Medieval Academy of America

Der Herzogstitel in Frankreich und Deutschland (9. bis 12. Jahrhundert) by Walther Kienast

Review by: Archibald R. Lewis

Speculum, Vol. 44, No. 3 (Jul., 1969), pp. 473-474

Published by: [Medieval Academy of America](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2855524>

Accessed: 05/02/2014 09:12

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at

<http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Medieval Academy of America is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Speculum*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

the former contradicting the latter's emphasis on soft expression, maternal tenderness, and infant dependency. Donatello and others turn to a new reality — strength and the revealed human figure as the perfect embodiment of strength or beauty or other attributes. A final gasp of the *gotico internazionale* appears in an archaizing trend peaking out *ca* 1460. The later work of Ucello and the decade of Donatello's return to Padua show its influence, based on a cultural trend exemplified in the Florentine patrician's desire to cut off any further secularization of religious art.

The clear evocation of the spirit of the *gotico internazionale* as well as the discussion of its characteristic media and attributes, both in Italy and outside, make Keller's book useful to a wide audience. It would be pleasing to have it available in English.

BRUCE S. EASTWOOD
Clarkson College of Technology

WALTHER KIENAST, *Der Herzogstitel in Frankreich und Deutschland (9. bis 12. Jahrhundert)*. München, Vienna: R. Oldenbourg, 1968. Pp. 505; 7 genealogical tables. DM 110.

THIS volume by a leading German scholar and dealing with the development of the ducal title in France from the ninth through the twelfth century and in Germany from the tenth through the twelfth century represents a real contribution to our knowledge. Written in *handbuch* style with copiously full references, it is a monument to German scholarship at its best. It traces the first appearance and continued use of the ducal title by a number of French and German noble families; those of Francia, Burgundy, Normandy, Brittany, Aquitaine, Poitou, Gascony, Toulouse-Narbonne in France, and of the *stam* and other duchies of Germany. Its French section is particularly full and complete where the author provides a kind of precise information gathered together in a form unavailable elsewhere — even in the *Histoire General de Languedoc*. Except for the Gascon dukes, for whom there simply exists no records during certain periods, the result is admirable precision and clarity. Any scholar using it will therefore have available to him a mine of essential information which will simplify his labors. Particularly useful are the genealogical charts concerning the leading French ducal families.

In the light of all this it might perhaps be ungrateful to wish for more. But one should note that the author has chosen to omit any references to German dukes and their titles in the ninth century, and instead begins his examination of them in the tenth century when the Saxon line took over Germany. This makes a comparison between French and German practices and ideas difficult indeed, as far as origins are concerned.

Even more important, though the author states in his introduction that he has prepared for publication an additional study of the dukes and ducal titles in the earlier Frankish period, this work starts with the Carolingian Empire at its height. This gives a curious sense of unreality to the total picture he so ably presents. For, as is well known, dukes and ducal title began to appear in a fully developed form in the seventh and eighth centuries — not in the ninth and tenth.

One can make a good case for the assertion that the Carolingian era interrupted a natural development along this line rather than serving as a point of origin. Witness late Merovingian Dukes of Saxony, Allemania, and Bavaria as well as Thuringia and Frisia and the seventh century Dukes of Brittany, Gascony, Aquitaine, and Septemania, and the Patrician of Provence. One might also conjecture that Merovingian Neustria was the precursor of the later Duchy of France. Merovingian Austrasia of the Duchy of Lorraine, and Merovingian Burgundy of the later Duchy of Burgundy.

In welcoming this valuable work of scholarship, then, one must be aware that the material it contains and the insights its author provides only partially answer the problem as to why and how dukes and ducal titles appeared in Germany and France during the Early and High Middle Ages.

ARCHIBALD R. LEWIS
University of Texas at Austin

JORGE LAPORTA, *La destinée de la nature humaine selon saint Thomas d'Aquin. (Études de philosophie médiévale, LV.)* Paris: J. Vrin, 1965, Paper Pp. 168.

ONE often finds Thomas Aquinas emphasizing the Christian view that man is destined to see God as he is in himself. But if Thomas can constantly affirm this as the final goal of human endeavor, his texts seem to leave another question in doubt: is this vision of God the end of human nature as such, or is it only a supernatural end for man? Laporta notes that Thomas seems to contradict himself on this point. On the one hand, he often insists that beatitude consists in an act of man's intellect, that perfect happiness involves complete satisfaction of the intellect, and that one cannot attain such satisfaction except by seeing God as he is in himself. Hence one finds a series of texts asserting that every created intelligence naturally desires to see the divine essence. But there are also texts where Thomas denies to man any natural desire to see God. Without faith man would not know that he has been called to such an end. Moreover, there are other apparent contradictions in Thomas, relating to the same theme. In some passages he affirms and in others he denies the presence in man of any natural potency with respect to the supernatural.

Laporta argues that these apparent contradictions have become all the more difficult to resolve because of the influence of Cajetan's interpretation of Thomas. He has stressed one side of the problem and one set of texts and has either ignored or rejected what Aquinas states elsewhere. The purpose of Laporta's own study, then, is to disengage the teaching of Thomas Aquinas, the philosopher, on the destiny of man. Granted the theological aspects of the problem and granted that it is often discussed in Thomas's theological writings, Laporta has chosen to concentrate on his philosophical treatment of the same.

In chapter 1, after detailed consideration of the various usages of the term "appetite" in Aquinas, Laporta arrives at the following precisions. A natural metaphysical appetite is the simple finality of a nature, its ordering to its end. This is contrasted with animal (elicited) appetite, which may be either sensitive or intellectual (the will). By his *conscious* intellectual appetite, man naturally