and therefore although each chapter relies on archival research to demonstrate embodiments, each chapter is also subtly different in its approach. The analysis of *Allegory* focuses on dance and choreography as described by the spectators and choreographer in mainstream newspapers; the Paterson Strike Pageant is recreated through numerous accounts by spectators, IWW leaders, and Greenwich Village journalists in memoirs and socialist publications; my analysis of *The Star of Ethiopia* relies heavily on Du Bois's own writing about the pageant.

The methodology I employ to analyze my case studies is an extension of the archival and secondary materials available to me. Although I chose my case studies, in part, based on accessibility to archival materials, among the three pageants the available archive varies widely. Throughout the dissertation I use personal correspondence, still images, lithographs, publicity materials, and script drafts to reconstruct the pageants, both

---

<sup>75</sup> "Negroes Open Exhibition," *New York Tribune* 23 Oct. 1913: 16.

on stage and behind the scenes. Hazel MacKaye devoted the bulk of her career to pageant making, and as a result, her materials housed in the MacKaye family archive at Dartmouth College have retained many of the newspaper clippings about her pageants, in addition to the copies of the many speeches MacKaye wrote and delivered about the usefulness of pageantry as an educational tool. Her archive was by far the most extensive. As W.E.B. Du Bois and John Reed had careers that ranged further from performance, their archival materials, though useful, were far less thorough in respect to pageant materials.

In more recent scholarship, two books from 1990 have set the primary precedents for contemporary work on pageantry. David Glassberg's *American Historical Pageantry: The Uses of Tradition in the Early Twentieth Century* and Naima Prevots's *American Pageantry: A Movement for Art and Democracy* are useful analyses of pageantry's form throughout the early twentieth century. Both of these works attempt to understand how pageantry broadly writ sought to create an idyllic picture of nationalism, and the ways in which immigrants were taught to adopt the United States as its home country through those performances. Both take up pageantry as a cohesive movement and construct arguments for the varied uses of the form. Although neither book explores the pageants of my case studies in detail, they provide a thorough background for explaining how pageants in the Progressive Era were used to promote nationalism.

Pageants have been theorized more recently as sites where place and race can be actively created. In "Making Place, Making Race" Hoelscher argues that the Natchez Pilgrimage pageant of Natchez, Mississippi exemplifies such a process: "By examining

this important display of regional memory, I hope to shed light on whom Natchez whites imagined themselves to be and on the memories and performances that helped them make their collectiveness—their whiteness—authoritative, all-encompassing, and real.”<sup>76</sup> My case studies of pageants from the Progressive Era can be understood in a similar fashion: as an attempt to perform their community for an audience in ways that constructed and defined community for that audience.

The major Progressive Era historical studies have approached the period from a wide range of perspectives; taken together, they provide a complex background against which to analyze pageantry. Lewis Gould’s work in his edited volume *The Progressive Era* and in *America in the Progressive Era, 1890-1914* offers an essential perspective on how progressivism as a political platform developed and then later receded after World War I. Steven J. Diner’s *A Very Different Age: Americans of the Progressive Era* examines the time period from the varying perspectives of the minority groups who lived it. Nell Irvin Painter argues through *Standing at Armageddon: The United States, 1877-1919* that the period’s economic concerns were the central factor shaping social and political issues. The historiography of the period is expanded through reading a wide variety of both popular and scholarly texts as historical evidence in Henry F. May’s *The End of American Innocence: A Study of the First Years of Our Own Time*. To contextualize my case studies against more specific aspects of the Progressive Era, Donald K. Gorrell’s *The Age of Social Responsibility: The Social Gospel in the Progressive Era, 1900-1920* offers an analysis of how progressivism and Protestantism

---

<sup>76</sup> Hoelshcher 660.

influenced each other. Although dedicated to a democratic ideal of inclusion for all, progressivism fell short of its goals. Herbert Croly's *The Promise of American Life* of 1909 is an often-cited resource for interpreting the Progressive Era belief in democracy; "*The World of Hope*": *Progressives and the Struggle for an Ethical Public Life* by David B. Danbom examines how the ideals of the Progressive Era grassroots activism, as expressed in works like Croly's, fell short of their intended goals.

The above sources provide a thorough general background for the time period; each case study relies on additional key sources pertaining to the individual pageants. *Allegory* has not been written about extensively. Existing scholarship on the pageant frequently compares the pageant to other feminist works, but rarely treats the pageant on its own. Karen Blair's *The Torchbearers: Women and Their Amateur Arts Associations in America, 1890-1930* contextualizes *Allegory* within the larger trajectory of Hazel MacKaye's career as a pageant director and concludes MacKaye's pageants were warmly received by the public only when they refused a strident argument.<sup>77</sup> Both Leslie Goddard's 2001 dissertation from Northwestern University, "Something to Vote For: Theatricalism in the U.S. Women's Suffrage Movement" and John Fletcher's 2005 dissertation from the University of Minnesota, "Common Stage, Contested Stage: Democratic Performance Activism in the United States of America" contextualize *Allegory* within its unique historical circumstances: Goddard by a comparison to other suffragist-sponsored performance and Fletcher through a comparison of *Allegory* to feminist activism of the 1970s.

---

<sup>77</sup> Karen J. Blair, *The Torchbearers: Women and Their Amateur Arts Associations in America, 1890-1930* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994) 135-142.

W.E.B. Du Bois is responsible for authoring or publishing the majority of extant writing on *The Star of Ethiopia*; I examine his writings from *The Negro* and the NAACP magazine *The Crisis* as evidence of his thinking about African and African American history at the time *The Star of Ethiopia* was devised. In addition, David Krasner wrote the most often cited article about *The Star of Ethiopia*: “‘The Pageant is the Thing’: Black Nationalism and *The Star of Ethiopia*” in which he argues *Star* was an opportunity for Du Bois to focus on African American culture to encourage morality. Krasner provides a helpful precedent for engaging with the philosophies shaping the pageant’s political viewpoint. He, however, comes to the conclusion the pageant displayed African American “plurality;” I argue that Du Bois focused the pageant on promoting his emerging idea of the Talented Tenth to encourage an African American presence in the middle class.

The major published scholarship on the Paterson Strike Pageant has focused on its success in varying contexts. Linda Nochlin’s “The Paterson Strike Pageant of 1913,” and Steve Golin’s “Paterson Strike Pageant: Success or Failure?” are the two most widely cited pieces of scholarship devoted to the pageant: Nochlin argues the Paterson pageant was a rare form of performance that affected and instructed its actors as much as its audience; Golin explores whether the pageant’s financial losses negated its emotional and political appeals, arguing that historians have paid far too much attention to the former at the expense of the latter. Lastly, Christin Essin’s 2007 dissertation from the University of Texas at Austin, “Landscapes of American Modernity: A Cultural History of Theatrical

Design, 1912-1951,” reads the pageant’s scene design as an affective and affecting space that contributed to the IWW’s ability to garner sympathy from its audience.

Each chapter of this dissertation is devoted to one pageant’s production. My case studies were not the only pageants devoted to political causes, nor the only to negotiate the Progressive Era understanding of citizenship. Choosing three pageants from the same year as my case studies, however, allows a tighter focus on historical context while addressing different aspects of Progressive Era citizenship. Because all three pageants were created and first performed in 1913, my analysis focuses on the unique combination of historical, political, and cultural factors of the Progressive Era that spawned its conception of citizenship through a convergence of race, gender, and class. Each case study takes up different challenges to the notion of Progressive Era citizenship through a respective focus on productions of whiteness in the woman suffrage campaign, the political solidarity of recent immigrants in a labor union, and attempts to achieve racial equality through middle-class status in the civil rights campaign.

Choosing these three case studies offers an opportunity to explore how performance shaped Progressive Era citizenship through a range of social movements. While providing variety, it also creates moments of overlap and similarity, as some of the pageants, and their respective movements, used similar strategies to make sure their voices were heard. There are also moments of intense discord, as the respective movements producing the pageants worked to make gains at the expense of one another. Each case study ultimately demonstrates how, in an attempt to reshape the status quo

through performance, each pageant sought to explore and redefine the contemporary understanding of citizen by embracing hegemony in unique ways.

Each chapter opens with a thick description of a significant visual moment from the pageant as a means of introducing each through a sense of its dramaturgy. This is followed by a brief contextualization of the political movement from which the pageant developed. Following the historical context, the text of the pageant, or what remains of it, the circumstances of its production are read closely for evidence of how the writers, directors, producers and actors used their pageant to make claims for their group's access to the rights afforded Americans, and how, in making those arguments, the pageants negotiated a complex relationship to notions of citizenship that, in places, perpetuated the restrictive Progressive Era rhetoric about what it meant to be a citizen. Although all are from 1913, the case studies are not presented in chronological order. Instead, I arranged them in ways that I believe more easily address their common themes and techniques, to provide a more natural flow from one case study into the next.

Chapter one explores the performance of whiteness in Hazel Mackaye's pageant *Allegory*. The performance was included as a part of the March parade organized by the National American Woman Suffrage Association (NAWSA) in support of a constitutional amendment granting women the right to vote; *Allegory* was created as a performance companion to the parade. I argue that by connecting themselves to the culture of ancient Greece through their performance, the women of *Allegory* reassured their audience of their moral character by foregrounding their claim to whiteness. The pageant served as an allegorical representation of the many virtues possessed by the

woman suffrage activists: the pageant began with a woman dressed as Columbia, a feminine symbol of the United States, standing before the crowd, as she called forward her attendants. These attendants were meant to symbolize virtues such as peace, charity, plenty, and hope; all congregated around Columbia to watch with approval as the suffrage parade marched past them. The chapter connects *Allegory* to a Progressive Era interest in ancient Greek culture and analyzes the complicated production of whiteness inherent in the performance. The suffrage movement had aligned itself in opposition to immigrants and African American men, and lobbied for woman suffrage on the platform that the votes of white women would be able to counteract those other voting blocks.<sup>78</sup>

Additionally, I also argue the vision of whiteness created in the pageant was in conversation with contemporary definitions of citizenship. Recent Greek immigrants to the United States would not have been considered legitimate, “native” citizens, and yet the women of *Allegory* were claiming ancient Greek culture as proof of their own superiority. The performance of their virtue served as public argument for why *white* women specifically should be able to vote. Through their performance they further defined what whiteness looked like to them in 1913, along a hierarchy of the “correct” degree of whiteness.

Chapter two looks at W.E.B. DuBois’s pageant *Star of Ethiopia* and argues that through creating new narratives of African and African American history, DuBois simultaneously created an implicit standard for African American women which embraced the Progressive Era assumption of middle class morality. By 1913 Du Bois was

---

<sup>78</sup> “Official Program, Woman Suffrage Procession,” Rauner Special Collections Library.

fully engaged in the “Talented Tenth,” his belief that to achieve equality, African Americans should aspire to middle class professions. Through work ethic and its concomitant social status African Americans would, DuBois argued, reach parity with middle class, native born, white Americans. DuBois also argued, however, that a middle class status was also a sign of moral achievement. I argue that throughout DuBois’s writings in *The Philadelphia Negro* and his edited volumes of *The Crisis* during the years before staging *Star of Ethiopia*, DuBois offered African Americans advice on how to conform to contemporary middle class standards of hygiene and housekeeping so as to be more recognizably of the middle class. DuBois made clear through his sociological studies and editorial choices that women were the caretakers of the home, and by extension, responsible for its management. I read *Star of Ethiopia* in the context of DuBois’s investment in African American women’s contribution to the perceived moral elevation of African Americans in general, and argue that in the pageant, DuBois creates female characters that further his attempts to instruct African American women in morality.

To construct this argument I piece together early drafts of the pageant script to chart the creation of the title character. As a character, The Star of Ethiopia did not appear in the first performance of the pageant; in fact, the first performance was not titled after her until 1915. Through a comparison of the scripts for the first two productions and a close reading of still images and publicity materials, I demonstrate how the title character of *The Star of Ethiopia* was developed to model DuBois’s ideal African American woman as a selfless, fearless, self-sacrificing persona. Throughout all three case studies, the

different methods of analysis I employ to make my arguments about each individual pageant work to construct a broader, but deeper, understanding of how citizenship was constructed through performance during the Progressive Era.

Chapter three explores the Paterson Strike Pageant as a performance of the working class and its complicity in the idealized notion of immigrants coming to the United States to be absorbed into the melting pot. In February of 1913 the silk industry of Paterson New Jersey began an unprecedented work stoppage lead by the International Workers of the World involving 25,000 workers and almost every single silk shop in the city. To raise money for the striking workers and to raise awareness for the workers' plight, the IWW leadership partnered with a group of Greenwich Village bohemians to create the Paterson Strike Pageant, a six episode re-creation of the recent events in Paterson which would relay the story of the strike to an audience unfamiliar with the workers' complaints and hardships.

I argue that although the Paterson Strike Pageant was criticized at the time, and written about since, as being revolutionary in its politics, upon closer consideration the pageant can be seen to embrace the Progressive Era notions of the idealized melting pot. The Paterson Strike Pageant sought to criticize contemporary labor practices and agitate for better working conditions for the workers of the silk industry who were mostly recent immigrants to the United States. Although the strike and the pageant made clear this particular group of immigrants would not "melt" easily, as mainstream Progressive Era notions of the citizen demanded, the rhetoric of the pageant created another melting pot: one in which the entire working class acted as one body, with all the various races and

ethnicities represented by the IWW working together without difficulty. Accounts of the strike indicate that Paterson's silk industry was made up of any number of smaller factions based on profession, race, ethnicity, and the length of time lived in the United States. Strike leaders in Paterson, and by extension the pageant created about their struggle, erased those differences to present another melting pot: one that implied the working classes of Paterson had melted seamlessly into one another.

However problematic, my neighborhood Fourth of July pageant was my first exposure to both pageantry and performing for a live audience. My friends and I wanted to embody what "America" meant to us; as result, from an early age I connected live performance with efforts to articulate national identity. It is perhaps no surprise then, that I would be drawn to historical pageants and these particular case studies with their attempts to embody a hoped-for nation. These three case studies also, however, embody the questions I most want to ask and understand about performance's ability to shape the world around us. Understanding historical pageantry in this context adds to its legacy as a genre intricately involved in shaping a nation.

## Chapter One:

### Producing Whiteness in Hazel MacKaye's *Allegory*

March 3, 1913 was a cool, clear morning in Washington, D.C. Although Woodrow Wilson's inauguration as the twenty-eighth President of the United States was to take place the following day, much of the press's attention was focused elsewhere: the National American Woman Suffrage Association, NAWSA, was holding a parade in support of a constitutional amendment to enfranchise women. In the days leading up to the parade, the press speculated on who and how many would attend, whether the event would persuade onlookers to their cause, and how warmly dressed the marchers would be. The public was reassured that the women taking part had "costumes of heavy material" which would protect them throughout the day.<sup>79</sup>

It was for other reasons entirely, however, that the suffragists found themselves needing protection. On the day of the march, thousands of spectators crowded the mile long parade route down Pennsylvania Avenue, from the Peace Monument on the grounds of the Capitol Building to the National Treasury Building at 15<sup>th</sup> Street.<sup>80</sup> Ropes were stretched along each side of the street to separate the 5,000 marching suffragists from the rowdy crowds on the packed sidewalks.<sup>81</sup> However, once the suffragists embarked from the Peace Monument and turned towards Pennsylvania Avenue, they saw only a mass of people standing before them. The crowds had jumped the ropes and reclaimed the street, which allowed the marching women, in some places, to squeeze through with only three

---

<sup>79</sup> "Suffrage Paraders to be Warmly Clad," *Philadelphia North American* 9 Feb. 1913, sec. 3: 7.

<sup>80</sup> Accounts vary as to how many spectators lined the streets; some estimated as many as 500,000. See "5,000 Women March for Suffrage Cause," *New York Times* 4 Mar. 1913: 5; "Women Appear in Tableaux," *The Washington Herald* 4 Mar. 1913: 9.

<sup>81</sup> "5,000 Women March for Suffrage Cause" 5.

or four women standing together.<sup>82</sup> As the crowd grew increasingly constrictive, spectators began harassing and physically intimidating the marchers. Although suffragists asked the police to intercede, by the end of the day over 100 women had been sent to the hospital.

Newspaper accounts of the weather and mob violence created an image of fragile, cold, bruised women. The suffragists' bodies were written as the vulnerable subjects of either the capricious environmental elements or the violent crowd around them. Those same bodies acted with far greater agency as they marched through Washington, D.C. publicly declaring their demand that women be extended fuller rights of citizenship. The parade was also a groundbreaking event in terms of the ways NAWSA incorporated performance into its campaign to increase their visibility. The day's events were in two parts: the parade with floats and a performance of *Allegory*, a pageant written and directed by Hazel MacKaye, with choreography by Florence Fleming Noyes.

This chapter explores how the performers in *Allegory* actively constructed an embodiment of white, middle class womanhood. Their performance choices made visible the women NAWSA excluded from their organization: recent immigrants and women of color. I argue that the production of whiteness in *Allegory* was used to reify the suffragists' position of power in their campaign for enfranchisement. To do this, the pageant produced a vision of female whiteness that was historically specific to the Progressive Era: it played on notions of the "correct" role for women; it aligned its cause in opposition to recent immigrants; and lastly, the style of its choreography was used to

---

<sup>82</sup> "Women Battle Hostile Mobs in Capital Parade," *New York Tribune* 4 Mar. 1913: 1.

further associate the pageant with ancient civilizations: in this case with ancient Greece, which clarified the suffragists' status as physically and intellectually superior.

In promoting a woman's right to vote, *Allegory* carefully constructed its representation of womanhood so as not to overly threaten conservative visions of Progressive Era femininity. *Allegory* sought a way to lobby for woman suffrage by showing spectators that women could be voting patriots who were also still the caretakers of white culture in the United States. To do this, *Allegory* crafted an argument for woman suffrage by drawing correlations between the beauty and morality of suffragists with that of a vague notion of the beauty and morality of more "advanced" civilizations. The pageant performers used a choreography which relied on their whiteness serving as an unmarked racial identity, which allowed the performers to access "universal" art and emotion.

In addition to appealing to the audience's sense of middle class femininity, I argue *Allegory* made its case based on a specific production of *feminine* whiteness. Beauty was certainly a factor in the creation of the pageant, and its subsequent reception; it was a construction of beauty which relied heavily on what it meant to be *white* and beautiful. The argument that NAWSA exploited a sense of aesthetic beauty and feminine virtue to aid their cause is not new, neither is the argument that the women leading NAWSA, and especially its president Alice Paul, refused to align their efforts with suffrage groups organized by women of color.<sup>83</sup> What I offer, however, is an analysis of how *Allegory's*

---

<sup>83</sup> See Goddard; Newman; Cott; Hazel Carby, *Reconstructing Womanhood: The Emergence of the Afro-American Woman Novelist* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987); and Paula Giddings, *When and Where I Enter: The Impact of Black Women on Race and Sex in America* (New York: Bantam Books, 1984).

argument of enfranchisement based on female beauty and virtue was entirely dependent upon both of those things being read in the context of their whiteness. The performance created an image of morality and beauty as being the distinct property of middle and upper class white women.

This chapter begins with descriptions of the parade and pageant. It continues with a discussion of the crossroads at which white womanhood found itself during the Progressive Era, as the True Womanhood of the late nineteenth century began to give way to the New Woman of the Progressive Era. I situate *Allegory* within the contexts of those competing gender roles and of constructions of whiteness to demonstrate the particular suffragist on whose behalf *Allegory* sought the vote.

My methodology takes up Ruth Frankenberg's suggestion that whiteness can be "viewed as ensembles of local phenomena complexly embedded in socioeconomic, sociocultural, and psychic interrelations."<sup>84</sup> That their audience presumed the women in *Allegory* were white, and that the performers benefited from that assumption, is the product of a myriad of factors, including Progressive Era politics, the state of the women's rights movement, recent immigration legislation, and theories on the efficacious potential of the arts. *Allegory* exists at this intersection in a performance that both reflects and reinscribes positions of power unique to white women in the northeastern United States in 1913.

According to the parade program: "The story told in the Procession shows what woman is striving to achieve, as well as what she has so far attained. The Allegory, on the

---

<sup>84</sup> Frankenberg, "Local Whiteness, Localizing Whiteness" 1.

other hand, illustrates those ideals toward which both men and women have been struggling through the ages and toward which, in co-operation and equality, they will continue to strive.”<sup>85</sup> The choice of “woman,” as opposed to “women,” and the consolidation that implies into one discrete identity category foreshadows the erasures in the suffragists’ agenda and in the performances on March third. The parade was meant to show the history of woman suffrage; the historical pageant was an attempt to embody a more abstract notion of what suffragists could be: the pageant used allegorical figures to showcase the moral virtues of white femininity as a way of assuaging public fears that a female voter would no longer be feminine.

NAWSA’s attempts to lobby for its cause without being perceived as overly aggressive or “masculine” became a concern that showed itself throughout the parade and pageant. In an essay in the suffrage program titled “Why Women Want to Vote,” NAWSA argued: “Because it is the quietest, easiest, most dignified and least conspicuous way of influencing public affairs.”<sup>86</sup> *Allegory* furthered NAWSA’s goal to present suffrage as quiet and dignified. The pageant opened with Columbia, a figure meant to symbolize the United States as a nation, dressed in the national colors, taking center stage. She subsequently summoned forth five virtues to the stage: Justice, Charity, Liberty, Peace, and Hope. Once assembled, Columbia and her attendants viewed the parading suffragists marching by with approval. *Allegory*’s attempt to construct a moral, patriotic, unthreatening suffragist was, however, simultaneously constructing the women of NAWSA specifically as white Americans by excluding recent immigrants and women

---

<sup>85</sup> “Official Program, Woman Suffrage Procession,” Rauner Special Collections Library.

<sup>86</sup> *Ibid.*

of color. Their performance of whiteness was predicated on Progressive Era anxieties over what “white” meant at a time when civil rights and immigration were challenging long held definitions of race and ethnicity in America. The white, female performers of *Allegory* were not a threat to American culture; they could, instead, continue to preserve America and the American family from the looming specter of the recent immigrant.

### **Progressive Era Femininity: True Womanhood vs. the New Woman**

Although *Allegory* sought to portray a homogenous, unified idea of “woman” through its performance, the notion of “woman” they crafted was split between aspects of True Womanhood and the New Woman. The ways in which *Allegory* straddled a space between both positions was made evident in how critics understood the performance. The woman suffrage campaign was both a product and reflection of a larger shift in gender roles during the Progressive Era. Throughout the second half of the nineteenth century, the “ideal” standard for middle class white women was “True Womanhood,” a pervasive set of expectations for the embodiment of femininity in the United States. True Womanhood was judged by a woman’s adherence to “four cardinal virtues—piety, purity, submissiveness and domesticity.”<sup>87</sup> These virtues focused on a woman’s role in the home: white, middle class women were expected to reign over their husbands and children in the domestic space. The belief that women were better suited than men to caretaking stemmed from her presumed innate devotion to spirituality; her unique Christian faith gave the True Woman a meekness of spirit far superior to any man. Her

---

<sup>87</sup> Barbara Welter, “The Cult of True Womanhood,” *American Quarterly* 18 (Summer, 1966): 152.

virtuous superiority made her responsible for the morality of all around her, because men were naturally more “sinful.” It was up to the True Woman to protect men from themselves.<sup>88</sup> Although white, middle class women were largely relegated to the home in this period, that position was not without agency. It was from the domestic space that white women and women of color in the middle class were able to form the woman’s club movement, and other activities that would eventually lead to political activity and greater visibility in the public sphere by extending it further and further outside of the home. Even inside the domestic space, however, middle class women were able to exert influence on those around them through social activity.<sup>89</sup>

At the end of the nineteenth century, this gender role began to shift in subtle and often contradictory ways as women made more open claims on public space. By the 1890s, True Womanhood was gradually giving way to the New Woman. A phrase coined in the 1890s, “the New Woman” described a new model for femininity, one in which women could seek higher education, an interest in athletics, and relationships with men based on equal footing, not subservience. The New Woman wanted to vote.<sup>90</sup> In conservative middle class circles, both men and women found the idea of the New Woman deeply threatening. Although descriptions of True Womanhood and the New Woman often involve checklists of the characteristics assigned to both stereotypes, each

---

<sup>88</sup> Ibid. 152.

<sup>89</sup> Linda J. Tomko, *Dancing Class: Gender, Ethnicity, and Social Divides in American Dance, 1890-1920* (Bloomington & Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1999) 37.

<sup>90</sup> See Bederman; Dorothy Schneider and Carl J. Schneider, *American Women in the Progressive Era, 1900-1920* (New York: Facts on File, 1993); Frances B. Cogan, *All-American Girl: The Ideal of Real Womanhood in Mid-Nineteenth-Century America* (Athens; London: The University of Georgia Press, 1989); Charlotte Rich, *Transcending the New Woman: Multiethnic Narratives in the Progressive Era* (Columbia; London: University of Missouri Press, 2009).

role had ties inextricably linked to larger feelings of social expectations with regard to race, class, and patriotism. For some, the innocence and frailty of the True Woman should not be exposed to the harsh world of politics; the True Woman was simply not equipped for admittance to that realm. If given access to a larger public sphere, how could she still maintain her innocence? How could she continue to serve as the touchstone for morality if she became tainted by the vulgar world of politics?

While these questions convey the response of the conservative, white middle class, more progressive women were opposed to suffrage, as well. Progressive reformer Mary (Mother) Jones infamously abstained from involvement in woman suffrage campaigns on the grounds they distracted women from adding their voices to more specific policy issues, noting “you don’t need to vote to raise hell.”<sup>91</sup> While Jones’s concern already assumes that women absolutely belonged in a political arena, and that America would be stronger for it, the arguments launched from more conservative corners implied that the New Woman and her interest in voting could destroy the fabric of American culture. The True Woman was charged with raising her sons to be “good Americans;” if she was no longer ultimately devoted to that cause, America would suffer.<sup>92</sup> Who would teach American children to *be* Americans, if their mother was not offering her single-minded, careful instruction? Seen in this light, the True Woman was responsible for standing up as a protector of the American family in the face of assault from many sides: new waves of immigration, the New Woman, and civil rights. True Womanhood represented values of the white middle class. Its parameters did not include

---

<sup>91</sup> Schneider and Schneider 166.

<sup>92</sup> Welter 172.

working class women or women of color, as economic needs often demanded they work outside the home. Through that work, a woman exposed herself to a harder world that compromised her innocence in many ways. She could not serve as the moral compass in the home; her time away from the domestic space hampered her ability to find her way. The next chapter will address the response women of color had to True Womanhood and the New Woman; this chapter focuses on how the woman suffrage movement, and *Allegory*, were created in the shadows of two enormously influential and conflicting views on the nature of womanhood during the Progressive Era.

NAWSA, too, was forced to grapple with these contradictory visions for feminine culture, often in ways that seemed counterproductive to the end goal of enfranchisement. Their parade and pageant events on March 3, 1913 were frequently understood in terms of their relationship to these incompatible gendered expectations. The performers in the pageant embraced a lax attitude towards the dress of the day with their loosely fitting tunics and bare feet; while scandalous to some, as the opening of the chapter indicates, it was intriguing to others. Some of the pageant's news coverage focused on the political argument inherent to *Allegory*, but much of it dwelt on the appearances of the women involved, particularly their costume choices.

Although a few of the NAWSA leaders disapproved of Paul's tactics, which included a privileging of performance and spectacle, for fear of being perceived as aggressive, outsiders did not see *Allegory* as part of a militant suffrage campaign. In its review of *Allegory*, Washington D.C.'s *Evening Star* congratulated the pageant workers: "It is to the credit of the American women that they have carried on this propaganda

without resort to the follies and the mistaken methods employed in England. They have appealed to the reason of the American men, and their arguments have gained increasing force as they have been able to point here and there to the comparative failure of unequal suffrage as a means to the end of good government.”<sup>93</sup> The *Evening Star* commented on the political efficacy of the event in a way few, if any, other papers did: “Today’s pageant is an impressive symbolism of the part which women play in civilization...It is futile to deny in the light of today’s impressive demonstration the capacity of American women to carry on their share of the world’s work apart from the domestic field hitherto allotted to them.” *Allegory*’s attempt to craft a gentle image of their political platform as not threatening, but enhancing an intentionally broad sense of white femininity landed well with at least a few critics.

The homogeneity implied in NAWSA’s policies showed itself in other ways to *Allegory*’s spectators: although The *Evening Star* noted the pageant’s potential political importance, most others focused on what the pageant said about the performers’ morality and physical beauty. In *The Washington Herald*, Genevieve Champ Clark noted that the pageant, “spoke eloquently of the grace and beauty of a woman’s soul.”<sup>94</sup> Careful to point out the gentility of the political movement, Clark also claimed: “It was an army not covered with the dust and gore of battle, but one of womanhood, arrayed in her gentlest virtues.”<sup>95</sup> *The Washington Herald* also observed: “Under an auspicious heaven, with their draperies fluttered and tossed by warm breezes, a springtide sun playing upon the

---

<sup>93</sup> “Woman’s Appeal,” *The Evening Star* 3 Mar. 1913: 6.

<sup>94</sup> Genevieve Champ Clark, “Parade as Seen by Miss Clark,” *The Washington Herald* 4 Mar 1913: 2.

<sup>95</sup> *Ibid.* 2.

brilliant tints and hues of their costumes, a chosen band of suffragists formed one of the most beautiful dramatic pictures ever seen on the stage, or in the open, in Washington to review the wonderful pageant given yesterday by the women of the nation.”<sup>96</sup> These spectators saw the pageant as a portrayal of a “woman’s soul,” assumed to be universal to all the white women on display in *Allegory* that afternoon.

The performers’ costumes also forced spectators to confront the differences between True Womanhood and the New Woman. The sight of women in loose robes and bare feet was reported with titillation. Coverage from the New York *Tribune* made note that as the first performer took the stage, a man in the audience said aloud: “Well, if that’s woman suffrage, it’s mighty good to look at.” The reporter from the *Tribune* went on to make special note of each performer’s costume, including what the principal characters wore on their feet. When Justice entered the “crowd didn’t pay much attention to that group. They all had shoes on—high, white shoes—and the crowd was reserving its enthusiasm for the bare tootsie-wootsies it had seen advertised.”<sup>97</sup> When Florence Fleming Noyes appeared as Liberty, the reporter noted: “. . .the cold winds nipped the little pink bare toes of Miss Florence Fleming Noyes, who did ‘Liberty’ in the lowest-necked, flame-colored gown you ever saw—sans shoes, sans stockings, almost sans everything, but with sandals that were nothing but soles that didn’t show, and a strap.”<sup>98</sup> Although the pageant costumes violated the more conservative rules for middle class female dress of the time, the way the “cold winds nipped the little pink bare toes” still

---

<sup>96</sup> “Women Appear in Tableaux” 9.

<sup>97</sup> “Women Battle Hostile Mobs in Capital Parade” 1.

<sup>98</sup> *Ibid.*

implied women were delicate and needed protection. They might be advocating for greater legal independence, but the reviewer implied that he or she was not fooled: women were still the weaker sex.

While still not wanting to seem aggressive, NAWSA openly embraced other aspects of the New Woman. Other fashion and lifestyle freedoms for the New Woman were promoted in the parade program. A half page ad from the American Security and Trust Company offered bank accounts for women because “every intelligent woman should appreciate the value of understanding business methods and the importance of having a bank account.”<sup>99</sup> An ad opposite promoted Madame DuFour’s Massage Cream and Face Powder, recommended to readers by Julia Marlowe, a Broadway actress admired for her portrayals of Shakespeare’s heroines, who claimed “There are none better.”<sup>100</sup> From a present-day perspective, at first glance these advertisements might seem contrary to one another: while the bank offered a woman financial freedom if she could afford it, the program simultaneously promoted superficial beauty through a celebrity endorsement. Both financial security and the use of make-up, however, were aspects of the New Woman and evidence of the ties she cut with True Womanhood. It was only since 1900 that laws protecting the property rights of married women had passed in each state; for women to have full control over and access to her personal

---

<sup>99</sup> “Official Program, Woman Suffrage Procession,” Rauner Special Collections Library.

<sup>100</sup> Ibid. For Julia Marlowe’s career, see Forrest Izard, *Heroines of the Modern Stage* (New York: Sturgis & Walton Company, 1915) 313.

finances was new to the nation.<sup>101</sup> Additionally, True Womanhood looked on cosmetics as vulgar; the New Woman embraced her beauty and enjoyed its enhancement.

NAWSA may have been standing between two definitions of womanhood, but the parade program made clear that racially speaking, there was no doubt that the women of NAWSA were white. To make their case, the parade program outlined their pro-suffrage argument in ways that clearly defined the NAWSA membership as a homogenous group of white, native born citizens. An anonymously written essay in the suffrage parade program titled “Why Women Want to Vote” claimed: “If this thing called the ballot is good for our brothers, why is it not good for us? We are born of the same parents, educated in the same schools, taxed at the same rate, governed by the same laws. Why should our voice not be heard in the State?”<sup>102</sup> In support of suffrage for white women, the writer uses “same” to assume a common parentage, a common ancestry, in a way that implies whiteness as the common denominator.

The essay’s insinuation of “same-ness” is used to further define what it means to be “white” by singling out recent immigrants as unfit for citizenship. A list of reasons why women should be given the vote also appeared in the essay: “Because it would increase the proportion of native-born voters. There are one hundred and twenty-nine men of foreign birth in the United States to every one hundred women.”<sup>103</sup> This rhetoric assumed NAWSA suffragists were “native” whites, and implied their presence in the electorate would counteract that of the recent European male immigrants who were

---

<sup>101</sup> Joan Hoff, *Law, Gender, and Injustice: A Legal History of U.S. Women* (New York: New York University Press, 1991) 121.

<sup>102</sup> “Official Program, Woman Suffrage Procession,” Rauner Special Collections Library.

<sup>103</sup> *Ibid.*

already enfranchised. It was assumed white women would vote with white men, thereby increasing the white male voting bloc, presumably unified against recent immigrants.

This rhetorical turn illuminates a key issue embedded in NAWSA's politics, which would later appear in *Allegory*: the anxieties about the recent influx of European immigrants and what that meant "white" now looked like.

Women of color were notoriously excluded from NAWSA's parade and pageant. Paul was holding together a tenuous alliance among many regional organizations all expecting to march in the parade. Southern white groups refused to take part if African American women were permitted to participate; NAWSA leadership divided over how to reconcile group unity with their commitment to woman suffrage, with some saying African American groups should take part, and others insisting their inclusion would cost too much to the group's overall solidarity. When Ida B. Wells-Barnett, anti-lynching campaigner and the co-founder of the first African American suffrage group, the Alpha Suffrage Club, requested a place in the parade, she was told her group could march at the end of the parade or not at all. Barnett's refusal to accept that decision and her subsequent choice to join the parade with the other white marchers remains an iconic moment in the history of suffrage movement—when its conflicts and shortcomings were made plain.<sup>104</sup>

### **Tea parties and "ladylikeness": NAWSA in 1913**

The program's advertisements demonstrated NAWSA's affiliation with aspects of the New Woman, but the program's content revealed the complicated rhetoric NAWSA

---

<sup>104</sup> Paula J. Giddings, *Ida: A Sword Among Lions* (New York: Amistad, 2008) 513-518.

used to argue the case for enfranchisement. By 1913, their campaign was mired in political strategy. By the end of the nineteenth century, the push for woman suffrage in the United States had stalled.<sup>105</sup> Throughout the late nineteenth and into the early twentieth century, leaders in the women's rights movement were at odds over the best political strategy for getting the vote. Two basic schools of thought had emerged: one argued the simplest means would be through a national campaign aimed at an amendment to the constitution, the other insisted lobbying individual state legislatures to hold their own state referenda would be more effective. Under the guidance of president Anna Howard Shaw, NAWSA's leadership throughout the 1910s was focused on lobbying for individual referenda in each state. Between the years 1896 and 1910, however, only six state referenda were held; three of these in Oregon. All six referenda failed. The federal amendment lay idle in committee; it had not been debated on the floor of the Senate since 1887.<sup>106</sup>

In contrast to NAWSA's gains, a national anti-suffrage movement gained traction. By 1900 six states established anti-suffrage organizations, and the National Association Opposed to Woman Suffrage formed in 1911.<sup>107</sup> Suffrage leader Harriot Stanton Blatch famously noted the woman suffrage movement was in a "rut of 'tea parties and innocuous ladylikeness.'"<sup>108</sup> Blatch found "good behavior" detrimental to woman suffrage; NAWSA's parade and pageant were ways to gain visibility and momentum sufficient to propel the movement out of that rut.

---

<sup>105</sup> Sidney Roderick Bland, "Techniques of Persuasion: The National Woman's Party and Woman Suffrage, 1913-1919," diss., George Washington University, 1972, 6.

<sup>106</sup> Flexner and Fitzpatrick 241.

<sup>107</sup> Goddard 41.

<sup>108</sup> Bland 26.

As NAWSA struggled to find new momentum, a Quaker named Alice Paul was in England observing and participating in the suffrage movement there. The British suffrage movement was known for its aggressive tactics: the Women's Social and Political Union (WSPU), led by Emmeline Pankhurst, found great efficacy in "provoking violent police reprisals" to their events and tactics.<sup>109</sup> Paul saw the value in the attention-grabbing spectacles of parades and demonstrations, and when she returned to the United States she was dismayed to see NAWSA making slow progress with its focus on a state by state lobby. Paul applied for and received permission from NAWSA to lead its Congressional Committee, which would focus on a federal amendment.<sup>110</sup>

As she led the NAWSA's Congressional Union she began to incorporate a greater attention to parades and pageants as a part of her political strategy. Linda G. Ford defines this "feminist militancy" as "the readiness to resist governmental authorities and break the law for the cause of women's rights."<sup>111</sup> Although considered an inflammatory influence on the suffrage movement, NAWSA, and later National Woman's Party in particular, Paul's tactics never approached the violence and destruction of property undertaken by the WSPU.<sup>112</sup> While Ford's definition fits Paul's later efforts at picketing the White House after she had broken from NAWSA, Paul's work as leader of the Congressional Union remained within legal limits.

Paul unveiled her new strategy with a suffrage parade and pageant planned for March 3, 1913, the day before president-elect Woodrow Wilson's inauguration. Her

---

<sup>109</sup> Flexner and Fitzpatrick 244.

<sup>110</sup> Linda G. Ford, "Alice Paul and the Triumph of Militancy," *One Woman, One Vote: Rediscovering the Woman Suffrage Movement*, ed. Marjorie Spruill Wheeler (Troutdale: NewSage Press, 1995) 277-278.

<sup>111</sup> Ford 279.

<sup>112</sup> Goddard 185.

decision to organize a parade in support of suffrage was not entirely new to the movement: Harriot Stanton Blatch began using parades as a part of the U.S. suffrage movement as early as 1910.<sup>113</sup> Due to Paul's choice of date, however, this event was sure to receive a great deal of media attention. Indeed, newspapers in Boston, Washington, D.C., and New York closely covered the events leading up to the parade, which was organized to demonstrate public support for the Congressional Union's agenda and to show support for an amendment to the Constitution giving women the right to vote.<sup>114</sup> Although Paul's ideas were publicly criticized by the NAWSA president Anna Howard Shaw, it didn't stop Paul from going forward with her plans; nor did it prevent Shaw from taking her place among the marchers in the parade.<sup>115</sup>

### **“Firing” a Community Spirit: Hazel MacKaye and the beginnings of *Allegory***

To augment the events of the suffrage parade, Alice Paul hired Hazel MacKaye, a young theatre actress and director, to devise a pageant in support of woman suffrage. Hazel MacKaye came from a Cambridge, Massachusetts family with deep theatrical roots. She was born the youngest of five children to dramatist Steele MacKaye and his wife Mary in 1888, who named their daughter after the heroine of Steele's play *Hazel Kirke*.<sup>116</sup> Hazel's older brother Percy was a widely respected pageant writer and director. She began her career as an actress in two of Percy's works: “The Masque of Ours,” in

---

<sup>113</sup> Bland 28.

<sup>114</sup> “Official program, Woman Suffrage Procession,” Rauner Special Collections Library.

<sup>115</sup> Bland 50.

<sup>116</sup> “A Pageant of Women at Woodrow Wilson's Inauguration,” *Boston Sunday Post* 25 Jan. 1913, sec. 2: 3.

1905, and “Gloucester Pageant,” in 1909.<sup>117</sup> Her first aspirations were for a career on the stage, but after a few small parts in various college productions and a summer touring troupe, Hazel’s interest faded. While a student at Radcliffe under the tutelage of George Pierce Baker, the Harvard drama teacher, pageant director, and mentor to her brother Percy, Hazel found a new interest in directing. At the suggestion of her friend, the playwright Constance D’Arcy Mackay, she applied for and won a position as assistant to the pageant master for *Darkness and Light*, to be performed in Boston.<sup>118</sup>

Throughout her early pageant work, MacKaye became convinced of pageantry’s ability to create community. Although she had enjoyed her first early performances in her brother Percy’s masques and pageants, it was while working on *Darkness and Light* that MacKaye came to find a deep respect for pageantry, about which she told a newspaper:

“It is the bringing of people together, to serve their community in a common cause; the firing of them with the community spirit—the spirit of sharing, of cooperation, the doing of things together because they should be done together. It is the spirit which is needed in this country today more than ever before; it makes for the solidity of the nation and the peace of the world.”<sup>119</sup>

MacKaye’s deep belief in the educational and political value of pageantry had only just begun. *Darkness and Light* was also an opportunity for MacKaye to acknowledge her burgeoning feminism: much of her work for the pageant involved orchestrating the chaos

---

<sup>117</sup> Hazel MacKaye, “Pioneering in Pageantry” (Papers of MacKaye Family; ML-5; Rauner Special Collections Library, Dartmouth College, Hanover, NH).

<sup>118</sup> Ibid.

<sup>119</sup> “‘All the World’s a Stage’: From Poetry to Fact,” *Boston Evening Transcript* 18 July 1917: 5.

of 1800 performers backstage, an experience MacKaye later wrote about in her unpublished memoir, “Pioneering in Pageantry”:

Being young, I was not averse to the wonder I caused among the people to see a woman in the position of stage manager. In particular, I took a pleasurable pride in convincing the professional stage hands whom we engaged to shift the scenery etc and who were frankly skeptical of a woman’s being able to handle ‘back stage,’ that I knew my business. I feel sure that this experience helped to strengthen my already growing feminist tendencies, for I wanted to prove that a stage manager’s job had nothing to do with sex—it was whether or not an individual was fitted for the task.<sup>120</sup>

Although *Darkness and Light* was not itself addressing the women’s rights movement, MacKaye learned about expectations for women working in the field. It was not long before MacKaye’s pageant work was turned more overtly towards the politics of women’s rights: her next major job was as director for *Allegory*. MacKaye was hired to create *Allegory* as an early trial to see how Paul’s plan for increasing NAWSA’s visibility through spectacle would fare.

While Paul was convinced of a parade’s importance for its value as attention-grabbing spectacle, Hazel MacKaye believed pageantry itself could serve as another form of democracy. After her initial success in *Darkness and Light*, and continuing after her work with *Allegory*, MacKaye earned a reputation as a director and writer of pageants. MacKaye supplemented that work with lectures and articles espousing the benefits of her

---

<sup>120</sup> Hazel MacKaye, “Pioneering in Pageantry,” Rauner Special Collections Library.

community drama. As MacKaye's work towards promoting pageantry as a new art form increased, she honed her argument around the idea that pageantry was the most democratic of aesthetics:

“Pageantry is only the logical outcome of all modern tendencies in life—of the present social evolution going on about us. Slowly but surely, inch by inch, true democracy is growing out of the tangled political weeds of the past. The plain citizen is coming to the front. His rights are gradually being established. With this dawning of democracy has come a new demand for self-expression. Not for a favored few but for all. Hence the re-birth of pageantry in its new form—the beginning of the drama of democracy—the drama of the people by the people and for the people.”<sup>121</sup>

For MacKaye, the key to pageantry was its cast of amateur, or nonprofessional, players. These performers in turn gave voice to ‘the people’: the citizens of the community being represented. The possibility that pageantry could give voice to local citizens meant the genre was more democratic than others. Although MacKaye intended her pageants to stand as experiments in an exemplary democracy, NAWSA's complex politics of exclusion are apparent throughout the pageant.<sup>122</sup> In shaping the pageant to (literally) stage an argument for woman suffrage, the *kind* of woman for whom *Allegory* lobbied was made evident.

---

<sup>121</sup> Hazel MacKaye, “Pageantry—Drama of the People by the People for the People” (Papers of MacKaye Family; ML-5; Rauner Special Collections Library, Dartmouth College, NH).

<sup>122</sup> Nothing in my research has unearthed where MacKaye herself stood on the issues of women of color and immigrants being included or excluded in NAWSA's campaigns.

### **Bare Feet and Bold Demands: NAWSA on March 3, 1913**

Although *Allegory* was publicized as the performance event of the day, the parade also engaged in quite a bit of pageantry. The parade was divided into six sections. Jane Walker Burleson, a suffragist from Texas, lead the way as Grand Marshal.<sup>123</sup> Nationally famous suffragist Inez Milholland rode down Pennsylvania Avenue on a white horse, wearing a white suit and boots underneath a light blue cloak, as the “herald” of the march.<sup>124</sup> Following these leaders rode a wagon with a sign reading “We Demand an Amendment to the United States Constitution Enfranchising the Women of the Country.”<sup>125</sup> The floats following the leadership in the initial section represented, first, those countries where women were already enfranchised: Norway, Finland, New Zealand, and Australia. Those were followed by floats honoring countries where women had partial suffrage: Sweden, Denmark, and Iceland. Last came floats representing those countries actively working for woman suffrage: Turkey, Persia, Italy, Switzerland, Holland, Germany, and China.<sup>126</sup>

The floats in the second section, “The Seventy-Five Years’ Struggle for Freedom or Justice Conquering Prejudice,” were arranged to tell a story of the women’s rights movement in the United States from 1840 to 1913.<sup>127</sup> The third section of the parade included floats representing the various professions in which women already had a presence. Floats with titles such as “In Patriotic Service,” and “In the Home,” were each

---

<sup>123</sup> Jane Walker Burleson is listed in the parade program and in all press coverage as Mrs. Richard Coke Burleson.

<sup>124</sup> “5,000 Women March For Suffrage Cause” 5.

<sup>125</sup> Ibid.

<sup>126</sup> “Official Program, Woman Suffrage Procession,” Rauner Special Collections Library.

<sup>127</sup> “5,000 Women March For Suffrage Cause” 5, and “Official Program, Woman Suffrage Procession,” Rauner Special Collections Library.

followed by women working as farmers, homemakers, nurses, educators, lawyers, doctors, government workers, and homemakers, dressed in the uniform or clothes appropriate to their line of work.<sup>128</sup> The fourth section represented women in government and business, as well as teachers, social workers, librarians, writers, artists, actresses, and musicians.<sup>129</sup> Marchers supporting woman suffrage without being attached to a specific profession walked in the fifth section. The sixth and final section of the parade was for state delegations; those states already affording women full suffrage marched first: Wyoming, Colorado, Utah, Idaho, Washington, California, Arizona, Kansas, and Oregon. These were followed by the delegations from states working towards woman suffrage, with delegations from the remaining states at the end.<sup>130</sup> Elsewhere among these sections two women carried a banner which read, “This space represents four million working women who cannot be here for lack of time and means.”<sup>131</sup> This banner was a gesture rare in the parade and pageant: a conscious acknowledgment of working-class women.

The parade fought its way through the mobbed street towards the south steps of the National Treasury Building, where the pageant would take place. Chosen because of its design as homage to ancient Greek architecture, the façade at the entrance to the National Treasury Building facing Pennsylvania Avenue boasted ten white Ionic columns, each 36 feet high.<sup>132</sup> The entrance was separated from the street below by a

---

<sup>128</sup> “Official Program, Woman Suffrage Procession,” Rauner Special Collections Library.

<sup>129</sup> Ibid.

<sup>130</sup> “5,000 Women March For Suffrage Cause” 5.

<sup>131</sup> Clark 2.

<sup>132</sup> “Fact Sheets: Treasury Building,” 27 May 2009 <<http://www.treas.gov/education/fact-sheets/building/history.shtml>>.

large white marble staircase, interrupted half way down by a fifty foot square landing.<sup>133</sup> The band accompanying the pageant was arranged on the street at the foot of the staircase, and a grandstand was constructed on the opposite side of the street; patrons willing to pay five dollars could sit and watch away from the crowds.<sup>134</sup> The remaining spectators without seats packed the street between the stands and the band.

Although the pageant and parade coordinators laboriously organized the logistics for their events, mob violence threw their careful plans up in the air. Both the pageant and the parade were planned to begin at three o'clock sharp. The pageant ran forty-five minutes, with the expectation that as it ended the marchers would by then be walking through the street in front of the Treasury Building.<sup>135</sup> The pageant performers expected to complete their performance, then descend the steps and join the parade. Unbeknownst to them, however, the parade was getting off to a late start and encountering significant obstacles; *Allegory* began precisely on time. The band at the foot of the Treasury Building steps called the audience to attention as it broke into "The Star Spangled Banner." The first performer emerged from behind the pillars and descended the steps to the landing.<sup>136</sup> Wearing a helmet and fitted breast plate over a floor length white skirt, Columbia walked toward the crowd carrying a staff with an eagle at its top. A cape was attached to her armor at each shoulder. The top of the cape was blue, but as the actress

---

<sup>133</sup> "Women Battle Hostile Mobs in Capital Parade" 1.

<sup>134</sup> "Official Program, Woman Suffrage Procession," Rauner Special Collections Library.

<sup>135</sup> "Women Battle Hostile Mobs in Capital Parade" 1.

<sup>136</sup> "Women Appear in Tableaux" 9. Although reviews for *Allegory* note the presence of a band at the steps, there is no information as to its size or number and type of instruments used. My descriptions of the music accompanying the pageant are based on contemporary recordings of the pieces. Therefore, my descriptions focus on the mood the music evokes and how it fits the particular vignette it accompanies, rather than a more technical description of the music, which would necessitate more information about the instruments played during the pageant.

lifted her arms, the wind of the chilly morning blew the cape back to reveal the red and white stripes of the cape's underside.<sup>137</sup>

### **Claiming Whiteness Through Ancient Greece: Columbia on stage in *Allegory***

In popular culture circa 1910, Columbia symbolized the nation in feminine form. Columbia, a feminine version of Columbus, the “discoverer” of America, emerged as a symbolic body representing the United States as early as the 1770s. Although the western world most frequently used a Native American woman to symbolize North and South America between 1765 and 1783, after the Revolutionary War her image on everything from maps to medals and coins began to change into a Greek goddess. The feathered headdress, bow and arrow, and “swarthy complexion” of the “Indian Princess” over time took the form of a white woman wearing an olive wreath in her hair, carrying a shield in her arms.<sup>138</sup>

The move away from the Native American symbolic figure towards the Greek goddess also coincided with a larger trend towards classicism in United States culture beginning in the 1780s. Although Columbia was not the only female figure used to represent the nation during these years, she remained one of the most popular, and over

---

<sup>137</sup> “Women Battle Hostile Mobs in Capital Parade” 1. Pictures of Columbia have been, for some time, mislabeled and mistakenly cite Florence Fleming Noyes in her performance as Liberty. Once examined closely, however, the pictures are clearly Hedwig Reicher as Columbia: the actress's facial features are clearly not those of Noyes; further, and more compelling, the descriptions of Columbia's costume by reviewers match the woman in the picture, not the costume of the actress playing Liberty, which was a much simpler red tunic.

<sup>138</sup> E. McClung Fleming, “From Indian Princess to Greek Goddess: The American Image, 1783-1815,” *Winterthur Portfolio* 3 (1967): 38. See also Martha Banta, *Imaging American Women: Idea and Ideals in Cultural History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1987) 112. Banta reminds readers that one of the most enduring images of Columbia is the Statue of Liberty, and notes the attendant irony: while that Columbia welcomed and encouraged immigration, other iterations of her image were used to exclude foreign born women from being considered American.

time was attached to various virtues, including peace, justice, and plenty.<sup>139</sup> As one reviewer noted of Columbia's costume in *Allegory*, she "wore the national colors and the crown of stars as it appears on the coins of the country."<sup>140</sup> For Columbia to appear in *Allegory*, with her costume of the national colors, staff, and headdress, made her recognizable to the crowd as a symbol of the United States as a nation.<sup>141</sup> If an audience member did not immediately recognize Columbia from the national currency, she was still draped in the national colors and descended the stairs of the Treasury Building to "The Star Spangled Banner": the connection of Columbia to a symbolic form of "America" could still be made.

The actress playing Columbia may have been recognizable to the crowd, as well, if not by sight then perhaps by name and reputation. Hedwig Reicher, a stage actress, appeared as Columbia in *Allegory*. Although listed in the program as a New Yorker, she was born in Germany; at least one review mentioned the irony of choosing a native European for the role.<sup>142</sup> Reicher had been acting in New York at least since 1908, when she appeared in German language plays at the New German Theatre.<sup>143</sup> She left the company to appear in English language plays on Broadway by 1909, and worked there steadily through 1916.<sup>144</sup> She later appeared in several feature films throughout the 1920s and 30s as Hedwiga Reicher, her birth name.

---

<sup>139</sup> Fleming 66.

<sup>140</sup> Clark 2.

<sup>141</sup> "Women Appear in Tableaux" 9.

<sup>142</sup> "5,000 Women March for Suffrage Cause" 5.

<sup>143</sup> "The New German Theatre," *New York Times* 27 Sept. 1908: X2.

<sup>144</sup> "Hedwig Reicher, Who Turns to a Play in English," *New York Times* 28 Feb. 1909: X9.

Reicher was not the first choice for the role. The Boston Sunday *Post* reported in January of 1913 the American opera star Lillian Nordica was “expected” to play Columbia. The *Post* claimed each of the virtues depicted in *Allegory* would be played by “some famous actress;” in addition to Nordica, stage actress Maud Skinner was also mentioned as a potential cast member.<sup>145</sup> Completing the cast for *Allegory* was a drawn out process: the names of the cast members weren’t available in time to be printed in the official program for the parade; instead, a separate single page with the names of the “principals” was handed out along Pennsylvania Avenue the day of the performance.<sup>146</sup> Just two days before the pageant, *Allegory* choreographer Florence Fleming Noyes referenced Nordica as the performer playing Columbia.<sup>147</sup> In fact, the confusion over who appeared in the pageant spread to those reporting on it: more than one review misreported the names of those appearing on the Treasury Building steps that afternoon.<sup>148</sup>

Reicher as Columbia descended to the landing on the stairs of the Treasury Building and began summoning forth her attendants: Justice, Charity, Liberty, Peace, and Hope. Each appeared one by one, followed by her own group of attendants, performing choreography meant to evoke their respective moral virtues. All were dressed in Grecian tunics of different shades, meant to symbolize the jewels in Columbia’s crown: the “best” women of the nation, including the suffragists the audience saw before them that day, possessed these virtues. *Allegory* implied this was how an American woman performed

---

<sup>145</sup> “A Pageant of Women at Woodrow Wilson’s Inauguration” 3.

<sup>146</sup> “*Allegory* program” (Papers of MacKaye Family; ML-5; Rauner Special Collections Library, Dartmouth College, NH).

<sup>147</sup> “Inauguration Pageant,” *New York Tribune* 2 Mar. 1913: 8.

<sup>148</sup> Neither “Women Battle Hostile Mobs in Capital Parade” nor “Women Appear in Tableaux” reported the names of the actresses correctly.

the role of woman patriot, through the deployment of these qualities.<sup>149</sup> MacKaye, and by extension, NAWSA, envisioned the suffragist as a bastion of all things proper, moral, and upright. A New Woman couched in the trappings of True Womanhood.

The choice of setting and costume to evoke ancient Greek civilization was deliberate. *Allegory*'s premiere coincided with a larger trend in a return to classicism: the early twentieth century brought a renewed interest in ancient Greek culture among the U.S. middle class, as it was believed to be the foundation of western civilization. The perception of ancient Greek culture as the antecedent to modern culture was a product of recent historiographical strategies. According to Martin Bernal in *Black Athena*, historians in the early nineteenth century interested in narratives of racial progress created the "Aryan Model" of ancient Greek history, which emphasized western European influences on Greece's formation at the expense of any other non-white influences, particularly Egyptian.<sup>150</sup> The interest in maintaining the "white" roots of ancient Greece was prevalent in the United States throughout the 1920s.<sup>151</sup>

MacKaye's and Noyes's attempt to associate their pageant with ancient Greece through the selection of the National Treasury building as the site of performance did not

---

<sup>149</sup> "Women Appear in Tableaux" 9.

<sup>150</sup> Martin Bernal, *Black Athena: The Afroasiatic Roots of Classical Civilization*, vol. 1 (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1987) 31. Bernal's work in *Black Athena* sparked critical debate upon its publication. In "Did Egypt Shape the Glory that was Greece?" John E. Coleman specifically addresses Bernal's evidence for and naming of the "Aryan Model" of ancient Greek history. While Coleman takes issue with the extent to which racisms shaped these histories, he does not refute Bernal's claim that racism may have been a factor in determining the originations of ancient Greece during the early twentieth century in the United States. Mary R. Lefkowitz and Guy MacLean Rogers, eds., *Black Athena Revisited* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1996) 288-291.

<sup>151</sup> Bernal, *Black Athena* 31. The beginning of the western world's renewed interest in Greek art and history is often traced back to the work of 18<sup>th</sup> century German art historian Johann Joachim Winckelmann. See Elfriede Heyer and Roger C. Norton, introduction, *Reflections on the Imitation of Greek Works in Painting and Sculpture*, by Johann Joachim Winckelmann (La Salle: Open Court, 1987); Alex Potts, *Flesh and the Ideal: Winckelmann and the Origins of Art History* (New Haven, London: Yale University Press, 1994).

go unnoticed; according to *The Washington Herald*: “The broad steps and Greek porticos and façade of the Treasury made a wonderful stage for such a scene. The background of the huge pillars and temple took one back thousands of years to scenes in ancient Greece.”<sup>152</sup> The “Greek” setting aided in the presentation of “Greek” culture.

Channeling ancient Greek culture through *Allegory* was complicated by Progressive Era politics regarding immigration. *Allegory* did not include recent Greek immigrants, but instead, claimed that country’s more distant history as property of white America. This is made clearer when set in the context of Progressive Era immigration. The way in which NAWSA, through the essay in the parade program, made obvious its official stance that “native born” voters were preferable to immigrants indicates that the women for whom NAWSA lobbied were not just white, but “native born” white—the “best” degree of whiteness.

The attitude towards immigrants revealed in the program’s essay, “Why Women Want to Vote,” further complicates MacKaye and Noyes’s relationship to Greek culture as displayed in *Allegory*: they were not interested in *contemporary* Greek culture as an expression of virtuous citizenship. They were instead invested in the romanticized ancient Greece of western civilization. The recent Greek immigrants to the United States would not have been considered white, but ancient Greek civilization *was* considered white by those involved in constructing the pageant. Although ancient Greek culture was associated with the highest accomplishments in the arts and democracy, contemporary Greek culture was looked down upon as something else entirely. The Dillingham

---

<sup>152</sup> Clark 2.

Commission's Report on Immigration from 1911, titled *Dictionary of Races or Peoples* claims: "The ancient Greeks were preeminent in philosophy and science, a position not generally accredited to the modern Greeks as a race."<sup>153</sup> Contemporary Greek culture was looked at by many in the United States as being far less than its ancient history. In its performance of *Allegory*, perhaps MacKaye and Noyes felt it then belonged more to them as white stewards of the ancient Greek tradition than to the "not white enough" recent immigrants from Greece. Recreating elements of ancient Greece in *Allegory* was another way of making that argument visible to an audience. Assumptions about morality, class, and race were so collapsed onto one another that *Allegory*'s symbolism was able to claim morality through an association with their presentation of a white ancient Greece, which implied the white women suffragists were somehow in touch with that civilization's intellect and artistry, and therefore deserving a greater consideration in the United States.

Although *Allegory* took pains to model its artistry on elements of ancient Greece, it was not the only European culture lauded through the pageant. A German immigrant played the role of Columbia, even if she was not the first choice for the part; classical music from European composers was featured throughout the pageant. The arts and governments of older countries across the Atlantic were much admired by Progressive Era reformers who looked to European cultures as inspiration for their proposed reforms.<sup>154</sup> The older traditions in these countries were given the most attention, similar to the way ancient Greek was given preference over that country's more recent history.

---

<sup>153</sup> Jacobson 79.

<sup>154</sup> Eldon J. Eisenach, *The Lost Promise of Progressivism* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1994) 225; May 15.

Although a recent immigrant, Reicher's status as a middle class artist from a culture admired by the American middle class perhaps justified her presence in the pageant. While two patriotic songs were used to open and conclude the pageant, the accompaniment used for each of the moral virtues who took the stage that afternoon came from a range of European composers: German, Italian, and Czech. All of the musical selections used, which will be discussed below, were well known classical pieces; their status as renowned classical music from the European middle and upper classes legitimated its inclusion.

By creating a performance which relied on a moral and sentimental notion of citizenship, MacKaye was attempting to take the politics out of their demand: theirs was not an angry demonstration on behalf of a minority group, but a suggestion for how to improve their nation. *Allegory* relied heavily on nostalgia for a culture of the past, however misogynistic that culture might have been, because its aesthetic and moral appeal side-stepped an argument about the specific politics of enfranchisement, in favor of an argument resting on a vague emotional sense of what was good and right. *Allegory* associated itself with ancient Greece as the birthplace of democracy, rather than touching on that culture's specific exclusion of women as citizens. Although untrue, it is still configured in the performance as a simpler, prettier, more peaceful society, and one that the women of the performance hold as a model towards which to strive.

### **Delsartean Movement in *Allegory*: Justice, Charity, and Liberty**

The first virtue to join Columbia on the landing was Justice, dressed in purple. Trailing Justice came two children, a boy and girl, representing Love. They were

followed by Justice's additional attendants who each carried scrolls, which when shown to the audience, were seen to read "Justice demands equal suffrage."<sup>155</sup> Justice's accompaniment was the "Pilgrim's Chorus" from Richard Wagner's *Tannhäuser*.<sup>156</sup> The song, from the beginning of the opera's third act, depicts a joyful homecoming. The music begins in quiet, muted tones, but quickly builds in strength and volume to high notes followed by quickly descending scales, before soaring up again to another high note. The song concludes as it began, with a quietness that follows easily into the next musical selection.

The young girl representing Love carried a basket of roses with her, and littered the ground with petals in preparation for the appearance of the next virtue summoned by Columbia: Charity. Her tunic was blue, and her attendants were all dressed in a version of her costume. Charity approached to the sounds of George Handel's "Largo."<sup>157</sup> The first aria from Handel's opera *Xerxes*, "Largo" was shorthand for the actual song title "*Obra ma fù*." In English the title translates to "Never has there been a shade," and is sung by the title character in the first act as an offering of gratitude for the shade under a tree. The nickname "Largo" comes from the song's tempo, which is slow and measured. The simple, sustained notes of the music, created primarily through stringed instruments, evoke a peaceful scene for Charity's dance.

---

<sup>155</sup> "Women Appear in Tableaux" 9.

<sup>156</sup> Several of the songs used in *Allegory* were written with lyrics, among them "The Star Spangled Banner," "Pilgrim's Chorus," "Largo," "Elsa's Dream," and "America." Although several accounts of *Allegory* mention the band playing music, none mention a chorus singing the words. My analysis here is based on the assumption that the lyrics of these songs were not heard, only the orchestrations.

<sup>157</sup> "Women Appear in Tableaux" 9.

The gentle serenity of Charity's vignette was quickly disrupted with the opening notes of the "Triumphal March" from Giuseppe Verdi's opera *Aida*, which ushered Liberty from the columns down to the marble landing.<sup>158</sup> Although not radically different in tempo, this piece was written for brass and horn instruments; in contrast to the high, sweet notes of "Largo," the "Triumphal March" is bold. The song repeats several phrases continually throughout the three minute song. This repetition creates a feeling of solidity and reliability, a reassurance through continuity that becomes a subtle proclamation for forward motion. This feeling is enhanced through the song's closing moments, when a staccato horn note is repeated throughout the last ten seconds, pushing the piece to its close.

The boldness of the music was reflected in the vignette's choreography. Liberty, dressed in a dark red tunic, was performed by Florence Fleming Noyes, *Allegory's* choreographer.<sup>159</sup> Two days before the pageant's performance, the New York *Tribune* interviewed Noyes and viewed a rehearsal of Liberty's dance; the article provides the most specific descriptions of the pageant's choreography. Noyes noted her vignette's shift in tone: "The figures who precede me will be the stately ones. They will approach in solemn procession. But when Columbia summons me the musicians will at once swing into the Triumphal March from 'Aida,' and I will leap forward with great, free limbed steps, like this."<sup>160</sup> Noyes then performed her choreography for the *Tribune* journalist who claimed once the music began, Noyes "sprang forward with the easy vitality and

---

<sup>158</sup> "Women Appear in Tableaux" 9.

<sup>159</sup> Clark 2.

<sup>160</sup> "Inauguration Pageant" 8.

forceful grace of a panther. In three or four leaps she had covered the length of her big studio, her red veil fluttering, her head thrown back and a smile of flushed victory in her face. Movement like that, said an authority on dancing of Miss Noyes, ‘has a curious way of making one’s heart leap with excitement, for it seems to have in it some of the ecstasy of a flying thing.’”<sup>161</sup> This quality of movement Noyes devised for Liberty stemmed from her understanding of that virtue as “‘strong and glad; she is confident, and has the whole use of herself. The bodily freedom I will emphasize—the freedom of limb and muscle.’” The connection Noyes makes between the interior emotion of the virtue portrayed on stage with a corresponding exterior quality of movement—in this case the connection between Liberty’s confidence with her “freedom of limb and muscle”—was characteristic of Noyes’s choreography for *Allegory*.

Thorough descriptions of the movement used in *Allegory* are difficult to piece together; little visual documentation remains of the event, and reviews focus more on the pageant’s overall aesthetic appeal and the costume choices than on a specific description of the choreography. The extant photograph of Columbia shows the actress standing at the bottom of the stairs of the Treasury building. She holds her staff straight out from her body, and looks out at the crowd. Long tassels extend from the cape’s collar, down over the front of her costume. She appears majestic, poised, looking out at her audience. Behind her are a number of women in plain, white tunics with empire waists.<sup>162</sup>

---

<sup>161</sup> Ibid.

<sup>162</sup> This photograph is readily available on-line: [http://www.hellowashingtondc.com/Images/People/8142006Florence\\_F\\_Noyes\\_1913.jpg](http://www.hellowashingtondc.com/Images/People/8142006Florence_F_Noyes_1913.jpg), and is often mistakenly labeled as a picture of Florence Fleming Noyes portraying Liberty.

A lithograph of *Allegory*, taken from a pamphlet Noyes wrote on rhythmic expression, depicts Peace's entrance later in the pageant. Standing in front of the columns of the Treasury building, the actress appears to wear a loose fitting white dress with an empire waist and a white cape. Her arms are extended into the air; she looks up, past her outstretched hands, at the dove she has just released. Shafts of light stream from the top right corner of the lithograph over the dove and the woman's form, painting a truly serene picture of the moment.

A second lithograph from the same Noyes pamphlet shows an unspecified moment of *Allegory*, in which a group of eight or nine women stand grouped together, all wearing similarly shaped loose fitting dresses with empire waists. Each woman grasps a large piece of flowing fabric in her hands, arms extended overhead, holding a corner of the fabric in each hand, so the material is held aloft by the breeze. A group of children stands to the side, observing them.<sup>163</sup> Although these still images are helpful in terms of the style of dress and the scope of the production, they tell us little about movement—how the actresses expressed their characters physically, what kind of gestural vocabulary was used, and how the different virtues moved together. A consideration of the technique Noyes used in her choreography, which her *Tribune* interview gestures towards, can illuminate some lingering questions about what *Allegory* may have looked like.

As a product of its historical moment, *Allegory* relied heavily on a performance of feminine beauty; this was enhanced by the pageant's choreography. Physical beauty and grace were, in terms of the stereotypes invoked during the Progressive Era, unique to

---

<sup>163</sup> "The Revived Art of Rhythmic Expression," (Papers of MacKaye Family; ML-5; Rauner Special Collections Library, Dartmouth College, Hanover, NH).

middle and upper class white women. Portraying the virtues in the pageant as physically stunning white women was necessary to *Allegory*'s argument as a piece of NAWSA's complex politics. *Allegory*'s performance of beauty drew from a newly popular system of calisthenics created by Francois Delsarte, who developed his system of movement in France. Hazel MacKaye's father, Steele, worked closely with Delsarte and is largely credited with promoting that system of movement in the United States.<sup>164</sup> Although it began as a system of teaching elocution, it was gradually extended to incorporate physical training exercises in an effort to attain a more complete form of 'expression.' Throughout the 1880s and 1890s, the Delsarte system of expression grew popular, particularly with women's club groups, and others began to promote the style of movement which emphasized internal and external harmony as a means of communicating the dancer's internal life to an outside world.

Delsartean performance showcased the white female body in ways unconventional for the time. In addition to Steel MacKaye, Genevieve Stebbins was a well known enthusiast for the Delsarte system; she developed the form into a non-verbal dance performance that could either stand on its own, or move a dramatic narrative forward.<sup>165</sup> The Progressive Era saw the rise of women in leadership positions in the United States; the field of Delsartean movement offered a unique opportunity to female dancers.<sup>166</sup> Stebbins was at the forefront of this trend, and developed the form as a non-verbal dance, which primarily used women in all levels of its production. In "Antique

---

<sup>164</sup> Nancy Lee Chalfa Ruyter, "Antique Longings: Genevieve Stebbins and American Delsartean Performance," *Corporealities: Dancing Knowledge, Culture and Power*, ed. Susan Leigh Foster (New York; London: Routledge, 1996) 71.

<sup>165</sup> Ruyter 74.

<sup>166</sup> Tomko ix-x.

Longings: Genevieve Stebbins and American Delsartean performance,” scholar Nancy Lee Chalfa Ruyter argues this expression was entirely of the body, speech was not used, and most usually performed on the bodies of white, middle class, urban women. To perform the open, freeing movement of the Delsarte technique, female performers often wore costumes modeled after Isadora Duncan’s Grecian tunics. Duncan introduced a free, unrestrained form of dance that centered on having great range of movement from the body’s core. In part to accentuate and facilitate that range of motion, Duncan performed in loose fitting, flowing Grecian tunics, without corset or shoes.<sup>167</sup> Duncan, like the women performing in *Allegory*, was criticized for her “revealing” choice of garment.

The Delsarte system thus offered both greater agency and closer scrutiny for the women on stage engaging in this method of performance. A woman’s body on such public display was already challenging conventional norms, but, as Ruyter points out, “Both teachers and students engaged in what was for them a new, and perhaps daring, repertoire of physical and expressive activities which did not, however, transgress the traditional bounds of gentility and propriety.”<sup>168</sup> For women to be on stage in the tunics traditional to the Delsarte technique, the kind also used in *Allegory*, departed from “respectable” dress for women during the Progressive Era. It allowed a much greater range of movement for the dancers, but also, as further evidenced in *Allegory*’s reception, led to fixations on the exposed female forms. As Ruyter notes, these tensions were also present in how Delsartean movement both offered agency to women by staking out access to public places, but granted access to that space through conformation to the

---

<sup>167</sup> Ibid. 31.

<sup>168</sup> Ruyter 72.

gender role of True Womanhood with its promotion of the female body as an expression of the grace, gentility, and morality. This tension was present in *Allegory*, too: although lobbying for woman suffrage, the form used to make the argument relied on more conservative expressions of a woman's role in society.

The Delsarte system also relied on a 'Law of Correspondence': a belief that outer movement reflected inner balance. In other words, physical beauty reflected inner harmony.<sup>169</sup> In creating her work, Stebbins looked to ancient Greek culture for artistic inspiration. She insisted that, "The Beautiful and the True in human nature...has been expressed in its highest degree by the immortal artists of Greece. They discovered, in all its perfection, the intimate relation of the laws of expression to art."<sup>170</sup> Stebbins also relies on assumptions of universal values—Beauty and Truth—and assumes a common "human nature." Ancient Greek culture is the touchstone and avenue to those qualities, and can be found through the Delsarte movement system. Beauty and Truth were attainable through an emulation of Greek art, and the evolving system of Delsartean performance was one method for transcending both the physical and historical and accessing the consciousness of ancient times. The generalizing usage of Beauty and Truth fit easily into the homogenized identity for "woman" created through the pageant: woman was not only virtuous, through incorporating the Delsarte technique in *Allegory*, woman's Beauty and Truth was used to further foreground her whiteness.

The potential for transcendence was possible because the suffragists' performing bodies in *Allegory* were read as middle class and white. Dance scholar Linda Tomko

---

<sup>169</sup> Ibid. 77.

<sup>170</sup> Ibid. 76.

observes in *Dancing Class: Gender, Ethnicity, and Social Divides in American Dance, 1890-1920* that it was middle and upper class women who could afford the leisure time necessary to devote to Stebbins's teachings.<sup>171</sup> The leisure time and extra money needed for devoted dance training excluded working class women. Additionally, the ability for the *Allegory* performers to "transcend" their material circumstances implies their bodies were "unmarked," as Peggy Phelan and Richard Dyer describe in their work on whiteness. The women of *Allegory* are able to "escape" their bodies and access another culture because both their class status and whiteness were rendered invisible through performance, and therefore able to be left behind. The very possibility of their transcendence further delineates their class and racial privilege.

The "Law of Correspondence" also had racialized implications. According to Harryette Mullen, the myth of America rests not only on the myth white superiority, but of white purity, also: "Racism reifies whiteness to the extent that it is known or presumed to be unmixed with blackness. Pure whiteness is imagined as something that is both external and internal."<sup>172</sup> As white women, finding a way to physically personify all that was good within them can also be read as an attempt to demonstrate their whiteness, as well. Their moral attributes linked them to a racial designation. The performance of external and internal here is not only related to morality, but also solidifies the connection between morality and whiteness. They are laying bare their "interior" lives: not just as moral women, but also as "pure" white women.

---

<sup>171</sup> Tomko 19-20.

<sup>172</sup> Harryette Mullen, "Optic White: Blackness and the Production of Whiteness," *Diacritics* 24 (1994): 80.

*Allegory* evoked a Progressive Era understanding of ancient Greece not just through costume and scenery, but also through choreography. MacKaye's choreographer for *Allegory*, Frances Fleming Noyes, was well versed in Delsartean movement. After learning Delsarte's technique while a student at Emerson College, she began teaching her own classes on the subject. For Noyes, however, the focus of her work on the subject was rhythm.<sup>173</sup> For Noyes, rhythm was "Strong, yet exquisitely fluid. Rhythm—that one great central force around which everything moves, ever changing—like flowers growing."<sup>174</sup> Rhythm encompassed a life force, an internal sense of self that could be expressed through fluid movement. Noyes also combined her sense of Delsartean technique with inspiration from ancient Greece. In a pamphlet she wrote to expand on the merits of her technique titled "The Revived Art of Rhythmic Expression," Noyes wrote about the ways her work connected to what the ancient Greeks called "Orchesis": "This was the art through which the great Greek choruses expressed the universal emotions that swayed them in the drama, and it was the art which enabled the individual performer to make the body an instrument for the presentation of an emotion as truly as the singer in his poem or the sculptor in his marble."<sup>175</sup> Noyes's interest in this form of expression was meant "to apply the principles of the Greek Orchesis to modern needs, to cultivate a creative art which may express through the rhythm of bodily movements the thought and emotion of today."<sup>176</sup> The very goal of Noyes's version of Delsartean movement was to bridge a

---

<sup>173</sup> Valeria Ladd, introduction, *Rhythm for Dance and Art: The Exact Notes Taken of the Teaching in Action of Florence Fleming Noyes*, by Florence Fleming Noyes (Portland: Noyes School of Rhythm Foundation, Inc., 1982) ix.

<sup>174</sup> Ibid. 100.

<sup>175</sup> "The Revived Art of Rhythmic Expression," Rauner Special Collections Library.

<sup>176</sup> Ibid.

connection between ancient Greece and the contemporary Progressive Era, a further explanation for *Allegory*'s reliance on that focus.

It is impossible to say exactly how these ideas were employed specifically in *Allegory*, but because these movement forms have been written about so extensively, it is possible to construct how these ideas informed *Allegory*'s creation. Descriptions of Delsarte's and Noyes's technique imply that the quality of movement would have been sustained and fluid. Delsarte's system engaged a highly coded style of gesture. Because he believed certain emotions resided in specific areas of the body, communicating ideas often meant using a body part to suggest the emotion attached to it. For instance, because Delsarte believed the arms and legs were sources of great power, it is perhaps not a coincidence that all three images from the pageant depict women with outstretched arms—the extension of the arm straight out from the body, although at different levels, could be Noyes's attempt to indicate a strength of power important to the cause she was supporting through the piece.<sup>177</sup> The descriptions of Noyes's choreography for Liberty, above, resonate here, too: the emotional qualities of confidence and freedom Noyes associated with Liberty were extended through how Noyes constructed Liberty's movement, with quick, graceful leaps. Liberty's self assurance, in accordance with the Law of Correspondence, made itself known through her movement: the interior emotion matched its exterior movement.

Noyes's attempt to "claim" Greek culture as the fount of "eternal" and "universal" emotion is also indebted to the historical trend in belief that ancient Greece was, in fact,

---

<sup>177</sup> Genevieve Stebbins, *Delsarte System of Expression* (New York: Edgar S. Werner Publishing & Supply Co., 1902) 118.

the product of white influence. For Noyes and MacKaye, their white, middle-class, female performers could access these emotions and virtues across the centuries because ancient Greeks were claimed as the ancestors of white, middle class culture during the Progressive Era. The white middle class was therefore descended from ancient Greek civilization; thus they could share an intimate knowledge transmitted bodily from woman to woman throughout the ages. It was precisely because of their middle class whiteness that the white women of *Allegory* were able to assume a connection to the “universal” feelings of their “ancestors.”

### **Peace and Hope on Stage, Whiteness on Display**

The next vignette’s tone changed again as Peace, dressed all in white, carefully followed Liberty to the steps of the Treasury Building. The vigor of Liberty’s music and movement were replaced with the staid music of the overture from another Wagner opera, *Lohengrin*. The confident marching song from *Aida* shifted to sustained, somber notes that although at times built to crescendo, never lost their slow, measured tempo. Amidst this tranquility, Peace moved to the top of steps, followed by two children, a boy and girl each holding flower baskets.<sup>178</sup> They were followed by attendants carrying olive branches and horns of plenty. Once at the head of the stairs, Peace slowly brought a dove from behind her back, and released it into the air. The above mentioned lithograph of this vignette is possibly from this moment of the performance: as Peace extends her arms up into the air, the dove was set free. Genevieve Clark, a suffragist marching in the parade

---

<sup>178</sup> “Women Appear in Tableaux” 9.

who also covered the event for the Washington *Herald*, claimed the dove “flew straight to the White House”<sup>179</sup> (although it may have been flying to the parade leader on the Capitol grounds).<sup>180</sup>

Last to appear was Hope, “timidly peering” at the audience from behind the pillars, before descending the steps.<sup>181</sup> She wore a “variegated” robe, “which gave a transparent effect.”<sup>182</sup> Hope was followed by a group of children holding balloons of different colors, meant to be “bubbles of hope.” The children’s presence on stage also reinforced the suffragists’ abilities as mothers and caretakers. The performers’ movements were choreographed to three songs: “Elsa’s Dream,” another song from Wagner’s *Lohengrin*; Czech composer Antonín Dvořák’s “Humoresque;”<sup>183</sup> and Felix Mendelssohn’s “Spring Song.” “Elsa’s Dream” is similar in quality to the other opera pieces used throughout *Allegory*: string instruments in somber, quiet, sustained notes created a placid mood. The next two music selections were quite different in tone from their predecessor: both “Humoresque” and “Spring Song” were written for the piano. After the fuller orchestrations of the previous music used throughout the pageant, Hope’s

---

<sup>179</sup> Clark 2.

<sup>180</sup> “Women Appear in Tableaux” 9. Clark was a suffragist and daughter of Representative James Beauchap “Champ” Clark of Missouri, who served as Speaker of the House of Representatives from 1911 to 1919. Congressman Clark would not publicly announce his support of woman suffrage until the summer of 1914. “Clark Declares for Suffrage; But Marshal Intimates to Delegation That His Wife Won’t Let Him,” *New York Times* 28 June 1914: 10.

<sup>181</sup> “Inauguration Pageant” 8.

<sup>182</sup> Clark 2.

<sup>183</sup> The suffrage parade program and Noyes’s interview in “Inauguration Pageant” both identify Dvořák’s “Humoresque” as the music for Hope’s vignette. However, Dvořák’s entire 101<sup>st</sup> opus is made up of eight “Humoresques,” and neither source specifies which movement was used in *Allegory*. Upon further research, Dvořák’s “Humoresque No. 7,” in G flat major, was by far the most popular of these. This piece was inspired by minstrel performance, which Dvořák saw on a trip to the United States in the 1890s. My description of the music for Peace’s vignette assumes that MacKaye and Noyes were in fact using “Humoresque No. 7” for the performance. Joseph Horowitz, *Dvořák in America: In Search of the New World* (Chicago: Cricket Books, 2003) 134.

vignette concluded with two pieces that were quieter, but faster. The quicker tempos and tinkling melodies created a much lighter feeling to *Allegory*'s mood as Hope's vignette concluded.

By then Columbia was surrounded by her full retinue: Justice, Love, Charity, Liberty, and Hope. They held their tableaux as the band concluded *Allegory* by playing "America;" at that moment Columbia was supposed to lead her virtues and all the amassed attendants and children down to the street and into the parade, which was expected to be moving past the Treasury Building. The violence along the parade route, however, had created significant delays. After holding the final tableaux for a few minutes, with no marchers in sight, the performers retreated back up the stairs to stand inside until the parade reached the Treasury Building.<sup>184</sup> A sad metaphor for times to come: suffragists would have to wait seven more years for enfranchisement.

By presenting themselves as morality made flesh, the performers could show an audience the morally correct attitude towards the politics represented by the parade. They could also display Columbia, a figure of the nation, accepting the virtues of women and modeling the nation's "correct" response to the parade and the cause of woman suffrage. She portrayed the suffragists hoped for reaction from the crowd. They created Columbia to model a new kind of citizenship, at once modeling reception and quelling fears that their parade was in any way threatening for contemporary gender roles.

With Columbia surrounded by Hope, Plenty, Justice, and Peace, she viewed the coming parade with approval: she modeled for spectators a vision of a new nation,

---

<sup>184</sup> "Women Battle Hostile Mobs in Capital Parade" 1.

surrounded by “good” morals, embracing woman suffrage. *Allegory* preyed upon spectators’ understandings of good morality to claim those morals for the nation, and then implicate them in the approval of the women’s rights movement. From the performance’s point of view, it was the moral choice to give women the right to vote.

Although *Allegory* did not use a traditional narrative to tell its story, the use of allegorical images invoked a rhetorical strategy. The women performing in *Allegory* used their whiteness to achieve various forms of transcendence—to escape their own physical forms and portray abstract virtues, and to access ancient Greek (but marked as “white”) culture. Dyer notes this ability for white people to become unstitched from their bodies: “Black people can be reduced (in white culture) to their bodies and thus to race, but white people are something else that is realized in and yet is not reducible to the corporeal or racial.”<sup>185</sup> Through the very fact of their perceived whiteness, the women of *Allegory* are permitted to transcend their historical moment to access another.

Middle class white women were afforded mobility in a number of ways: not just in terms of physical and financial access, but also by their perceived racial identity. According to Dyer: “In Western tradition, white is beautiful because it is the color of virtue. This remarkable equation relates to a particular definition of goodness. All lists of the moral connotations of white as symbol in Western culture are the same: purity, spirituality, transcendence, cleanliness, virtue, simplicity, chastity.”<sup>186</sup> Whiteness simply was their claim to virtue and beauty. Noyes and MacKaye were benefiting from the assumption that whiteness was, in fact, unmarked for them. It was a privilege for them to

---

<sup>185</sup> Dyer 14.

<sup>186</sup> Ibid. 72.

be able to shed their individual personalities and create this beauty reliant on “universal and eternal” emotions.<sup>187</sup> *Allegory* was, in the end, a moment for suffragists to demand their cause be taken seriously by asking an audience not to see them at all.

In her 2001 dissertation, “Something to Vote For: Theatricalism in the U.S. Women’s Suffrage Movement,” Leslie Goddard conducts a semiotic analysis of *Allegory* to better understand the ways in which the suffrage movement garnered support from middle and upper class women through its emphasis on a less radical, virtuous and physically attractive suffragette.<sup>188</sup> Ironic, considering Paul was given her position as the head of the Congressional Union with the understanding that she would focus attention on NAWSA with a fresh emphasis on spectacle and parades, she filtered the radical idea of woman suffrage through a conservative ideal of femininity. According to Goddard, the *Allegory* pageant’s emphasis on traditional notions of feminine virtue served to remind onlookers that “If women already exemplified the ideals of justice, hope, and liberty—and they did, according to years of American civic celebrations and patriotic rituals—then they qualified for literal consideration as citizens on precisely those same grounds.”<sup>189</sup> In making their case for enfranchisement by literally showing an audience their non-threatening moral virtue, they simultaneously made visible the bodies excluded from NAWSA’s campaign.

---

<sup>187</sup> “The Revived Art of Rhythmic Expression,” Rauner Special Collections Library.

<sup>188</sup> Goddard 126.

<sup>189</sup> *Ibid.* 132.

**Chapter Two:**  
**“Looking at One’s Self Through the Eyes of Others’”: Representations of the  
Progressive Era Middle-class in W.E.B. Du Bois’s *The Star of Ethiopia***

Eleanor Curtis, an African American actress, walked onto an outdoor stage constructed on a baseball field before a crowd of 14,000 spectators in Washington, D.C. Her floor-length dress was adorned with a single necklace and sleeves so wide and long they trailed the ground as she walked across the stage. A tiara sat atop her head. On her back she wore wings that peeked out on either side of her body. The wings were rounded, and from the front, gave the impression that this young woman was perhaps wearing a heart on her back. Curtis gripped a paper star in her hand; once on stage, she stood facing the crowd and slowly raised the star above her head. As the title character in W.E.B. Du Bois’s pageant *The Star of Ethiopia*, she embodied the symbolic protector for Africans and African Americans through hundreds of years of world history.

Although he did not attend the March 1913 NAWSA suffrage parade events, African American sociologist and historian W.E.B. Du Bois admired MacKaye’s pageant. In the April 1913 issue of *The Crisis*, the magazine Du Bois edited for the newly formed NAACP, he derided the white male bystanders at the parade for their lewd behavior, and lauded the suffragists for their efforts. He makes no mention of the fact that the African American women involved in the parade, most notably a contingent led by Ida B. Wells-Barnett, were made to march at the back of the procession. Instead, Du Bois writes, presumably in reference to *Allegory*: “...Hail Columbia, Happy Land!”<sup>190</sup> Du Bois, however, had been impressed with the possibilities of pageants long before hearing

---

<sup>190</sup> W.E.B. Du Bois, “Hail Columbia!” Qtd. in David Levering Lewis, ed. *W. E. B. Du Bois: A Reader* (New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1995) 295.

of *Allegory*. In 1913, he too staged a pageant: *The Star of Ethiopia*, an historical narrative of African and African American history spanning several hundred years.

Du Bois first produced *The Star of Ethiopia* in 1913 in an effort to challenge the racist African American histories written during Reconstruction, which portrayed freed blacks as poverty stricken and unwilling to work, while simultaneously singling out African American women as sexually promiscuous and incapable of raising a family. At a time when middle class America was obsessed with classical cultures, Du Bois's pageant demonstrated a classical lineage and challenged Reconstruction histories by connecting African Americans to ancient cultures. Du Bois's goal in writing and staging *The Star of Ethiopia* was, in part, to create a performance that could serve as an alternative to the Reconstruction histories of African Americans written and promoted by "pro south" groups. Du Bois felt *The Star of Ethiopia* could change the historical narrative assigned to African Americans in the United States, and by extension, embody a new cultural memory of African American history. In attempting this, Du Bois's pageant expressed a complicated relationship to notions of the Progressive Era middle class, as Du Bois sought to portray African Americans simultaneously as having descended from ancient civilizations and having worked diligently to attain a place in the American work force. In a similar rhetorical turn to *Allegory*'s connection with ancient Greece, *The Star of Ethiopia* portrayed African Americans as the descendants of ancient Egyptian and African cultures as a way to confer status and respect on contemporary African Americans.

Du Bois wrote the first draft of what would later become *The Star of Ethiopia* in 1911 and presented it to the officers of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP) as a suggestion for a fundraiser. Du Bois's colleagues at the NAACP were not convinced of the pageant's efficacy, however, and the project was temporarily abandoned. Du Bois found a way to resurrect it two years later. 1913 was the fiftieth anniversary of the signing of the Emancipation Proclamation; the anniversary was remembered publicly in the United States through special issues of journals, public speeches, commemorative figurines of civil rights leaders, and public expositions modeled on world's fairs. The state legislatures of New Jersey, Illinois, Pennsylvania, and New York each appropriated funds for large expositions devoted to "black progress."<sup>191</sup> The New York Emancipation Exposition was a ten-day celebration from October 22<sup>nd</sup> to 31<sup>st</sup> in Manhattan at the 12<sup>th</sup> Regiment Armory near 62<sup>nd</sup> Street and Broadway. With a budget of \$25,000, the New York Emancipation Exposition was the largest state exposition.<sup>192</sup> New York Governor William Sulzer appointed Du Bois as one of nine members of the Exposition's organizing committee; Du Bois found in it an opportunity to revisit his pageant.

To commemorate the occasion, *The Star of Ethiopia* staged thousands of years in African and African American history. In doing so, both the original 1913 production and its revival two years later embodied Du Bois's desire for African Americans to enter the middle class in the United States as a part of his vision of a "talented tenth." Although

---

<sup>191</sup> David W. Blight, "Fifty Years of Freedom: The Memory of Emancipation at the Civil War Semicentennial, 1911-15," *Slavery & Abolition: A Journal of Slave and Post-Slave Studies* 21.2 (2000) 129-130.

<sup>192</sup> "A National Emancipation Exposition," *The Crisis* 6.4 (Aug. 1913): 181.

meant to inspire and educate, the pageant also functioned as a disciplinary tool, able to instruct and encourage its audience in recreating and embodying middle class values. Through *The Star of Ethiopia* Du Bois sought to encourage his audience towards middle class status; as the pageant went through major revisions its focus sharpened on the role of African American women and their ability to nurture and sacrifice so that more African Americans might reach a higher socio-economic status. As the script evolved between its first two productions, the sacrifice needed from African American women became key to how African Americans would stake a claim to the middle class. The 1915 production refocused on the title character, a new addition to the pageant, who offered great sacrifices in a struggle to protect and defend the rights of African Americans, inspiring those around her to work harder. Using the first two drafts of the pageant, and the work Du Bois edited for *The Crisis* and published in *The Philadelphia Negro*, this chapter explores how Du Bois promoted a vision of black women that sought to mirror the public image of virtuous and chaste Progressive Era middle class white women in an attempt to create an alternative historical record through *The Star of Ethiopia*.

### **The Talented Tenth and the Anniversary of Emancipation in 1913**

Du Bois's depiction of the middle class in *The Star of Ethiopia* was developed through his own scholarship on the subject. In 1903 Du Bois announced in *The Souls of Black Folk* that "The problem of the twentieth century is the problem of the color-line;" a pronouncement that effectively shaped the trajectory of Du Bois's career and ushered in a

period in his scholarship characterized by his belief in race as a form of culture.<sup>193</sup> For Du Bois, culture for African Americans would be, and should be, led by the best educated. He introduced the idea of the “Talented Tenth” the same year: “it is the problem of developing the Best of this race that they may guide the Mass away from the contamination and death of the Worst, in their own and other races.”<sup>194</sup> The “Best” of the race was an educated elite who would pull “all that are worth saving up to their vantage ground.”<sup>195</sup>

The 1913 production of *The Star of Ethiopia*, titled “The People of Peoples and Their Gifts to Men” was written at the intersection of several major developments in Du Bois’s scholarly and professional lives in the early twentieth century. Du Bois’s vision for the Talented Tenth put him in direct opposition to the philosophies of Booker T. Washington; their feud would become a hallmark of Du Bois’s career that further clarified his beliefs about equality. The two men publicly argued over their beliefs with respect to civil rights. While Du Bois was promoting his ideal of the Talented Tenth, Washington advocated a slower process: a temporary acquiescence would allow African Americans time to amass wealth and education. Their disagreement represented a larger rift in two different schools of thought regarding civil rights in the United States during the Progressive Era. Washington advised African Americans not to worry about

---

<sup>193</sup> Vilashini Cooppan. “Move On Down the Line: Domestic Science, Transnational Politics, and Gendered Allegory in Du Bois,” *Next to the Color Line: Gender, Sexuality, and W.E.B. Du Bois*, eds. Susan Gillman and Alys Eve Weinbaum (1903; Minneapolis, London: University of Minnesota Press, 2007): 36.

<sup>194</sup> W. E. B. Du Bois, “The Talented Tenth,” *The Negro Problem: A Series of Articles by Representative American Negroes of To-day* (New York: Arno Press and the New York Times, 1969) 33. Du Bois was not the first to coin the phrase “Talented Tenth.” It was first used by the American Baptist Home Missionary Society in 1896. Joy James, *Transcending the Talented Tenth: Black Leaders and American Intellectuals* (New York; London: Routledge, 1997): 16.

<sup>195</sup> Du Bois, “The Talented Tenth” 45.

education, but to instead focus on earning money through labor. These ideals were famously expressed in an 1895 speech Washington delivered in Atlanta, in which he likened the races to the fingers of a hand.<sup>196</sup> Washington also preached against violent recriminations, and instead advocated acquiescence. Du Bois, although in agreement that a violent response was not necessary, felt keeping silent about serious grievances would be disastrous. It was during this time that southern states began passing laws to disenfranchise African Americans, and also at this time that “Jim Crow” laws were passed to segregate public spaces and public transportation. Du Bois essentially blamed Washington’s refusal to speak out as assistance in passing the legislation.

1913 was a crucial moment for Du Bois to publicly explore his belief in the Talented Tenth: civil rights were being stripped away at a rapid pace; Du Bois sought to expose the evils of racism through reclaiming African and African American history via pageantry.<sup>197</sup> Du Bois first found opportunities to explore his idea of the Talented Tenth from within the NAACP, then through his pageant work. Du Bois left his teaching position at Atlanta University to join the NAACP in 1910, and took on editorship of *The Crisis*, the organization’s monthly magazine. Du Bois continued his research outside of academia. It is unclear as to how Du Bois first became interested in pageantry as an art form. He did not have the family interest and involvement of Hazel MacKaye—whereas she came to pageantry through a career in performance, with political and social change agendas developing as a later interest, Du Bois came to pageantry in the opposite order.

---

<sup>196</sup> Painter 217.

<sup>197</sup> Krasner 114.

The political agenda was his first commitment; by 1911 he had become interested in how pageantry might be used to forward his ideas.

After the pageant's debut in 1913 as "The People of Peoples and Their Gifts to Men," Du Bois produced the pageant three more times over the following twelve years: in Washington, D.C. in 1915, Philadelphia in 1916, and Los Angeles in 1925. Although Du Bois himself notes 1913 as the year *The Star of Ethiopia* debuted at the National Emancipation Exposition,<sup>198</sup> the version he premiered there was slightly, but importantly, different from the subsequent productions. Other writings on *Star* imply that the four productions incorporated only minor changes, and thus comparatively little attention has been paid to the script's evolution.<sup>199</sup> Because *The Star of Ethiopia* did, however, employ significant revisions and additions from its first performance in New York to its next major public performance in Washington, D.C., especially with regard to how women were portrayed, it is worth examining those changes in more detail.

Both the theme of the exposition and Du Bois's historical research influenced the creation of "The People of Peoples and Their Gifts to Men." The New York Emancipation Exposition was crafted to tell a "continuous and complete story of fifty years unusual progress among colored Americans."<sup>200</sup> To accomplish this goal, the exposition availed itself of Du Bois's sociological training by including "detailed charts, models, moving pictures, maps and a few typical exhibits."<sup>201</sup> The organizing committee constructed exhibits which emphasized the importance of religion, education, and work

---

<sup>198</sup> W.E.B. Du Bois, "The Star of Ethiopia" *The Crisis* (Dec. 1915): 91.

<sup>199</sup> Krasner 109.

<sup>200</sup> "The Exposition," *The Crisis* 7.2 (Dec. 1913): 84.

<sup>201</sup> "A National Emancipation Exposition" 181.

through an exposition divided into fifteen sections; each of these was devoted to specific professions and industries, education, church, and “women and social uplift.” The exposition also crafted a longer historical lineage for African Americans through an exhibit on “the industries of Africa”: The National Emancipation Exposition celebrated African history as an early precursor to African American history.<sup>202</sup> *The Star of Ethiopia* fit easily into the overall goals for the exposition: the pageant, too, emphasized the connections between African and African American histories. Publicity for the exposition boasted Du Bois’s pageant as its central event.

The inaugural 1913 production of the pageant employed 350 performers in six chronologically ordered episodes, each telling the story of how a different “gift” was given by Africans and African Americans to the world. “The People of Peoples” premiered with a total of four performances between October 22<sup>nd</sup> through 31<sup>st</sup>, 1913.<sup>203</sup> An estimated 14,000 patrons witnessed the performances.<sup>204</sup> Du Bois wrote the script, but collaborated with a number of others: Charles Burroughs served as director; Dora Cole Norman was the choreographer; and Colonel Charles Young composed original music.<sup>205</sup>

Young, an officer in the United States Army, graduated West Point in 1889.<sup>206</sup> In 1894, Young joined the faculty of Wilberforce University in Ohio as a professor of military science and tactics. W.E.B. Du Bois joined the faculty as a classics professor the same year. Young’s family home in Wilberforce became a center of social activity; Du

---

<sup>202</sup> “Three Expositions,” *The Crisis* 6.6 (Oct. 1913): 297.

<sup>203</sup> Ibid. The pageant was performed on October 23<sup>rd</sup>, 25<sup>th</sup>, 28<sup>th</sup>, and 30<sup>th</sup>.

<sup>204</sup> W.E.B. Du Bois, “The Star of Ethiopia,” *The Crisis* 11.2 (Dec. 1915): 91.

<sup>205</sup> “The National Emancipation Exposition,” *The Crisis* 7.1 (Nov. 1913): 339.

<sup>206</sup> David P. Kilroy, *For Race and Country: The Life and Career of Colonel Charles Young* (Westport; London: Praeger, 2003) 19.

Bois was a frequent guest and the two became fast friends. It was also while in Ohio that Young honed his musical talents as a composer.<sup>207</sup> Years later, Du Bois solicited Young to compose the original music for “The People of Peoples.” Young was stationed in Liberia at the time, but used his experiences in Africa as inspiration for his compositions.<sup>208</sup> Charles Burroughs, the director of all four productions of *The Star of Ethiopia*, including “The People of Peoples,” was a pupil of both Young and Du Bois at Wilberforce. A Texan by birth, as an undergraduate at Wilberforce Burroughs aspired to a profession in the theater.<sup>209</sup> Burroughs continued his interest in performance even while serving in the Spanish-American War under Young: he entertained his fellow troops with Shakespearean performance.<sup>210</sup> The choreographer, Dora Cole Norman, became involved in the pageant through a family connection: her brother, Bob Cole, was the famous musical theater composer and a friend of Du Bois.<sup>211</sup> In addition to her work as a choreographer, Dora Cole Norman was also a director and playwright; in 1919 she went on to serve as director of the Colored Players’ Guild, a key group in the Harlem Little Theatre Movement.<sup>212</sup>

The organizing committee of the New York Emancipation Exposition intended “to make this exposition a complete picture of Negro progress and attainment in

---

<sup>207</sup> Ibid. 32-33.

<sup>208</sup> Ibid. 101.

<sup>209</sup> Jeffrey Babcock Perry, *Hubert Harrison: The Voice of Harlem Radicalism, 1883-1918* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2009) 89-91.

<sup>210</sup> Kilroy 43.

<sup>211</sup> Paula Marie Seniors, *Beyond Lift Every Voice and Sing: The Culture of Uplift, Identity, and Politics in Black Musical Theatre* (Columbus: The Ohio State University Press, 2009) 193.

<sup>212</sup> John G. Monroe, “The Harlem Little Theatre Movement, 1920-1929” *The Journal of American Culture* 6.4 (Winter 1983): 64. When it was first formed in 1919, The Colored Players’ Guild was originally named the Players’ Guild of the Circle. By June of 1920 they had changed their name to the Colored Players’ Guild.

America;” “The People of Peoples” narrative structure reflected that concern.<sup>213</sup> The question of “progress” made by African Americans was a heavily discussed topic in 1913. The Emancipation Proclamation’s anniversary sparked much public debate about the state of the civil rights movement in the United States. Although the fifteenth amendment, passed in 1870, stipulated that voting could not be restricted by the citizen’s race, and the Civil Rights Act of 1875 guaranteed equality in “public accommodations,” individual southern states began stripping these rights away less than twenty years later. By 1888 the Mississippi state legislature had passed a series of statutes meant to legalize segregation and in 1890 ratified a new constitution disenfranchising African Americans. Between 1898 and 1918, South Carolina, North Carolina, Alabama, Virginia, Georgia, and Oklahoma followed suit.<sup>214</sup> In 1893 the United States Supreme Court reversed the Civil Rights Act of 1875. 1896 saw *Plessy v. Ferguson*, and its endorsement of “separate but equal.” These rulings essentially granted protection for public segregation and gave rise to mob violence.<sup>215</sup> At least 3,224 individuals were murdered by lynch mobs between 1889 and 1918.<sup>216</sup> As David W. Blight argues in his article “W.E.B. Du Bois and the Struggle for African American Memory:” “Traditional historians’ treatment of the black experience, the civil rights leader argued, ‘was a conscious and deliberate manipulation

---

<sup>213</sup> “A National Emancipation Exposition,” *The Crisis* 6.4 (Aug. 1913): 181.

<sup>214</sup> Davis 112.

<sup>215</sup> Ibid. 116.

<sup>216</sup> Wallace 26.

of history and the *stakes* were high.”<sup>217</sup> “The People of Peoples” was Du Bois’s attempt to intervene.

### **“The People of Peoples and Their Gifts to Men”: The Embodiment of the Talented Tenth**

“The People of Peoples and Their Gifts to Men” perpetuated Progressive Era notions of the middle class through its emphasis on historical genealogies, religious faith, and a significant presence in the American work force. The pageant opened with heralds playing trumpets to call the audience’s attention, then proclaiming:

“Hear ye, hear ye! Men of all the Americas, and listen to the tale of the eldest and strongest of the races of mankind, whose faces be black. Hear ye, hear ye, of the gifts of black men to this world, the Iron Gift and Gift of Faith, the Pain of Humility and the Sorrow Song of Pain, the Gift of Freedom and of Laughter, and the undying Gift of Hope. Men of the world, keep silence and hear ye this!”<sup>218</sup>

This brief proclamation of the gifts that would be offered by Africans and African Americans sums up the action of the entire pageant. Each subsequent episode began with a herald calling the audience to attention, followed by an announcement of which individual gift would be offered in the scene to follow.

The portrayal of the gifts in “The People of Peoples and Their Gifts to Men” maintained the exposition’s commitment to connecting African Americans to African and

---

<sup>217</sup> David W. Blight, “W.E.B. Du Bois and the Struggle for American Historical Memory,” *History and Memory in African American Culture*, eds. Geneviève Fabre and Robert O’Meally (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994) 45.

<sup>218</sup> “The National Emancipation Exposition” 339.

Egyptian histories. The first scene depicted the Gift of Iron: a group of African “savages” is visited by a Veiled Woman; she brings iron and fire to the people of Africa, who then rejoice and dance in celebration. The Emancipation Exposition, and in turn “The People of Peoples,” were also committed to recuperating African histories.

The racisms attached to African American histories during the Progressive Era extended to African historiographies: “Europeans judged the signs of the African past—customs, traditions, social hierarchies—by official or racist attitudes, and often quickly dismissed them. The Negro, more than any other race, had no history, for he had no writing and he had taken no major steps forward.”<sup>219</sup> Part of the ease with which historians dismissed African American culture issued from a belief that the continent from which they came was of little cultural significance. As so much historical interest was placed on ancient civilizations at the time, as discussed in the previous chapter, by denying any claim to an ancient civilization, African American history was presented as inferior.

Before turning to pageantry, Du Bois tried to intervene in several ways. Du Bois published and wrote his own histories of African and African American cultures to refute the racist post-Reconstruction studies. In March of 1911, Du Bois edited “African Civilization,” an article in *The Crisis* written by M.D. Maclean, a staff writer for *The New York Times*. In his article, Maclean wrote: “As time goes on, however, and more and more evidence of a very ancient development appears in Africa, scientists have come to the conclusion that Africa played a very important part in the first stages of the world’s

---

<sup>219</sup> Barker 241.

history.” Maclean further posits the evidence that “the black man, not the white, was the first to discover the art of working metals and gave this knowledge, which was the first great step forward in civilization, to Europe and nearer Asia.”<sup>220</sup> The image of black men discovering metal working was featured prominently in “The People of Peoples,” and would remain so in the 1915 *The Star of Ethiopia*; Du Bois culled from these revisions of African American history the images he would later infuse throughout his pageant.

How African histories were articulated and taught in the fifty years since emancipation was a vital issue to Du Bois. By 1915, much of African and African American history had been dropped from primary and secondary education in the United States; much of what was available was in line with the racist historiography of the day.<sup>221</sup> Once the Civil War ended in 1865, another fight began over how to characterize the events of that conflict. Both “pro Union” and “pro South” histories were being written and published at a rapid pace. “Pro Union” histories made claims that “southerners were semi-barbarous people who had conspired to destroy the Union in order to perpetuate slavery,”<sup>222</sup> while pro-South histories insisted that “fanatics and fools” such as John Brown, William Lloyd Garrison and Abraham Lincoln had “inspired the North to participate in an immoral and imperialistic conspiracy” motivated by jealousy of “the planters’ ‘superior refinement of scholarship and manners.’”<sup>223</sup> Additionally, the pro-South histories made assertions about the peaceful nature of slave culture. William L.

---

<sup>220</sup> M.D. Maclean, “African Civilization,” *The Crisis* 1.5 (Mar. 1911): 23-24.

<sup>221</sup> John K. Thornton, introduction, *The Negro*, by W.E.B. Du Bois, The Oxford W.E.B. Du Bois, ed. Henry Louis Gates, Jr. (Cambridge: Oxford University Press, 2007) xxvi.

<sup>222</sup> William L. Van Deburg, *Slavery & Race in American Popular Culture* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1984) 71.

<sup>223</sup> *Ibid.* 72.

Van Deburg points out in *Slavery and Race in American Popular Culture* that Civil War histories written in the early twentieth century described plantation life as a “tranquil” time when “bondsmen” were fed and clothed by white southerners who “loved” them.<sup>224</sup> Although there were historians who argued against this naïve view of slavery, the “proslavery” histories were pervasive: “...proslavery theorists described the diverse benefits of slavery for blacks and whites alike. Their rhetoric dominated the postwar generations. It bolstered well southern propaganda against federal control in the region. And it propped up the racial settlement upon which the New South movement rested.”<sup>225</sup> The proslavery sentiment structured not only the myriad Civil War histories published in the decades immediately after the war, but in turn structured political and cultural policies.

In the second scene of “The People of Peoples,” the Gift of Civilization is given to the valley of the Nile. According to Du Bois “This picture tells how the meeting of Negro and Semite in ancient days made the civilization of Egypt the first in the world.” In this scene, one hundred “savages” are greeted by fifty veiled Egyptians, who, when they remove the veils, are seen to be “Negroes and mulattoes clothed in the splendor of the Egyptian Court.” To the spectacle is added representations of the Sphinx, Pyramid, the Obelisk, and the throne of the Pharaoh.

The interior of the 12<sup>th</sup> Armory was decorated throughout with sets and scenery reminiscent of ancient Egypt: in the center of the room stood a replica of an ancient

---

<sup>224</sup> Van Deburg 68-69. See also John David Smith, *An Old Creed for the New South: Proslavery Ideology and Historiography, 1865-1918* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1985) 41-42.

<sup>225</sup> John David Smith 7.

temple; the individual exhibits in the exposition hall were built inside of “tomb-like booths” meant to evoke Memphis and Thebes.<sup>226</sup> These booths, like the one titled “The Temple of Beauty,” were replicas of Egyptian tombs; the exterior of The Temple of Beauty was decorated with pictures of Egyptian gods and the entrance was marked with two obelisks.<sup>227</sup> It is unclear whether “The People of Peoples” used its own Egyptian temples and obelisks for performance, or whether they used the architecture of the exhibition as their backdrop. As the savages and Egyptians watch, joined by the Queen of Sheba and Candace of Ethiopia, Ra, an African, is crowned Priest and King. Gradually, throughout the end of the scene, Egyptian culture dies, and the savages fall to the ground as the episode concludes.

The pageant also emphasized the importance of religion to African cultures: the gift of faith was offered next, meant to show “how the Negro race spread the faith of Mohammed over half the world and built a new culture thereon.”<sup>228</sup> The savages, no longer sleeping, leap to their feet and begin to fight Mohammed and his followers; the fight ends when the savages are converted and begin to shout, along with Mohammed’s followers, “God is God! God is God! There is no God but God, and Mohammed is his prophet!”<sup>229</sup> These early efforts to reclaim and reshape African history also appear in Du Bois’s 1915 book *The Negro*, in which Du Bois charts the history of Africa and its various subcultures from 4700 B.C.E. through the end of the nineteenth century. Part of Du Bois’s project in *The Negro* is a culmination of his attempts to re-historicize African

---

<sup>226</sup> “Negroes Open Exposition” 16.

<sup>227</sup> “The National Emancipation Exposition in New York City: The Temple of Beauty in the Great Court of Freedom,” *The Crisis* 7.2 (Dec. 1913): 78.

<sup>228</sup> “The National Emancipation Exposition” 340.

<sup>229</sup> *Ibid.*

culture as a complex and ancient civilization. Looking at Du Bois's work in *The Crisis* and *The Negro* provides a helpful dramaturgical perspective into the plot of the pageant. "The People of Peoples" and *The Star of Ethiopia* draws plot devices and characters from both "African Civilization" and *The Negro*; the latter, in particular, provides a helpful dramaturgical perspective into the symbolic imagery embedded in the pageant. *The Negro* and *The Star of Ethiopia* can be read as companion pieces, and as an example of the ways in which performance can inform the creation of scholarship, and vice versa.

Much of the historical narrative appearing in *The Negro* also surfaces in "The People of Peoples" and later in *The Star of Ethiopia*. For the purposes of his research, Du Bois divided Africa into several major areas: the Nile, the Congo, the borders of the Gulf of Guinea, the Sudan, and South Africa.<sup>230</sup> In *The Negro*, Du Bois credits the Nile as one of the earliest civilizations in the world, emphasizes Egypt's African heritage and genealogies, and lays out the early history of the region: "The ethnic history of Northeast Africa would seem, therefore, to have been this: predynastic Egypt was settled by Negroes from Ethiopia."<sup>231</sup> Du Bois also documents the invasion of Egypt by various African groups, particularly from the "unruly Negro tribes of the upper Nile valley."<sup>232</sup> Egypt was saved, Du Bois claims, by a group from Upper Egypt. They founded a new Egyptian empire in 1703, B.C.E., Du Bois claims, and ruled Egypt. Although revered, Egyptian history was marked by squabbles for power, and "finally of religious dispute

---

<sup>230</sup> W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Negro*, The Oxford W.E.B. Du Bois, ed. Henry Louis Gates, Jr. (Cambridge: Oxford University Press, 2007) 11.

<sup>231</sup> Ibid.

<sup>232</sup> Ibid. 13.

and overthrow.”<sup>233</sup> According to Du Bois, meanwhile, Ethiopia was growing in stature in Africa, led by Candace, a revered queen.<sup>234</sup>

The remaining scenes in the pageant connected African history to that of African Americans in slavery and demonstrated how African Americans shaped industrial America through various professional fields. The fourth scene shows the Gift of Humiliation, and how “this race did suffer of Pain, of Death and Slavery and yet of this Humiliation did not die.” The episode showed men being sold into slavery while they sang “Nobody Knows the Trouble I’ve Seen.” In the fifth episode, the audience sees the Gift of Struggle Toward Freedom: several groups—Native American Indians, French, Spanish, Africans, and Haitians struggled for power in North America. After the groups fought amongst themselves, the scene concluded with the arrival of King Cotton; he was followed by the allegorical figures of Greed, Vice, Luxury, and Cruelty. Slaveholders then appeared to assert their power over their slaves, who were shown working in silent despair.

The sixth and final scene showed the gift of Freedom: actors playing the historical figures of John Brown, Abraham Lincoln, Frederick Douglass, and Sojourner Truth entered and pronounced their hopes for the end of slavery. Symbolic figures entered to represent the proliferation of freedom, including “the Laborer, the Artisan, the Servant of Men, the Merchant, the Inventor, the Musician, the Actor, the Teacher, Law, Medicine and Ministry, the All-Mother, formerly the Veiled Woman.” The pageant ended with more music from the heralds, who pronounced “Hear ye, hear ye, men of all the

---

<sup>233</sup> Ibid.

<sup>234</sup> Ibid. 15.

Americas, ye who have listened to the tale of the eldest and strongest of the races of mankind, whose faces be black. Hear ye, hear ye, and forget not the gift of black men to this world—the Iron Gift and Gift of Faith, the Pain of Humility and Sorrow Song of Pain, the Gift of Freedom and Laughter and the undying Gift of Hope. Men of America, break silence, for the play is done.”<sup>235</sup>

At first glance, *The Star of Ethiopia* took a popular performance form largely being used to prop up notions of American “same”ness to invest it with a greater sense of diversity, in color and in belief. However, the pageant concludes with a visual picture of Du Bois’s Talented Tenth: an assemblage of the professional teachers, doctors, lawyers, and others Du Bois imagined would lead African Americans throughout the twentieth century. These professionals are shown to be the descendants of the African and Egyptian royalties of the pageant’s early scenes: these contemporary working professionals are the “best” class of African American citizens Du Bois sought during the Progressive Era. Portraying their ancestors as the ancient royalty of Africa underlines how deserving the professionals are. They are, truly, the elite citizens on whose behalf Du Bois advocated through his scholarly work.

Concluding “The People of Peoples” with an image of the African American middle class on stage would also hopefully dispel other dangerous stereotypes perpetuated through “pro South” histories. Visual representations of African Americans in the early twentieth century in everything from literature and film to children’s toys and the illustrations on food items at the grocery store were reflections of the racial

---

<sup>235</sup> “The National Emancipation Exposition” 339-341.

stereotypes of African Americans as unintelligent, economically disadvantaged, and uninterested in work: “These grotesque, garishly dressed beings, with black skins, protruding red lips and bulging eyeballs, were usually shown in impoverished settings with yard fowl, watermelons, and so on.”<sup>236</sup> The inundation of United States’ culture with images of the stereotype of African Americans became crucial to a sense of what white Americans thought they knew about people of color: “visual culture was fundamental not only to racial classification but also to racial reinscription and the reconstruction of racial knowledge in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.”<sup>237</sup> The racist visual culture of stereotype went hand in hand with racist historiographies to craft a belittling image of African Americans, while simultaneously denigrating the lineage of an entire race. “The People of Peoples” and *The Star of Ethiopia* were part of Du Bois’s ongoing effort to change the narratives of African American history circa 1913 through both written historical narratives of Africa and African Americans, in addition to the visual images associated with their histories.

Although Du Bois was thrilled with the end result and the audience response, the process of producing the pageant was not pleasant. Of the experience he wrote: “Such an avalanche of altogether unmerited and absurd attacks it had never been my fortune to experience.”<sup>238</sup> By the end however, he was convinced of pageantry’s unique ability to affect social change: “And then it came—four exhibitions, singular in their striking beauty, and above all in the grip they took upon men. Literally, thousands besieged our

---

<sup>236</sup> Richard J. Powell, *Black Art and Culture in the 20<sup>th</sup> Century* (New York: Thames & Hudson, 1997) 25.

<sup>237</sup> Shawn Michelle Smith, *Photography on the Color Line: W.E.B. Du Bois, Race, and Visual Culture* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2004) 3.

<sup>238</sup> Du Bois, “The Star of Ethiopia” 91.

doors and the sight of the thing continually made the tears arise. After these audiences aggregating 14,000, I said: the Pageant is the thing. This is what the people want and long for. This is the gown and paraphernalia in which the message of education and reasonable race pride can deck itself.”<sup>239</sup> Du Bois was hereafter convinced of the pageant’s affective possibilities, and was dedicated to performing it again. He would not get the chance for two more years.

When Du Bois’s pageant next appeared in Washington, D.C. in 1915, it featured a new title and central character: the Star of Ethiopia. The new pageant, although clearly rooted in “The People of Peoples,” was significantly different from its 1913 predecessor. Along with the title change, *The Star of Ethiopia* placed a greater emphasis on the role of African American women in shaping and guiding African and African American cultures. Just as “The People of Peoples” reflected Du Bois’s burgeoning scholarly interests in African and African American historiographies, so too did *The Star of Ethiopia*’s emphasis on women reflect work from Du Bois’s scholarly pursuits.

The 1915 pageant was not Du Bois’s first attempt to redress stereotypes of African American women through visual interpretations of African American life. For the 1900 Paris Exhibition Du Bois served as curator for a photography exhibition titled “Exhibit of American Negroes.” The exhibit, like *The Star of Ethiopia*, was meant to address stereotypes of African Americans women through their depiction as “respectful” members of the middle class. This exhibit, like *The Star of Ethiopia* would be thirteen years later, was groundbreaking in its re-envisioning of black culture. It also represented

---

<sup>239</sup> Du Bois, “The Star of Ethiopia,” *The Crisis* 11.2 (Dec.1915): 91.

a complicated intersection of gender and class as applied to black women. A closer look at the exhibit offers an illuminating precedent in Du Bois's work for creating images of African American women meant for a disciplinary purpose.

Not only was Du Bois working to differentiate a group of African Americans from ubiquitous images of poverty and ignorance, he was also setting up a continuum in which African Americans were superior to recent European immigrants. Du Bois's exhibit of 363 photographs was arranged into albums titled *Types of American Negroes, Georgia, U.S.A.* and *Negro Life in Georgia*. According to the exhibit's explanation, it was meant to show "what the negro really is in the South."<sup>240</sup> The photography albums were a part of a larger sociological exhibit Du Bois organized which, much like the New York Emancipation Exposition of 1913, also featured maps of the African American populations in Georgia counties, charts illustrating the "social and economic status of African Americans," and volumes detailing the specific laws pertaining to African Americans in Georgia. The majority of the pictures were portraits. The remainder were "domestic interiors, homes, businesses, churches, rural scenes, street scenes," and group portraits.<sup>241</sup> The photos were primarily of middle class African Americans, shown at home in their parlors or working in their offices, as if, Smith argues, Du Bois were trying to distance the individuals pictured from other representations of African American culture: "In differentiating his vision of the *best* African American families from the *mass* of European immigrants, Du Bois also dissociates them from the majority of African

---

<sup>240</sup> Qtd in Shawn Michelle Smith 3.

<sup>241</sup> Shawn Michelle Smith 4.

Americans.”<sup>242</sup> Du Bois’s work, like MacKaye’s, was also invested in creating a social hierarchy with the recent European immigrants at the bottom.

Photography, too, had been used as a part of the visual campaign aimed at denigrating African American culture, especially through the national and international fairs of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The relatively new art form of photography was, at the time, believed to be almost sociological in its documentation of the “real.” “The photograph represented the product of an unmediated and objective recording process. Particularly in the context of national pavilions, world’s fairs, and colonial expositions, a set of equivalencies was established between live exhibitions, wax models, taxidermy, and photography...the photograph functions as a sociological text, as evidence.”<sup>243</sup> At the end of the nineteenth century, world’s fairs became a place for an important showcase of “American” culture, often through ethnological exhibits meant to display “savages” in native habitats. It was at the World’s Columbian Exposition in 1893 that the stereotype of Aunt Jemima was born, when an African American woman, Nancy Green, cooked pancakes for an audience while telling stories of the south.<sup>244</sup> Through his exhibition in 1900, Du Bois made an early attempt to use his training as a sociologist to connect his argument for a new historiography of African Americans through a revision of the visual culture surrounding African American life. In *Photography on the Color Line: W.E.B. Du Bois, Race, and Visual Culture*, Shawn Michelle Smith argues that the photography exhibit served as a counterarchive that challenges a long legacy of racist

---

<sup>242</sup> Ibid. 98.

<sup>243</sup> Coco Fusco and Brian Wallis, eds., *Only Skin Deep: Changing Visions of the American Self* (New York: International Center of Photography, 2003) 313.

<sup>244</sup> Michael D. Harris, *Colored Pictures: Race and Visual Representation* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2003) 68.

taxonomy, intervening in turn-of-the-century ‘race science’ by offering competing visual evidence.”<sup>245</sup> Smith defines visual culture as “best defined by a common set of questions, rather than a canon of objects or a privileged group of media. Visual culture scholars seek to understand how *viewing* creates *viewers*, how acts of looking are encouraged and circumscribed culturally, and how access to the gaze shapes subjectivity.”<sup>246</sup> Much like notions of reception theories in performance studies and theatre history, Smith posits that Du Bois created this exhibit to change viewers’ reception of African American culture, through a shift in the visual images used as referents to signify black culture.

While a revisualization of African American culture as a part of the American middle class was Du Bois’s goal in general, Smith argues that Du Bois achieved this, in part, through his representation of black women. Shown in middle class dress, with high collars and long skirts, and almost always accompanied by an African American man, created an image, Smith, writes, of a subservient gender balance: “Du Bois founds an African American middle class on gender differentiation and sexual discipline; ultimately, in the Georgia Negro photographs, his claims to racial equality through class stratification are figured through gender hierarchy.”<sup>247</sup> The exhibit was at once an argument for an ascendance to the middle class and a refutation of stereotype.

### ***The Star of Ethiopia* takes shape**

The interest Du Bois cultivated in challenging stereotypes through his sociological photography exhibit continued into his performance work. Du Bois claimed

---

<sup>245</sup> Shawn Michelle Smith 2.

<sup>246</sup> Ibid. 22.

<sup>247</sup> Ibid. 79.

that following the 1915 release of *Birth of a Nation*, a popular silent film valorizing the Ku Klux Klan, he felt a renewed urgency to perform his pageant as a direct rebuttal of that film's racist claims.<sup>248</sup> The pageant was heavily revised in preparation for the revival; the alternations maintained Du Bois's interest in propagating the Talented Tenth, but re-centered the story around the The Star of Ethiopia, a mythical woman whose presence linked scenes spanning thousands of years. Her presence, while refuting American Progressive Era stereotypes of African American women, at the same time reified Progressive Era ideals for women of the middle class. This next section of the chapter will examine these textual revisions, along with the work Du Bois was publishing in *The Crisis*, as evidence of how The Star of Ethiopia came to embody Du Bois's gendered thinking of middle class femininity during the Progressive Era.

Although African American women were included in the denigrating performances and histories of Reconstruction and immediately after, specific stereotypes evolved around black women at the nexus of their gender, race, and class. Throughout slavery, black female sexuality was used in a complex web of domination and submission at the hands of white, male slave owners. This led to the systematic raping of black women, in a way that threatened white women and a sense of white female sexuality and propriety. Deborah Gray White notes in her book *Ar'n't I a Woman?: Female Slaves in the Plantation South* that "American white women were expected to be passive because they were female. But black women had to be submissive because they were black and slaves. This made a difference in the sex roles of black and white women, as well as in

---

<sup>248</sup> W.E.B. Du Bois, "A Pageant," *Pamphlets and Leaflets by W.E.B. Du Bois*, ed. Herbert Aptheker (White Plains: Kraus-Thomson Organization, 1986) 151.

the expectations that their respective societies had of them.”<sup>249</sup> Long after slavery, the stereotype of the sexually available and therefore promiscuous black woman lived on in the form of the Jezebel or Sapphire character, a black woman ruled by her lust for men.<sup>250</sup>

In contrast to the promiscuous Jezebel stood the chaste, helpful, capable martyr of the black female Mammy.<sup>251</sup> Another stereotype with her origins in slavery, this image of black femininity evolved from the black slave women put to work in the plantation house. She was charged with looking after home life, which involved a number of tasks from raising the white owner’s children to overseeing the other house slaves. From this role came the image of black womanhood as strong and endlessly able: a woman who could not only handle everything asked of her, but a woman happy to always be doing for others. Recuperating these contrasting images and expectations for black women resulted in additional stereotype. Michele Wallace in her book *Black Macho and the Myth of the Superwoman* sums up the resulting expectation for black women to be a kind of superwoman:

From the intricate web of mythology which surrounds the black woman, a fundamental image emerges. It is of a woman of inordinate strength, with an ability for tolerating an unusual amount of misery and heavy, distasteful work. This woman does not have the same fears, weaknesses, and insecurities as other women, but believes herself to be and is, in fact, stronger emotionally than most men. Less of a woman in that she is less ‘feminine’ and helpless, she is really

---

<sup>249</sup> Deborah Gray White, *Ar’n’t I a Woman?: Female Slaves in the Plantation South* (New York: Norton, 1985) 17.

<sup>250</sup> White 28-29 and Wallace 106.

<sup>251</sup> White 47 and Wallace 106.

*more* of a woman in that she is the embodiment of Mother Earth, the quintessential mother with infinite sexual, life-giving, and nurturing reserves. In other words, she is superwoman.<sup>252</sup>

This image of the black superwoman was promoted during Reconstruction by those seeking to redress the stereotype of the Jezebel. In doing so, it created another expectation for black women to struggle against.

Although Du Bois claimed that *The Star of Ethiopia* didn't resurface again until its 1915 production in Washington, D.C.,<sup>253</sup> archival documents provide a draft, dated and signed by Du Bois in 1914, titled *The Star of Ethiopia*, written for "the Women's Club of Xenia, Ohio, in honor of the biennial meeting of the National Federation of Colored Women's Clubs at Wilberforce."<sup>254</sup> "The People of Peoples and Their Gifts to Men" as presented in New York in 1913 made no mention of The Star, or of Ethiopia as a character in the drama; she did not appear until this next version from 1914, the first with *The Star of Ethiopia* as its title. Although little is available to indicate how the drafts lead from one to another, the "All-Mother" of the 1913 pageant becomes Ethiopia the Black in the 1914 version. Perhaps in re-writing the pageant for an audience of women, Du Bois rediscovered a new focus for the piece, which, in the 1914 draft, was then anchored by the presence of a female herald. Entering the playing area, the herald announces to the audience that they will witness "a Dream of things that were and Prophecy of things that

---

<sup>252</sup> Wallace 107.

<sup>253</sup> Du Bois, "The Star of Ethiopia" 91.

<sup>254</sup> Du Bois, *The Star of Ethiopia*, draft, W.E.B. Du Bois Papers (MS 395), Special Collections and University Archives, University of Massachusetts Amherst.

are to be.”<sup>255</sup> The herald calls forth “Negro masters of the earliest world, from the vale of Ganges, Tigris-Euphrates and Nile.” Then emerges “Ethiopia the Black, All-Mother, mystic queen of men, bearing on her mighty hands, the Star of Freedom—Freedom divine, long sought for, unattained.” Ethiopia is attacked by “tribes of the unwon West,” who bring with them “Bigotry, Industry, Passion and Greed.” Ethiopia is killed, but the Star is saved. Ethiopia’s soul is returned to her; she arises and reclaims the Star for safe keeping.<sup>256</sup>

In the 1915 draft of *Star of Ethiopia*, first performed in Washington, D.C. on October 11<sup>th</sup>, 13<sup>th</sup>, and 15<sup>th</sup>, Du Bois merged both the 1913 and 1914 versions into a hybrid of the two.<sup>257</sup> In this version, which would remain the basic script for the rest of *Star*’s performances, the story of the star of Ethiopia is told in six scenes. In this draft, the imagery is steeped in the various religious and historical mythologies that characterized the first two drafts, ranging from the African Yoruba faith, to biblical history and Egyptian myth. *The Star of Ethiopia* ultimately incorporated both the mythology of the 1913 pageant with the presence of a central female character: a protective and guiding presence for Africans and African Americans throughout the various episodes of world history shown throughout the pageant.

The three performances were held at the American League Baseball Park in Washington, D.C.<sup>258</sup> This iteration was produced by Du Bois in collaboration with the National Pageant and Dramatic Association in Washington, D.C., and with the help of E.

---

<sup>255</sup> Ibid.

<sup>256</sup> Ibid.

<sup>257</sup> “The Great Pageant,” *The Washington Bee* 23 Oct. 1915: 1.

<sup>258</sup> Errol G. Hill and James V. Hatch, *A History of African American Theatre* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003): 201.

L. Thurston, the Superintendent of Colored Education in Washington.<sup>259</sup> The 1915 production used more performers than the 1913 performance in New York; this one boasted a cast of over 1,000 in addition to a singing chorus of 200. The Colored District Militia was included for use in the battle episodes.<sup>260</sup> Du Bois's primary collaborators were the same, however: Charles Young's music was kept in the pageant; Dora Cole Norman resumed her work as choreographer; Charles Burroughs stepped in again to direct.<sup>261</sup>

Other analyses of *The Star of Ethiopia* note the pageant's attempt to discipline its audience: as Krasner writes "For Du Bois, the invocation of black collective history could be seen in a positive light; it should inspire the black community, in Darwinian terms, to higher stages of development."<sup>262</sup> The 1915 production in Washington, D.C. was received as such a call by the local African American paper, *The Washington Bee*. After praising Du Bois for dramatizing the history of African Americans, the *Bee* wrote, "The success of this Pageant shows conclusively that there is inherent in our race all the innate qualities of the highest civilization and that our only problem is to bring the masses of our people to appreciate entertainments of this class."<sup>263</sup> It was not only *The Star of Ethiopia*'s subject matter that encouraged African Americans to aspire to middle class propriety: pageantry as an artistic form furthered the pageant's alignment with middle class culture. Elsewhere in the review, the *Bee* asks "Shall our men and women of dramatic talent allow low vaudeville and semi-smutty skits to set the taste of our people

---

<sup>259</sup> Ibid. 202.

<sup>260</sup> Ibid.

<sup>261</sup> "The Great Pageant," *The Washington Bee* 23 Oct. 1913: 1.

<sup>262</sup> Krasner 108.

<sup>263</sup> "The Great Pageant" 1.

of amusement?”<sup>264</sup> Vaudeville is understood to be a lesser form of entertainment; pageantry as a form can lift the tastes of audience members. In 1915, vaudeville may have included blackface performance; at the very least, its status as a popular entertainment for mass working-class audiences, regardless of efforts to make the form more “respectable,” was enough to disqualify it as suitable entertainment for discerning spectators.

In the 1915 pageant’s first scene, dated 50,000 B.C.E., African “savages” enter and make a human sacrifice to Shango, the Yoruba god of thunder.<sup>265</sup> Once appeased, Shango appears and summons Ethiopia. Shango bestows upon her the Star of Freedom, and charges her to guard it forever because “the time has now come for her people to advance.”<sup>266</sup> In this first scene, The Star of Ethiopia’s presence inspires Africans to forge the first iron weapons, and under her direction men and women peacefully perform their duties: men go out to hunt, while women and children weave and mold clay.<sup>267</sup> In this opening vignette, The Star of Ethiopia is responsible for teaching and overseeing early African civilization: she offers tools for survival in both the physical world and the social. She teaches gender roles as a survival strategy, to help this early civilization find its structure.

Du Bois used his work throughout the early twentieth century as a platform to articulate his concerns about black women, and eventually create a venue, through his

---

<sup>264</sup> Ibid.

<sup>265</sup> Du Bois, “The Star of Ethiopia,” draft, W.E.B. Du Bois Papers (MS 395), Special Collections and University Archives, University of Massachusetts Amherst.

<sup>266</sup> “The Great Pageant” 1.

<sup>267</sup> Du Bois, “The Star of Ethiopia,” draft, W.E.B. Du Bois Papers (MS 395), Special Collections and University Archives, University of Massachusetts Amherst.

editorial control of *The Crisis*, to offer advice to women on how they, too, could endeavor to look like the women he included in his photography exhibit. Du Bois's vision for the Talented Tenth involved more than just striving for education: the Talented Tenth should also be social role models as well. According to Du Bois "human education is not simply a matter of schools; it is much more a matter of family and group life—the training of one's home, of one's daily companions, of one's social class."<sup>268</sup> Other aspects of Du Bois's sociological work leading up to *The Star of Ethiopia* focused on how African Americans could "learn" to be of a similar social class.

In *The Philadelphia Negro*, Du Bois's 1899 sociological study of the African American community in that city, he cites several dire problems adversely shaping the African American family. Du Bois noted both prostitution and working mothers were serious threats to the African American family group. Low wages for men and high rent prices made it necessary for women to work outside the home, with severe consequences: "This leaves the children without guidance or restraint for the better part of the day—a thing disastrous to manners and morals."<sup>269</sup> Women who engaged in prostitution or common law partnerships outside of marriage, were "ignorant and loose," and were "absolutely without social standing." These women were compared to the "the lowest class of recent immigrants and other unfortunates," with their "sexual promiscuity and the absence of a real home life."<sup>270</sup> Du Bois also expressed concern about issues of hygiene as they related to the health of African Americans: "in habits of personal

---

<sup>268</sup> Du Bois, "Talented Tenth" 61.

<sup>269</sup> Du Bois, *The Philadelphia Negro* 135.

<sup>270</sup> *Ibid.* 134-135.

cleanliness and taking proper food and exercise, the colored people are woefully deficient.”<sup>271</sup> For Du Bois, these issues of sexuality, morality, and cleanliness all converged in the home and had great affect on the African American family. Du Bois often charged women, as the overseers of the home, with the task of correcting these evils. Once *The Crisis* was founded, Du Bois had a venue to offer suggestions for such corrections.

Through *The Crisis*, Du Bois proscribed a role for middle class African American women to work and sacrifice for their families; an idea that would permeate *The Star of Ethiopia*. In its early years especially, Du Bois used the publication to create a space for white women to offer advice to African American women. Patricia Morton argues in her book *Disfigured Images: The Historical Assault on Afro-American Women* argues that, through *The Crisis*, Du Bois “exposed and condemned America’s abuse of black women—economic and sexual, psychological and physical—revealing that not only black men but also black women were victims of the horror of the lynch mob.”<sup>272</sup> While true that Du Bois worked to include articles about discriminations specific to African American women, in the years leading up to the first two productions of *The Star of Ethiopia*, these articles were most often written by white women. Additionally, several of the articles were constructed as advice-giving columns, and created a situation whereby *The Crisis* was used as a platform for white women to offer advice to African American women, in some cases instruction, and in others outright chastisement, on everything

---

<sup>271</sup> Ibid. 115.

<sup>272</sup> Patricia Morton, *Disfigured Images: The Historical Assault on Afro-American Women* (New York: Greenwood Press, 1991) 56.

from hygiene to child care to black women's involvement in the woman suffrage movement.

The *Star of Ethiopia* would become the epitome, and more, of the capable matriarch described in the pages of the magazine. In its first year the magazine featured a regular column titled "Talks About Women," written by Jean Torrey Milholland, mother of the famous suffragist Inez Millholland who marched as herald in the March 3<sup>rd</sup> suffrage parade.<sup>273</sup> Jean Torrey Milholland used her column in a variety of ways. In December of 1910, Milholland chastised African American women for letting their suffrage efforts become insulated from those of the white suffragists: "The colored women have done their share in this march for progress and the betterment of their sex, but, as yet, their efforts seem to have been made principally within their own circle and among their own race. It is time, now, however, that they come forward and help share with their white sisters their responsibilities, and seek to obtain for both recognition as citizens possessed of political rights."<sup>274</sup> Although women such as Ida B. Wells-Barnett and Mary Church Terrell had already begun to publicly express dissatisfaction with the ways African American women were being intentionally excluded from the woman suffrage movement, that dissatisfaction was not expressed in the early years of *The Crisis*.

Although columns such as these ran in the magazine, Du Bois also published articles that conceded the complication of gender and race. In December of 1911, Milholland's "Talks About Women" column was devoted to a speech she heard by the African American women's rights activist Mary Church Terrell at an NAACP event.

---

<sup>273</sup> Milholland's byline in *The Crisis* always appeared as "Mrs. John E. Milholland."

<sup>274</sup> Mrs. John E. Milholland, "Talks About Women" *The Crisis* 1.2 (Dec. 1910): 28.

Milholland reviewed Terrell's speech sympathetically and reported "not only, said Mrs. Terrell, must she struggle with the handicap of color, but only too often she gets no sympathy from the white woman, who should be at least willing to give a helping hand to these colored friends who, like herself, are more or less looking forward to perfect freedom and all which that means for womanhood."<sup>275</sup> In the very same issue, however, appeared an article by Jane Addams of Hull House, in which she insisted that "lack of social tradition" kept African American girls from making "progress," because parents weren't teaching black children "social restraint." Addams then makes a comparison to Italian immigrants, whose parents, Addams claims, guard them more closely because they are "but carrying out social traditions."<sup>276</sup> Her implications that African Americans were without social traditions lingered from the long held presumption, discussed earlier, that African Americans were without a meaningful culture and heritage. While Du Bois permitted her article to appear in *The Crisis*, in other issues he addressed this belief through an effort to recuperate African culture as an important semblance of African American heritage.

Through the second, third, and fourth scenes of the 1915 pageant, *The Star of Ethiopia* must protect the civilization she helped create. The second scene, "The Culture of Egypt," set circa 5,000 B.C.E., opens on ancient Egypt; the Egyptians are attacked by the savages of the previous scene. The episode concluded with a dance by one hundred Egyptian women.<sup>277</sup> *The Star* presides over the two cultures as they learn to coexist and

---

<sup>275</sup> Mrs. John E. Milholland, "Talks About Women" *The Crisis* 1.3 (Jan. 1911): 27.

<sup>276</sup> Jane Addams, "Social Control" *The Crisis* 1.3 (Jan. 1911): 22.

<sup>277</sup> Du Bois, "The Star of Ethiopia," draft, W.E.B. Du Bois Papers (MS 395), Special Collections and University Archives, University of Massachusetts Amherst.

mingle peacefully.<sup>278</sup> In the third scene, titled “The Black Man Rules the World,” set in 1000 B.C.E., The Star appears again to resolve a conflict, this time between groups of Muslims and Christians on the brink of fighting. She quells the angry spirit of the place and all leave in peace.<sup>279</sup>

The fourth scene is titled “The Land of the Blacks,” and is dated 1500 C.E. and later. The Star of Ethiopia, now moving slowly from exhaustion, enters. She is no longer able to keep peace among the several groups fighting over Africa’s future, and a group of slave traders rips the star from her hands and burns her alive.<sup>280</sup> She embodies the ultimate caretaker, giving her life for the protection of others.

Through their columns in *The Crisis*, Milholland and Addams sought to advise African American women in conforming to the caretaker expectations laid out for white women during the Progressive Era. Their attempts to offer training in motherhood, house keeping, and hygiene belied a belief that African American women, too, should conform to the ideal of True Womanhood discussed in the previous chapter. True Womanhood was created as a model for white, middle class women during the Progressive Era; African American women at the turn of the century were excluded from the possibility of True Womanhood. While it defined a gender role for white women, True Womanhood simultaneously “stigmatized women of color as incapable of chastity, purity, and moral

---

<sup>278</sup> “The Great Pageant” 1.

<sup>279</sup> There is a discrepancy between the review in *The Washington Bee* and the copy of the pageant script in the Du Bois archive as to how many scenes were included in *The Star of Ethiopia*. The *Bee* describes scenes three and four as one continuous episode; Du Bois’s script notes they were two separate scenes. In my work, I defer to the scene divisions as they appear in Du Bois’s script.

<sup>280</sup> Du Bois, “The Star of Ethiopia,” draft, W.E.B. Du Bois Papers (MS 395), Special Collections and University Archives, University of Massachusetts Amherst.

virtue.”<sup>281</sup> That exclusion opened the door for white women like Addams and Milholland to attempt their instruction, because as Louise Michele Newman notes in her book *White Women’s Rights: The Racial Origins of Feminism in the United States*: “white women’s rights activists measured the (lack of) ‘social progress’ of non-white races in terms of their (lack of) conformity to Anglo-American Protestant middle-class gender relations.”<sup>282</sup> Although Newman notes this trend in terms of how white women attempted to reform women of color, it was also a strategy Du Bois employed through his writing in *The Crisis* and *The Star of Ethiopia*.

The fifth and sixth scenes depict The Star’s resurrection and ultimate triumph. The fifth scene, titled “The Search for the Star of Freedom,” was set in 1750 C.E. In North America, African American slaves work under the lash of slave owners. Frederick Douglass and Sojourner Truth enter to warn the slave drivers to stop, but are ignored.<sup>283</sup> John Brown, the famous abolitionist who advocated aggression for the cause through several violent raids, enters with the “torch of war” but falls dead. As slaves congregate around the body and the chorus sings “Were You There When They Crucified My Lord?” Shango, the Yoruba deity who summoned The Star in the first scene, reappears. Shango then resurrects The Star of Ethiopia from the dead; she is reborn holding her Star in her left hand, and a sword in her right. Once reborn, The Star uses her sword to instruct African American men to fight in the Civil War for the Union Army.<sup>284</sup>

---

<sup>281</sup> Newman 6.

<sup>282</sup> Ibid. 7.

<sup>283</sup> Du Bois, “The Star of Ethiopia,” draft, W.E.B. Du Bois Papers (MS 395), Special Collections and University Archives, University of Massachusetts Amherst.

<sup>284</sup> “The Great Pageant” 6.

The seventh and final scene, “The Tower of Light,” was set in 1915. The Star of Ethiopia appears sitting on a throne to watch as African Americans dressed as “ministers, lawyers, physicians, teachers, students,” and a host of other professions enter. They all perform their various crafts but then fall under siege from the allegorical figure of Prejudice, who enters with “Hooded Hounds” and “rush forward and begin lashing and lynching.” In supplication the workers turn to the Star, who once again protects those in need and dispels Prejudice. She then summoned the rivers of the world to aide her in constructing the “Tower of Light”: she would rest her star there, where it would be forever safe and out of reach from anyone seeking its destruction.<sup>285</sup> The Star of Ethiopia closed the pageant by raising her hands in benediction and peace.

Throughout the pageant, The Star of Ethiopia epitomizes the sacrificing, moral woman Du Bois recommended to his readers through *The Philadelphia Negro* and *The Crisis*. In this last scene, The Star presides over and aides in the creation of Du Bois’s notion of the Talented Tenth. Once the assembled African Americans in the final scene demonstrate their claim to the middle class through performing roles as lawyers, doctors, and teachers, The Star can rest. Her sacrifice has been to bring African Americans to this place, where the allegorical figure of Prejudice can no longer touch them. Throughout the pageant, The Star of Ethiopia teaches, guides, protects, dies and returns to life; she is truly superhuman.

Through the advice proffered in *The Crisis* Du Bois encourages a discipline among his readership to *look* like the men and women he displayed in Paris in 1900.

---

<sup>285</sup> “The Great Pageant” 6.

Although ostensibly about the state of the African American family, Du Bois scholars have argued that his concerns may have ultimately been motivated from a desire to protect black masculinity. Through criticizing the practice of black women working outside the home because of the attention it took away from the family's children, Patricia Morton contends that Du Bois was implicitly suggesting that the public sphere was for men. The picture Du Bois paints of black women working outside the home, Morton argues, creates an image of a domineering woman who emasculates her husband.<sup>286</sup> Hazel Carby in her book *Race Men* expands on this by suggesting that Du Bois's work was not intentionally promoting sexist rhetoric, but rather took up the gendered thinking of the period. She observes that "beneath the surface of this apparent sacrifice of individual desire to become an intellectual and a race leader is a conceptual framework that is gender-specific; not only does it apply exclusively to men, but it encompasses only those men who enact narrowly and rigidly determined codes of masculinity."<sup>287</sup> Although Du Bois was making specific prescriptions for women, he was making similar demands of black men in ways that conformed to the rigidly gendered thinking of middle class Progressive Era culture.

These different aspects of Du Bois's work: the investment in creating a new visual culture depicting African American history, and a need to reanimate perceptions of African history were the intentional purposes behind *The Star of Ethiopia*, but it, perhaps inadvertently, was structured by the gendered thinking Du Bois had already expressed through works like *The Philadelphia Negro* and *The Crisis*. The gendered representations

---

<sup>286</sup> Morton 3.

<sup>287</sup> Hazel Carby, *Race Men* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1998) 10.

of women in *The Star of Ethiopia* were constructed to address the Jezebel/Sapphire stereotype through a depiction of the black women of ancient civilization as beautiful and loving. The pageant was organized around the central figure of The Star, a morally and virtually superior woman designated as the protector of African and African American culture, effectively creating a new stereotype of what Michele Wallace refers to as the “superwoman.”

Publicity images of the Star of Ethiopia further cemented her middle class status. Once the imagery of the Star of Ethiopia was introduced in 1915, she was the focus of the pageant’s visual imagery, largely evidenced through publicity posters and other photographs. The December 1915 issue of *The Crisis* featured an article about that year’s production of *The Star of Ethiopia* in Washington, D.C. Its cover features the publicity image used on programs and publicity fliers for the 1915, 1916, and 1923 productions: A woman, shown from the chest up, looks up to the sky, arms reaching overhead. In her right hand she holds a banner, with the words “‘The Star of Ethiopia’: A Pageant.” The banner is waving in the breeze, opened fully behind the woman to show its letters. In her left hand she holds aloft a horseshoe shaped wreath. She is bedecked in jewelry: on her left wrist are several bangle bracelets, and on her right is a single coil wrapped several times around her forearm; long, thin jewels suspended from a choker-length necklace adorn her chest. The woman’s face is nearly expressionless, lips together, eyes looking up past her unfurled flag. A cap is fitted tightly to the top of her head, sitting just above her ears; her hair is cut in a chic chin-length bob. She is wearing what looks to be armor: a fitted garment with circular plates affixed over her breasts. Because she is only visible

from the chest up, the overall effect is one of great opulence, as the jewelry and fitted clothing are featured prominently on what we can see of her body. Her facial expression gives little indication as to her mood, but with her head leaning back to look up, her arms stretched out into the air above her, and her focus on the sky above the flag, she appears at once reverential and exultant, but also grave and somber in her physical gestures.

In addition to the image of Eleanor Curtis as the Star of Ethiopia described at the beginning of this chapter, the *Crisis* article on the 1915 production includes two other images of the female characters in the pageant: Adelia Parks as The Queen of Sheba, and Gregoria Fraser as Candace. The Queen of Sheba, as played by Parks, wore a light colored, sleeveless dress. Although sleeveless, the dress had fabric extending from the shoulders down to her finger tips, so as not to be fully bare-armed. Although the picture is difficult to make out in detail, there is embroidered detailing along the waist and along the bottom hem. Like the image from the publicity poster and programs, she, too, is wearing circular plates over her breasts. The Queen of Sheba is wearing a cloth headdress, fitted tightly over the skull, but extending out loosely past her chin. Her waist length hair is left loose over her right shoulder. The front of the dress is obscured by at least 11 strands of large-beaded necklaces varying from chokers, to chest and waist length. She looks straight at the camera, expressionless, her head tilted slightly towards her right shoulder.

Gregoria Fraser as Candace is wearing similar necklaces to the Queen of Sheba: at least five strands, ranging in length from her waist to her throat. She stands, turned at a quarter left profile, her right arm extending straight out in front her, one finger of her

right hand pointed, as if she is pointing and looking at something past the picture's frame. Her extended right arm has three bracelets: one just below the elbow, and two on her upper arm. Her dress has short sleeves that reach half way between elbow and shoulder; the robe-like cut of the dress extends down to the floor. Her hair is tucked behind her, under a headdress that sits above her ears, but extends just above her head, closing in a point. On her left arm, which is closer to the camera, there are a thick bangle bracelet on her upper arm, and slender bracelet above the wrist, and two large wrings on the fingers of her left hand.<sup>288</sup>

The Star character also features prominently in the group photographs taken of the cast. In a photograph of 200 cast members from the 1916 Philadelphia production<sup>289</sup>, the woman playing the Star stands in the center of the fourth row. The first three rows are populated by seated women and children; the Star stands in the center of the first row of standing cast members, one hand raised in the air, bearing the star. Both because she is in the center of the first standing row, and because she is the only cast member with an arm raised, the star is of primary visual importance.

In his article “‘The Pageant is the Thing’: Black Nationalism and *The Star of Ethiopia*,” David Krasner argues that in creating the pageant, Du Bois “sought a cultural representation of black diaspora, the collective consciousness among black people centered upon a common history and ancestry.”<sup>290</sup> While representations of black histories were key to how Du Bois conceived of the pageant, he was also creating a

---

<sup>288</sup> Du Bois, “The Star of Ethiopia” 90.

<sup>289</sup> W. E. B. Du Bois, “The Drama Among Black Folk,” *The Crisis* 12.4 (Aug. 1916): 170.

<sup>290</sup> Krasner 108.

gendered notion of black women. The Star of Ethiopia was a woman capable of enduring great suffering and hardship, able to rise from the dead, all out of a selfless need to protect. The allegorical figures representing evils were in stark contrast to the Star of Ethiopia; she was all things good, and, in that one body, could be all that was needed for protection and survival. Whereas Hazel MacKaye used allegorical bodies to show women what virtue looked like in *Allegory, The Star of Ethiopia* disciplined through a demonstration of how to guard against various evils. Whereas MacKaye and Du Bois found success in using allegorical figures to evoke classical civilizations and legitimate their causes, the Paterson Strike Pageant would take a far different approach: actual union members were cast in a narrative limited to the previous few months as a demonstration of the great sacrifices endured by their workers. Although a widely different approach, the Paterson Strike Pageant would similarly find expression for their movement using historical pageantry.

### **Chapter Three: Embodying Melting Pot(s) in The Paterson Strike Pageant**

On June 7, 1913, red lights arranged to spell “IWW” blazed over Madison Square Garden. Inside, an audience of almost 15,000 gathered together in the hall, red flags draped from the balconies. The spectators were a mixture of Greenwich Village bohemians, upper class society people, and working class union members. Although cutting a wide swath across New York social groups, all were there to see the members of the International Workers of the World perform a pageant in support of the striking silk industry workers from Paterson, New Jersey.

The opening curtain was held to accommodate crowds still trying to find their seats, and by nine o’clock, the hall was full of expectant energy as the performers took the stage for The Paterson Strike Pageant. One thousand performers, cast entirely from the pool of nearly 25,000 striking laborers in New Jersey, opened the pageant with a scene recreating the first moments of their strike. Three industries within Paterson silk production had refused to work since the end of February. As the pageant began, the strikers-turned-performers walked on stage as if going to work. Entering the space, they hurried towards a set designed as an exterior of a silk mill. Not long after the workers entered the mill, calls for a strike were heard, and the workers came pouring back out. Audience member and Paterson striker Grace Potter described the emotion of the moment:

First we saw the mill, stretching its black stories menacing to the sky. Its windows were lit, its whistles blowing. We watched the still sleepy men, women and children, with their coat collars turned up to keep out the chill of the early

morning—it was in February that the strike began—we watched them swallowed, one by one, through the mill’s hungry door... They were dying inside that mill and worse than dying, and it was the same all over the world. We held our breath. And then—something happened. The machinery stopped grinding. A faint free cry rises slowly to deafening hosannas from a thousand throats as the workers rushed from the mill. They wave their hands, they shout, they dance, they embrace each other in a social passion that pales individual feeling to nothing. They are a mad mob, glad and beautiful in their madness. They sing the Marseillaise. The strike is on!<sup>291</sup>

This description alludes to the enthusiasm of the audience, but also to the performance’s aesthetic: the Paterson Strike Pageant was not, as pageants similar to *Allegory* or *Star of Ethiopia*, meant to evoke scenes of beautiful allegorical figures or illustrate connections to classical civilizations. Instead, the Paterson Strike Pageant was devised as a realist narrative of the ongoing silk industry strike in Paterson, New Jersey. As Potter’s description indicates, the pageant was written and directed as a way to put the lived experiences of striking workers on stage to document the conflict between the striking laborers and the manufacturers who ran the silk shops in Paterson. It was an opportunity for the striking workers to show their story to an audience who had, presumably, heard little about their struggle and might be convinced to help.

The strong emotional connection Potter felt while watching the pageant was no accident or coincidence. The Paterson Strike Pageant was created not just as a strict

---

<sup>291</sup> Grace Potter, “Max Eastman’s Two New Books,” *The New Review* 1.20 (Sept. 1913): 795.

documentation of the strike's events, but was also designed to elicit sympathy for the working class strikers. Reviews, whether predisposed to be supportive of the IWW or not, would all agree that emotions ran high in Madison Square Garden that night. That emotion, one review argued, created such a bond between performers and spectators that "actors and audience were of one class and one hope."<sup>292</sup> The pageant worked hard to give that impression: that the working class of Paterson was a singularly united group, and the pageant was staged to allow the audience to feel they, too, were included in that solid bond.

This chapter explores the depiction of the striking workers with their audience "of one class and one hope" and argues, ultimately, that not only were the strikers and their audience at odds, but more importantly, the multiple ethnicities of the mostly immigrant union members created divisions among the group that led to a far from cohesive movement. The strike organizers and pageant writers assumed the group of working class picketers was of one mind and spirit; this chapter argues, however, that, as with *Allegory* and *The Star of Ethiopia*, the Progressive Era specter of middle class whiteness served as a catalyst for the disintegration of the group's unity, both in the strike and in the pageant.

Whiteness has been invoked differently in each pageant of this dissertation: as a means for the suffragists in *Allegory* to assert their superiority and demand the vote; as a tool for developing the Talented Tenth in *The Star of Ethiopia*; and in The Paterson Strike Pageant, as a way for the IWW to claim its union was uniformly united behind its cause. On the surface, the Paterson Strike Pageant was fighting against the ubiquitous

---

<sup>292</sup> "The Paterson Strike Pageant," *The Independent* 19 June 1913: 1407.

notion of the melting pot, which pervaded Progressive Era immigration rhetoric. As discussed in the introduction, the melting pot described expectations for first generation immigrants to the United States to shed the cultures of their homelands and adopt an American way of life. On the surface, The Paterson Strike Pageant appeared to refuse the melting pot through its demand for workers' rights: the recent immigrants of the IWW publicly rejected expectations for a seamless transition into America. This chapter argues, however, that the Paterson Strike Pageant embodied a melting pot of their own by insisting, despite deep divisions among the union members, that the IWW members of varying nationalities were all seamlessly united behind the silk workers' cause.

Although both *Allegory* and *Star of Ethiopia* lobbied for expanding notions of contemporary citizenship, their arguments still accepted middle class status as an entry point into citizenship for their respective publics. In this chapter, I argue that while the Paterson Strike Pageant sought to expand a contemporary understanding of citizenship to include the working classes, specifically recent immigrants, it did so by erasing the class and race differences among the striking workers. Additionally, the pageant invested in and demonstrated a belief in the Progressive Era notion that to be American meant being white and middle class, and that those categories of race and class were also predicated on a belief that morality was the property of that specific racial and socio-economic group. Just as contemporary notions of race were expanded along a broader continuum than merely the dichotomy of black and white, so, too, was class a more complex category than a simple dichotomy between the middle and working classes. Ultimately,

the Paterson Strike Pageant crafted its revolutionary message about the significance of labor politics through a conservative erasure of difference.

Much of the previous scholarship on the Paterson Strike Pageant has considered the production in terms of its “success.”<sup>293</sup> The pageant was conceived with several goals in mind: to publicize the events of the strike to a middle and working class New York audience, many of whom had not yet heard details of the strike; to create an event for the striking workers that would solidify their ties to the IWW and reaffirm their commitment to staying out on strike until their demands were met; and, some scholars argue most importantly, to raise money to aid the strike efforts. After the pageant failed to raise significant funds for the strike in Paterson, however, morale among the striking workers was low. Not long after the pageant, the tenuous relationships the IWW had painstakingly built and maintained among the various silk shops for so many weeks began to unravel. Individual shops began returning to work after negotiating contracts to the advantage of the manufacturers, who made few of the sought after concessions. In the months and years after the strike, IWW leaders claimed that the timing of the settlements was no coincidence: the “failure” of the pageant discouraged the picketers to the point of giving up.

Steve Golin, in his article “The Paterson Strike Pageant: Success or Failure?” argues that historians have paid the “success” question too much attention in scholarship about the pageant.<sup>294</sup> He claims that although a financial flop, the pageant was still successful in its goal to create publicity for the strike in New York. Golin believes

---

<sup>293</sup> Golin 45-78; Nochlin 87-95.

<sup>294</sup> Golin 45.

historians have paid too much heed to claims the pageant hastened the strike's end. Whether or not the pageant brought an end to the Paterson strike is not the focus of this chapter; those arguments have been made usefully elsewhere. Although a significant backdrop to the events of the pageant, my argument is focused instead on how this pageant, like *Allegory* and *The Star of Ethiopia*, speaks to contemporary anxieties over proving a right to citizenship, and the rights afforded to citizens.

This chapter will begin with a discussion of another pageant taking place in New York City on June 7, 1913, at the Henry Street settlement home, to serve as an illustration of how immigrant narratives were frequently told in Progressive Era pageants. The two pageants premiered on the same night in New York and were compared to each other in the press.<sup>295</sup> Using the Henry Street Pageant as a counterpoint, the rest of the chapter is devoted to a scene by scene description and analysis of the Paterson Strike Pageant. As the pageant unfolds, I will analyze its content and structure to assess, first, how the Paterson workers were divided throughout the early weeks of the strike. I demonstrate how the differences among the silk workers were erased in favor of an image of a singular body working toward a common cause through descriptions of how the events of the strike were portrayed in the pageant.

The silk industry in Paterson, like most working class labor in the northeast in 1913, relied heavily on recent immigrant populations to fill their ranks. In 1913, silk workers were predominantly recent Italian and German immigrants. Bill Haywood, one of the IWW strike leaders, proclaimed: “nearly every nationality on earth is represented

---

<sup>295</sup> “Two Pageants—A Contrast,” *The New York Times* 9 June 1913: 8.

in the strike. The Italians and Germans are the most numerous, with thousands of Russians, Poles, Hungarians and Armenians besides. Shoulder to shoulder they have stood, with a spirit and loyalty that nothing could break or weaken.”<sup>296</sup> Haywood’s optimism about the relative comfort between the different racial groups was warranted, but not entirely true. Strike leaders, and the workers themselves, had already begun to divide the working class population of Paterson into two different groups: “English-speaking” and “non-English speaking.”<sup>297</sup>

The division into “English speaking” and “non-English speaking” literalized how well a silk worker spoke English, but by extension presumed a level of assimilation into American culture and subsequently, areas of professional expertise and political affiliation. With these definitions also came presumptions and accusations from within and without of which group was the more patriotic, and therefore more “American,” based on their involvement in the strike efforts and with the pageant. Part of the schism between the two groups grew from their division in the work place: the English speaking workers mostly worked in safer jobs; by the end of the work stoppage, the manufacturers would acknowledge and exploit these differences to break the strike effort.

Union members’ racial categorizations were based on the degree to which immigrants appeared to have assimilated to American culture. As discussed in the first chapter, racial categorization at the time was not just a question of whether or not an individual was considered white, but what “degree” of white. “Whiteness” in the

---

<sup>296</sup> William D. Haywood, “The Rip in the Silk Industry,” *The International Socialist Review* 13.11 (May 1913): 787-788.

<sup>297</sup> John Reed, “War in Paterson,” *John Reed for The Masses*, ed. James C. Wilson (Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarland & Company, Inc., 1987) 31; Haywood, “Rip” 788.

Progressive Era was conflated with being a middle class citizen of the United States. Critics of the strike in Paterson, fearful of a perceived threat to American whiteness, lambasted the IWW for disrupting American industry for selfish reasons.<sup>298</sup> The workers, however, saw their actions as a revision of the rhetoric surrounding what it meant to be “American” to include the working classes.

On the night of the pageant, the seats were full. The performance was received enthusiastically by the spectators, and some of the press. But news of the box office in the days immediately following was not good: although the *New York Tribune* carried a headline the next day reading, “Big Profit in Spectacle,” there would only be a little over \$300 for the strike relief fund.<sup>299</sup> The union members in Paterson were floored: how could that be all?

Public anxieties over the Paterson Strike Pageant are made clearer when discussed in contrast to another pageant performed the same night in New York City. June 7, 1913 was also the performance date for a pageant featuring 600 performers, 100 of whom were children, in celebration of the twentieth anniversary of the Henry Street Settlement House. Performed to celebrate “the picturesque...gatherings of the people of different nationalities, who have lived, in course of time, in the neighborhood,”<sup>300</sup> the pageant told the history of the Henry Street neighborhood from 1617 to 1913 in five episodes. In its tone and content, the Henry Street Pageant was every inch performed in the original intention of pageantry detailed in the introduction: it celebrated the success of the

---

<sup>298</sup> “Two Pageants—A Contrast” 8.

<sup>299</sup> “Strike Realism Staged in Pageant,” *New York Tribune* 8 June 1913: 1. This would be almost \$6,500 in 2009 U.S.D.

<sup>300</sup> “10,000 See Pageant of Henry St. Life,” *New York Times* 8 June 1913: 7.

American spirit through a historical narrative of America's promise: the United States was destined to emerge as a world power through the hard work of its citizens. Perhaps most importantly, that hard work was harmoniously performed by citizens of varying nationalities who were welcomed into the United States and easily absorbed into mainstream culture, a true melting pot. The story told in the Henry Street Pageant is a progress narrative with the United States as the happy ending.

The first scene of the Henry Street pageant staged the founding of the United States. The episode shows Dutch settlers arranging the ownership of Manhattan over a calm fireside chat with a group of Native American Indians. Said one review: "The Indians assembled about a campfire in council, and gravely welcomed the white strangers, to whom they made gifts of wampum and skins in exchange for bright colored trinkets and garments. They smoke the pipe of peace with the newcomers, buried the hatchet, and after joyous songs and dances that brought loud applause, bade farewell to the white settlers and departed, leaving the Dutch in possession of the territory."<sup>301</sup> In this scene, the sale of Manhattan is simplified into an easy transaction of goods for property, with the Native Americans joining in with the white Dutch settlers in singing and dancing for joy afterward. Here, the Indians realize the significance and inescapability of what is at stake in the transaction, and are excited to be a part of the process and progress implied in the episode.

The last scene of the Henry Street Pageant demonstrates the sentimental ideal of the various races and ethnicities of immigrants in the United States merging together in

---

<sup>301</sup> "10,000 See Pageant of Henry St. Life" 7.

one peaceful melting pot. According to the *New York Times*, in the final scene, the “picture was of all the nationalities that have lived in that street in the last fifty years, including the Irish, Scotch, Germans, and Russians. They sang again the songs, and danced the dances of their native lands.”<sup>302</sup> Here, as with many pageants of the time, was the vision of America as the successful experiment in assimilation: a mixture of nationalities, all bringing their various cultural traditions together not just in peace, but joyful to have left their homeland to work towards the creation of a stronger United States. This was the promise of America made good, and the pageant was designed to reassure its audience that this was not only possible, but already happening.

That same night in Madison Square Garden, the IWW’s pageant was performed to show the problems with this theory: that assimilation was fraught with class, race, and union politics designed to keep Americans and soon-to-be Americans without a voice in the political and social processes. In some ways, the Paterson Strike Pageant was a direct challenge to the narrative of the Henry Street Pageant. The benign narrative of the Henry Street Pageant reified a vision of the United States as inherently united, and the Paterson Strike Pageant was trying to tell a much different story, one that disrupted the peaceful, inevitable, and unmarred progress of the American story.

The anxieties over how the Paterson Strike Pageant would tell their story were apparent from the reviews in the *New York papers*. While on Henry Street, “Children watched the beautiful spectacle,” as “their elders marveled,”<sup>303</sup> reviewers from the same publications described the crowd at Madison Square Garden as “violent Industrial

---

<sup>302</sup> Ibid.

<sup>303</sup> Ibid.

Workers of the World sympathizers,” and noted the presence of the police sheriff.<sup>304</sup>

While the set of the Henry Street Pageant was decorated with American flags, Madison Square Garden was draped with the red flags of the IWW. The sheriff of New York showed great concern for the American flag, telling the *New York Times*: “Just let anybody...say one word of disrespect to the flag and I will stop the show so quickly it will take their breath away.”<sup>305</sup> Concerns for the flag correspond to a larger public concern over the IWW’s reputation for “anti-American” activities, and fears for how that might manifest itself during the evening’s pageant.

Although the sheriff was there to maintain order, pageant director John Reed and the IWW were a step ahead. Back in Paterson, local Police Chief Bimson was considered an enemy of the strike—the IWW leaders believed him responsible for policies that lead to the arrests of many picketers; he was widely believed “in the pocket” of big business in Paterson. As an opportunity to mock him publicly, and as a way to patrol the crowd on the evening of the pageant, striking workers in police uniform, commanded by a “Chief Bumson” kept order in the auditorium prior to the show’s start. Ultimately, however, the sheriff’s fears, and those of the IWW in setting up their own internal policing, were unfounded. The pageant was performed without incident, and with perhaps more conformity than first expected.

---

<sup>304</sup> “Strike Realism Staged in Pageant” 1; “Patterson Strikers Now Become Actors,” *New York Times* 8 June 1913: 2.

<sup>305</sup> “Patterson Strikers Now Become Actors” 2.

### **Episode One: The Mills Alive—The Workers Dead**

Six o'clock on a February morning. The mill windows all aglow. The mill whistle sounds the signal to begin work. Men and women, old and young, come to work in the bitter cold of the dawn. The sound of looms. The beginning of the great silk strike. The striking workers sing the Marseillaise, the entire audience being invited to join in the song of revolt.<sup>306</sup>

In 1913 the IWW was still riding a wave of success from its recent strike of textile workers in Lawrence, Massachusetts. IWW organizers Bill Haywood, Elizabeth Gurley Flynn and Carlo Tresca, among others, led the strike efforts there.<sup>307</sup> That strike scored a major victory for the IWW: it brought national attention to the union and its leadership while securing economic and professional gains for the textile workers of Lawrence.<sup>308</sup> This success led to a rash of IWW strikes throughout New England, with varying results.<sup>309</sup>

By the night of the pageant, 25,000 workers had shuttered the silk industry in since the end of February, creating an unprecedented industry wide work stoppage. Now in the fourteenth week of what was, initially, supposed to have been a brief strike, the workers were in desperate need of money and the union coffers were running low. The IWW strike leaders felt the manufacturers would relent soon; with the goals of both

---

<sup>306</sup> Joyce L. Kornbluh, ed. *Rebel Voices: An I.W.W. Anthology* (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 1964) 210. Each section of this chapter opens with a description of a scene from the pageant as found in Kornbluh's anthology. I use these to contrast the basic descriptions of what took place with the larger issues present below the surface of the pageant's action.

<sup>307</sup> Anne Huber Tripp, *The I.W.W. and the Paterson Silk Strike of 1913* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1987) 26.

<sup>308</sup> *Ibid.* 33.

<sup>309</sup> *Ibid.* 34.

solidifying unity among a group of approximately 25,000 laborers for the last weeks of picketing and raising money for the strike support funds, the IWW crafted a pageant depicting the events of the strike in Paterson. The pageant was staged in a matter of several weeks and performed for a sold out crowd in Madison Square Garden. Five scenes told the story of the strike to date: the first episode showing the walk out was followed by the death of a local Paterson man when violence erupted on a picket line; a city wide funeral held to mourn the fallen worker; a climactic meeting of 20,000 strike workers; a May Day parade arranged by the IWW; and a sixth and final scene imagining a day when the striking workers would legislate their own working conditions. The pageant concluded with a scene of a utopic future, in which the workers passed their own laws to enforce the new standards they were demanding through their strike.

On February 24<sup>th</sup>, 1913, the IWW Local 152 voted to call on the silk workers of Paterson for a general strike. It began the following day. The IWW's national organization quickly sent in several of its seasoned veterans to lead the silk industry: William "Bill" Haywood, Elizabeth Gurley Flynn, Carlo Tresca, and Patrick Quinlan. Haywood had been a significant presence in the IWW since its formation in 1905.<sup>310</sup> A miner from the west, Haywood lost an eye in a work accident years before Paterson; his eye patch, combined with his height and girth, lead to many descriptions of his intimidating presence. He used it to his advantage in several major IWW victories, including the recently successful strike in Lawrence. Due to his long affiliation with the IWW and his earlier success, the Paterson silk community hoped for his involvement.

---

<sup>310</sup> Ibid. 9.

Haywood arrived in Patterson soon after the strike was declared and was greeted by hundreds of workers at the train station platform; he delivered his first address to the picketers that very afternoon.<sup>311</sup>

In the first few days of the strike prior to Haywood's arrival, Elizabeth Gurley Flynn and Carlo Tresca organized the workers. Flynn, an Irish woman and only twenty-two years old, was already a seasoned IWW leader; Carlo Tresca, an Italian, was as well. Their group was rounded out by Patrick Quinlan, another IWW veteran of the strike in Lawrence. The union situation in Paterson had grown increasingly complex over the previous several years, with several competing unions, some among the IWW itself, vying for control throughout several unsuccessful strikes during 1912.<sup>312</sup> Part of Flynn, Tresca, and Quinlan's earliest duties was to protect the IWW's claim on the Paterson strike from their competitors in the American Federation of Labor (AFL). Their initial concerns over AFL interference were overshadowed by the internal divisions among the Paterson shops. While the IWW leadership attempted to keep those relationships strong, another very different group of people got involved with the strike in Paterson.

As opposed to *Allegory* and *The Star of Ethiopia* which, although influenced by a number of thinkers and artists, were primarily the creations of Hazel MacKaye and W.E.B. Du Bois, respectively, the Paterson Strike Pageant resulted from a collaboration

---

<sup>311</sup> Ibid. 75.

<sup>312</sup> Ibid. 62. For additional information about the IWW, AFL and union workers during the Progressive Era see Eric Arnesen, Julie Greene, and Bruce Laurie, eds., *Labor Histories: Class, Politics, and the Working-Class Experience* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1998); Julie Novkov, *Constituting Workers, Protecting Women: Gender, Law, and Labor in the Progressive Era and New Deal Years* (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 2001); Bruno Ramirez, *When Workers Fight: The Politics of Industrial Relations in the Progressive Era, 1898-1916* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1978); Gwendolyn Mink, *Old Labor and New Immigrants in American Political Development: Union, Party, and State, 1875-1920* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986); Donald E. Winters, Jr., *The Soul of the Wobblies: The I.W.W., Religion, and American Culture in the Progressive Era, 1905-1917* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1985).

between the strike leaders and a group of Greenwich Village artists. Although the IWW provided financial support for the pageant, and released over 1,000 picketers to work as actors, much of its artistic control was in the hands of the New Yorkers. By 1913, a bohemian culture overtook much of Greenwich Village; artists, intellectuals, writers, and activists lived and often loved among this neighborhood in New York City considered, at the time, a radical and permissive environment.<sup>313</sup> At the center of their community stood Mabel Dodge, an independently wealthy New York socialite. She gathered about her a group of activists, writers, journalists, playwrights, and artists, who met for salon evenings in Dodge's home. The group regulars included Lincoln Steffens, Hutchins Hapgood, Robert Edmond Jones, Upton Sinclair, and Walter Lippmann, but they all regularly brought others whose work interested the group or promoted an important cause. The salons were spent debating current political issues and contemporary artistic pursuits. The revolutionary spirit found in Greenwich Village in 1913 was, in part, devoted to exploring the connections between art, politics, aesthetics, and ideology.

At Dodge's salons, artists were encouraged to think about how their work influenced and shaped politics, and vice versa. To create this cross dialogue, the salon cast a wide net for attendees. Hapgood, of all the salon regulars, was perhaps primarily responsible for the salon's investment in labor politics. Prior to the Paterson strike, Hapgood had already written about and reported on labor activity, including a 1907 work,

---

<sup>313</sup> The bohemian atmosphere of Greenwich Village had its limits. Homosexuality was tacitly criticized; although immigrants were welcomed, there were few, if any, African Americans in Mabel Dodge's salon circle.

*The Spirit of Labor*, which profiled union leader Anton Johannson.<sup>314</sup> It was Hapgood who brought Emma Goldman and Alexander Berkman to Dodge's apartment, and so introduced a more radical political element to the group.

Not everyone in attendance was convinced of the salon's efficacy. In fact, eight months after the Paterson pageant, Goldman wrote that "the intellectuals of America have not yet discovered their relation to workers, to the revolutionary elements which at all times and in every country have been the inspiration of men and women who worked with their brains. They seem to think that they and not the workers represent the creators of culture. But that is a disastrous mistake."<sup>315</sup> Coming so close on the heels of the pageant, it is hard not to read a judgment of that collaboration between the lines of Goldman's screed. Although not always a symbiotic relationship, Dodge's salon provided opportunity for artists, intellectuals, writers, and revolutionaries to exchange ideas. Not everyone would be satisfied with the results.

Goldman's objections to Dodge's salon centered around her belief that because Dodge was not of the working classes, her interest in the bohemian and revolutionary spirits of Greenwich Village were not a necessity, but passing fancy. In 1912, Dodge moved back to New York after a number of years in Florence, Italy. Although she was married, the relationship was strained. Her husband, Edwin Dodge, paid for Mabel to take residence in a floor of a brownstone at 23 Fifth Avenue in Greenwich Village. Edwin lived in a nearby hotel, giving Mabel free range over the apartment. Her tastes

---

<sup>314</sup> Martin Green, *New York 1913: The Armory Show and the Paterson Strike Pageant* (New York: Scribner, 1988) 56.

<sup>315</sup> Emma Goldman, "Intellectual Proletarians" *Mother Earth* 8.12 (Feb. 1914): 363-370.

were famously opulent: she notoriously decorated the entire residence in white—paint, furniture, and carpet. Although an occasional writer, Mabel was primarily supported by her husband. Her real talent, admittedly, was in bringing people together—making advantageous introductions between people who could be useful to one another. The society pages referred to her as the “sphinx,” a nickname she abhorred, because her public reputation was one of a quiet woman of financial means with little to contribute aside from her wealth and prestigious social standing. Her importance to the group was akin to being an editor for their social circle—she was someone who saw the big picture, knew who should be working together, who should be introduced, and whose work would be mutually generative. In her memoirs, Dodge admits, “my own part in it was involuntary. The share I had in bringing people together was inspired not at all by any conscious realization in me.”<sup>316</sup> Her friendships with regular salon members Steffens and Hapgood eventually led to the first salon, as the two men were constantly bringing friends with them on their visits to Dodge’s apartment.

Dodge’s financial means, and those of her friends, combined with the accidental salon creation, led to a feeling among devoted revolutionaries like Goldman, and later some of the IWW leadership, that Dodge and her friends were merely toying with labor politics as a fleeting interest, not born of genuine belief in the plight of the working classes. The cultural exchange between Dodge’s salon and the Paterson strikers showed its seams in the pageant: John Reed, a former college cheerleader, rewrote the lyrics to

---

<sup>316</sup> Mabel Dodge Luhan, *Movers and Shakers* (1936; Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1985) 39.

Harvard fight songs to reflect the events of the strike and taught the IWW members to sing them at rallies and in the pageant.

In the spring of 1913 Hapgood brought Dodge with him to hear Bill Haywood speak at the home of a mutual acquaintance. Haywood spoke of the strike conditions in Paterson, the dilemma and passion of the workers there, and their need for better publicity. Haywood expressed his belief that the manufacturers of Paterson had curtailed strike publicity in New York by threatening to halt advertisements with newspapers giving sympathetic coverage to the Paterson picketers.<sup>317</sup> New York newspapers gave scant coverage of the events in Paterson; the few news items that appeared often demonized the IWW as instigators of the unrest.<sup>318</sup> Haywood was determined to spread news of the strike out of New Jersey and into the city, with hopes of garnering more support for the struggling strike.<sup>319</sup> Dodge was moved by Haywood's story, and, according to her autobiography, made the suggestion that spurred the pageant's creation. Inspired by Haywood's plea for help, Dodge purportedly whispered, "Why don't you bring the strike to New York and *show* it to the workers?...Why don't you hire a great hall and re-enact the strike over here? Show the whole thing: the closed mills, the gunmen, the murder of the striker, the funeral."<sup>320</sup>

With this suggestion was born an odd alliance between the union members of the IWW and the intellectual salon crowd of New York's Greenwich Village. Although the two groups overlapped in their commitment to progressivism, their memberships and

---

<sup>317</sup> Haywood, "The Rip in the Silk Industry" 784.

<sup>318</sup> "Two Pageants—A Contrast" 8.

<sup>319</sup> Golin 46-47.

<sup>320</sup> Luhan 188.

goals were vastly different. John Reed, then a recent Harvard graduate and budding journalist, was also in attendance that night. Later famous for covering the revolutions in Mexico and Russia, and his work *Ten Days that Shook the World*, in 1913 Reed was twenty-seven and only just gaining an interest in labor politics. Reed traveled to Paterson to see the events firsthand after hearing Haywood speak. Never being one to sit back and watch, Reed got involved in a labor demonstration while there, skirmished with local police, and was summarily arrested.<sup>321</sup> He spent four days in prison with other IWW picketers, where he became convinced he could be useful to their cause. Reed overheard Dodge's suggestion to "show it to them" the night they both met Bill Haywood. On his return from Paterson he conceived the idea of producing a pageant telling the story of the strike, with proceeds going to aid the families of Paterson.

The Greenwich Village salon crowd was primarily responsible for the pageant's organization and rehearsal. In a personal letter, John Eyre Hunt, a writer and college friend of Reed's who was also salon regular, describes for his correspondent what it was like to attend one of the pageant's organizational meetings. In his letter, he humorously explains the difficulty in getting a group of artists and intellectuals used to discussing ideals of art and politics to sit down and focus on the complicated logistics of staging a pageant with a cast of 1,000 for an audience of 15,000 in Madison Square Garden. His description reads as a brief scene, with "lines" attributed to Alexander Berkman, Margaret Sanger, Dodge, Reed, and many others:

---

<sup>321</sup> Reed, "War in Patterson" 28.

“Have you found out how many Madison Square Garden will seat?” “The processions of strikers are to come in from—” “And you just ought to have seen Reed teaching ‘em that song! They simply—” “We’ve got to have a good man to head the advertising committee; it’s the most impor—” “No, I don’t think there ought to be elaborate scenery; you see, when—” “The I.W.W. doesn’t mean that; it means—” “Who’s in charge of that anyway? I thought—” Summers Boyd gently insinuating his voice into the uproar: “The meeting will come to order. Now, we shall take up the membership of the executive committee.” Jack [Reed]: “I thought we’d done that long ago.”<sup>322</sup>

While not a transcript of an actual production meeting, Hunt creates a vivid picture of the meeting’s flavor. Those attending the meetings seem to put everything “on the table,” from how the pageant should be advertised, to their excitement over how rehearsals were progressing, to the lingering question of “who’s in charge.” Given the nature of these meetings, it is perhaps clearer how the pageant failed to reach the financial outcome expected and hoped for by so many. Hunt’s letter also indicates that although the meetings were primarily focused on the artistry of the pageant, there was some discussion among the salon members of the IWW’s strategy and goals. As a group, the salon’s interaction with the leadership of the IWW was limited; Reed and Dodge were the primary points of contact between the two groups.

---

<sup>322</sup> Edward Eyre Hunt, Letter. John Reed Papers, 1903-1967 (MS Am 1655). Houghton Library, Harvard University. I use several long quotations from Hunt’s correspondence in this chapter. I do not hold his words up as the “truth” of what happened in rehearsals and performance; I include his letters at length because they are the thickest descriptions of the pageant rehearsal process I have found, and effectively convey his sense of what he saw, heard, and felt there.

Both groups, the IWW and the salon members, shared the spirit of the Progressive Era, even if different in their make up and goals. The IWW was founded on the principle that its movements and strike activities would be led by the membership. A goal articulated in the populist mood of the times, the IWW claimed there would be no leaders for its organization.<sup>323</sup> According to Flynn, the activities of the strike were determined democratically by a strike committee, a body made up of two members from each of the 300 Paterson shops cobbled together throughout the strike. If all had been present at a meeting, it would have resulted in a group of 600 Paterson workers voting on actions to be taken by the strikers.<sup>324</sup> When, in an attempt to hasten the end of the strike, a Paterson rabbi met publicly with Haywood and other IWW members to mediate a reconciliation with the manufacturers, the rabbi reportedly requested to speak with the strike's leader: "'The strike has no leaders,' answered Bill. 'It hasn't! Well, who is in charge of it?' 'The strikers,'" came the response from Haywood.<sup>325</sup>

At first glance these two groups working together, the Greenwich Village bohemians and the IWW leadership, might not seem to have a great deal in common. Their respective devotion to leading through group rule provided a common ground based in a mutual commitment to populism during the Progressive Era. Although Haywood, Tresca, Flynn, and Quinlan were the public faces of the strike, often giving interviews for papers, publishing articles, and speaking to the strikers to continually motivate their efforts, they were still at the mercy of the strike committee to dictate their

---

<sup>323</sup> Tripp 77.

<sup>324</sup> Elizabeth Gurley Flynn, "The Truth About the Paterson Strike," *Rebel Voices: An I.W.W. Anthology*, ed. Joyce Kornbluh (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 1964) 216.

<sup>325</sup> Tripp 77.

actions. Flynn said the IWW leadership “were in the position of generals on the battlefield who had to organize their forces, who had to organize their commissary department while they were in battle but who were being financed and directed by people in the capital.”<sup>326</sup> Just as the salon members had a difficult time leading through committee, so did the IWW.

The problem of creating a cohesive narrative around the various factions involved in the strike landed on John Reed once he became pageant director and writer. As the descriptions of the opening scene indicate, the first episode attempted to recreate the morning the strike began. Reed’s intent to put the real lives of the striking workers on stage was evident in how he rehearsed with the union members turned actors in their first rehearsal. In a letter dated June 12, 1913, Edward Eyre Hunt described that initial meeting:

On Tuesday the real drill began, with about three hundred men, women, and children in the hall. They were a merry crowd, looking on the scene as a chance for a big lark. Jack began by telling them in outline the plot of the Pageant: “In the first scene, you are going to work. Now, how do you feel when you go to work?” Voices from all over the hall: “Always hurry.” “Always late.” “Cold.” “Don’ like go!” ... “Here, you!” called Jack, “You men right down here in front; come up on the platform and show how you go to work.” Up they came, serious all at once, and shuffled rapidly across the stage. “No! No!” shouted the crowd below, “Don’ go work that way. Goin’ ball-game. Here!” and a dozen others leaped on

---

<sup>326</sup> Flynn, “The Truth About the Paterson Strike” 216.

the platform and began to hurry across, heads down, arms hanging limp, feet feverishly shambling. “That right?” asked Jack of the others. “Yes; si, si; a’ right; that right.” And rehearsal went on. The strikers were actors, managers, critics, and public throw into one.<sup>327</sup>

The rehearsal environment’s intensity, captured by Hunt in his correspondence, only grew as opening night approached. While the salon’s behind-the-scenes preparations may have been tumultuous and confusing, the focused energy of the performers was undisputed. Once June 7<sup>th</sup> arrived, all accounts, whether supportive of the IWW politics or not, remarked on the union members’ vigor as they took the stage.

Hunt was responsible for cueing the actors to start the show with their entrance from the house, down the center aisle to the stage. He, like Grace Potter, describes the opening scene of the pageant as a “thrilling” sight:

You should have seen them and have heard the roars of applause that greeted them. There they came, heads down, despondent, hurried, indifferent to everything but getting into the mills. Some had lunch-baskets; a few had umbrellas. In the uncanny light of early dawn those bright-eyed mills were grewsome [sic] things, and the workers looked like ants as they shambled up [illegible] stage and into the doorway. A few gathered in small groups about the stage, gesticulating. Prompt to the minute, there was a piercing cry of ‘strike! strike!’ and out of the mills poured a tumultuous roaring army of workers, dancing, throwing up their hats, and surging about the stage as they shouted and

---

<sup>327</sup> Edward Eyre Hunt, Letter. Houghton Library, Harvard University.

sang their good news. The whole audience rose to meet them, yelling their delight.<sup>328</sup>

The opening moments of the pageant struck a vibrant chord with their audience, albeit with spectators predisposed to be sympathetic to the cause. Hunt had a close look at this opening moment, as he was with the actors up until they made their entrance through the audience on a wide aisle from the back of the auditorium to the stage.

The director and designers carefully orchestrated the audience's sympathy for the workers. The Paterson Strike Pageant was designed to elicit sympathy from its audience from the earliest moments, in part through its scene design.<sup>329</sup> The pageant was designed scenically to allow both proximity between the audience and the performers and create a picture of the silk mills as visually and physically oppressive to the workers. Some reports listed as many as 1,029 performers in the pageant.<sup>330</sup> With so many in the cast, the scene design had to be equally massive to support such numbers and to appear intimidating in comparison to such a large group on stage. On the night of the performance the stage took up the entire interior side of Madison Square Garden along Fourth Avenue. The permanent backdrop for the pageant was a massive curtain painted with a picture of several silk mills crowding the sky line. As the description from Grace Potter claimed, the "black stories menacing to the sky"<sup>331</sup> created an image of towering industry, dwarfing the workers, who appeared as "ants"<sup>332</sup> in comparison. The entire drop depicting the steel mills was painted in black and grey, a stark contrast to the red already

---

<sup>328</sup> Ibid.

<sup>329</sup> Essin 86.

<sup>330</sup> "Paterson Strikers Now Become Actors" 2.

<sup>331</sup> Potter 795.

<sup>332</sup> Edward Eyre Hunt. Letter. Houghton Library, Harvard University.

draped throughout Madison Square Garden, and to the additional use of red found throughout the pageant on flags, flowers, and costumes.

Scene designer Robert Edmond Jones created an aisle extending from the stage to the rear of the auditorium, which was used as an entrance and exit throughout the pageant.<sup>333</sup> In this first scene, the aisle represented a road in Paterson leading up to a silk mill.<sup>334</sup> In subsequent scenes, the aisle was configured alternately as a parade route and funeral procession, but throughout the pageant the aisle itself fostered not just physical proximity, but a sense of emotional closeness to the actors on stage. With the sheer size of the group, and their presence not just on stage but throughout the auditorium via the aisle, the audience was placed in the center of the action, and invited to consider themselves a part of the labor movement.

The overwhelming size of the scenery on stage—the massive painting of the silk mills as the backdrop for the entire pageant—created, as the two audience accounts indicate, a sense of the futility of the workers’ situation. These choices presented a distinctly expressionist flair to the pageant’s scene design, which created a general ambivalence towards industrialization while showing the striking workers, coached to be as “realistic” as possible, struggling against a true behemoth. As Reed’s direction in rehearsals indicates, in the opening moments of the pageant, the workers trudged grimly into work. When the audience was presented with the workers’ reality—of spending day after day in such an environment, the workers’ burden was clear. Once “strike” was

---

<sup>333</sup> Essin 84-88.

<sup>334</sup> Elizabeth Gurley Flynn, *I Speak My Own Piece: Autobiography of “The Rebel Girl”* (New York: Masses & Mainstream, 1955) 155.

declared, the workers came running back out again, singing and dancing for joy, in starkest contrast to how they went in to start the work day. Once they escape the confines of their work space, the workers come to life—streaming out of the mill to begin their strike together. From this moment on, the silk industry of Paterson would be shown as a united group, singing and agitating for their rights together. The next few scenes demonstrated the depth of those bonds.

### **Episode Two: “The Mills Dead—The Workers Alive”**

Mass picketing. Every worker alert. The police interfere with peaceful picketing and treat the strikers with great brutality. The workers are provoked to anger.

Fights between police and strikers ensure. Many strikers are clubbed and arrested.

Shots are fired by detectives hired by the manufacturers, and Valentino

Modestino, who was not a striker or a silk mill worker, is hit by a bullet and killed as he stands on the porch of his house with one of his children in his arms.<sup>335</sup>

In rehearsal, John Reed had difficulty convincing any of the performers to play the policemen.<sup>336</sup> Perhaps because of the high premium Reed had placed on putting real life on stage, none of the performers wanted to attempt stepping into the shoes of their nemeses on the picket lines. Even after Reed found workers to play the roles, the other performers were so intent on living the events of the strike through the performance that they booed their fellow strikers dressed as policemen during rehearsals.<sup>337</sup>

---

<sup>335</sup> Kornbluh 210.

<sup>336</sup> Golin 52; Tripp 142.

<sup>337</sup> Edward Eyre Hunt, Letter. Houghton Library, Harvard University.

This anecdote helps paint an image of the striking workers as a particularly unified block: even *representations* of the police were treated as the enemy by the group of actor-strikers. This idealized notion of the picketers as a cohesive group was introduced in the first episode and continued in this second scene. The workers are trying to picket peacefully when attacked by the police; the program description above makes clear the workers are provoked into fighting back. In the scene, the police violently beat the workers, culminating in the death of Valentino Modestino, a Paterson citizen. The next section will deal more closely with the pageant's treatment of Modestino and his funeral; this section will look at the strategic ways in which the workers were portrayed as a single-minded, cohesive group.

John Reed first learned of the conflict between English speaking and non-English speaking workers during his incarceration in Paterson. While there, he saw that the majority of the jailed workers were recent immigrants who did not speak English fluently. When he asked an IWW picketer why that was, the Italian worker told Reed, "English peoples no go on picket-line... 'Mericans no lika fight!"<sup>338</sup> Reed noted that, "This sad fact appears to be true. It was the English-speaking group that held back during the Lawrence strike. It is the English-speaking contingent that remains passive at Paterson."<sup>339</sup> While Reed was well aware of the tensions between these groups as he began his work on the pageant, those fault lines do not appear anywhere in the pageant.

The silk industry of Paterson, New Jersey, was essentially comprised of three different areas: the broad cloth shops where silk fabric was woven on looms; the dye

---

<sup>338</sup> Reed, "War in Paterson" 31.

<sup>339</sup> Ibid.

houses where fabric was then taken to be dyed; and the ribbon shops, where silk ribbons were manufactured separately from large bolts of cloth. All workers were lobbying manufacturers for an eight-hour workday, but each of the three professions had separate safety concerns. As Grace Potter's description of the opening scene above indicates, the silk workers were shown in the first episode of the pageant to be "dying inside that mill and worse than dying." In the dye houses, workers had to sink their bare hands into vats of corrosive chemicals used to color raw silks. The chemicals could burn skin, eat away fingernails, and permanently dye flesh. In the broad cloth shops, manufacturers were attempting to instigate the multi-loom system. Already used in other silk manufacturing areas in Pennsylvania, it required each worker in the broad cloth shop to simultaneously operate four to eight weaving looms. Aside from the dangers inherent to splitting focus over so many machines, union members were further concerned this new system would lead to layoffs, as fewer workers would be needed in each shop.

Of the broad cloth, dye, and ribbon shops, the last were considered safest. Workers in the ribbon shops were primarily on strike for the establishment of an eight hour work day. That the IWW was able to get all three professions, totaling almost 25,000 workers, into a simultaneous and continuous strike in unilateral support for the silk industry in Paterson was a feat all in its own. The workers agreed to go on strike for the good of the entire industry: no shop would return to work until all shops were satisfied their respective demands had been met. That meant the ribbon shops agreed not to work until the dye shops were safer; the dye shops could not work until the broad cloth workers were back to two looms; no one would work until every shop had an eight hour

work day. Although smaller strikes had previously shut down individual parts of the Paterson silk industry, the strike of 1913 was the first to bring all three branches together in support of fair, safe, industry-wide conditions.

The linguistic divisions corresponded to different professional ties within the silk industry: most of the “English speaking” group worked in the ribbon shops, while the “non-English speaking” worked in the dye and broad cloth shops. The difference in language facility, then, ultimately corresponded to a difference in why these groups were participating in the strike. Because the English speaking workers primarily worked in the safer ribbon shops, and the non-English speaking workers were primarily in the more dangerous dye and broad cloth shops, the English-speaking group mainly sought an eight hour workday through the strike, while the non-English speaking group was also striking for safer working conditions. Here, as in the previous two chapters, identity categorizations based on one single identity factor, whether gender, race, or class, give way to far greater complexities. The perceived binaric relationship of working class silk worker to middle or upper class manufacturer was not as simple as the IWW would have had the greater public believe. Inside the union, divisions along a continuum of working class labor identities complicated a working class vs. middle class dynamic: the working classes of Paterson were not agitating for the same rights. In these first two scenes, and throughout the rest of the Paterson Strike Pageant, the workers act as one body, that, in the second episode, is treated with uniform cruelty by the police. The first two scenes of the Paterson Strike Pageant establish the silk workers as a group attempting to escape the

confines of an unforgiving industry while battling against the brutality of those above them in the Paterson hierarchy.

### **Episode Three: “The Funeral of Modestino”**

The coffin containing the body of Modestino is followed by the strikers in funeral procession to the strains of the Dead March. The strikers passing drop red carnations and ribbons upon the coffin until it is buried beneath the crimson symbol of the workers’ blood.<sup>340</sup>

After Modestino’s death, the IWW leadership visited his widow in her home. They offered to organize a funeral for Valentino Modestino, who, although unintentionally, had given his life for the strike. An elaborate public funeral event was held, replete with speeches from Elizabeth Gurley Flynn and Carlo Tresca, in which Tresca infamously proclaimed the striking workers needed “Blood for blood.”<sup>341</sup> The funeral’s re-staging in the pageant grew to a similar fever pitch of emotion. In the pageant’s third episode, the mourners marched up the center aisle to the stage and dropped red carnations on the casket. Flynn and Tresca recreated their graveside speeches. Of witnessing the scene on stage, Mabel Dodge wrote: “The funeral procession marched right through it...so that for a few electric moments there was a terrible unity between all these people. They were one: the workers who had come across the river, and the workers who had come to see it. I have never felt such a high pulsating vibration in any gathering before or since.”<sup>342</sup>

---

<sup>340</sup> Kornbluh 210.

<sup>341</sup> Tripp 110.

<sup>342</sup> Luhan 204.

Even the unsympathetic New York *Tribune* noted the intense emotion of the scene: "... with all the accessories of somber realism, worked the actors themselves and their thousands of sympathizers in the audience up to a high pitch of emotion, punctuated with moans and groans and sobs."<sup>343</sup> Dodge's observation of that "terrible unity," and the *Tribune's* recognition of the intense grief present, evoke the heart of the scene's purpose: the narrative of the strike is again written as the oppression of a singular entity of silk workers at the hands of an unfeeling middle class. This section of the chapter explores how this narrative was crafted not just through what the pageant included in its first three scenes, but also through what was excised during the rehearsal process.

An earlier draft of the pageant shows plans for two scenes eventually cut from the script. In an episode titled "Recorder Carroll's Court Room," forty strikers were brought before the judge who sentenced them all to jail without letting them respond to the police's allegations. The scene ended with strikers yelling "Fill up de jail! No take no bail! To hell with the A.F. of L.! Hooray for the I.W.W.!" A second cut scene titled "The Armory Meeting" dramatized attempts by the AFL to break the strike.<sup>344</sup> Both of the two cut scenes depicted events crucial to the development of the strike: Carroll was notorious among the silk workers, and noted in the local Paterson press, for jailing the striking workers; he was also the judge who sentenced Reed to his several days in prison. Just as the IWW leadership and the striking workers loathed Police Chief Bimson, so too was Recorder Carroll a much maligned presence throughout the strike. Ending the scene with the striking workers shouting "To hell with the A. F. of L.!" as a lead in to the next cut

---

<sup>343</sup> "Strike Realism Staged in Pageant" 4.

<sup>344</sup> John Eyre Hunt, Letter. Houghton Library, Harvard University.

scene was indicative of the animosity the IWW leadership and the strikers also felt for the AFL. Once the strike was truly underway, AFL representatives came to Paterson to create a wedge between the IWW and the striking laborers. Although ultimately unsuccessful, the AFL's presence created tensions all around. Swaying support from the strikers away from the AFL towards the IWW was an onerous, but ultimately successful, task for the IWW.<sup>345</sup>

The struggles with Recorder Carroll in the courthouse and the AFL in the streets were crucial to the events in Paterson, and, in terms of Reed's goal to tell the audience about the major events of the strike, their inclusion in an initial draft seems logical. For Reed to cut these two scenes in favor of keeping episodes like the funeral of the fallen Paterson citizen seems to place an emphasis on the human drama of the strike.

By 1913, much public opinion stood against the IWW for what was popularly seen as anarchist tendencies.<sup>346</sup> That the IWW members in Paterson were constantly being sent through the court system, with many being jailed, was part of what led to the public sentiment that the IWW was dangerous and "un-American." Regardless of whether the pageant was successful in demonstrating the striking laborers' wrongful imprisonment, as Reed had argued elsewhere through his own journalism on the strike, the scene would still have shown the intolerance of the local Paterson legal system for the striking workers. If being American in a Progressive Era pageant meant assimilating harmoniously into American culture, being jailed en masse, regardless of the fairness of

---

<sup>345</sup> Flynn, *I Speak My Own Piece* 153-154; Tripp 111-116.

<sup>346</sup> See "Strike Realism Staged in Pageant" 1; "10,000 See Pageant of Henry Street Life" 7; "Two Pageants—A Contrast" 8.

due process, ran the risk of portraying the union members as unruly and dangerous. Ultimately, archival documents do not indicate why the scenes were cut from the pageant. The logistics of pace, running time, and ability to prepare during the short rehearsal period could all be factors in trimming the two scenes, but regardless, the pageant's remaining narrative preferences a more emotionally sympathetic image of the striking workers.

The final version of the pageant included the more emotionally wrought moments that ultimately had less impact on the outcome of the strike itself, at the expense of the cut scenes which depicted issues of more sustained consequence for the strike effort. Although the cut scenes were perhaps also ultimately designed to create sympathy for the workers by showing them jailed without a proper chance to defend themselves, or through showing that the labor movement itself was trying to pull the strike apart, these scenes might not have found the sympathy or emotion they sought.

#### **Episode Four: "Mass Meeting at Haledon"**

Great mass meeting of 20,000 strikers. I.W.W. organizers speak. Songs by the strike composers are sung by the strikers. They also sing the International, the Marseillaise and the Red Flag, in which the audience is invited to join.<sup>347</sup>

In the fourth scene, the first songs performed were sung by groups representing the largest cultural blocks among the strikers. Separate small groups sang songs in German, Italian, and English, before everyone sang together the International, the

---

<sup>347</sup> Kornbluh 210.

Marseillaise, and the Red Flag, a song of the IWW. Having the individual groups of Germans, Italians, and English-speakers singing in their respective languages acknowledged the diversity of the union, and acknowledged each of the languages most represented among the strikers. While each group got its own moment of individuation, the scene closed with all the workers on stage singing the three revolutionary songs used by the IWW throughout the previous months of the strike to rally the workers together. Beginning the scene with an acknowledgement of the union's diversity and ending it with the entire block of workers singing together implied that the workers might have different cultural backgrounds, but were all united in a common cause. They might speak different languages, but the language of revolution and strike was universal among them. Their belief in the strike transcended whatever individuality might exist in other aspects of their lives.

Although arguing against a notion of melting into a pot of mainstream America, the pageant does argue, through the songs staged in the fourth episode, and other moments in the preceding three scenes, that the workers have melded into one cohesive identity. Through the preceding scenes, the union's solidarity was portrayed as the result of several factors: a response to job dissatisfaction in the first scene, as a response to mass brutality in the second scene, and in the third episode, as a bond born out of grief. The fourth scene, however, acknowledges the union's diversity, but then demonstrates another common ground among the striking workers: their devotion to labor politics. The union's solidarity was symbolized throughout the pageant with the incorporation of the

red flag of the IWW in the scene design and in the performance hall to create an image of workers united together around a common cause.

As discussed previously, the American flag's exclusion from the interior of the performance hall concerned several New York reviewers. The IWW and the striking workers of Paterson had a complicated relationship to that symbol of American patriotism. Manufacturers seeking an end to the work stoppage declared March 17, 1913 "Flag Day," flew American flags in front of every silk mill and urged picketers to return to work because it was their patriotic duty.<sup>348</sup> In response, the IWW hung an American flag in Main Street in Paterson, over a sign that read, "We wove the flag, we dyed the flag, We live under the flag; but we won't scab under the flag."<sup>349</sup> This refrain from the striking workers reminded the larger Paterson public that the silk workers *made* the American flag at great personal cost. They did, they reassured, want to "live" under the flag—so much so that they earned a living in creating of one of the country's most valued symbols. They would not, however, let the manufacturers' rhetoric convince them to break allegiance to the union.

The IWW flag, to which their membership pledged allegiance, was intended to represent its cultural diversity. In a speech during the strike, Bill Haywood spoke of the importance of the red flag to the strikers: "We will have a new flag, an international flag. We will take the flag of every nation, dip them in a common dye pot and then take all out together. Then you will get a flag of one color—the red flag, the color of the working

---

<sup>348</sup> Kornbluh 201.

<sup>349</sup> Ibid.

man's blood, and under that we will march."<sup>350</sup> Again, the rhetoric of the IWW, both during the strike and in its pageant, implies that although made up of immigrants from several different parts of the world, they are all united under a common cause and working towards common goals.

Previous scholarship on the pageant points to the IWW's response to "Flag Day" as evidence of their rejection of a sentimentalized melting pot. In refusing to scab under the flag, the IWW was also refusing to let manufacturers force their hand into resuming work by insinuating the workers were unpatriotic for going out on strike. In this respect, the IWW and the striking Paterson workers did reject the prevailing Progressive Era melting pot logic, as demonstrated in other pageants like the one at Henry Street. Whereas the Henry Street pageant made claims for the ease and simplicity of the melting pot ideal, the Paterson strike and its pageant showed the difficulty of that process by exposing the ways workers and immigrant populations were abused under the guise of being "patriotic." The sought after ideal of the melting pot, the Paterson strike argued, could be used against less powerful citizens to exploit their labor.<sup>351</sup>

Although the Paterson Strike Pageant was certainly criticizing labor practices, and more specifically the labor practices in Paterson, New Jersey, I argue that they were not engaging in an outright rejection of the melting pot sentimentality. The pageant resisted a picture of seamless transition for the strike workers of Paterson, New Jersey, into "American" culture by acknowledging the workers' exploitation in the silk mills.

---

<sup>350</sup> Tripp 76.

<sup>351</sup> Linda Nochlin and Steve Golin also write about the Paterson strike pageant's criticism of America and, more specifically, the image of the melting pot. Nochlin 93; Golin 56.

However, the pageant, based in the rhetoric and actions of the IWW leadership, embodied an image of the striking workers which implied they had become their own “melting pot”: a group of varied ethnicity all easily working together for a common goal. This image of unity sought in the pageant masked the many problems of affiliation and loyalty seen throughout the events of the strike as the IWW leadership and the pageant organizers worked to gloss over those problems in an attempt to project a unified bloc lobbying for a cause.

### **Episode Five: “1. May Day; 2. Sending Away the Children”**

The May Day Parade. The workers of Paterson, with bands playing, flags flying, and women and children dressed in red, celebrate the international revolutionary labor day. The strikers give their children to the ‘strike mothers’ from other cities. The strike mothers receive them to be cared for during the war in the silk industry. Elizabeth Gurley Flynn speaks to the strikers and the children, dwelling upon the solidarity of labor shown in this vividly human episode, and is followed by William D. Haywood.<sup>352</sup>

The fifth episode was a combination of two events: a May Day parade and a recreation of the morning Paterson families sent their children away to New York to be taken care of by foster families for the duration of the work stoppage. Publicly staging the children’s send off was a strategic move for the IWW. They used a similar event to great success in Lawrence, Massachusetts. In the Paterson Strike Pageant the scene was

---

<sup>352</sup> Kornbluh 210.

performed as the climax to the May Day Parade scene, as hundreds of children in red sashes<sup>353</sup> were paraded onto stage, where they bade farewell to their mothers and were then put in the care of foster families: “With all the details of farewell embraces and tears, and finally shouts of enthusiasm breaking through the sadness of parting, the tots were handed over to the ‘strike mothers’ from other cities, and taken away, while Elizabeth Gurley Flynn made a consoling speech to the weeping mothers, and roused their spirits once more to the blind determination to fight on.”<sup>354</sup> When the actual event first took place during the strike, it was meant to focus attention on the plight of the workers’ families and sway public sentiment in their favor, at the expense of the local government, which the IWW felt was not sympathetic enough to the workers of their local silk industry.<sup>355</sup>

Despite the IWW’s success with this event in Lawrence, it was less beneficial to the strike in Paterson. When the children of strike families were sent away in Lawrence, the local government there attempted to prevent the children from boarding the outbound trains; in the ensuing skirmish, many were hurt. The IWW was then able to paint a picture in the local media of the Lawrence magistrates as willing to beat women and children in their efforts to stop the strike. In Paterson, however, perhaps because their local government had learned from others’ mistakes, when the IWW tried this tactic again, the local government kept out of their way. The IWW still made an event of it: pictures show children, some waving American flags, being carted to the train station in

---

<sup>353</sup> “Paterson Strikers Now Become Actors” 2.

<sup>354</sup> “Strike Realism Staged in Pageant” 4.

<sup>355</sup> Tripp 117-118.

wagons with banners on the sides reading “Children of Paterson Strikers.”<sup>356</sup> Although it produced a few sympathetic pictures of families saying goodbye to their children, the event in Paterson was not the watershed event it had been in Lawrence.<sup>357</sup>

Once the Paterson Strike Pageant established the union’s loyalty and solidarity through the first four scenes, it then used the fifth to demonstrate the ways in which the working classes of Paterson possessed strong family bonds, with the mother as the overseer of the home. As mentioned previously in the introduction, one of the basic suppositions behind some of the Progressive Era attempts at “reforming” the working class through initiatives like settlement houses was to teach homemaking skills and family values to an immigrant population assumed to have neither.<sup>358</sup> Staging the moments in which the children were separated from their parents had the potential to create empathy for the striking workers through an appeal to an audience’s sense of middle class values. The tearful goodbyes demonstrated to an audience first and foremost that the workers had very strong connections to their children, and they to them. The scene staged the close family bonds to demonstrate a similarity to those of their middle class audience: because contemporary judgments of the working class did not allow for strong family values, showing the Paterson workers in such a way challenged an audience to expand their understanding of the working class family in Paterson. The emotional goodbyes reminded middle class audience members that the workers they saw shared a similar belief in the importance of family.

---

<sup>356</sup> William D Haywood, “On the Paterson Picket Line,” *The International Socialist Review* 13.12 (June 1913) 847.

<sup>357</sup> Tripp 117-118.

<sup>358</sup> See Shannon Jackson, *Lines of Activity: Performance, Historiography, Hull-House Domesticity* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2000).

The scene also demonstrated the working class mother as an important presence in the domestic space. Elizabeth Gurley Flynn, the only female IWW leader working in Paterson, made a speech at the end of the scene to the mothers weeping over the recent departures. This underscored the episode as a scene of domestic loss, and it is, importantly, the women of Paterson who are shown distraught by its having taken place. This was another opportunity to demonstrate that the family life of the working class was similar to the believed family life of the middle classes: the mother as ultimate caretaker is the one left bereft when her home is torn apart.

On a level more specific to telling the story of the Paterson strike, the scene also lobbies for a great deal of empathy for the striking workers while simultaneously demonstrating their resolve and belief in their cause. Given this demonstration of deep familial affection, with the striking workers choosing to give up their children for the duration of the strike, shows how high the stakes were for the laborers. The recent violence towards the picketers by the police and private detectives meant that parents no longer felt their children safe, but their lack of income left them without recourse. Because the strike had gone on longer than anyone had first anticipated, parents could no longer provide for their families. Rather than submit their children to unsafe streets or a bare dinner table, the striking workers made the impossible choice to temporarily part with their children, that they might find better shelter elsewhere. While making clear the gravity of the situation in Paterson, it also showed an audience the great lengths to which the workers would go for their cause: they believed in their rights so much they would make the difficult choice to part with their children so they could continue their devotion

to the strike. It also painted the manufacturers as insensitive and unfeeling that they would push their workers to such a breaking point.

To see the workers pushed to such a decision begs the question: at what point, or did, Reed wish the audience's empathy to become pity? Staging such a scene, of children being ripped from their families and sent away to unfamiliar places, was described by reviewers as tearful for audience and performers alike. It was also perhaps a reminder to the middle class patrons in the audience that their ticket price was going towards an important cause—and would perhaps convince some to give more. It connected the plight of the workers in their shops to the protection of the domestic space—this scene in the pageant made the argument that you could not have one without the other. Without better regulations in the shops, the family home could not thrive. Connecting these two ideas together could perhaps extend past empathy and resound in a sense of pity for the workers and what they had gone through. But it also reminded an audience of the middle class that the safety of the working classes domestic space was forever tied to the mercy of their employers.

### **Episode Six: “Strike Meeting in Turner Hall”**

The strikers, men and women, legislate for themselves. They pass a law for the eight-hour day. No court can declare the law thus made unconstitutional.

Elizabeth Gurley Flynn, Carlo Tresca and William D. Haywood make typical strike speeches.<sup>359</sup>

---

<sup>359</sup> Kornbluh 210-212.

Elizabeth Gurley Flynn's description of the sixth episode reveals the final scene was staged to include the audience: the actors entered from the back of the auditorium, came up the center aisle, and walked to their meeting on stage. Once they reached the stage, they did not turn to face the audience; they kept their backs to the spectators and faced Bill Haywood, who had taken a spot upstage center at the head of the group. In turning to address the workers, Haywood was also the only body on stage facing the packed house at Madison Square Garden. The scene was staged so that Haywood was not only addressing the Paterson strikers, but the audience as well, who were now included in the group as if they were at the meeting, too.<sup>360</sup>

This scene of the pageant was the only one to suggest what the IWW hoped for: an opportunity for the strikers themselves to legislate their working conditions. Although the prior scenes staged what had actually taken place in Paterson, this scene reminded an audience of what was at stake. This episode was structured similarly to earlier historical pageants that concluded with a scene depicting a dreamed for future. Although the IWW truly believed they could successfully win an eight hour work day for the silk workers, it is unlikely they actually believed the local political machine in Paterson would embrace their working class members to the point of allowing them to legislate themselves.

Emotionally, the scene created another moment of alignment between the audience and the workers on stage. With audience and spectator treated as one, here was a scene of a future the audience could work for, too, if they would only consider themselves to be a part of the group. In the end, this scene never took place in the way the

---

<sup>360</sup> Flynn, *I Speak My Own Piece* 156.

IWW hoped. In the days after the pageant, news of the minimal funds raised by the performance got back to the workers in Paterson. Reed himself eventually went out to New Jersey to face the strikers and announce his plans to sail for Europe, citing exhaustion and a need to recover. Although historians disagree over the extent to which the pageant's financial failure contributed to the overall loss of morale, within weeks the strike was over. The first shops to break ranks and settle individually were the ribbon shops, populated by the English speaking workers. Once the group of striking workers was fractured, the shops negotiated freely on their own; the IWW leadership could do nothing to stem the tide. Although Elizabeth Gurley Flynn would make public her belief that the pageant ultimately brought on the end of the strike, the fault lines along which the mass of workers would eventually break had been present for quite some time, a fact the IWW leadership and Reed sought to hide during the strike and pageant. Although publicly maligned for its revolutionary politics, in attempting to find sympathy with a middle class audience, the Paterson Strike Pageant embraced notions of the Progressive Era "melting pot," and of middle class values, to create a less threatening and ultimately sympathetic picture of the silk workers in Paterson.

## Conclusion: Historical Pageantry's Varied Legacy

Historians disagree over precisely when historical pageantry faded as a popular performance form. Most, though, see the outbreak of World War I in 1914 as a pivotal moment in pageantry's history. The local grassroots initiatives and civic engagements, which fed pageantry's success prior to the war, were re-channeled into relief efforts once the United States entered the global conflict in 1917.<sup>361</sup> Once the war was over, pageantry never quite regained its initial momentum and the American Pageantry Association folded in the 1920s.

In retrospect, 1913 saw pageantry at the peak of its popularity, necessitating the creation of The American Pageantry Association that year, which recorded more than fifty pageant performances nationally.<sup>362</sup> Hundreds of audience members packed auditoriums and amphitheatres; pageant directors were respected as significant artists. It was an aesthetic that captured and reflected its time: the popular grass roots movements of the Progressive Era were mirrored back to audiences as pageantry employed huge casts of amateur performers to engage in local issues. The pageant form also challenged national Progressive Era politics in pieces like *Allegory*, *The Star of Ethiopia*, and the Paterson Strike Pageant.

Once progressivism was swept away, pageantry held far less consequence for its audiences. While pageantry had once reflected a populist spirit circulating in the United States, that attention to grassroots action was far diminished once soldiers came home. A

---

<sup>361</sup> Glassberg 213.

<sup>362</sup> Glassberg 246.

nation tested and hardened by loss could not return to its pre-war political tactics. Pageantry's form was so inextricably linked to progressivism that once that particular historical moment passed, pageantry could no longer constitute a public. An art form once functioning as a public performance of its political moment lost its relevance amidst a post-war climate.

Although support waned, pageantry was by no means stopped in its tracks; both Du Bois and MacKaye continued writing and directing pageants after 1913 to support their respective causes. Du Bois staged *The Star of Ethiopia* in Philadelphia in 1916, to commemorate the hundredth anniversary of that city's African Methodist Episcopal church. Du Bois took a hiatus from pageantry during the war and immediately after, but staged his pageant for the final time in Los Angeles in 1925.<sup>363</sup> He employed his familiar collaborator, director Charles Burroughs, with the task of rehearsing 700 local citizens for two June performances.<sup>364</sup>

The L.A. production of *The Star of Ethiopia*, almost ten years after the Philadelphia incarnation, was performed at the height of the Harlem Renaissance; Du Bois credited the early performances of his pageant as a harbinger of that movement. In the days leading up to the 1925 production's opening, Du Bois gave credit to the recent war, which "knocked" sense into Americans and allowed a new focus on African art.<sup>365</sup> He insisted further that that *The Star of Ethiopia* was not merely evidence of this

---

<sup>363</sup> W.E.B. Du Bois, "A Negro Art Renaissance," *Los Angeles Times* 14 June 1925: 27.

<sup>364</sup> "Pageant to be Epic of Negro Race," *Los Angeles Times* 14 June 1925: B12. I have not uncovered a script to the 1925 pageant; however, brief descriptions of the production's episodes appear to remain faithful to the 1915 production. Du Bois, "A Negro Art Renaissance" 27. See also "Pageant to be Epic of Negro Race" B12.

<sup>365</sup> Du Bois, "A Negro Art Renaissance" 26.

renaissance, but had paved the way forward through his pageant's focus on African and African American history. Through acknowledging and exploring these histories, he argued, *Star's* early productions encouraged the potential for future self-expression.<sup>366</sup> Additionally, the pageant was sponsored in part by the local NAACP; after the national board members' initial refusal to sponsor the pageant in 1913, *The Star of Ethiopia* found support from the group for its final performance.<sup>367</sup>

Hazel MacKaye's first foray into suffrage pageantry swayed her strongly in favor of the form's efficacy for fundraising and conversion to her cause; she continued to create pageants in support of women's rights in the years leading up to and immediately after World War I. Eight months after *Allegory's* debut MacKaye insisted in a speech before the School for Suffrage in Washington, D.C. that "The drama is undoubtedly the most powerful and effective means of carrying on the work of propaganda that we have at our command."<sup>368</sup> She went on to call for the creation of an office purely devoted to managing suffrage performances nationally, that women's groups across the country might perform plays and pageants under increased supervision and organization.<sup>369</sup>

Although her desire to see such an office would never be fulfilled, MacKaye staged two more suffrage pageants prior to 1917. *The American Woman: Six Periods in American Life*, a feminist re-imagining of key moments in U.S. history, was performed in New York in 1914 at the behest of the New York City Men's League for Woman

---

<sup>366</sup> Ibid. 27.

<sup>367</sup> "Negro Pageant Director to be Welcomed Here," *Los Angeles Times* 12 May 1925: A1.

<sup>368</sup> Hazel MacKaye, "Plays and Pageants in Connection with Woman Suffrage," unpublished ms, Papers of MacKaye Family; ML-5; Rauner Special Collections Library, Dartmouth College, Hanover, NH: 2-3.

<sup>369</sup> Ibid. 6.

Suffrage.<sup>370</sup> Alice Paul commissioned another pageant, *Susan B. Anthony*, from MacKaye the following year; by then, Paul had broken from NAWSA and was leading the Congressional Union. *Susan B. Anthony*, a biographical pageant devoted to the suffragist who had died nine years before, earned MacKaye some of her best reviews and was subsequently produced by a number of suffrage groups across the country.<sup>371</sup>

MacKaye halted her suffrage work during the war, but still remained active in pageantry. The Young Women's Christian Association (YWCA) hired her to their War Work Council as Director of the Pageantry Department to produce "morale boosting pageants."<sup>372</sup> Following the war, MacKaye returned to political pageants when she staged *Into the Light*. Commissioned by the National Woman's Party in 1923 to commemorate the seventy-fifth anniversary of the Seneca Falls Women's Rights Convention, *Into the Light* launched the NWP's campaign for an Equal Rights Amendment.<sup>373</sup> This would be MacKaye's final pageant. She taught for a time at Brookside Labor College, but she too felt pageantry's declining popularity and never again took up the form in support of women's rights.<sup>374</sup>

Although performance was never a focus for John Reed again after 1913, the few remaining years of his life after the Paterson pageant were devoted to investigating global working class political issues. Mabel Dodge accompanied John Reed to Europe for "convalescence" after the sole performance of the Paterson Strike Pageant. Their

---

<sup>370</sup> Blair, *Torchbearers* 139.

<sup>371</sup> Karen J. Blair, "Pageantry for Women's Rights: The Career of Hazel MacKaye, 1913-1923," *Theatre Survey* 31 (May 1990): 42.

<sup>372</sup> *Ibid.* 43.

<sup>373</sup> Blair, *Torchbearers* 140-141.

<sup>374</sup> Blair, "Pageantry for Women's Rights" 45.

romantic affair fizzled overseas. Once back in New York, Dodge went back to her salons, although they too would not last much longer. Her salon circle never attempted another pageant. Reed left the group altogether to become a war correspondent; he covered the 1917 Bolshevik revolution in Russia, before dying there of typhus in 1920. The IWW did not attempt pageantry again, either, but in the 1920s and 30s other U.S. labor unions would employ performance in a similar fashion—to raise awareness about their working conditions, build financial stability, and support their memberships. Workers’ Theatre took a variety of forms, from informal classes taught at the close of the workday to *Pins and Needles*, a Broadway musical, performed by the International Ladies’ Garment Workers’ Union.<sup>375</sup>

Once pageantry lost its popularity in the early twentieth century, launching cogent political critique through the aesthetic was less effective. Since that time, newer performance forms have taken shape to explore questions of national identity, citizenship, and democracy. Theater historians acknowledge historical pageantry as an important precursor to contemporary community-based performance. The relationship is a complex one, however, because while community-based performance does not seek to replicate historical pageants, they are inspired by the ideas and ideals behind pageantry, especially in its ability to address political concerns.

Jan Cohen-Cruz describes community-based performance of the past thirty-five years as “a response to a collectively significant issue or circumstance” devised as a

---

<sup>375</sup> See Colette A. Hyman, *Staging Strikes: Workers’ Theatre and the American Labor Movement* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1997); Michael Denning, *The Cultural Front: The Laboring of American Culture in the Twentieth Century* (New York: Verso, 1997); Bruce McConachie and Daniel Friedman, eds., *Theatre for Working Class Audiences in the United States, 1830-1980* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1985).

“collaboration between an artist or ensemble and a ‘community’ in that the latter is a primary source of the text, possibly of performers as well, and definitely a goodly portion of the audience.”<sup>376</sup> The Cornerstone Theater in Los Angeles is perhaps one of the most famous examples of this work; they are currently devising the “Justice Cycle,” a series of six performances created for their 2009-2010 production season. Each of the pieces is a collaboration between Cornerstone artists and Los Angeles community members exploring how “laws create and disrupt communities.” The shows address a range of legislation effecting migrant workers, reproductive rights, and the local environment, among other topics.<sup>377</sup>

Cohen-Cruz names historical pageantry as an important precursor to contemporary community-based performance, but significantly locates the two as a part of the same genealogy, or “family” of performance, rather than a “cause-and-effect history.”<sup>378</sup> Cohen-Cruz makes clear that community-based performance and pageantry are related through their commitments to social engagement, even if the products take widely different forms. *Allegory*, *The Star of Ethiopia*, and the Paterson Strike Pageant belong in this family of performance that builds on community concerns and interests to begin a community dialogue. Many additional time periods in U.S. theatre history could be included in this family—workers’ theatre of the 1930s, the Federal Theatre Project,

---

<sup>376</sup> Jan Cohen-Cruz, *Local Acts: Community-Based Performance in the United States* (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2005) 2.

<sup>377</sup> Cornerstone Theater Company website. Visited August 29, 2009.

<[http://www.cornerstonetheater.org/content/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=117:the-justice-cycle&catid=21:now-playing-current-shows&Itemid=110](http://www.cornerstonetheater.org/content/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=117:the-justice-cycle&catid=21:now-playing-current-shows&Itemid=110)>.

<sup>378</sup> Cohen-Cruz 17. Sonja Kufinec also discusses the significance of pageantry as a precursor to community-based performance in her book *Staging America: Cornerstone and Community-Based Performance* (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2003) 26-31.

the off-Broadway collectives of the 1960s, and perhaps even my neighborhood pageant, which opened this study.

## **Bibliography**

### **Collections:**

Du Bois, William Edward Burghardt. W.E.B. Du Bois Papers. Special Collections and University Archives. University of Massachusetts Amherst.

MacKaye, Hazel. Papers of MacKaye Family, 1751-1990. Rauner Special Collections Library. Dartmouth College.

Reed, John. John Reed Papers, 1903-1967. Houghton Library. Harvard University.

### **Books and Articles:**

“5,000 Women March for Suffrage Cause.” *New York Times* 4 Mar. 1913: 5.

“10,000 See Pageant of Henry St. Life,” *New York Times* 8 June 1913: 7.

“A National Emancipation Exposition,” *The Crisis* 6.4 (Aug. 1913): 181.

“A Pageant of Women at Woodrow Wilson’s Inauguration.” *Boston Sunday Post* 26 Jan. 1913, sec. 2: 3.

“‘All the World’s a Stage’: From Poetry to Fact.” *Boston Evening Transcript* 18 July 1917: 5.

Addams, Jane. “Social Control.” *The Crisis* 1.3 (Jan. 1911): 22.

Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso, 1983.

Arnesen, Eric, Julie Greene, and Bruce Laurie. Ed. *Labor Histories: Class, Politics, and the Working-Class Experience*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1998.

Banes, Sally. *Writing Dancing in the Age of Post-Modernism*. Hanover: Wesleyan University Press, 1994.

Banta, Martha. *Imaging American Women: Idea and Ideals in Cultural History*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1987.

Barker, John. *The Superhistorians: Makers of our Past*. New York: Charles Scribner’s, 1982.

- Bederman, Gail. *Manliness & Civilization: A Cultural History of Gender and Race in the United States, 1880-1917*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995.
- Benjamin, Walter. "Theses on the Philosophy of History." *Illuminations*. New York: Schocken Books, 1969.
- Berlant, Lauren. *The Queen of America Goes to Washington City: Essays on Sex and Citizenship*. Durham: Duke University Press, 1997.
- Bernal, Martin. *Black Athena: The Afroasiatic Roots of Classical Civilization*. Vol. 1. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1987.
- Blair, Karen J. "Pageantry for Women's Rights: The Career of Hazel MacKaye, 1913-1923." *Theatre Survey* 31 (May 1990): 23-46.
- . *The Torchbearers: Women and Their Amateur Arts Associations in America, 1890-1930*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994.
- Bland, Sidney Roderick. "Techniques of Persuasion: The National Woman's Party and Woman Suffrage, 1913-1919." Diss. George Washington University, 1972.
- Blight, David W. "Fifty Years of Freedom: The Memory of Emancipation at the Civil War Semicentennial, 1911-15." *Slavery & Abolition: A Journal of Slave and Post-Slave Studies* 21.2 (2000) 117-134.
- . "W.E.B. Du Bois and the Struggle for American Historical Memory." *History and Memory in African American Culture*. Ed. Geneviève Fabre and Robert O'Meally. New York: Oxford University Press, 1994.
- Canning, Charlotte. "Feminist Performance as Feminist Historiography," *Theatre Survey* 45:2 (Nov. 2004): 227-233.
- Carby, Hazel. *Race Men*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1998.
- . *Reconstructing Womanhood: The Emergence of the Afro-American Woman Novelist*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1987.
- Chambers, John Whiteclay. *The Tyranny of Change: America in the Progressive Era, 1890-1920*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1992.
- "Clark Declares for Suffrage; But Marshal Intimates to Delegation That His Wife Won't Let Him." *New York Times* 28 June 1914: 10.

- Clark, Genevieve Champ. "Parade as Seen by Miss Clark." *The Washington Herald* 4 Mar 1913: 2.
- Cogan, Frances B. *All-American Girl: The Ideal of Real Womanhood in Mid-Nineteenth-Century America*. Athens: The University of Georgia Press, 1989.
- Cohen, Selma Jeanne. *Next Week, Swan Lake: Reflections on Dance and Dances*. Middletown: Wesleyan University Press, 1982.
- Cohen-Cruz, Jan. *Local Acts: Community-Based Performance in the United States*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2005.
- Coleman, John E. "Did Egypt Shape the Glory that was Greece?" *Black Athena Revisited*. Ed. Mary R. Lefkowitz and Guy MacLean Rogers. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1996.
- Cooppan, Vilashini. "Move On Down the Line: Domestic Science, Transnational Politics, and Gendered Allegory in Du Bois." *Next to the Color Line: Gender, Sexuality, and W.E.B. Du Bois*. Ed. Susan Gillman and Alys Eve Weinbaum. Minneapolis, London: University of Minnesota Press, 2007.
- Cott, Nancy F. *The Grounding of Modern Feminism*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1987.
- Davis, Angela Y. *Women, Race & Class*. New York: Random House, 1981.
- Davol, Ralph. *A Handbook of American Pageantry*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Taunton: Davol Publishing Company, 1914.
- Davis, Angela Y. *Women, Race & Class*. New York: Random House, 1981.
- Davy, Kate. "Outing Whiteness: A Feminist/Lesbian Project." *Theatre Journal* 47 (1995): 189-205.
- Deloria, Phillip. *Playing Indian*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998.
- Denning, Michael. *The Cultural Front: The Laboring of American Culture in the Twentieth Century*. New York: Verso, 1997.
- Diner, Steven J. *A Very Different Age: Americans of the Progressive Era*. New York: Hill and Wang, 1998.
- Du Bois, W.E.B. "A Pageant." *Pamphlets and Leaflets by W.E.B. Du Bois*. Ed. Herbert Aptheker. White Plains: Kraus-Thomson Organization, 1986.

- . "A Negro Art Renaissance." *Los Angeles Times* 14 June 1925: 26-27.
- . "The Drama Among Black Folk." *The Crisis* 12.4 (Aug. 1916): 169-173.
- . *The Philadelphia Negro: A Social Study*. The Oxford W.E.B. Du Bois. Ed. Henry Louis Gates, Jr. Cambridge, Oxford University Press, 2007.
- . *The Negro*. The Oxford W.E.B. Du Bois. Ed. Henry Louis Gates, Jr. Cambridge: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- . "The Star of Ethiopia." *The Crisis* 11.2 (Dec. 1915): 90-94.
- . "The Talented Tenth." *The Negro Problem: A Series of Articles by Representative American Negroes of To-day*. 1903. New York: Arno Press and the New York Times, 1969.
- Dyer, Richard. *White*. New York: Routledge, 1997.
- Eisenach, Eldon J. *The Lost Promise of Progressivism*. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1994.
- Erdman, Harley. *Staging the Jew: The Performance of an American Ethnicity, 1860-1920*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1997.
- Essin, Christin. "Landscapes of American Modernity: A Cultural History of Theatrical Design, 1912-1951." Diss. The University of Texas at Austin. 2006.
- Fleming, E. McClung. "From Indian Princess to Greek Goddess: The American Image, 1783-1815." *Winterthur Portfolio* 3 (1967): 37-66.
- Fletcher, John. "Common Stage, Contested Stage: Democratic Performance Activism in the USA." Diss. University of Minnesota. 2005.
- Flexner, Eleanor and Ellen Fitzpatrick. *Century of Struggle: The Woman's Rights Movement in the United States*. Enlarged Ed. Cambridge: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1996.
- Flynn, Elizabeth Gurley. *I Speak My Own Piece: Autobiography of "The Rebel Girl"*. New York: Masses & Mainstream, 1955.
- . "The Truth About the Paterson Strike." *Rebel Voices: An I.W.W. Anthology*. Ed. Joyce Kornbluh. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 1964.

- Ford, Linda G. "Alice Paul and the Triumph of Militancy." *One Woman, One Vote: Rediscovering the Woman Suffrage Movement*. Ed. Marjorie Spruill Wheeler. Troutdale: NewSage Press, 1995.
- Foster, Susan Leigh, ed. *Choreographing History*. Bloomington: University of Indiana Press, 1995.
- Frankenberg, Ruth. "Local Whiteness, Localizing Whiteness." *Displacing Whiteness: Essays in Social and Cultural Criticism*. Ed. Ruth Frankenberg. Durham: Duke University Press, 1997.
- . *White Women, Race Matters: The Social Construction of Whiteness*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1993.
- Fusco, Coco and Brian Wallis. Ed. *Only Skin Deep: Changing Visions of the American Self*. New York: International Center of Photography, 2003.
- Gerstle, Gary. *American Crucible: Race and Nation in the Twentieth Century*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001.
- Giddings, Paula. *Ida: A Sword Among Lions*. New York: Amistad, 2008.
- . *When and Where I Enter: The Impact of Black Women on Race and Sex in America*. New York: Bantam Books, 1984.
- Glassberg, David. *American Historical Pageantry: The Uses of Tradition in the Early Twentieth Century*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1990.
- Goddard, Leslie. "'Something to Vote For': Theatricalism in the U.S. Women's Suffrage Movement." Diss. Northwestern University, 2001.
- Goldman, Emma. "Intellectual Proletarians." *Mother Earth* 8.12 (Feb. 1914): 363-370.
- Golin, Steve. "Paterson Strike Pageant: Success or Failure?" *Socialist Review* 69 (May-June 1983): 45-78.
- Gorrell, Donald K. *The Age of Responsibility: The Social Gospel of the Progressive Era, 1900-1920*. Macon: Mercer University Press, 1988.
- Gould, Lewis L. *America in the Progressive Era, 1890-1914*. Harlow, England: Pearson, 2001.
- . "The Progressive Era." *The Progressive Era*. Ed. Lewis L. Gould. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1974.

- Green, Martin. *New York 1913: The Armory Show and the Paterson Strike Pageant*. New York: Scribner, 1988.
- Harris, Michael D. *Colored Pictures: Race and Visual Representation*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2003.
- Hartigan, John Jr. "Locating White Detroit." *Displacing Whiteness: Essays in Social and Cultural Criticism*. Ed. Ruth Frankenberg. Durham: Duke University Press, 1997.
- Haywood, William D. "On the Paterson Picket Line," *The International Socialist Review* 13.12 (June 1913): 847-851.
- . "The Rip in the Silk Industry." *The International Socialist Review* 13.11 (May 1913): 783-788.
- "Hedwig Reicher, Who Turns to a Play in English." *New York Times* 28 Feb. 1909: X9.
- Heyer, Elfriede and Roger C. Norton. Introduction. *Reflections on the Imitation of Greek Works in Painting and Sculpture*. By Johann Joachim Winckelmann. La Salle: Open Court, 1987.
- Hill, Errol G. and James V. Hatch. *A History of African American Theatre*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.
- Hoelshcher, Steven. "Making Place, Making Race: Performances of Whiteness in the Jim Crow South." *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 93.3 (2003): 657-686.
- Hoff, Joan. *Law, Gender, and Injustice: A Legal History of U.S. Women*. New York: New York University Press, 1991.
- Horowitz, Joseph. *Dvořák in America: In Search of the New World*. Chicago: Cricket Books, 2003.
- Hyman, Colette A. *Staging Strikes: Workers' Theatre and the American Labor Movement*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1997.
- "Inauguration Pageant," *New York Tribune* 2 Mar. 1913: 8.
- Izard, Forrest. *Heroines of the Modern Stage*. New York: Sturgis & Walton Company, 1915.

- Jackson, Shannon. *Lines of Activity: Performance, Historiography, Hull-House Domesticity*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2000.
- Jacobson, Matthew Frye. *Whiteness of a Different Color: European Immigrants and the Alchemy of Race*. Cambridge, Harvard University Press, 1998.
- James, Joy. *Transcending the Talented Tenth: Black Leaders and American Intellectuals*. New York: Routledge, 1997.
- Kilroy, David P. *For Race and Country: The Life and Career of Colonel Charles Young*. Westport: Praeger, 2003.
- Kornbluh, Joyce L. Ed. *Rebel Voices: An I.W.W. Anthology*. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 1964.
- Krasner, David. “‘The Pageant is the Thing’: Black Nationalism and *The Star of Ethiopia*.” *Performing America: Cultural Nationalism in American Theater*. Ed. Jeffrey D. Mason and J. Ellen Gainor. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1999.
- Kuftinec, Sonja. *Staging America: Cornerstone and Community-Based Performance*. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2003.
- Ladd, Valeria. Introduction. *Rhythm for Dance and Art: The Exact Notes Taken of the Teaching in Action of Florence Fleming Noyes*. By Florence Fleming Noyes. Portland: Noyes School of Rhythm Foundation, Inc., 1982.
- Lefkowitz, Mary R. and Guy MacLean, eds. *Black Athena Revisited*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1996.
- Lewis, David Levering, ed. *W. E. B. Du Bois: A Reader*. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1995.
- Luhan, Mabel Dodge. *Movers and Shakers*. 1936. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1985.
- MacKaye, Percy. *The Civic Theatre*. New York: Mitchell Kennerley, 1912.
- Maclean, M.D. “African Civilization.” *The Crisis* 1.5 (Mar. 1911): 23-25.
- Mann, Arthur. *The One and the Many: Reflections on American Identity*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1979.

- May, Henry F. *The End of American Innocence: A Study of the First Years of Our Own Time, 1912-1917*. 1959. New York: Columbia University Press, 1992.
- McConachie, Bruce and Daniel Friedman, eds. *Theatre for Working Class Audiences in the United States, 1830-1980*. Westport: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Milholland, Mrs. John E. "Talks About Women." *The Crisis* 1.2 (Dec. 1910): 28.
- . "Talks About Women" *The Crisis* 1.3 (Jan. 1911): 27.
- Mink, Gwendolyn. *Old Labor and New Immigrants in American Political Development: Union, Party, and State, 1875-1920*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986.
- Monroe, John G. "The Harlem Little Theatre Movement, 1920-1929." *The Journal of American Culture* 6.4 (Winter 1983): 63-70.
- Morton, Patricia. *Disfigured Images: The Historical Assault on Afro-American Women*. New York: Greenwood Press, 1991.
- Mullen, Harryette. "Optic White: Blackness and the Production of Whiteness." *Diacritics* 24 (1994): 71-89.
- "Negro Pageant Director to be Welcomed Here," *Los Angeles Times* 12 May 1925: A1.
- "Negroes Open Exposition," *The New York Tribune* 23 Oct. 1913: 16.
- Newman, Louise Michele. *White Women's Right: The Racial Origins of Feminism in the United States*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Nochlin, Linda. "The Paterson Strike Pageant of 1913." *Theatre for Working-Class Audiences in the United States, 1830-1980*. Eds. Bruce A. McConachie and Daniel Friedman. Westport: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Novkov, Julie. *Constituting Workers, Protecting Women: Gender, Law, and Labor in the Progressive Era and New Deal Years*. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 2001.
- Omi, Michael and Howard Winant. *Racial Formation in the United States: From the 1960s to the 1980s*. New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1986.
- "Pageant to be Epic of Negro Race," *Los Angeles Times* 14 June 1925: B12.
- "Patterson Strikers Now Become Actors," *New York Times* 8 June 1913: 2.

- Perry, Jeffrey Babcock. *Hubert Harrison: The Voice of Harlem Radicalism, 1883-1918*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2009.
- Phelan, Peggy. *Unmarked*. New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Potter, Grace. "Max Eastman's Two New Books." *The New Review* 1.20 (Sept. 1913): 793-797.
- Potts, Alex. *Flesh and the Ideal: Winckelmann and the Origins of Art History*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994.
- Powell, Richard J. *Black Art and Culture in the 20<sup>th</sup> Century*. New York: Thames & Hudson, 1997.
- Prevots, Naima. *American Pageantry: A Movement for Art & Democracy*. Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1990.
- Ramirez, Bruno. *When Workers Fight: The Politics of Industrial Relations in the Progressive Era, 1898-1916*. Westport: Greenwood Press, 1978.
- Reed, John. "The War in Patterson." *John Reed for The Masses*. Ed. James C. Wilson. Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarland & Company, Inc.: 1987.
- Rich, Charlotte. *Transcending the New Woman: Multiethnic Narratives in the Progressive Era*. Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 2009.
- Ruyter, Nancy Lee Chalfa. "Antique Longings: Genevieve Stebbins and American Delsartean Performance." *Corporealities: Dancing Knowledge, Culture and Power*. Ed. Susan Leigh Foster. New York; London: Routledge, 1996.
- Schneider, Dorothy and Carl J. Schneider. *American Women in the Progressive Era, 1900-1920*. New York: Facts on File, 1993.
- Seniors, Paula Marie. *Beyond Lift Every Voice and Sing: The Culture of Uplift, Identity, and Politics in Black Musical Theatre*. Columbus: The Ohio State University Press, 2009.
- Smith, John David. *An Old Creed for the New South: Proslavery Ideology and Historiography, 1865-1918*. Westport: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Smith, Shawn Michelle. *Photography on the Color Line: W.E.B. Du Bois, Race, and Visual Culture*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2004.

- Sollors, Werner. *Beyond Ethnicity: Consent and Descent in American Culture*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1986.
- Stebbins, Genevieve. *Delsarte System of Expression*. New York: Edgar S. Werner Publishing & Supply Co., 1902.
- “Strike Realism Staged in Pageant.” *New York Tribune* 8 June 1913: 1.
- “Suffrage Paraders to be Warmly Clad.” *Philadelphia North American* 9 Feb. 1913, sec. 3: 7.
- Taylor, Diana. *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2003.
- “The Exposition,” *The Crisis* 7.2 (Dec. 1913): 84.
- “The Great Pageant.” *The Washington Bee* 23 Oct. 1915: 1; 6.
- “The National Emancipation Exposition,” *The Crisis* 7.1 (Nov. 1913): 339-341.
- “The National Emancipation Exposition in New York City: The Temple of Beauty in the Great Court of Freedom.” *The Crisis* 7.2 (Dec. 1913): 78.
- “The New German Theatre.” *New York Times* 27 Sept. 1908: X2.
- “The Pageant, ‘Star of Ethiopia,’ in Philadelphia.” *The Crisis* 12.4 (Aug. 1916): 170.
- “The Paterson Strike Pageant.” *The Independent* 19 June 1913: 1406-1407.
- “The Star of Ethiopia,” *The Crisis* 11.2 (Dec. 1915): 91.
- Thornton, John K. Introduction. *The Negro*. By W.E.B. Du Bois. The Oxford W.E.B. Du Bois. Ed. Henry Louis Gates, Jr. Cambridge: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- “Three Expositions.” *The Crisis* 6.6 (Oct. 1913): 297.
- Tomko, Linda J. *Dancing Class: Gender, Ethnicity, and Social Divides in American Dance, 1890-1920*. Bloomington & Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1999.
- Tripp, Anne Huber. *The I.W.W. and the Paterson Silk Strike of 1913*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1987.
- “Two Pageants—A Contrast,” *The New York Times* 9 June 1913: 8.

- Van Deburg, William L. *Slavery & Race in American Popular Culture*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1984.
- Wallace, Michele. *Black Macho and the Myth of the Superwoman*. New York: Dial Press, 1979.
- Welter, Barbara. "The Cult of True Womanhood." *American Quarterly* 18 (Summer, 1966): 151-174.
- White, Deborah Gray. *Ar'n't I a Woman?: Female Slaves in the Plantation South*. New York: Norton, 1985.
- Winters, Donald E. Jr. *The Soul of the Wobblies: The I.W.W., Religion, and American Culture in the Progressive Era, 1905-1917*. Westport: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- "Woman's Appeal." *The Evening Star* 3 Mar. 1913: 6.
- "Women Appear in Tableaux." *The Washington Herald* 4 Mar. 1913: 9.
- "Women Battle Hostile Mobs in Capital Parade." *New York Tribune* 4 Mar. 1913: 1.
- Zangwill, Israel. *The Melting Pot*. Rev. Ed. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1916.
- Zeidel, Robert F. *Immigrants, Progressives, and Exclusion Politics: The Dillingham Commission, 1900-1927*. DeKalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 2004.

## **Vita**

Rebecca Coleman Hewett graduated from high school in Fairfax, Virginia at James W. Robison Secondary School in 1997. She received her Bachelor of Arts degree from the College of William and Mary in 2001. Following graduation she interned in the press department at the John F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts in Washington, D.C. In the fall of 2002, she began her graduate studies at The University of Texas at Austin, where she received her Master of Arts in the spring of 2004.

Permanent Address: 608 Valley Road, Sanford, North Carolina 27330.

This dissertation was typed by the author.