

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Southern Political Science Association

Policymaking for Social Security. by Martha Derthick

Review by: Gary Freeman

The Journal of Politics, Vol. 42, No. 4 (Nov., 1980), pp. 1191-1193

Published by: [Cambridge University Press](#) on behalf of the [Southern Political Science Association](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2130753>

Accessed: 04/02/2014 13:42

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
<http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Cambridge University Press and Southern Political Science Association are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Journal of Politics*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

Perhaps Jordan was forced to resort to anecdotal touches simply because much of what he proposed to write about was covered with a veil of secrecy. But then, classifications being terminal, would not it be reasonable to expect some of these restrictions to have been lifted after a decent interval? Admittedly, the author also covered more substantive points, but overall the book does not live up to the promise stated in its subtitle.

A little disappointing as well (for entirely different reasons) is Phillip Taylor's work. The writer argues that the European Community, while internally stagnant, has made important strides in its external role. Political analysts and concerned practitioners failed to foresee this phenomenon. Nor have contemporary integration theories provided satisfactory explanations. Taylor, desirous to fill that vacuum, has conducted extensive field work that has generated a mass of data. Nevertheless, it would seem a trifle presumptuous to label the end product behavioral analysis. Taylor's method of data gathering (elite interviews), as well as the structure of their application, is somewhat ramshackle. The samples are not only small but highly selective. The questions in the plethora of surveys are occasionally irrelevant. This evidence hardly enables Taylor to test theories of political integration. Finally, it is more than presumptuous to assume that his explanatory model of the internal stagnation/external progress pattern of the European Community can be applied to the study of political and economic integration and regional organizations throughout the world.

HENRI J. WARMENHOVEN, *Virginia Commonwealth University*

Policymaking for Social Security. By MARTHA DERTHICK. (Washington: The Brookings Institution, 1979. Pp. xiv, 446. \$11.95 cloth, \$4.95 paper.)

This masterful and timely study asks why the politics of social security has not been more intense. The author relentlessly pursues the answer by examining the policy-making system, program characteristics, and instances of major expansion since 1935. She finds that social security policy normally has been made in a closed environment with few participants. The most important have been

the talented, politically adroit, and dedicated executives at the Social Security Administration (SSA). Committed to a comprehensive social insurance system, these program proprietors have worked closely with Congress and labor to build the system incrementally. The Congressional committees with jurisdiction have demonstrated a sense of trusteeship with respect to the system, and program executives have defeated criticism and reform proposals originating elsewhere through their monopoly of expertise, their reputation for efficiency, and their organizational autonomy within HEW.

The program itself is marked by "ambiguity, obscurity, and paradox" (8). Public misunderstanding has been encouraged by the SSA through the dissemination of the symbols of contributory insurance and compounded by the juxtaposition of the contradictory goals of equity and adequacy. Costs have been hidden and benefits, in the early years, unrealistically high: the self-interest of politicians and beneficiaries has led both to support expansion. Conflict has occurred only over "boundary issues" (369-377) such as the introduction of the disability and medicare programs. Having devoted nearly 400 pages to building the case for the non-politics of social security, however, the author ends by showing that this cozy political arrangement has begun to unravel under the pressure of the fiscal difficulties of the maturing system.

The following are less criticisms than suggestions for building on this work. Derthick's analysis of the political sources of policy is compelling, but her interpretation is limited by a lack of any real sense of the structural relationship between the program and the economy and how this has changed over time. Her uncritical treatment of "generalist" decision-makers fails to see that by more closely aligning the system with the needs of capitalist development they may narrow rather than broaden "society's options" (412-428). The growth and popularity of social security is from a structural and comparative perspective far less remarkable than the leaden pace of reform and its profoundly conservative character. The lack of business resistance reflects the fact that their "fundamental interests" (133) were not normally threatened, but we are left to wonder why this is so. The concept of "boundary issue" is insufficient, because its focus on the division of labor between the public and private spheres obscures the inter-relationship between the two. The exploration of these questions would help explain the otherwise anomalous behavior of the program executives who, in Derthick's account, are benevolent, if ultimately misguided, social engineers

almost completely divorced from social context. Hers is a case of internally derived welfare state expansion run wild. One needs to see the activities of these bureaucrats as constrained, not only by the political realities delineated by the author, but by the logic of capitalist development as well.

GARY FREEMAN, *The University of Texas at Austin*

Tides Among Nations. By KARL W. DEUTSCH. (New York: The Free Press, 1979. Pp. viii, 342. \$17.95.)

The Correlates of War: I: Research Origins and Rationale. Edited by J. DAVID SINGER. (New York: The Free Press, 1979. Pp. xix, 405. \$17.95.)

The Politics of Peril: Economics, Society, and the Prevention of War. By CARL FRIEDRICH VON WEIZSÄCKER. (New York: The Seabury Press, 1978. Pp. xi, 276. \$12.95.)

The theme that unites these ostensibly disparate books is the relevance of modern social science to our understanding of and ability to control international conflict. Thus they provide an occasion for reflections not only on the causes of war but also on some basic methodological issues in the study of international politics and on the question of the feasibility of applied peace research.

The volumes by Deutsch and by Singer are useful collections of papers published by their authors over the years. *Tides Among Nations* collects 18 papers by Karl Deutsch on the subject of national and international integration written over a period from 1940 to 1974 and originally published in widely scattered places. Thus it not only makes an important part of Deutsch's scholarly contribution more easily available, but it also enables one to see more clearly the evolution of his thinking on these questions. The early papers reveal clearly his uncanny ability to synthesize large quantities of research in diverse fields and languages and tease out of it provocative generalizations and contain interesting applications of economic theory to the study of national integration. The later papers provide examples of his innovations in quantitative methods for the study of these phenomena, as well as his contributions to theory in this area. The book also includes some reflections by the author on the trajectory of his work and what lies ahead.